

Sanskrit Text

Critical Edition

Introduction

Editorial Policy: General

All of the variants in mss P, Q and the paper manuscripts ascribable to scribal error and interpretation have been recorded in the critical edition's (negative) apparatus.¹ The following types of variants have generally not been recorded:

- Gemination of consonants after a semi-vowel, e.g., *dharmah* written as *dharmmah*, *karma* as *karmma*; *kārya* written as *kāryya*, *ārya* as *āryya*; *sarve* as *sarvve*.
- Reduction of a double consonant to a single one before a semi-vowel, e.g., *tattvam* written as *tatvam*; *sattva* written as *satva*.
- Use of *anusvāra* for homorganic nasal and vice-versa, e.g., *aṅgaḥ/amaṅgaḥ*; *kiṃ tu / kin tu*; *pañca/paṃca*.
- Non-application of *sandhi*.
- Non-application of *avagraha* where the *avagraha* does not indicate a deleted alpha privative.

Where a word or compound has been recorded in the apparatus because it attests a variant other than one of these five types, any of the five may occur elsewhere in the word or compound. The five types of variants mentioned above have, of course, been recorded in the diplomatic edition for ms P.

¹ A positive apparatus would have been preferable, but the critical text editing program I started with (Collate) was, at the time, unable to deal with Sanskrit compounds and had to be abandoned. The program used to format the present edition (Classical Text Editor) only became available to me after I had established the edition.

daṇḍa variants are mentioned only when they are relevant to the constitution of the critical text.

Some philological comments which explain my emendations and choice of readings have been included within the apparatus. The reader is referred to the translation notes for explanations requiring more detail.

Editorial Policy: Ms P and Ms Q

All errors of substance and all scribal errors in mss P and Q have been recorded in the critical apparatus to the edition. P's and Q's variants always stand in first place, set off from those of the paper manuscripts, even when they are shared by one or more of the paper manuscripts.

Mss P and Q do not graphically differentiate the *akṣaras va* and *ba*. Any variants that have been recorded because of other errors and that additionally contain, or rather require, the reading *va* where the bi-functional *ba* stands in the manuscript have been recorded in the apparatus as containing *va*, and not an erroneous *ba*.

The fact that a reading is the result of a scribal correction or has been written in the margins or between the lines is generally not mentioned unless the correction or text placement bears on the establishment of the critical text. Corrections and marginal/interlineal text that required editorial attention and decisions are discussed in the edition's apparatus and/or in the notes to the translation.

The extensive breakage of and worm damage to the palm leaf in sections of ms P has resulted in considerable loss of P's text. P's loss of individual words and compounds is indicated in the critical apparatus by way of the sign Ø. To avoid overloading the critical apparatus, the lacunae in ms P are reported only when a variant from Q or one or more of the better paper manuscripts, viz. B, D, J and L,²

² Since all of the paper manuscripts other than mss B, D, J and L derive, directly or indirectly, from either J or L they do not present singular correct readings, that is, correct readings which their lineage exemplar, i.e., J or L, does not also attest, and thus are not taken into consideration here. While it is a fact that these later

is reported. In these cases, “P: Ø” appears in the initial variant position, followed by the variant(s) from the other manuscript(s).

The variant readings in the group of manuscripts deriving from mss J and L which do not appear in J or L result almost invariably from scribal error and therefore do not represent variants of any substance. On account of this, it has not been deemed necessary to mention P’s lacunae when variants appear only in the text of manuscripts that derive from J and L; the reader who wishes to know P’s reading or lack of reading at such points is referred to my diplomatic edition of ms P. Thus according to the above scheme, if, for example, thirteen of the fourteen paper manuscripts correctly read *tadā* but ms G, one of the less important manuscripts,³ reads *tada*, the fact that P has a lacuna at this point will not be recorded alongside G’s variant in the apparatus. If, however, the majority of the paper manuscripts attest the correct reading but ms J, for example, in addition to ms G, contains a variant, P’s lacuna will be noted.

Ms Q has lost *akṣaras* and words from its first two folios due to broken margins. The *akṣaras* still visible before or after the break are reported in the apparatus, followed or preceded by “//”. In instances where entire words or compounds have been lost due to the breakage, this loss is indicated, as in the case of P, with the sign Ø. Since Q has experienced far less damage than P, all of Q’s lost words and compounds are individually reported, with the exception of those for Q’s missing folio 10 section. In order not to overload the apparatus, Q’s lacunae are reported for folio 10 only when one or more of the other main manuscripts, i.e., P, B, D, J and L, attests a variant. The

manuscripts on occasion re-present correctly, for example, a Nepalese-script *akṣara* which has been confused with a similarly formed Devanāgarī *akṣara* (e.g., an incorrect *ha* in Devanāgarī ms L may be re-presented in its correct form as a *dbha* in Nepalese ms K), there are no cases in the first chapter where the correct reading occurs only in one of the manuscripts other than B, D, J or L. There is also no cross-contamination between the paper manuscripts.

³ This judgement “less important” is drawn from the fact that G stems from J. All the manuscripts that are based on the extant exemplars J and L are deemed, for the present discussion, to be of lesser importance. They are not taken into consideration in the second half of the critical edition.

number of lacunae reported in the apparatus for this section of Q will alert the reader to the fact that the folio is missing in its entirety.

Numerous words and compounds in ms P's folios present still visible but damaged or faded *akṣaras*. In comparison, only a few visible but damaged *akṣaras* are found in ms Q.⁴ When the damage affects an entire word or compound, it is indicated by the sign ⊗. Thus "P: ⊗" or "Q: ⊗" will stand in first position after the appropriate footnote marker in the apparatus. Given the large amount of damage in P, its damage is noted only when one or more of the better manuscripts (Q, B, D, J and L) attests a variant. The diplomatic edition for ms P may be consulted for information about damage in other instances.

Ms P's damage is, however, occasionally reported in some detail if Q, B, D, J and/or L attest a variant and P's corresponding text is only partially damaged, i.e., some of the surrounding *akṣaras* in the relevant word or compound are still readable. Specifically, P's reading is reported only if 1) Q cannot report on part or all of the word or compound in question due to a lacuna or damage of its own,⁵ or 2) P's damage or unclear and thus uncertain reading occurs at exactly the point in the word/compound where the variant *akṣaras* (or surplus or lack of *akṣaras*) occur in Q, B, D, J and/or L's corresponding word/compound. In these cases, ms P's reading from the diplomatic edition is introduced, but often in a slightly abbreviated and thus more reader-friendly form. To illustrate, if the apparatus presents ms Q as reading *bhā*/// (i.e., the leaf has broken off after *bhā*) where the critical text has *bhāvāḥ*, and P is unable to fully support the critical text because its *akṣara* part *v* is uncertain and its final *visarga* is missing due to damage to the folio, then P's reading is reported as it stands in the diplomatic edition, though without spacing between the individual *akṣaras*, that is, as "*bhā(v)ā+*", the round brackets indicating uncertainty and the small cross signifying that part of an *akṣara* is missing.⁶ In a similar

⁴ The damaged and unclear *akṣaras* are underlined in Yonezawa's hand-copy.

⁵ P's damage is not reported for all of the missing readings of Q's lost folio 10.

⁶ For the signs used in the critical edition, see Critical Edition: Editorial Signs and Main Abbreviations. For those used in ms P's diplomatic edition, see Diplomatic Edition Ms P: Editorial Signs.

manner, if ms D reads *kīm* where the critical edition has *kiṃ*, and ms P's corresponding word is difficult to decipher but thought to read *kin*, then P's reading will appear in the apparatus of the critical edition as it is written in the diplomatic edition, that is, as “(kin)”. Likewise, if the critical edition reads *puruṣavyatiriktāḥ* but ms L attests the variant *puruṣatiriktāḥ*, and ms P's *vy* is unclear, with damage to the area around the *vy* so that its vowel cannot be determined, then P's damaged reading will be included. Ms P's compound will appear as [3](vy).[1](r).(k)t+h, the unreadable vowel indicated by way of the single dot. Instead of employing the diplomatic edition's large crosses (“+”) or double dots (“..”) to indicate, respectively, individual missing or damaged, i.e., indecipherable, *akṣaras*, reference is made only to the number of missing and/or damaged *akṣaras*—in this case three at the beginning and one in the middle—which are placed in square brackets. The information given for P thus informs the apparatus reader that although it looks as though ms P may have had the correct reading as regards the variant in L, that is, what remains of P's *akṣara* in question suggests it might indeed be a *vya*, some uncertainty remains. In other cases, such as ms L's reading *pratyayetya* for the critical text's *pratyayebhya*, P's reading *pratya*[2] informs the reader that P can neither testify for or against the accepted reading. Where damage is so severe that only one or two *akṣaras* in a longer word or compound are visible, or visible but uncertain, I revert to using the symbol for damage, i.e., Ø.

The manuscripts tend not to end verses with single or double *danḍas* and rather apply the appropriate *sandhi* for final consonants and *visargas* before the following *iti*, or coalesce final vowels with its initial *i*. This *iti* is then usually followed by single or double *danḍas*. For the sake of clarity, all verses in the edition are closed with *danḍas*, which are then followed by *iti*.

Editorial Policy: Mss A to N

As stated earlier, only the first half of the critical edition contains variants for mss A to N. Since the paper manuscripts' level of the

stemma could be established on the basis of their variants for this section, ten manuscripts were dropped after the editing of the first half of the chapter and only mss B, D, J and L were consulted for its second half.

Corrections, such as in cases of metathesis where the numbers “2” and “1” have been written over the switched *akṣaras*, are usually not mentioned; a couple of cases have been included because they contribute to explaining variants in manuscripts copied from the manuscript with the correction. Marginal or interlineal material marked for insertion (*akṣaras*, words, sentences) is generally only mentioned if it is relevant to the establishment of the critical text.

Neither the Devanāgarī manuscripts nor the Nepalese-script manuscripts distinguish between *ba* and *va*, Devanāgarī *ba* being written like Devanāgarī *va* in the Devanāgarī manuscripts and Nepalese-script *va* like Nepalese *ba* in the Nepalese manuscripts, i.e., without the Nepalese-script *va*’s expected lower indent.⁷ I have not noted instances of non-discrimination of *va* in the apparatus and instead read *ba* where *ba* is expected and *va* where *va* is expected.

Similar, but not usually as all-encompassing decisions had to be made in the cases of *ca* written within a conjunct or together with a preceding *ś* due to external *sandhi*. Some of the scribes (for example, those of mss B, C, J, L, M, N) took care to define the edges of the *ca* in such cases and it was possible to note the exceptions, though when the scribe started to write less clearly due possibly to tiredness or haste it became impossible to distinguish his *cas* from *vas* and seemed futile to try to do so. In other manuscripts (for example, A, D, E, F, G, H, I, K), the *cas* contained within conjuncts or written together with a preceding *ś* owing to external *sandhi* appear the majority of the time as *vas*, and I decided to spare the apparatus the clutter of noting all of these instances.

It was also often difficult to distinguish medial subscript *u* from *ū* in the Nepalese-script manuscripts, either because specific scribes did not seem to distinguish between the two vowel-markers or because

⁷ The paleographical manuals on Nepalese script often present *va* with a lower indent; for a list of the manuals, see Pant 2000: 91f. and n. 53.

they wrote the two vowel-markers in nearly the same way. As in the above cases involving *ca*, I noted variants only when the difference between the two vowel-markers was pronounced.

Most of the Devanāgarī manuscripts attest Nepalese-script features. Variants exhibiting them have for the most part not been noted in the apparatus.⁸ It is possible that the transmission line for ms D includes at least one Devanāgarī stage given, for example, the occasional appearance of the Devanāgarī diagonal medial *e* marker; it may, on the other hand, be possible that this marker, also sometimes attested in the older Nepalese script, has been transmitted to ms D through Nepalese manuscripts. Ms D does, however, on occasion exhibit the Devanāgarī *r*.

A final point regarding scribal habit: Each of the scribes of the fourteen paper manuscripts has his own personal style, and I tried to accommodate that style when I recorded variants. Some scribes write, for example, *py* such that it appears as *pp*, and *ty* as *tp*, etc. If a scribe was consistent the majority of the time in writing such conjuncts, I did not assume, even though he quite likely did not understand the meaning of the text he was copying, that he was a fool who did not see that he was copying *py* as *pp* or *ty* as *tp* over and over again. One might compare these habits to one's own handwriting, in which, for example, one might usually write the letter *f* as a simple straight line with a loop on the bottom, but once in awhile, sometimes even within the same sentence, one might write it "properly," with a loop on both the top and bottom of the letter. I have tried, then, to be fair to the scribes and endeavoured to accustom myself to their

⁸ Both ms B and ms L contain numerous *akṣaras* written in Nepalese-script style. When, for example, Nepalese *ra* (correct reading) appears in ms B and is not written like B's regular Devanāgarī *na* but is unequivocally the graphic equivalent of a Nepalese-script *ra*, I accept the letter as *ra* and do not record it as a variant (i.e., as *na*). Similarly, in the case of ms L, when *me* represents the correct reading but the *e* is written Nepalese style as a wavy line over the *m*, I accept the reading as correct. Although this procedure deprives the individual examining the apparatus of full access to the actual graphical representation of certain *akṣaras*, I excluded them from the apparatus owing to the fact that the stemma could be worked out on the basis of other more substantial variants and since the recording of the *akṣaras* in Nepalese-script would not add to establishing the text of the chapter.

individual styles so as not to be so critical of their penmanship that correct but idiosyncratically written *akṣaras* and words were relegated to the apparatus.

In particular, a number of features concerning the style of the scribe of ms D had to be taken into consideration, some of which are mentioned in the following. *anusvāra* in D is sometimes written as a small circle above the line, sometimes as a dot above the line, and sometimes as an irregular dot that could be taken for a superscript *r*. The hook of superscript *r* often tends to bend down close to the line and is easily confused with both the circle *anusvāra* and with the curved stroke of medial *i*. In most cases I accepted this superscript *r*, if superscript *r* was the correct reading, as such, even if the *r* was tending dangerously toward looking like a circle *anusvāra*; but when the form of the *r* had devolved so much that it could only be seen as a circle *anusvāra* or the curved stroke for medial *i*, I rejected the *r* possibility and added an *anusvāra* or *i* variant to the apparatus. That many of these decisions were of a subjective nature goes without saying. Ms D's scribe further often writes medial *ā* in such a way that the *ā* looks like a *ya*. It was frequently impossible to distinguish between *nā* and *nya* or *mā* and *mya*, but knowing that this was a regular feature of ms D's scribe's writing, I usually accepted a *nya*-looking *nā* as *nā* when *nā* was the correct reading. In addition, the scribe tends to write, for possibly a quarter of the occurrences in the first chapter, *tva* as *nva* and *tya* as *nya*, and on numerous other occasions, records *t* for *n* and vice-versa. While his exemplar may well have carried such forms, it is questionable whether this tendency can be attributed solely to the style of the scribe of the exemplar, and doubtful, if the exemplar did not attest such forms, that ms D's scribe repeatedly mistook the graphically similar *akṣaras* for each other. It may be possible that both orthography and paleography account for the irregularity here, and that *t* and *n* were understood by the scribe of ms D, or by a scribe earlier on in his ms tradition, as alternative forms of the same *akṣara*-element.⁹ Thus for the sake of sparing the

⁹ Brough (1996: 139), criticising Edgerton's acceptance of the forms *-itsu(h)*, *-etsu(h)*, etc., as Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit forms of the 3rd plural optative and aorist, writes: "In some forms of the Central Asian scripts, for example, the appearance of *n* and *t* is very similar; and it may well be that at some stage in the development of

apparatus overload, I did not record the many instances of ms D attesting *tva* as *nva* and *tya* as *nya*—the most obvious and frequently occurring of the above-described feature—but, unsure as to whether other instances should be assumed to owe their existence to (possibly) alternative forms of orthography, I decided to record these latter cases.

The reader of the apparatus should be alerted to the fact that many of the variants I have recorded for ms D differ from those recorded by de Jong for ms D (his ms R) in his “Textcritical Notes.” These differences are not usually substantial: de Jong chose to present the words and compounds from ms D that are of relevance to the improvement to the text of the PsP in a more transparent form, i.e., in a form that does not demand prior knowledge of the Nepalese-script *akṣaras* and the elements the scribes tend to confuse. To give a simple but straightforward example, where de La Vallée Poussin’s manuscripts read *nipātaḥ*¹⁰ and D attests *yāteḥ* (for the correct reading *pāthaḥ*), de Jong, assuming a scribal misreading of *y* for *p*, gives the variant as *pāteḥ*. I have recorded such variants as they appear in D, without any interpretation.

Nepalese writing there was a genuine coalescence in graphic forms of conjuncts such as *-ts-* and *-ns-*, *-tm-* and *-nm-*. If this is so, then it may be that, in the older Nepalese manuscripts at least, the shapes which from their appearance we transcribe as *-ts-*, *-tm-*, were actually intended by the scribes as *-ns-*, *-nm-*. Alternatively, the confusion may simply have started through straightforward misreading of archaic exemplars. However this may be, it is certain that some later scribes considered that they had two alternatives for their free choice. Where the second member of the conjunct is *m* (graphically close to *s*), this alternation has clearly been assisted by the normal *sandhi* of *t* before a following *m*. In a number of places I have seen phrases like *tan me*, with a tail added to the *n* in a second hand, thus producing *tat me*. It would seem that a reader of the manuscript, either for his own reassurance or in teaching a pupil, has ‘restored’ the basic grammatical form. From instances of this sort, some scribes may have even derived the feeling that the perverse writing looked more learned than the other, and for this reason introduced it elsewhere also.”

¹⁰ Cf. PsP_L 7.4; PsP_M §7.

PsP_L and the Critical Edition

De La Vallée Poussin often entered corrections into the text of his edition without mentioning that his manuscripts (my L, M and N) bore other readings, usually because the variants were caused by scribal error and resulted in nonsensical words. I have noted all of his silent corrections, both those rectifying scribal errors and those of substance, in the apparatus to the first half of the chapter so as to indicate readings that would appear, according to his edition, to be attested in the manuscripts L, M and N but are in fact not there, and also because scholars may find it interesting to gain a glimpse of de La Vallée Poussin, on whose editions of other texts we also rely, at work. The inclusion of reference to his corrections and conjectures is additionally intended to give him due credit for his pioneering and extremely learned work on the text of the PsP. The silent emendations he makes that have been confirmed by manuscripts he did not have access to have been registered at the end of the group of variants as “em. by LVP (silently).” Whenever I found it necessary to emend the text as found in the manuscripts, and when this emendation concurred with that proposed by de La Vallée Poussin, the statement “em. with LVP” appears before the list of variants. If de La Vallée Poussin’s emendation was entered without square brackets indicating it as such, a bracketed “LVP emends silently” follows. Once I discontinued working with the ten manuscripts that derive from mss J and L, a group to which mss M and N belong, I could no longer know what de La Vallée Poussin had read in M and N or infer his reasons for emending the text as he did and therefore changed the emendation wording from “em. with LVP” to “em. following LVP.”

Editorial Signs and Main Abbreviations

Ø	lacuna: text is missing due to breakage, fibre loss, a hole in the basis or a missing leaf (palm-leaf manuscripts only)
+	indicates part of an <i>akṣara</i> that is physically missing due to breakage, fibre loss or a hole in the basis (ms P only)
⊗	damage: one or more <i>akṣaras</i> constituting a word or part of a word are visible but unidentifiable due to damage (palm-leaf manuscripts only)
.	indicates part of an <i>akṣara</i> that is visible but unidentifiable due to damage to the <i>akṣara</i> (ms P only)
≈	indicates an unidentifiable <i>akṣara</i> (paper manuscripts only)
()	enclose <i>akṣaras</i> or parts of <i>akṣaras</i> whose reading is uncertain due to damage (ms P only)
[]	enclose an arabic numeral indicating a specific number of missing or damaged <i>akṣaras</i> (ms P only)
ṁ	indicates the vowel <i>a</i> where <i>a</i> is expected but where the reading <i>a</i> —instead of <i>u</i> or <i>ū</i> —cannot be ascertained beyond all doubt because the palm leaf has a hole or has broken off <i>below</i> the <i>akṣara</i> (ms P only)
ṁ̄	indicates the vowel <i>a</i> where <i>a</i> is expected but where the reading <i>a</i> —instead of <i>ā</i> , <i>i</i> , <i>e</i> , <i>ai</i> or <i>o</i> —cannot be ascertained beyond all doubt because

	the palm leaf has a hole or has broken off <i>above</i> the <i>akṣara</i> ¹¹ (ms P only)
ā	indicates the vowel <i>ā</i> where <i>ā</i> is expected but where the reading <i>ā</i> —instead of <i>ī</i> , <i>o</i> , or <i>au</i> —cannot be ascertained beyond all doubt because the palm leaf has a hole or has broken off <i>above</i> the <i>akṣara</i> (ms P only)
///	breakage (at the end or beginning of a line)
,	<i>avagraha</i>
∴	instead of (regarding word form and/or meaning)
...	editorial ellipsis
em.	emendation
conj.	conjecture
n.e.	no equivalent for
om.	omit(s)
LVP	de La Vallée Poussin
ms	manuscript
Skt	Sanskrit
Tib	Tibetan

¹¹ “Above the *akṣara*” refers to the area in which the diagonal and curved strokes for marking the vowels could be written and does not include the area to the left of the *akṣara* where the *prṣṭhamātra* stroke is written.

Critical Edition

¹ §1. यो ऽन्तद्वयावासविधूतवासः ² सम्बुद्धघीसागरलब्धजन्मा ।

सद्धर्मतोयस्य गभीरभावं ³ यथानुबुद्धं ⁴ कृपया जगाद ⁵ ॥

यस्य दर्शनतेजांसि ⁶ परवादिमतेन्धनम् ⁷ ।

PsP_L 2

दहन्त्य ⁸ अद्यापि ⁹ लोकस्य ¹⁰ मानसानि तमांसि ¹¹ च ॥

5

यस्यासमज्ञानवचःशरौघा ¹² निघ्नन्ति निःशेषभवारिसेनाम् ¹³ ।

त्रिधातुराज्यश्रियम् आदधाना ¹⁴ विनेयलोकस्य ¹⁵ सदेवकस्य ¹⁶ ॥

नागार्जुनाय ¹⁷ प्रणिपत्य ¹⁸ तस्मै तत्कारिकाणां ¹⁹ विवृतिं ²⁰
करिष्ये ।

¹ P: Ø up to PsP_M §5 (end of third sentence [= PsP_L 4.6]); Q: ddhāya || (the right and left edges of folio 1 are damaged due to breakage; the homage may have read: om̐ namo buddhāya ||); A-C, E-M: om̐ namo buddhāya ||; D: namo buddhāya; N: om̐ namaḥ śrīvajrasatvāya | om̐ namo ratnatrayāya |. Tib: 'phags pa 'jam dpal gzhon nur gyur pa la phyag 'tshal lo ||. ² P: Ø; D: yānta°; F: yānta...tavāsa; K: yotta°; N: yo ntardvayā°. LVP (PsP_L 1, n. 4) remarks: "Mss. yo 'ntardaya°" but L and M read yo ntadvayā° (N as stated). ³ A: gaṃbhira°; C, G, I: gaṃbhīra°; E, H, M: gaṃbhīra° ⁴ P: Ø; Q: yathānabu°; A, I: yathānuddha; E, H: yathānuddham ⁵ A, E, I: jagmada; H: jagmadaḥ ⁶ P: Ø; A, E, H, I: daśana°; D: °jātsi ⁷ A: paravādimete°; F: °mate-ndharam; I: °matyaṃdhanam ⁸ P: Ø; A-C, E, G-J, L, M: dahaty; F: rahabhy; K: nahaty ⁹ F: eyāpi ¹⁰ A, E, H, I: tavānsi ¹¹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: va ¹² P: Ø; Q: yasyādvayajñāna°; Tib: gnyis med ye shes; *LT: asamaññanam. Q presumably has its reading from the γ line (see Stemma). ¹³ F: °bhacāriśenām; G: °bhavāri=sañām ¹⁴ P: Ø; Q: ādadhanā ¹⁵ P: Ø; L: vineyayalokasya ¹⁶ P: Ø; Q: sadeva///; N: repeats sadevakasya ¹⁷ P, Q: Ø ¹⁸ P, Q: Ø ¹⁹ N: tatkāṇām ²⁰ F, K: vikṛtiṃ

उत्तानसत्प्रक्रियवाक्यनद्धा¹ तर्कानिलाव्याकुलिता² प्रसन्नाम्³ ॥⁴

§2. तत्र न स्वतो⁵ नापि परतो न द्वाभ्याम्⁶ इत्यादि⁷ वक्ष्यमाणं⁸
शास्त्रम्⁹ । तस्य कानि सम्बन्धाभिधेयप्रयोजनानीति¹⁰ प्रश्ने¹¹ मध्यम-

N2r कावतारविहितविधिनाद्वयज्ञानालङ्कृतं¹² महाकरुणोपायपुरःसरं¹³

प्रथमचित्तोत्पादं¹⁴ तथागतज्ञानोत्पत्तिहेतुम्¹⁵ आदिं¹⁶ कृत्वा¹⁷

5

J2r C2r I2r यावद्¹⁸ आचार्यनागार्जुनस्य¹⁹ विदिताविपरीतप्रज्ञापारमितानीतेः²⁰

PsP_L 3

¹ P: Ø; D: °satprakriyavākanaddhām ² A, E, H, I: tarkātila° ³ A, E, H, I: prasannā; N: nnasannām ⁴ P: Ø; A-C, E-N number the verses one to four ⁵ I: mvato ⁶ N: dvā; Tib: n.e. na dvābhyām ⁷ N: tyādi ⁸ H: vakṣamāṇām ⁹ A, E, F, H, I: śāstra ¹⁰ P: Ø; Q: sambandhābhidheyaprayojanaprayojanānīti; A: sam...ābhiveyaprayojanatatprayojanānīti; B: sam...ābhidheyaprayojanamtatprayojanānīti; D: sam...āvidheyaprayojanatatprayojanānīti; E, F, H, I, K, L: sam...ābhidheyaprayojanatatprayojanānīti; PsP_L: sambandhābhidheyaprayojanānīti; Tib: 'brel pa dang brjod par bya ba dang | dgos pa'i dgos pa dag ... zhes (*sambandhābhidheyaprayojanaprayojanānīti). The fact that the manuscript group C, G, J, M and N reads *sambandhābhidheyaprayojanānīti* presumably has its source in an eyeskip committed by J's scribe; ms κ, from which mss B, J and L stem, must have contained the reading °*ābhidheyaprayojanatatprayojanānīti* in order for it to appear in both B and L. Candrakīrti only refers to a *prayojana* and not to a *prayojanaprayojana* in the commentary which follows. See Translation note. ¹¹ P: Ø; A-C, E, H-N: praśe; F: praśe; G: pradeśe; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² H: °kṛta ¹³ H: °karuṇopāyavurāṣasaram; Tib: n.e. upāya ¹⁴ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, K, L: °cittautpādam ¹⁵ P: Ø; Q: tathāgata/// ¹⁶ P, Q: Ø ¹⁷ P, Q: Ø ¹⁸ P: Ø; Q: ///d ¹⁹ P: Ø; A-N: ācāryāryanāgārjunasya; Tib: n.e. ārya ²⁰ F: °pārapitānīṭh

करुणया परावबोधार्थं¹ शास्त्रप्रणयनम्² इत्य् एष³ तावच्⁴ छास्त्रस्य⁵
सम्बन्धः ॥

यच्⁶ छास्ति⁷ च⁸ क्लेशरिपून्⁹ अशेषान्¹⁰ सन्नायते¹¹ दुर्गतितो¹²
भवाच् च।

5 तच्¹³ छासनात्¹⁴ त्राणगुणाच् च शास्त्रम् एतद्¹⁵ द्वयं¹⁶ चान्य- G2r
मतेषु नास्ति ॥

इति ॥

§3. स्वयम्¹⁷ एव¹⁸ चाचार्यो¹⁹ वक्ष्यमाणसकलशास्त्राभिधेयार्थं²⁰ स- K2r
प्रयोजनम्²¹ उपदर्शयन्²² तदविपरीतसम्प्रकाशकत्वेन²³ माहात्म्यम् B2r

¹ C, G: parova°; M: parova...tha ² P: Ø; C, G, J, N: °preṇayenam; F: °pranayanam; M: śāstrampreṇayenam ³ P: Ø; C, G, J, M, N: aṣa
⁴ A: tavad ⁵ A: tastrasya; C, G: chāstra; M: chāstram ⁶ P: Ø; A, E, H, I, L: ya; C, G, J, M, N: yec; em. by LVP (silently); Tib does not include the verse. ⁷ H: chāstī ⁸ P: Ø; A-N: va; conj. by LVP: va[h]. ⁹ P: Ø; A-E, H-L, N: °ripūr; F: °ripur; G: °ripūv; M: °ripupūr; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ F: aṇeṣānu ¹¹ A, E, H, I: saṃśāyate; C, G, M, N: °yata ¹² M: durgatitot ¹³ P: Ø; A-N: tec; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁴ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): chāsanāt; P: Ø; Q: chāsanā; A, E, F, H, K, L: chāsanām; B, C, D, G, J, M, N: chāsanān; I: chasanā ¹⁵ P: Ø; D: etata ¹⁶ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: dvaya ¹⁷ A: svayem ¹⁸ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): eva; P: Ø; Q: evan; A, B, D-F, H-M: evam; C, G, N: evam; Tib: nyid ¹⁹ P: Ø; A, C-H, J-M: vā°; B: vācārye; I: vāmcāryyo; N: cācāyo; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: n.e. ca ²⁰ P: Ø; Q: °śāstrābhidheyam artham; A: °śāstrabhi°; B: vikśya°; C: °śāstrābhirdheyartham; D: °śāstrahidheyam artham; F: vakṣa...rtha; G: °śāstrābhirdheyam artham; M: vakṣyamāta°; Tib: 'chad par 'gyur ba'i bstan bcos mtha' dag gi brjod par bya ba'i don ²¹ P: Ø; Q: sapra///; A-C, E-N: su°; em. by LVP

H2r उद्भाव्य¹ तत्त्वभावाव्यतिरेकवर्तिने² परमगुरवे³ तथागताय शास्त्र-
प्रणयननिमित्तकं⁴ प्रणामं⁵ कर्तुकाम आह –

अनिरोधम्⁶ अनुत्पादम् अनुच्छेदम् अशाश्वतम्।

L2r अनेकार्थम्⁸ अनानार्थम्⁹ अनागमम् अनिर्गमम्¹⁰ ॥

A2r यः प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादम्¹¹

5

इत्यादि ॥

M2r तद्¹² अत्रानिरोधाद्यष्टविशेषणविशिष्टः¹³ प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादः¹⁴ शास्त्रा-
भिधेयार्थः¹⁵ ॥

PsP_L 4

(silently) ²² P, Q: Ø; A, E, H: upadarśayaṃ; I: ūpa°; PsP_L: °yan
²³ P: Ø; Q: ///(prakāśakatvena); A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °parītaprakāśaka-
tvena; PsP_L: °parītasamprakāśatvena; Tib: ston par mdzad pa nyid
kyi sgo nas

¹ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, L: uhāvyā; M: utbhāvyā; I: ūhāvyā ² P: Ø; D:
tetsva°; F: °vyatīnekavarttine; G: °vattine; H: °varttite; M: °varttire

³ P: Ø; C, M: parana°; D: parave; I: °guruve ⁴ P: Ø; D: °praṇapa-
nanani°; F: °praṇayaṇa°; G: °ka ⁵ P: Ø; A-N: pramāṇaṃ; em. by
LVP (silently); Tib: phyag

⁶ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: anirādhām
⁷ P: Ø; A: anurāchedam; E, F, H, I, K, L: anugachedam ⁸ A: anekār-
tha ⁹ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om. ¹⁰ N: anirggasaṃ ¹¹ P: Ø;

A: pratitamanutpādam; B-H, J-N: pratītyamanutpādam; D: pratītye-
samutpādam; I: pratītyamanutpādam; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² P: Ø;

Q: om.; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om. ¹³ P: Ø; Q: tatrānīrodhā°; A, E, H,
I: tatrānīrodhādyāstaviśeṣaṇaviśiṣṭa; B: °viśiṣṭa; C, J, M, N: °viśeṣe-
ṇaviśiṣṭa; F: tatrānīrodhājyaṣṭaviśeṣaṇaviśiṣṭa; G: °viśeṣeṇaviśiṣṭa;

K, L: tatrānīrodhā...viśiṣṭa; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: de la ÷ tad
atra° ¹⁴ P: Ø; Q: °samutpāda///; F, K: pratīmanupādaḥ ¹⁵ Em.

with LVP (LVP emends silently): śāstrābhīdheyārthaḥ; P, Q: Ø; A, B,
D-F, H, I, K, L: śāstre 'bhīdheyārthaḥ; C, G, M, N: śāstra 'bhīdheyār-

सर्वप्रपञ्चोपशमशिवलक्षणं¹ निर्वाणं² शास्त्रस्य³ प्रयोजनं⁴ निर्दिष्टम्॥

तं वन्दे⁵ वदतां⁶ वरम्॥

इत्यनेन प्रणामः⁷ ॥

§4. इत्य् एष⁸ तावच्छ्लोकद्वयस्य⁹ समुदायार्थः¹⁰ ॥

F2r

5 §5. अवयवार्थस्¹¹ तु विभज्यते¹² । तत्र निरुद्धिर्¹³ निरोधः क्षण- E2r I2v
भङ्गो¹⁴ निरोध¹⁵ इत्युच्यते¹⁶ । उत्पादनम्¹⁷ उत्पाद आत्मभावोन्म- P2r
जनम्¹⁸ । उच्छित्तिर्¹⁹ उच्छेदः²⁰ प्रबन्धविच्छित्तिर्²¹ इत्यर्थः । J2v C2v

thaḥ; J: śāstre(/°tra?) 'bhidheyārthaḥ; Tib: bstan bcos kyi brjod par bya ba yin

¹ P: Ø; Q: ///ñcopaśama°; F: °siva°; G: sasarva° ² P: Ø; C, G, J, M, N: nirvāṇa ³ P: Ø; A, E, F I: sāstrasya; L: s(/ś?)āstrasya ⁴ P: Ø; C, G: prayojenan; J: prayoje(/ja?)nan; M: prayojanan; N: prayojana ⁵ I: vade ⁶ A, E, H, I: om. ⁷ F, K: pramāṇa; I: prāṇāma ⁸ A, E, H, I: epa ⁹ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K-M: °choka°; B, C, G, J, N: °chroka°; D: tovacchroka°; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ M: °ārthaṃ ¹¹ A, E, H: ayavārthas; C, G, M: avyayavārthas°; I: ayavārtham; N: aveya° ¹² P: Ø; A, E, F, H, K, L: vibhakṣyate; D: vihakṣyate. The following explanation of the words *nīrodha* to *nirgama* appears in Tib only after the discussion of the compound *pratītyasamutpāda*, i.e., in §15; see Translation: Appendix IV. ¹³ P: Ø; A-C, E, G-N: niruddhi; F: mirurddhi; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁴ P: Ø; A, D-F, H, K, L: kṣa-ṇabhaṅgā; C, G, M: kaṇa° ¹⁵ I: ni=dha ¹⁶ N: ityucya ¹⁷ P: Ø; A-C, E-G, I-N: utpādenam; H: utpātenam; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁸ P available as witness; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ātmabhāvānma°; M: ātmabhāvajanam; PsP_L: ātmabhāvonmajjana[m ity arthaḥ], but *ity arthaḥ* appears neither in the mss nor in Tib ¹⁹ F: ucchittin ²⁰ A: ucheda ²¹ A, E, H: prabandhva°

शाश्वतो¹ नित्यः² सर्वकालस्थास्तु³ इत्य्⁴ अर्थः⁵ । एकश् चासाव्⁶
 अर्थश्⁷ चेत्य्⁸ एकार्थो⁹ ऽभिन्नार्थो¹⁰ न¹¹ पृथग् इत्यर्थः¹¹ । नानार्थो¹²
 N2v भिन्नार्थः पृथग् इत्य्¹² अर्थः¹³ । आगतिरागमो विप्रकृष्टदेशाव-
 G2v स्थितानां¹⁴ सन्निकृष्टदेशागमनम्¹⁵ । निर्गतिर्¹⁶ निर्गमः¹⁷ सन्निकृष्ट-
 देशावस्थितानां¹⁸ विप्रकृष्टदेशागमनम्¹⁹ ॥

PsP_L 5

§6. एतिर् गत्यर्थः²⁰ प्रतिः²¹ प्राप्त्यर्थः²¹ । उपसर्गवशेन²² धात्वर्थ-
 विपरिणामात्²³ –

K2v उपसर्गेण²⁴ धात्वर्थो²⁵ बलादन्यत्र नीयते²⁶ ।
 गङ्गासलिलमाधुर्यं²⁷ सागरेण यथाम्भसा²⁸ ॥

¹ Q: śā//; F, K: śāśvato nityarthaḥ | śāśvato ² Q: Ø ³ Q: Ø; A-F H-N: °sarvakālasthānur; G: sarvakālasthānur; PsP_L: sarvakāle sthānur. LVP (PsP_L 4, n. 5) suggests *sarvakāle sthānu* as a possible original reading. Tib: dus thams cad du gnas pa ⁴ Q: Ø ⁵ Q: //rthaḥ ⁶ Q: cārthaś ÷ cāsāv arthaś ⁷ Q: see previous note ⁸ A, E, H, I: cet ⁹ P: akārto; A, E, H, I: ekārtā ¹⁰ F: om. ¹¹ A: ta ¹² A, E, I: ity; N: i ¹³ N: rthaḥ ¹⁴ D: viprakṛṣṭadaśā° ¹⁵ D, F, K: saṃti°; H: saṃkṛṣṭa° ¹⁶ A, C, E-N: nirgati; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁷ M: nirgamaṃ ¹⁸ Q: °deśāvasthinām; A, E, H, I: sinnikṛ° ¹⁹ A: °gamatām; H: °gamanām; I: vikṛṣṭa° ²⁰ A-N: prati; em. by LVP (silently) ²¹ A: prāpprarthah; I: °artha; M, N: prātyarthaḥ ²² P: °vasena; A: °vaśema; Tib: n.e. vaśena ²³ M: °mā; Tib: n.e. artha ²⁴ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): elision of hi. P: uparggeṇa hi; Q: u//; A, D-F, H, I, K, L: °gena hi; B, C, G, J: °geṇa hi; M: ipa-sargeṇa hi; N: upargeṇa hi. See Translation note. ²⁵ Q: Ø; F: dhā-tvarthā ²⁶ I: nīyatye ²⁷ B: °mādhūryam; F, J: °mādhurya; G: °mādhūryat; I: °mādhūryya; M: gaṅgāsariramādhuryaḥ; N: °mādhūr-yan ²⁸ G: yathāmbhameti ÷ yathāmbhasā || iti; M: yathābha°

इति¹

– प्रतीत्यशब्दो² ऽत्र³ ल्यबन्तः⁴ प्राप्ताव् अपेक्षायां⁵ वर्तते। H2v
 समुत्पूर्वः⁶ पदिः⁷ प्रादुर्भावार्थ⁸ इति समुत्पादशब्दः⁹ प्रादुर्भावे¹⁰ B2v
 वर्तते। ततश्च¹¹ हेतुप्रत्ययापेक्षो¹² भावानाम्¹³ उत्पादः¹⁴ प्रतीत्यसमु- D2r
 5 त्पादार्थः¹⁵ ॥

§7. अपरे¹⁶ तु ब्रुवते¹⁷ – इतिर्¹⁸ गतिर्¹⁹ गमनं²⁰ विनाशः²¹ । इतौ²²
 साधव इत्याः²³ । प्रतिर्²⁴ वीप्सार्थ²⁵ इत्य् एवं²⁶ तद्धितान्तम्²⁷ इत्य- I3r

¹ PsPL: n.e. iti; Tib: zhes bshad do ² P: °śabdātra ⇄ °śabdo 'tra; A: °sabdo; K: °da≈ ³ Tib: n.e. atra ⁴ A: ityabanta; B: ityabantaḥ; C-E, G, H, J-N: ityabantaḥ; F: ityebakaḥ; I: ityebanta; em. by LVP ⁵ A, E: epekṣāyā; D: ayekāyām; F, K, L: epekṣāyaṃ; H: eyeṣṣāyā; I: epekṣāmā ⁶ F: samūt° ⁷ M: yadiḥ ⁸ A: pādur°; M, N: °bhāvarthaḥ ⁹ A, E, H, I: samutpādasah; B, C, F, G, J-N: samutpādaśah; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ A: pradurbhāve, superscript *r* written above *pra*°; E: pradurbhāve, possibly long *ā* stroke extending upward from top of *pra*° (resembles 2 superscript *r*-s on top of each other) ¹¹ Tib: n.e. ca ¹² A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °pratya-yāveṣṣā; D: °pratya-yāveṣṣo ¹³ A, E, H, I: bhavām ¹⁴ D: °deḥ ¹⁵ C, G, M: °tha ¹⁶ A: apale ¹⁷ F: bruvateḥ; K: bruvato ¹⁸ Q: i///; C, G, J, M, N: iti; I: gitir ¹⁹ Q: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: gati; G: tatiḥ; PsPL: om.; Tib: 'gro ba ²⁰ Q: Ø; F: gamana ²¹ Q: Ø ²² Q: itau, followed by 'x' marking point of insertion, presumably for *bhavāḥ* in margin (PsP Tib: i tya ni 'gro bar rung ba dag go; AKBh: itau sādharma ityāḥ ...); A, E, F, H, I, K, L: isau ²³ G: ityā ²⁴ G: prīti; H: pratī. De Jong (1979: 29), citing PsPL 5.7 as attesting the reading *prati*, emends to *pratir*, but PsPL 5.7 correctly reads *pratir*. ²⁵ M: vipsārtha ²⁶ C, G, I, M: avan; D: aivaṃ ²⁷ F: taddhitātam; K: taddhitātam

शब्दं¹ व्युत्पाद्य² प्रति प्रति³ इत्यानां विनाशिनां⁴ उत्पादः⁵ प्रतीत्यस-
 मुत्पादं⁶ इति वर्णयन्ति। तेषां⁷ प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादं⁸ वो⁹ भिक्षवो¹⁰ देश-
 यिष्यामि। यः प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादं¹¹ पश्यति¹² स¹³ धर्मं¹⁴ पश्यतीत्य¹⁵
 एवमादौ¹⁶ विषये¹⁷ वीप्सार्थस्य¹⁸ सम्भवात्¹⁹ समाससद्भावाच्²⁰ च
 स्याज्²¹ ज्यायसी²² व्युत्पत्तिः²³। इह²⁴ तु चक्षुः²⁵ प्रतीत्य रूपाणि²⁶
 चोत्पद्यते²⁷ चक्षुर्विज्ञानम्²⁸ इत्येवमादौ विषये²⁹ साक्षाद्³⁰ अङ्गीकृ-

PsP_L 6

5

¹ A, E: ityaśabda; H: ityaśabdaḥ; I: ityaśabdā ² A, E, H, I: vyatpāya; F: vetpādyā; L: vyatpādyā; K: vetyādyā ³ G: patti ⁴ P: vināsinām; C, G, J, M, N: vināsinām; ⁵ A, E: śamutpādaḥ; B-D, F-N: samutpādaḥ; PsP_L: samutpāda ⁶ A: °pada; G, H: pratitya°; PsP_L: om.; Tib: rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba ⁷ H, N: teṣā ⁸ A, H: pratitya°; N: pratīsamut° ⁹ A-C, E-N: bodhi; em. by LVP on the basis of Tib: khyed la ¹⁰ D, F: bhikṣuvo ¹¹ A, E, H, I, K, L: pratāmtya°; F: pratāmtypādram; G: °pāda ¹² A, B, E, H, L, M: paśyāmti; C, F, G, I-K, N: paśyanti; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ A, E, H, I: om. ¹⁴ F, G, I: dharma; H: dharmma ¹⁵ B, M: paśyāmtīty; F: paśyatit; G: paśyantīty; H: paśyātī; I: paśyantīty ¹⁶ F: evamārdō; H: eva ādau ¹⁷ A, E, H, I, K: viṣaya; F: viṣayā ¹⁸ D: vīp-sārthamśya; F: vīpsyārthasya; H: vip° ¹⁹ A, E, H: saṃbhāvāt ²⁰ Q: samāśa°; A, E, F, H, L: samāśasahāvāc; D: °bhāvōc; M: samā-sasabhāvāc; N: samāśa, then repeats from *viditāvīparītaprajñā-pāramitānīteḥ* up to and including *anekārtham anānārtham anāgam* (sic) *anirggamaṃ* | ya, after which the text continues with *sadbhāvāc*; em. by LVP (silently) ²¹ C, G, M: sāt ²² A, B, E, F, H, I, K, L: kāyaśī; C, G, M: jyāpaśī; D, J, N: jyāyaśī; em. by LVP (silently) ²³ A, C, E-G, J-N: vyatpattiḥ; H: vyaktantiḥ; I: vyatpatti; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁴ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ihaca; D: ihe ²⁵ D, F: tuc ²⁶ D: cakṣaḥ; F: cakṣu; I: cakṣu ²⁷ A, C, E, F, H, J-L, N: vātpadyate; D, M: vot°; G, I: cātpadyate; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁸ D: °nem ²⁹ H: viṣaya ³⁰ F: sāksā

तार्थविशेषे¹ चक्षुः प्रतीत्येति² प्रतीत्यशब्द³ एकचक्षुरिन्द्रियहेतुका-
याम्⁴ अप्य⁵ एकविज्ञानोत्पत्ताव्⁶ अभीष्टायां कुतो⁷ वीप्सार्थता⁸ । G3r
PsP_L 7 प्राप्त्यर्थस् ब् अनङ्गीकृतार्थविशेषे⁹ ऽपि¹⁰ प्रतीत्यशब्दे¹¹ सम्भवति¹²
प्राप्य सम्भवः प्रतीत्य समुत्पाद इति¹³ । अङ्गीकृतार्थविशेषे¹⁴ ऽपि¹⁵ F2v
5 सम्भवति¹⁶ चक्षुः¹⁷ प्रतीत्य¹⁸ चक्षुः¹⁹ प्राप्य²⁰ चक्षुर् अपेक्ष्येति²¹ 22
व्याख्यानात्²³ । तद्धितान्ते²⁴ चेत्यशब्दे²⁵ चक्षुः²⁶ प्रतीत्य रूपाणि²⁷ K3r E2v

¹ F: kṣīkṛtārthaviśeṣe; G: agīkṛtārtha°; H: añjikr° ² A, B, E, F, I, K, L: pratītyeti; H: pratīteti; Tib: migs dang gzugs la brten nas (= cakṣuḥ pratītya rūpaṃ ca) ÷ cakṣuḥ pratītya ³ A, E, I: tyāśarbde; H: tyēśabde; G: prātītyeśabde; C, M: pratītyeśabde ⁴ Q: °hetukā///; C, G, J, M, N: °kāmām ⁵ Q: Ø ⁶ Q: ///tpattāv; A: akavijñānotbattāv; J, C: °vijñānotpajñānāv; E, H, I, K, L: aka°; G, M: °vijñānotpājñānāv; N: °vijñānotprajñānāv; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: kutā; C, G, J, M, N: kṛto; D: kūto; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ A, E, H, I, K, L: vipsārthata; F: vipsarthataḥ; C, G, J, M, N: vip°; em. by LVP (silently) ⁹ F: anaṅgi° ¹⁰ A, E, H, I, L: pri; D: di; F: dhi (?); K: prī (?) ¹¹ Tib: rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba'i sgra la ÷ pratītyaśabde ¹² A: °bhavati; G: °bhaveti; N: sambhati ¹³ H: itiḥ ¹⁴ C, G, M: °kṛtārthavipa; F, K: agī°; J, N: °kṛtārthaviṣe ¹⁵ G: yi ¹⁶ D: °veti ¹⁷ G: cakṣu; I: om. ¹⁸ I: om. ¹⁹ C, M: caḥ; D: cakṣu; G: vaḥ ²⁰ G: prāpyavac ²¹ C, G, J, M, N: cakṣu; L: cakṣun; em. by LVP (silently) ²² A: apekṣotu; D: apekṣyamti; C, G, J, M, N: pekṣyeti; em. by LVP: prekṣyeti, LVP's Cambridge ms (= ms L) bears the correct reading; Tib: ltos nas zhes. Tib: mig dang gzugs la brten nas mig dang gzugs phrad cing mig dang gzugs la ltos nas zhes ÷ cakṣuḥ pratītya cakṣuḥ prāpya cakṣur apekṣyeti ²³ P: vyākhyā syāt; A, F: vyākhyātāta; D: vyākhyānosyāt; E, H, I, K, L: °nāta; Tib: bshad pa'i phyir ²⁴ D: taddhitaunte ²⁵ A: catye°; B, E, F, H, I, K, L: catya°; C, G, M: catyacakṣuśabdeḥ; I: caśaśabde; N: caśabde; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁶ C, G, M: see previous note; I: cakṣu ²⁷ F: rūpāśi

I3v चोत्पद्यते¹ चक्षुर्विज्ञानम्² इत्य³ अत्र⁴ प्रतीत्यसब्दस्याव्ययत्वाभावात्⁵
H3r समासासद्भावाच्च⁶ च⁷ विभक्तिश्रुतौ⁸ सत्यां⁹ चक्षुः¹⁰ प्रतीत्यं¹¹
विज्ञानं रूपाणि चेति पाठः¹² स्यात्। न¹³ चैतद् एवम्¹⁴ इत्य¹⁵ अव्य-
B3r यस्यैव¹⁵ ल्यबन्तस्य व्युत्पत्तिर् अभ्युपेया¹⁶ ॥

§8. यस् तु

5

वीप्सार्थत्वात्¹⁷ प्रत्युपसर्गस्यैतेः¹⁸ प्राप्त्यर्थत्वात्¹⁹ समुत्पाद-
शब्दस्य²⁰ च²¹ सम्भवार्थत्वात्²² तांस्²³ तान्²⁴ प्रत्ययान्²⁵ प्रतीत्य

¹ A: potpadyate; C, G, M: ropadyate; E, H, I: ṣotpadyate; F, K, L: votpadyate; J, N: copadyate; em. by LVP (silently) ² Q: cakṣur-vijñā/// ³ Q: Ø ⁴ Q: Ø; D: atre; M: utra ⁵ Q: ///syāvvyayatvābhā-vāt ⁶ P: °sadbhāvā(c); A, E, H, L: °hāvāc; D: °sadbhāvāṣ; M: °sat-bhāvāc ⁷ P: (ca); D: ṭha ⁸ A, E, H: tibhaktiṣrutau; I: tibhakti° ⁹ D: śatyām; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: satyam ¹⁰ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om. ¹¹ P: (pratīty); A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om. ¹² A-C: nipātaḥ; D: yāteḥ (not *pāteḥ* as de Jong [1978: 29] records; de Jong suggests the emendation *pāthaḥ*, following Tib 'don pa); E, F, H-N: nipātaḥ; G: nipāta; LVP (PsPL 7, n. 5) retains the reading *nipātaḥ* found in his mss but notes Tib's *pāthaḥ* as a "leçon au moins aussi vraisemblable." ¹³ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ta ¹⁴ K: evaṃ; N: evas ¹⁵ A, E, H, I: avā-ya°; C, G, M, N: avyayasyava ¹⁶ P: ityupeyā; D, M, N: atyupeyā; F: atyupiyā; H: abhyupeya ¹⁷ F, G: vipsyārthatvāt; A-C, E, H-M: vip°; N: vipsārthatvān; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁸ A, B, E, F, H, I, K: °ete; D: pratyeyasargasya° ¹⁹ A, E, F, H, K, L, M: prārthatvāt; I: prārtha-tvātta ²⁰ D: °sye ²¹ A, B, D-F, H, I, K-N: va; em. by LVP (silently) ²² N: °ārthatvār≈ ²³ G, M: tāṣ; H: stāṣ ²⁴ P: +ān+; C, G, M: tāvat; A, B, E, F, K, L: tāṃ ²⁵ F: pratyānpratītyayān; I: pratyeyān

PsP_L 8

समुत्पादः¹ प्राप्य² सम्भव³ इत्य्⁴ एके⁵ । प्रति⁶ प्रति⁷ विनाशिनाम्⁸
उत्पादः प्रतीत्यसमुत्पाद इत्य्⁹ अन्ये⁹ ॥

इति परव्याख्यानम् अनूद्य¹⁰ दूषणम्¹¹ अभिधत्ते¹² । तस्य परपक्षानु-
वादाकौशलम्¹³ एव¹⁴ तावत् सम्भाव्यते¹⁵ । किं कारणम् । यो हि C3v
5 प्राप्त्यर्थ¹⁷ प्रतीत्यशब्दं¹⁸ व्याचष्टे । नासौ प्रति¹⁹ वीप्सा²⁰ व्याचष्टे²¹ N3v P2v
नाप्य²² एति²³ प्राप्त्यर्थम्²⁴ । किं²⁵ तहि²⁶ । प्रति²⁷ प्राप्त्यर्थम्²⁸ एति²⁹ J3v
च³⁰ गत्यर्थ³¹ समुदितं च प्रतीत्यशब्दं³² प्राप्ताव्³³ एव³⁴ वर्णयति³⁵ ॥

¹ Q: samutpāda/// ² Q: Ø ³ Q: Ø; I: sabhava ⁴ Q: ///ty ⁵ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ake; D: eka ⁶ N: pati ⁷ C, G, M: om. ⁸ A, E, H, I, L: vitāśinām; C, G, J, N: vināśinām; M: vināsi=ām; em. by LVP (silently) ⁹ A, E: enya; I: ene ¹⁰ A, E, H, L, M: anudya ¹¹ I: ≈ūṣa-ṇam; N: dūṣ ¹² P: a(bh)idha.e; A-C, E-G, J-N: ahidhatte; D: abhi-dhaste; I, H: ahidhante; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ P: [3].ān.°; A, E, F, H, K, L, N: parakṣānu°; G, M: parapakṣānavā°; I: parakṣānuvādāḥ-kaūśalam; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁴ A: evat ¹⁵ A: om.; D: tāvata-na ¹⁶ A: saṃbhāvetēḥ; G: sabhāvyate; E, H, I: saṃbhāvyateḥ ¹⁷ F: prātyartham ¹⁸ Tib: rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba'i sgra ÷ prātītyaśabdaṃ ¹⁹ M: pratī ²⁰ A, C, E, G, H, J, M, N: vip°; F, I: vipsārtha ²¹ Tib: ma yin ÷ na ... vyācaṣṭe ²² C, G, N: nāṣy ²³ P: +t+; A, E, H, J-L: e || te; B: ate; C, G, I, M, N: a || te; F: e te; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁴ F: prāptyārtha ²⁵ I: ki ²⁶ P: (t)ā+h+; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: tahi ²⁷ A: prati ²⁸ Q: prāp///; A, E, F, H, I, K: prā-ptyārtham; C, G, M: prāptyartham ²⁹ P: (e)t+; Q: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K: atimś; B, C, J, M: atim; L, N: atin; PsP_L: om.; Tib: 'brel par ³⁰ P: (c)a; Q: Ø; PsP_L: om.; Tib: zhing ³¹ Q: Ø; D, F, I: gatyartha; PsP_L: om.; Tib: 'gro ba'i don yin ³² A: pratītyaśabda; E, H, I, K, L: °śabda; F: pratyatīśabda; G: pratītya° ³³ D: prāptov ³⁴ A, C, E-I, K-N: e; D: eta; em. by LVP (silently) ³⁵ K: carṇṇayati

- L3r तेनेदानीं¹ प्राप्य सम्भवः² प्रतीत्य समुत्पाद इत्येवं³ व्युत्पादितेन⁴
 G3v प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादशब्देन⁵ यदि⁶ निरवशेषसम्भविपदार्थपरामर्शो⁷
 A3r l4r विवक्षितः⁸ । तदा⁹ तां तां¹⁰ हेतुप्रत्ययसामग्रीं¹¹ प्राप्य सम्भवः
 M3r प्रतीत्य समुत्पाद इति वीप्सासम्बन्धः¹² क्रियते¹³ । अथ¹⁴ विशेष-
 परामर्शः¹⁵ । तदा चक्षुः प्राप्य¹⁶ रूपाणि चेति न¹⁷ वीप्सायाः¹⁸ 5
 सम्बन्ध इति । एवं तावद् अनुवादाकौशलम्¹⁹ आचार्यस्य ॥
 K3v §9. एतच्चायुक्तं²⁰ चक्षुः²¹ प्रतीत्य रूपाणि चोत्पद्यते चक्षुर्विज्ञा-
 नम्²² इत्यत्रोभयार्थाभिसम्बन्धासम्भवात्²³ ॥

¹ A, E, H, I: tenedānī ² H: saṃbhava; I: sabhavaḥ ³ P: Ø; A, E, H, I, K, L: ityedam ⁴ P: Ø; C, M: vyatpādi | tena; G: vyatpādi || tena; J: vyatpyaditena, vertical line above *te*; N: vyatpādite | na; ⁵ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °samupādaśabdana; M: pratyasamutpāda° ⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ya; D: padi; N: p(?)adi ⁷ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): °śo; P, Q: °šo; A-E, G, H, J-N: °šo; F: nina...šo; I: °vipa-dārthapārāmaršo ⁸ A-M: vivarjitas; N: vivarjjitas; Tib: brjod par 'dod pa; em. by LVP (silently) ⁹ P: Ø; C, G, J, M, N: tadās ¹⁰ P: Ø; A, E, H, I, K, L: tāṃ to; F: tāṃ tī; G: tāṃ tā ¹¹ P: Ø; A, C, E-N: °grī; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² A: tipsā°; C, E-L, N: vip°; M: vipsā-sam=andhaḥ; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ Q: kri///; A: triyate; I: kriye-teḥ; J: krīyate ¹⁴ Q: Ø; F: artha ¹⁵ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): °śaḥ; P: °śas; Q: ///parāmarśas; A, B, C, E-N: °śas; D: °ma-rśaṃs ¹⁶ Tib: brten nas (pratītya) ÷ prāpya ¹⁷ A: ta ¹⁸ A, E, K, L: vip°; F: vīptāyā; H, I: vipsāyā ¹⁹ P: °nu° (the preceding *akṣara* is damaged); A, E: °kauśam; D: enu°; H, I: °kausam; N: °kośalam ²⁰ P: Ø; A-C, E, G, H, J-N: etad vāyukta kiṃ ca ayuktaṃ etat; D: eted vāmuktaṃ kiṃ ca ayuktaṃ et; F: yatad vāyukta kiṃ ca ayuktaṃ etata; I: etad vāyukta kiṃ cakṣu ayuktaṃ etat (most of the manuscripts place a *daṇḍa* after *vāyukta[m]*); PsPL: etad vā [a]yuktaṃ, kiṃ ca, ayuktaṃ etat; Tib: de yang mi rung ste. See Translation note.

PsP_L 9 इति¹ यदुक्तं दूषणं तदपि नोपपद्यते। किं कारणम्²। कथमसम्भव³ H3v
इति युक्त्यनुपादानेन⁴ प्रतिज्ञामात्रत्वात्⁵ ॥

§10. अथायम् अभिप्रायः⁶ स्यात्⁷ – अरूपिबाद्⁸ विज्ञानस्य चक्षुषा B3v D2v
प्राप्तिर्⁹ नास्ति¹⁰ रूपिणामेव तत्प्राप्तिदर्शनाद्¹¹ इत्य्¹² एतद्¹³ अपि

²¹ F, K: cakṣu ²² P: Ø; A, C, E, F, H-J, L, N: cakṣuvi°; D: °nem

²³ Em: atrobhayārthābhisambandhāsambhavāt. P: .(obh)āyārthābhisambandhā(s)ā+bhā(vād) (the first akṣara is damaged); Q: atrobhayāthābhisambandhāsambhavād; A, E, I, L: atrobhayārthābhisambandhāsataṣvād; B: atrāhayārthābhisambandhāsambhavād; C, J, M: atrāhayārthābhisambhavād; D: atrā | bhayārthābhisambandhāsambhavād; F, K: atrobhayārthābhisambandhāsataṣvād; G: atrāhayāthābhisambhavād; H: atrobhayārthābhisambandhvāṣataṣvād; N: as C, °sambhavād; PsP_L: atrārthadvayāsambhavāt. LVP (PsP_L 8, n. 7) records Paris (= M) and Calcutta (= N) as attesting *atrāha yārthābhisambhavād* but misreads Cambridge (= L) as *atrāha yārthābhisambandhād*. Tib: 'di la don gnyi ga med pa'i phyir.

¹ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): ceti/vati/veti not included. P: ⊗, the lower parts of two akṣaras are visible after *iti* (the reading *iti* is uncertain due to damage) before serious damage to the leaf begins. The remains of the akṣaras could indicate a c/v and a t, and there is a vertical line prior to the t suggesting *tī*; Q: iti ceti; A, E, F, I, K, L: iti vati; B-D, G, J, M, N: iti veti; H: iti cati; PsP Tib: n.e. ceti/vati/veti.

² G: kāraṇa ³ P: ⊗; A-C, E, F, H-L, N: katham anava tetprāpte saṃbhava; D: katham anameva tetprāpte saṃbhava; G: katham anava tetprāpte sabhava; M: katham anava tetprāpte saṃbhava; conj. by LVP: katham an[enai]va tatprāpte[h] saṃbhava; Tib: ji ltar med. See Translation note. ⁴ Q: yu///; B, J, N: yuktyunu°; C: puktyunu°; D: yuktyenu°; A, E, H, I: yuktyanu°; F: yuktatyanu°; G: yuṣtyanu°; K: yuktyanu°; M: yuktyanupā° ⁵ Q: ///jñāmātratvāt ⁶ F: abhipraya

⁷ H: syāth ⁸ A, E, F, H, L: anupitvād; K: anūpitvād ⁹ I: prāpti

¹⁰ D: nāsthi ¹¹ P: ṭat*(pr)ā[1]°; A-C, E-N: tatprāpta°; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² P: t(y) (the preceding akṣara is damaged); D: it ¹³ P:

F3r न¹ युक्तम्¹ प्राप्तफलो² ऽयं³ भिक्षुरित्य⁴ अपि⁴ प्राप्त्यभ्युपगमात्⁵ ॥

§11. प्राप्यशब्दस्य⁶ चापेक्ष्यशब्दपर्यायत्वात्⁷ । प्राप्यार्थस्यैव⁸ आचा-

E3r C4r र्यनागार्जुनेन⁹ प्रतीत्यशब्दस्य¹⁰

(et)ā[1]; A, C, E-N: adād; B: atad; em. by LVP (silently)

¹ A, E, H, I: na yu ² P: Ø; E, H, I, L: prāptya° ³ A: ya; I: om.

⁴ Em. by LVP (silently): atrāpi; LVP's emendation ostensibly based on Tib which attests 'dir (G, N, P) and 'di la (C, D). Tib: n.e. api.

⁵ A, E, F, H, L: prāptyatyupagamāta; B-D, J, M, N: prāptyatyupagamāt; G: prāptyutyupatamāt; K, I: °māta; em. by LVP (silently) ⁶ D:

prāptośabdasya ⁷ I: capekṣa°; A, B, E, F, J-L: capekṣya°; C, G, M: capakṣya°; H: capekṣe°; N: capekṣyaśabdasyacapekṣyaparyāyatvāt; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ Q: prāptyarthasya caiva; D: prāpppyarthasyaiva; A, E, H: prāpyārthasyeva; I: prāpyārthasyava; em. by LVP:

prāptyarthasyaiva. See Translation note. Tib: phrad nas zhes bya ba'i sgra yang ltos nas zhes bya ba'i sgra'i rnam grangs yin pa'i phyir

dang | rten cing 'brel par zhes bya ba'i sgra ni | ... zhes slob dpon klu sgrub kyis kyang phrad nas zhes bya ba'i don nyid du zhal gyis bzhes

pa'i phyir ro ||. LVP (PsPL 9, n. 2) reconstructs the Skt of Tib's *phrad nas zhes bya ba don nyid du as prāpyetyarthasya eva* but the

translators have on occasion in this section taken the liberty of adding *zhes bya ba* for the sake of clarity; cf., e.g., earlier on in this same

sentence where *prāpyaśabdasya* has been translated as *phrad nas zhes bya ba'i sgra* and *apekṣyaśabda°* has been translated as *ltos nas zhes*

bya ba'i sgra; cf. also the following paragraph's *pratītyasamutpādaśabdayoḥ*, which has been translated as *rten cing 'brel par zhes bya*

ba dang 'byung ba zhes bya ba'i sgra gnyis. ⁹ B-N: ācāryāryanāgārjunainaṃ; A: ācāryāryanāgārjunenaṃ; em. by LVP (silently): ācāryāryanāgārjunena; Tib: slob dpon klu sgrub kyis kyang. ¹⁰ A:

pratitya°; H: pratīta°

तत्¹ तत्² प्राप्य³ यद्⁴ उत्पन्नं⁵ नोत्पन्नं⁶ तत्⁷ स्वभावतः⁸ ।

Q2v

इत्⁹ अभ्युपगमाद्⁹ दूषणम्¹⁰ अपि नोपपद्यत¹¹ इत्यपरे¹² ॥

§12. यच्¹³ चापि स्वमतं¹³ व्यवस्थापितम्¹⁴

किं तर्हि¹⁵ । अस्मिन् सतीदं¹⁶ भवत्य्¹⁷ अस्योत्पादाद्¹⁸ इदम्¹⁹

J4r l4v

उत्पद्यत²⁰ इतीदम्प्रत्ययतार्थः²¹ प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादार्थः²²

PsP_L 10 इति तदपि नोपपद्यते । प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादशब्दयोः²³ प्रत्येकम्²⁴ अर्थ-

G4r

विशेषानभिधानात्²⁵ तद्व्युत्पादस्य²⁶ च विवक्षितत्वात्²⁷ ॥

N4r

¹ M: ta ² Q: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ta; M: hat ³ Q: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: pya; C: pāpya ⁴ Q: Ø; N: yad yad ⁵ Q: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: utpanna ⁶ Q: ///tpannan; A-C, E-N: om.; conj. by LVP: [notpan-nam]. The verse-half (= YṢ 19ab) is repeated in §13. ⁷ Q: tat tat; D: tet ⁸ D: svābhāvat ⁹ C, M: atyupagapagamād; D: atyupamāt; F: atyupa°; G: utyupagapagasād; I: ebhyupa° ¹⁰ H: dūṣaṇam; I: dūṣaṇam; M: duṣ°; conj. by LVP: [tato] dūṣaṇam; Tib: des na skyon ¹¹ A, E, F, K, L: nāpapadyata; C, G, J, M: papadyate; H: nāpapayata; N: padyate; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² F: ityepare ¹³ N: svematam ¹⁴ I: vevasthāpitam ¹⁵ A, C-N: tarjy; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁶ A, B, E, F, H-L: saṃtīdam; C, G, M, N: santi; F: saṃtīdam; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁷ D: bhevaṭi ¹⁸ P: (a)+(y)+(t)°; Q: asyaivotpādād; A, E, H, L: asyet°; F, K: asyat°; N: asyotpādād; Tib: 'di skyes pa'i phyir ¹⁹ P: [2](m); A-C, E, F-N: im; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ A, E, H: upadyata; I: upayeta ²¹ A: itidampratyaya°; B, D: °tārtham; C, G, J, M, N: °tārtham; E, F, H, I, K, L: °tārtha; em. by LVP (silently) ²² E, H, I: °tham ²³ D: °śabdaryāḥ ²⁴ C, G, J, M, N: pratyakam ²⁵ A-C, E-N: °viśeṣānavidhānāt; D: viśeṣānāmvadhānāt; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: tadyu°; M: tatmutpādasya ²⁷ Q: vivakṣi///; C, G, J, M, N: vivarjitatvāt; D: vivarj(?)itatvāt; em. by LVP: vivakṣitatvāt. LVP (PsP_L 10, n. 1) records, "Mss. *vivarjitatvāt*," but Cambridge (= L) clearly reads *vivakṣitatvāt*; Tib: *brjod par 'dod*

§13. अथापि¹ रूढिशब्दं² प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादशब्दम्³ अभ्युपेत्यारण्ये-
तिलकादिवद्⁴ एवम्⁵ उच्यते। तदपि नोपपन्नम्⁶। अवयवार्थानु-
गमस्यैव⁷ प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादशब्दस्याचार्येण⁸

L3v

pa'i phyir. De Jong (1978: 29) argues: “In spite of T read as Mss. and R. Candrakīrti accuses Bhāvaviveka of not having analysed the expression *pratītyasamutpāda*.” Ms D’s (= de Jong’s ms R’s) *j* of *vi-varjitatvāt* is, however, somewhat strangely formed, unlike the more typical *j* found, e.g., in *jāti*, *jarā*, etc., of D’s fol. 3r, line 2. Given that *j* and *kṣa* are often confused in Nepalese-script mss, D’s *j* of *vivarjitatvāt* could be the mangled remains of a *kṣa*, to which a superscribed *r* has been added. Although ms J recorded *vivarjitatvāt*, ms L, also descended from ms λ, read and copied *vivaḥṣitatvāt*, as did ms B which descends, together with ms λ, from ms κ. I think it can further be assumed that Candrakīrti asserts that an analysis was intended by Bhāvaviveka because Bhāvaviveka commenced his discussion of the compound *pratītyasamutpāda* with the presentation of two different analyses of the compound.

¹ Q: Ø ² Q: ///dhi°; D: ruti°; I: rūṇḍhi° ³ H: °śabdayom; I: pratī-
samupādāśabdam ⁴ A, E, L: atyupetyāraṇyetitisakādivad; B:
abhyupetyāraṇyetitilakādivad; C, M: apyupetyārathetitilakādivad; D:
atyupetyāraṇyetitilekādivad; F, K: atyūpetyāraṇyetititsakādivad; G:
apyayetyārathetitilakādivad; H: atyuyetyāraṇyetitisakādivad; I: atyu-
tyāraṇyotitisakādivad; J, N: apyupetyāraṇyetitilakādivad; em. by LVP
(silently) ⁵ Q: *tta* in the upper margin and an insertion-point ‘x’
after the *aḥsara va* of °āraṇyetilakādivad appear to indicate the read-
ing *tad evaṃ*; B: *eyam*; Tib: *de skad du* (n.e. *tad*) ⁶ A: *nāpāpannem*;
C, D, E, G-J, L, M: *nopāpannem*; F, K: *nopapattē*; N: *nopāpannem*;
em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ A, B, E, H-J, L, N: °*gatasyaiva*; C, G, M:
avayavārthānagatasyaiva; D: *evayavārthānugatasyaiva*; F: *avaya-
vārthāmūgatasyaiva*; K: *avayavārthāmūgatasyaiva*; PsP_L: *avayavār-
thānugatasyaiva* ⁸ P: *pratītyasamutpādasyā°*; A, E, H, K, L: *pratī-
tyasamutpādasyācāryaṇa*; B-D, F, G, J, N: *pratītyasamutpādasyā°*; I:
pratītyasamutpādasyācārjyena; M: *pratītyasamutpādasyāvāryeṇa*;

तत् तत्¹ प्राप्य यद्² उत्पन्नं नोत्पन्नं³ तत् स्वभावतः।

इत्⁴ अभ्युपगमात् ॥

§14. अथ⁵

अस्मिन्⁶ सतीदं⁷ भवति⁸ ह्रस्वे⁹ दीर्घं¹⁰ यथा सति।

5 इति¹¹ व्याख्यायमानेन¹² ननु¹³ तद् एवाभ्युपगतं¹⁴ भवति¹⁵ ह्रस्वं¹⁶ K4r A3v
 प्रतीत्य¹⁷ ह्रस्वं¹⁸ प्राप्य¹⁹ ह्रस्वम्²⁰ अपेक्ष्य²¹ दीर्घं²² भवतीति।
 ततश्च²³ यदेव²⁴ दूष्यते²⁵ तद् एवाभ्युपगम्यत इति न युज्यते इत्²⁶ M3v H4r

PsP_L: pratīyasamutpādasya ācāryeṇa; Tib: rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba'i sgra ni slob dpon

¹ A, I: tan ² I: d ³ A: om. ⁴ A, D, E, F, H, L: etyupa°; B, M: atyupa°; K: ebhyupa°; N: abhyupamāt; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ Q: n.e. atha; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: atho; Tib: ci ste ⁶ P: asmina; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: smim ⁷ A: satidam; E: satīdam; F: satīdam; H: sayīmdan; I: samīdan ⁸ A, E: ntavati; D, F: bhavatī; H, I: tavati ⁹ D: sva ¹⁰ G, I: dīrga ¹¹ A: i; G: ti ¹² P: khyāyamānena, vyā appears to have been erased ¹³ P: tu; A-E, G-N: nutu; F: tūtu; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: ci ste ... zhes bya bas 'chad par byed pas ni thung ngu dang phrad cing thung ngu la brten te | thung ngu la ltos nas ring por'gyur ro zhes de nyid khas blangs par 'gyur ro ¹⁴ F, M: evātyupa°; I: evaḥbhyu° ¹⁵ A, E, H, I: bhavatā; F, K: bhavatī; L: bhavatī(?) ¹⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om. ¹⁷ Q: pra///; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om.; N: pratībya ¹⁸ Q: Ø ¹⁹ Q: Ø; D: prāpye; C, G, M: repeat hrasvaṃ prāpya; Tib: thung ngu dang phrad cing thung ngu la brten (reverses hrasvaṃ pratītya hrasvaṃ prāpya) ²⁰ Q: ///m ²¹ A, E, F, I, K: epekṣya; H: epyakṣya; L: epekṣyaṃ ²² A, C, E-N: dīrga; em. by LVP (silently) ²³ Tib: n.e. ca ²⁴ Tib: n.e. eva ²⁵ D, M: evātyu°; F: evotyū°; I: evābhapagameta; N: °gamyā

अलं¹ प्रसङ्गेन² ॥

§15. तदेवं³ हेतुप्रत्ययापेक्षं⁴ भावानाम्⁵ उत्पादं⁶ परिदीपयता भग-
 B4r वता⁷ अहेबेकहेतुविषमहेतुसम्भूतत्वं⁸ स्वपरोभयकृतत्वं⁹ च¹⁰ भा-
 वानां¹¹ निषिद्धं भवति¹² । तन्निषेधाच्च¹³ च¹⁴ सांवृतानां¹⁵ पदार्थानां¹⁶
 I5r C4v यथावस्थितं¹⁷ सांवृतं¹⁸ स्वरूपम् उद्भावितं¹⁹ भवति । स²⁰ एवेदानीं²¹ 5
 सांवृतः²² प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादः स्वभावेनानुत्पन्नत्वाद् आर्यज्ञानापेक्षया²³ PsP_L 11
 नास्मिन्²⁴ निरोधो²⁵ विद्यते यावन्²⁶ नास्मिन्²⁷ निर्गमो²⁸ विद्यत²⁹

¹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: anam ² I: prasargena ³ Tib: de'i phyir de ltar na 'dir ÷ tad evam ⁴ A, E, H, I, K: °āpekṣyam; C, M: hetupāpa-kṣam; G: hetupāyakṣam ⁵ A, H: bho° ⁶ A: utpodam ⁷ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: bhagavetā ⁸ G: ahetvekehetu°; H: °viṣamahetusabhū°; J: °viṣamehetu°; Tib: rgyu med pa nyid dang | rgyu gcig pu nyid dang | mi mthun pa'i rgyu las byung ba nyid ⁹ A: svaparobhaya-kṛmatve; B, C, E, G-N: °kṛtatve; D: kṛtetvam; F: svaparābhayakṛtatve; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ A-N: va; em. by LVP (silently) ¹¹ Q: bhāvānā; E: bhāvātā; A, F, H, I, K, L: bhāvānā ¹² A, E, H, I, K, L: bhevati ¹³ A, E, F, H, K, L: °ṣedhā; I: tantīṣedhā ¹⁴ A, C-I, L-N: va; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁵ C, J, M, N: sāvr°; G, I: sāvr̥tānā ¹⁶ G, H, I: °nā ¹⁷ Q: yath///; F: yathāvasvitam ¹⁸ Q: Ø ¹⁹ A, E, L: uhāvitam; F: uhārvitam; H: umuhāvitam; M: utbhā° ²⁰ I: su ²¹ C, J: eva°; D: evedānām; A, E, I: evedānī; G, M: evadānī; N: evadānīn ²² I: savṛtaḥ; A-C, E-H, J-M: samvṛtaḥ; D: sāmvr̥teḥ; N: samvṛtaḥ; em. by LVP (silently) ²³ A, E, K, L: ārdya°; H: ārdyajñānāpyekṣayā; I: ārdyajñātāpekṣayā ²⁴ D: nosmin; M: nāsmi ²⁵ M: rodho ²⁶ C, F, G, J-M: yāva; N: om.; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁷ D: nosmin; K, L: nāsmi; N: om. ²⁸ D, K: nirgamā; N: om. ²⁹ N: om.

इत्¹ अनिरोधादिभिर्² अष्टभिर्³ विशेषणैर्⁴ विशिष्यते⁵ । यथा⁶ च⁷ निरोधादयो⁸ न सन्ति प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादस्य⁹ । तथा सकलेन¹⁰ शास्त्रेण¹¹ प्रतिपादयिष्यति¹² । अनन्तविशेषणसम्भवे¹³ ऽपि¹⁴ प्रती-
त्यसमुत्पादस्याष्टानाम्¹⁵ एवोपादानम्¹⁶ एषां¹⁷ प्राधान्येन¹⁸ विवादा-
5 ङ्गभूतत्वात्¹⁹ ॥

J4v

G4v P3r

F3v

§16. यथावस्थितप्रतीत्यसमुत्पाददर्शने¹⁹ च²⁰ सत्यार्याणाम्²¹ अभि-
धानाभिधेयादिलक्षणस्य²² प्रपञ्चस्य²³ सर्वथोपरमात्²⁴ प्रपञ्चानाम्²⁵

¹ P: anni°; A, C-E, G, J-L, N: anirodhādibhin; B: anirodhādibhirn; F: enirodhādibhin; H: aniradhedibhin; I: anīro°; M: a=irodhādibhin; em. by LVP (silently) ² A, C, E-L: aṣṭabhi; M: aṣṭābhi ³ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °ṣaṇai ⁴ Q: vviśeṣyate ⁵ Tib inserts the word explanation block that appeared earlier in Skt (§5) immediately before this sentence beginning with *yathā ca*. ⁶ A-N: va; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: n.e. ca ⁷ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °dayā ⁸ A, E, F, J, H, K, L, N: pratīta°; I: pratita° ⁹ A-C, E-N: sakale; em. by LVP (silently) of *sakale* to *sakala*, interpreted as the initial element of the compound *sakalaśāstreṇa* ¹⁰ Q: śāstre, with a small 'x' inserted between *stre* and the next *akṣara pra*; a *ṇa akṣara* is, however, not written in the margin ¹¹ Q: pratipādayiṣ///; D: pratipratipādayiṣyati ¹² Q: ///ṇa-sambhaye; A-C, E-M: °viśeṣeṇa°; D: ananteviśeṣeṇa°; N: °viśe-ṣoṇa°; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ A, E, F, I, K, L: yi; H: ya ¹⁴ B: °āṣṭānās; F, H: °āṣṭānom; N: °āṣṭonām ¹⁵ A-N: evā°; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁶ Tib: di dag kho na ÷ eṣām ¹⁷ A: prathānana; I: pradhānyana ¹⁸ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: vivādāgabdhū°; C, G, M: virādāṅga°; N: virādānam eṣām pradhānyona vicādāmgabhūtātīvāta; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁹ P: °pratīsamutpāda°; Q: °samutpādarśane; A, E, F, I, K, L: °samutpādarśanena; B, C, G, J, M, N: °samutpādarśanena; H: yathāpāsthi...nena; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ A-C, E-N: om.; PsP_L: om.; Tib: n.e. ²¹ Q: abhidhānābhidheyalakṣaṇasya; A-C, E-N: om. abhidhāna; PsP_L: om. abhidhāna; Tib: brjod bya dang rjod

E3v उपशमो ऽस्मिन्निति स एव प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादः¹ प्रपञ्चोपशम²
 N4v इत्युच्यते। चित्तचैत्तानां³ च⁴ तस्मिन्⁵ अप्रवृत्तौ⁶ ज्ञानज्ञेयव्यवहार-
 निवृत्त्या⁷ जातिजरामरणादिनिवशेषोपद्रवरहितत्वाच्⁸ छिवः⁹।
 K4v L4r यथाभिहितविशेषणस्य¹⁰ प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादस्य¹¹ देशनाक्रियया ईप्सि-
 ततमत्वात्¹² कर्मणा निर्देशः¹³ ॥

5

H4v I5v

§17. अनिरोधमनुत्पादमनुच्छेदम् अशाश्वतम्।

byed dang | mtshan nyid dang mtshon bya la sogs pa. See Translation note. ²² N: prapañca; Tib: spros pa rnam; ÷ prapañcasya ²³ E, H, I: °paramātā; M: °thopamāt ²⁴ A: prapañconām; B, C, E, F, H, J, L-N: prapañcovām; G, I: prapañcāvām; K: prapañcocām; em. by LVP (silently)

¹ N: pratīsamutpādaṃ ² A, E, F, G, I, K, L: prapañcā°; H: prapañcā° ³ Q: °caittān///; A-M: °caityānām; N: °caityānāñ; em. by LVP (silently) ⁴ Q: Ø; A: cetī; B, C, E-N: ce; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ Q: Ø; E, F, H, I, L: tasmint; K: tasmitt ⁶ Q: Ø; J: apravṛtto ⁷ A: °jñeyavyavahāraṇivṛtte; B, F, K: °jñayavyavahāraṇivṛtye; C, G, J: °jñayavyavahāraṇivṛtyo; D: °jñayavyavahāraṇivṛtyā; E, H: °jñeyavyavahāraṇivṛtye; I: °jñeyevavahāraṇivṛttau; L: °jñayavyavahāraṇivṛtye; M: °tto; N: °nivṛtyo; em. by LVP (silently): °nivṛttau; Tib: shes pa dang shes bya'i tha snyad log pa'i sgo nas ⁸ A: °rahitotyā; E, I, K: °rahito | tyā; F: °ādininavaśeṣopudravarahitotvāc; G: °ādinivaravaśeṣo°; H: °rahitām | tyā; L: °rahitotyā; N: °rahitattvon; Tib adds *na ba* after its translation for *jarā* ⁹ A: chivavaṇa; C, G, J, M: chiva; E, F, K, L: chivaṇa; H: chivaṇam; I: chivana ¹⁰ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °viśeṣaṇayā; D: yathābhīhite° ¹¹ F: om. pratīyasamutpāda-sya deśanākrīyayā īpsitatamatvāt karmaṇā nirdeśaḥ || anirodham anutpādam anucchedam aśāśvatam | anekārtham anānārtham anāga-mam anirgamam || yaḥ; N: °samupā ¹² A, C-E, G, H, J-N: ipsi°; I: ipsitasatvāt; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ G: nideśaḥ

अनेकार्थम् अनानार्थम्¹ अनागमम् अनिर्गमम्² ॥

यः प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादं³ प्रपञ्चोपशमं⁴ शिवम्⁵ ।

देशयामास⁶ सम्बुद्धस् तं⁷ वन्दे⁸

PsP_L 12 इति¹⁰ ॥

5 यथोपवर्णितप्रतीत्यसमुत्पादावगमाच्च¹¹ च¹² तथागतस्यैवैकस्या-
विपरीतार्थवादिब¹³ पश्यन् सर्वपरप्रवादांश् च बालप्रलापान्¹⁴

B4v A4r C5r
D3r
M4r

¹ M: anārtham ² N: arggamam ³ M, N: °da ⁴ P: prapa-
ñcopasamam; Q: copasamam; A: prayavopasama; E: prayavopa°; F:
prapañcā°; G: prayamco°; H, L: prayaco°; I: prayacopasama; K:
prapaco° ⁵ Q: Ø ⁶ Q: ///sa; A, E, H, I, K, L: deśayāsa; F:
daśayāsa; N: deśayāmā ⁷ E, F, H, I, K, L: sambuddham ⁸ A, E, I:
tum ⁹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: samvamdha; em. by LVP (silently):
deśayāmāsa sambuddhas tam vande vadatām varam, obviously on the
basis of Tib's spros pa nyer zhi zhi bstan pa || rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas
smra rnams kyi || dam pa de la phag 'tshal lo ||. *vadatām varam*
appears in the Skt mss only at the end of the following sentence; it is
also attested there in Tib. The Tibetan translators included *smra*
rnams kyi || *dam pa* here in the verse because, unlike in Skt, where
vadatām varam follows *vande*, *smra rnams kyi* || *dam pa* appears
before *phyag 'tshal lo*. Skt *vadatām varam* merely completes the
quotation; the Tib verse could hardly have been left without the
phrase preceding *phyag 'tshal lo*. ¹⁰ PsP_L: om. ¹¹ Q: yathopavar-
ṇina°; B: yathopavanīta°; C, G, J, M, N: yathopavanīta°; I: °prāṭi-
tyasamutpādāgamāc ¹² D: vate; Tib: n.e. ca ¹³ A, E, F, H, K, L:
tathāgatasyevai...ditva; D: tathāgatasmaivaikasyāpiparī°; C, G, J, M:
°voditva; I: °ditvā; N: °tva; em by LVP (silently) ¹⁴ F: °pon; N:
pralopān

इवावेत्यातीव¹ प्रसादानुगत² आचार्यो भूयो भगवन्तं विशेषयति³ –
वदतां⁴ वरम्॥

इति॥

G5r J5r §18. अत्र⁵ च⁶ निरोधस्य⁷ पूर्व⁸ प्रतिषेध⁹ उत्पादननिरोधयोः¹⁰ पौर्वा-
पर्यव्यवस्थायाः¹¹ सिद्धिभावं¹² द्योतयितुम्¹³ । वक्ष्यति¹⁴ हि –

5

पूर्व¹⁵ जातिर्¹⁶ यदि भवेज्¹⁷ जरामरणम्¹⁸ उत्तरम्¹⁹ ।
निर्जरामरणा जातिर्²⁰ भवेज्²¹ जायेत²² चामृतः²³ ॥

¹ A, E, H, I, K, L: imāvityā°; B, J, N: imāvetyā°; C, G, M imāvatyā°; F: isāvityā°; em by LVP (silently) ² D: pramā°; F K: prāsā° ³ I: viṣayeti ⁴ A, E, F, H, K, L: varatām; C, G, M: varatām; D: vadatom; I: varatās ⁵ I: atta ⁶ A, E, F, H, I, L: va; Tib: n.e. ca ⁷ F: nito-dhasya; I: nirādhasya ⁸ F: pūrva ⁹ I: pratiṣpedha ¹⁰ I: utpādati-ro° ¹¹ Q: pau///h; C, G, J, M: paurvāparyavasthāyāḥ; D: yaurvāparyavya°; N: paurvvāparyavasthāyāḥ; em. by LVP (silently): paurvāparyavasthāyāḥ, apparently overlooking Cambridge's (= ms L's) paurvāparyavyavasthāyāḥ; Tib: rnam par gzhaḡ pa ¹² A, F: siddhābhāva; G: siddhā°; E, H, I, K, L: °va; Tib: n.e. siddhi (snga phyi'i rnam par gzhaḡ pa med par bstan pa'i phyir ÷ paurvāparyavyavasthāyāḥ siddhyabhāvaṃ dyotayitum) ¹³ F: jyo°; H: dyotata itum; I: dyetayitum ¹⁴ P: ∅; Q: vakṣati; C, G, M: vati; D: vivakṣyati ¹⁵ A-N: pūrva; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁶ F: tatir; K: tātir ¹⁷ D: hevaj; M: ≈avej ¹⁸ A, E, H, I, K, L: jārā°; D: jarāmeraṇam ¹⁹ P: untaraṃ; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: uttamaṃ; C, G, J, M, N: om.; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ D: jotir; A, E, F, H, I, L, M: jati ²¹ P: bhava ²² Q: jāyet; D: jāyate; H: jayata; N: jāyeka ²³ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: vāmṛta-vā; B, D, G, J, M, N: vāmṛta; em. by LVP

इति। तस्मान् नाय¹ नियमो² यत् पूर्वम् उत्पादेन³ भवितव्यं⁴ पश्चान्⁵
निरोधेनेति⁶ ॥

§19. इदानीम्⁷ अनिरोधादिविशिष्टप्रतीत्यसमुत्पादप्रतिषिपादयिष-
योत्पादप्रतिषेधेन⁸ निरोधादिप्रतिषेधसौकर्यं⁹ मन्यमान¹⁰ आचार्यः Q3r
5 प्रथमम् एवोत्पादप्रतिषेधम्¹¹ आरभते¹² । उत्पादो हि परैः¹³ परि-
कल्प्यमानः¹⁵ स्वतो वा¹⁶ परिकल्प्येत¹⁷ परत उभयतो¹⁹ ऽहेतुतो²⁰ l6r

¹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: tāyaṃ ² A: ti; E, H, I: ni ³ D: utpādeva; I: utpādyana ⁴ A: bhavitavitavya; E, F, H, I, K, L: °vya ⁵ A-C, E-L, N: yaścān ⁶ P: virodheneti; F: nironati, I: nirodhyena iti; K, L: °nati ⁷ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: idānim; M: idānīma ⁸ A, E: °viśiṣṭepra...prativipādapiṣayā || ut°; B: °viśiṣṭepra...pādampativipādapiṣayā || ut°; C, G, J, L-N: °viśiṣṭepra...prativipādapiṣayā || ut°; D: °prativipādapiṣayā || ut°; F: °viśiṣṭepra...prativivādayisa (space) ut°; H: °viśiṣṭepra...prativipādapiṣayā || utpādapratīṣedhamna; I: viśiṣṭepratitya-samutpādapiṣayā || utpāda pratīṣyedhena; K: °viśiṣṭepra...prativivādayisa || ut°; em. by LVP (silently) ⁹ P: °(p).ṭiṣe(dh).°; A-C, E, H, L: °pratiṣedhesaukaryam; F: nirodhānipratīṣedhesaukaryam; G, M: °pratiṣedhesaukaryā; N: as A, °karyam; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ P: [1]nyā°; D: yanya° ¹¹ P: Ø; A, D, E, F, H, I, K, L: evāt°; Tib: n.e. eva ¹² H: ārabhyate ¹³ Tib: yang ¹⁴ D: paramḥ ¹⁵ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: parikalpāmānaḥ; C: parikalp(?)yamānaḥ; G: parikalpāmānaḥ; M: parikasyamānaḥ ¹⁶ D: vo ¹⁷ Q: parikalpita; A: parikalota; E, F, H, I, K: parikalpota; G: parikalpyata; M: parikalpeta; PsP_L: parikalpyeta; de Jong (1978: 29) emends to *parikalpyate* because PsP_L's following *parikalpyeta* (PsP_L 12.12) reads *parikalpyate* in D. The optative, however, is employed by Candrakīrti in other sentences with a similar structure, see, e.g., PsP_L 138.1-2 (cp. Tib P 52b8) and PsP_L 390.13-391.2. Only when the first alternative is taken up for discussion is the present passive employed; see PsP_L 391.2-3 and PsP_L 340.15-16. ¹⁸ A, E, H, I: para; C, D, G, J, N: parate; M: rate ¹⁹ Q: vobhayato vā (Q incorporates a *vā* after both

वा परिकल्प्येत¹ सर्वथा² च³ नोपपद्यत⁴ इति निश्चित्याह⁵ –

न स्वतो नापि परतो न⁶ द्वाभ्यां नाप्⁷ अहेतुतः⁸ ।

K5r H5r

उत्पन्ना जातु विद्यन्ते⁹ भावाः¹⁰ कचन¹¹ केचन¹² ॥ [MMK 1.1]

PsP_L 13

N5r §20. तत्र जाब् इति¹³ कदाचिद्¹⁴ इत्य् अर्थः¹⁵ । कचनशब्द¹⁶ आधा-
रवचनः¹⁷ कचिच्छब्दपर्यायः । केचनशब्द¹⁸ आधेयवचनः¹⁹ केचि- 5

parataḥ and *ubhayataḥ*); C, G, J, M, N: ubhayo ²⁰ C, E-N: 'rhatuto; em. by LVP (silently)

¹ Q: parikalpyet; A, E, H, I: parikalpāta; D: parikalpyate; M: parikalpeta; Tib: rtog; de Jong (1978: 29) accepts D's reading. ² A, E, H, I: savathā ³ Q: pi; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: va; Tib: n.e. ca ⁴ F, K: topa-padyate; I: °dyateḥ ⁵ B: niścītyetyāha; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: niścītyātyāha ⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: va ⁷ A, E, I: vāṣy; F, K: cāpy; H: cāṣy ⁸ C, G, M: ahetutar; D: ahetu ⁹ F, K: vidyate ¹⁰ P: bhā(v)ā+; Q: bhā/// ¹¹ P: (kv)ācanā; Q: Ø; A, E, H, I: kvarana; D: kvacena; M: kacata ¹² P: +e[2]; Q: Ø; A: ketvana ¹³ A, E, H, I: i ¹⁴ P: Ø; A: kadavid; E, I: kadāvid; C, G, J, N: kādāc; M: kādāv ¹⁵ P: +(th).(h); A, E, F, H, I, K, L: artha ¹⁶ D: kvacena° ¹⁷ P: Ø; D: °vacanā; G: °vacana ¹⁸ P: Ø; C, G, J, M, N: om.; F: kecata°. P's lacuna begins with and includes the *akṣara ra* in *ādhāravacanaḥ* and ends with, but does not include, the *akṣara yaḥ* in either *kvacicchabdaparyāyaḥ* or *kecicchabdaparyāyaḥ*. There is space in the lacuna for only 10 *akṣaras*, which could mean that P's scribe committed the same mistake that ms J's scribe did, i.e., he dropped *kecanaśabda ādheyavacanaḥ kecicchabdaparyāyaḥ*; alternatively, his eye may have jumped, probably while he was writing *ādhāravacanaḥ*, to the *vacanaḥ* belonging to *ādheyaavacanaḥ*. LVP places *kecanaśabda ādheyavacanaḥ kecicchabdaparyāyaḥ* in square brackets in his edition and supports his conjecture with reference to Tib and to the fact that *kecana* is glossed in the Tib of the ABh (cf. PsP_L 13.2 and n. 1); he appears to have overlooked that *kecanaśabda* and *ādhecavacanaḥ* (sic) are attested in Cambridge (= ms L). L's scribe, likely due to an eyeskip or

च्छब्दपर्यायः¹ । ततश्चैवं² सम्बन्धः³ – नैव⁴ स्वत⁵ उत्पन्ना⁶ जातु⁷
विद्यन्ते⁸ भावाः कचन⁹ केचन¹⁰ । एवं प्रतिज्ञात्रयम्¹¹ अपि योज्यम्॥

E4r C5v L4v
B5r

§21. ननु¹² च नैव¹³ स्वत उत्पन्ना इत्य् अवधार्यमाणे¹⁴ परत¹⁵
उत्पन्ना¹⁶ इत्यनिष्टं प्राप्नोति । न¹⁷ प्राप्नोति¹⁸ । प्रसज्यप्रतिषेधस्य¹⁹

F4r

5 विवक्षितत्वात्²⁰ परतो ऽप्य् उत्पादस्य²¹ प्रतिषेत्स्यमानत्वात्²² । यया²³
चोपपत्त्या²³ स्वत उत्पादो न सम्भवति²⁴ । सा

G5v

two, then wrote *kvacichabdaparyāyaḥ* (sic) as the final compound (he continued on with *tataś caivam*). ¹⁹ P: Ø, see previous note; A, E, H, I, L: ādheca°; C, G, J, M, N: om.; F, K: ādhecanacataḥ; conj. by LVP: ādheyavacanah, see previous note.

¹ P: Ø, the sole visible *akṣara yaḥ* might belong to the previous *kvacichabdaparyāyaḥ*; A, B, E, F, H, I, K, L: kvacichabda°; C, G, J, M, N: om.; conj. by LVP: kecicchabdaparyāyaḥ; see the previous two notes.

² Tib: n.e. ca ³ E, F, I, K, L: °dha ⁴ Tib: n.e. eva ⁵ P: Ø; D: śvata; F: sva ⁶ A: utpanā; F: uḥyaṃnā; K: utyaṃnā ⁷ P: (jā)[1]; A, C, E-L, N: tu; M: nu; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ A, E, H, I, K: vidyate ⁹ A, E, H, I, N: kvacane ¹⁰ N: cana ¹¹ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °tayam; D: pratijñātuyam ¹² D: nenu; F: tanu ¹³ A, F, H, I, K, L: neva; E: neca ¹⁴ P: avadhāryamāṇa; A-C, E-H, K, L-N: eva°; I: °dhārjyayamāṇe; J: °māṇe; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁵ M: para

¹⁶ D: utpanno ¹⁷ Q: Ø ¹⁸ Q: Ø ¹⁹ P: [5](ś)edhasya; Q: ///jya°; A, C, E, F, H, J-M: prapajya°; D, G: pravajya°; I: praparjya°; N: praśajya°; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ P: viva(kṣ).[2]; D: vivejitatvāt

²¹ P: Ø; A, E, F, I, K, L: °sye; C: utpyā(?)dasya; G: utpyādasya; H: °pādase ²² A, E, F, H, I, K, L: pratiṣatsya°; C, G, M: pratimedhatsya°; D: pratiṣaitsya°; J, N: pratiṣedhatsya°; em. by LVP (silently);

Tib: 'gog par 'gyur ²³ P: c(o)[3]; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: cāpapastyā; B: cā°; C: cāpe°; D: cāpayatyā; G: cāyepatyā; J, N: cāpapatyā; M: cāpe-tyā; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: n.e. ca ²⁴ A, E, F, I, K, L: sabhavati; H: cabhavati

A4v J5v

तस्माद्¹ धि तस्य² भवने³ न गुणो ऽस्ति कश्चिज् जातस्य जन्म⁴
पुनर् एव⁵ च नैव⁶ युक्तम्⁷ ॥

P3v इत्यादिनावसेया⁹ ॥PsP_L 14

§22. आचार्यबुद्धपालितस्¹⁰ बाह –

I6v M4v

न¹¹ स्वत उत्पद्यन्ते भावास् तदुत्पादवैयर्थ्याद्¹² अतिप्रसङ्ग-⁵
दोषाच्¹³ च । न¹⁴ हि¹⁵ स्वात्मना¹⁶ विद्यमानानां¹⁷ पदार्थानां¹⁸

¹ I: tasata ² P: Ø; D: tesya ³ A: bhavaine ⁴ P: Ø; D: jalpa ⁵ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ava; D: eve ⁶ H, M: va ⁷ P: (n).[1]; A-C, E-L, N: nava, M: na; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ A, B, E, F, H-L, N: yujyam; C, G, M: pujyam; D: pūjyam; em. by LVP (silently) ⁹ P: ityādinā 'vaśeyā; Q: ityādinā madhyakāvatārādīdvāreṇāvaseyā. *madhyakāvatārādīdvāreṇā* is written in Q's lower margin and is followed by the number '3', and an 'x' marking the point of insertion is placed after *ityādinā* (in line 3); A, E, H, L: ityādinā madhyamakāvatārādīdvāreṣāvameyā; B, F, K: ityādinā madhyamakāvatārādīdvāreṇāvameyā; C, J, M, N: ityādinā madhyamakāvatārādīdvāreṇāvameyā; D: ityādinā madhyamakāvatārādīdvāreṇovaseyā; G, I: ityādinā madhyamakāvatārādīdvāreṇāvameyā; Tib: la sogs pas dbu ma la 'jug pa la sogs pa'i sgo nas nges par bya'o; em. by LVP (silently): ityādinā madhyamakāvatārādīdvāreṇāvaseyā. See Translation note. ¹⁰ I: ācārjya°; K: ācāryā° ¹¹ H: u ¹² P: °vaiyathyāt; A, E, H, I, L: °vaivaryyāt; B: °vaiparyāt; C, J: °vaicaryāt; D: tadutpādaparyyāt; F, K, M: °vaivaryāt; G, N: °vaicaryyāt; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ Em. with LVP: °doṣāc. P: °doṣā, followed by lacuna; Q: a///; A-C, J, M, N: °doṣān; D-F, H, I, K, L: °doṣāt; G: astiprasaṅgadoṣān ¹⁴ Em. with LVP: ca. P, Q: Ø; A-N: om.; PsP Tib: dang; BP Tib: dang; PP Tib: dang ¹⁵ Q: Ø ¹⁶ Q: Ø ¹⁷ P: Ø; A: svātmane; B-N: °no; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁸ A, H, I: vidyamonānām ¹⁹ P: Ø; Q: om.; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om.; D: °ṇām

पुनरुत्पादे¹ प्रयोजनमस्ति। अथ सन्न अपि² जायेत³ न⁴ कदा-
चिन्⁵ न जायेत⁷ ॥

इति ॥

§23. अत्रैके⁸ दूषणम् आहुः⁹ –

5 तद् अयुक्तं¹⁰ हेतुदृष्टान्तानभिधानात्¹¹ परोक्तदोषपरिहाराच्च¹²
PsP_L 15 च¹³। प्रसङ्गवाक्यत्वाच्च¹⁴ च¹⁵ प्रकृतार्थविपर्ययेण¹⁶ विपरीत-

¹ F: °utpādi; K: °utpādi ² P: Ø; D: epi ³ P: Ø; C, G, I, J, M: jāya-
te; D: j̄yate; N: jāyaya ⁴ P: Ø; A, E, H, I, L: ta ⁵ F: kadācit;
N: kadocin ⁶ P: (n)a; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ta ⁷ A-N: jāya°; em. by
LVP (silently) ⁸ N: atreke ⁹ P: (ā)+(u)+; A: āngas; D: āhas
¹⁰ Q: uktam ayuktam; PsP Tib, PP Tib: de ni rigs pa ma yin te (= tad
ayuktam) ¹¹ A, E, H, I, L: °dṛṣṭāntātabhidhānāt; B: °dṛṣṭānābhi-
dhānāt; C, G, M, N: °dṛṣṭāntonabhidhānāt; F: °dṛṣṭāntātebhidhānāt;
K: dṛṣṭāntātātidhānāt; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² Em. with LVP: °pa-
rihārāc. P: paroktad(o)ṣāparihārāt (for *daṇḍa* placement in the mss,
see the following note); Q: °parihārāt; A, E, H, I, L: parāktadoṣāpari-
hārāt; B: °parihārāt; C, G, J, M, N: parakta...āt; D: paroktadāṣā...āt; F:
K: as A, °rāta. LVP notes that his mss read °hārāt and emends to
°hārāc ca (PsP_L 15, n. 6; see next note). LVP emends to *parokta*°
silently. ¹³ Em. with LVP: ca; P, Q: om.; A-N: om.; P and Q: hetu-
dṛṣṭāntānabhidhānāt | paroktadoṣāparihārāt | prasaṅgavākyatvāc ca
prakṛtārthaviparyayeṇa, etc. (see diplomatic edition for P's unclear
akṣaras). A-N with a double *daṇḍa* after *hetudṛṣṭāntānabhidhānāt*; D,
J, the L family and N additionally place a double *daṇḍa* after *para-*
oktadoṣāparihārāt while the rest, excepting G, place a single *daṇḍa*
after the compound. LVP (cf. PsP_L 14, n. 5) bases his emendation on
Tib. See Translation note and Appendix VII. ¹⁴ C: esaṅga°; G:
emlaṃtavākyaṃtvāc; M: esaṃga°; ¹⁵ Tib: n.e. ca. See Appendix
VII. ¹⁶ Q: °viparyeṇa; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °viparyaye, A, E, I, K
and L with a blank space after the compound with a line drawn over

साध्यतद्धर्मव्यक्तौ¹ परस्माद्² उत्पन्ना³ भावा⁴ जन्मसाफल्याज्⁵
जन्मनिरोधाच्⁶ चेति कृतान्तविरोधः⁷ स्यात्॥

इति⁸ ॥

it, indicating that one or two *akṣaras* are missing (F adds a dot); D: °viparyayaṇa; M: °viparyena

¹ P: °vyakto; A, E: °taddharmattye; B, J, N: °vyakto; C, G: viparīta-syadhyā...kto; F: viparītasādhātaddhamakko; H: °sādhayatarddharma-taye; I: viparita...dharmmakā(?); K: viparītasādhātaddharmakko; L: °taddharmakto; M: viparītasādhayatarddhamavyakto. Although LVP (PsP_L 15, n. 2) remarks that his mss attest “°vyakto, °vyaktā”, M and N read °vyakto while L reads °taddharmakto. He emends to °vyaktau (attested by Q and D) noting that Tib *mngon pas* would expect as equivalent *vyakteḥ*. LVP also conjectures *viparī[ārth]asādhayataddharma*° on the basis of Tib’s *bsgrub par bya ba dang | de’i chos bzlog pa’i don*, a conjecture I am hesitant to accept—even though the PP translation indicates that *artha* stood in PP Skt—given that an assumed loss of the *akṣara* parts *ā* and *rth* is difficult to explain and because one also finds, e.g., at PsP_L 38.12-39.1, the compound *viparītasādhyaśādhanavyaktivākyārthaḥ*. One also notes that the author of *LT does not appear to have read *artha* between *viparīta* and *sādhya*: *prasaṅgetyādi sāphalyād ityantam ekaḥ pakṣaḥ prasaṅgaviparyayaṇa viparītasādhyaśādhya vyakti[r] niṣpattiḥ* (cf. Yonezawa 2004: 121, 131 [fol. 1b6]). The appearance of *don* in PsP Tib is apparently the result of the translators having quoted directly from PP Tib. ² D: para-smāhaṃ; F: panaspād ³ A-F, H-N: utpanno; G: utpano; em. by LVP ⁴ D: hāvā ⁵ C, J: jatma°; M: janmasāhalyāt; N: °sāphatyāt ⁶ P: jañnavir(o)dhā[1]; Q: Ø; B: °nirādhāc; C: jav(?)manirodhā; D: janma-virādhā; G, J, M, N: °nirodhā; H: janmavirodhāc; L: jatma°; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ P: Ø; Q: °nirodha; C, G, J, M, N: °nirodha; D: °virādhāḥ; H: °virodha ⁸ P: Ø; PsP_L: om. iti; Tib: zhes

§24. सर्वम्¹ एतद्² दूषणम्³ अयुज्यमानम्⁴ एव⁵ वयं पश्यामः। कथं⁶ K5v H5v
 कृत्वा। तत्र यत् तावद्⁷ उक्तं⁸ हेतुदृष्टान्तानभिधानाद्⁹ इति¹⁰ तद्¹¹
 अयुक्तम्¹²। किं कारणम्¹³। यस्मात् परः¹⁴ स्वत उत्पत्तिम्¹⁵ अभ्युपग-
 च्छन्¹⁶ विद्यमानस्य¹⁷ पुनरुत्पादे¹⁸ प्रयोजनं¹⁹ पृच्छ्यते²⁰ – स्वत²¹ C6r
 इति विद्यमानं²² हेतुत्वेन²³ ब्रवीषि²⁴ तद्²⁵ एव²⁶ चोत्पद्यत²⁷ इति न
 च²⁸ विद्यमानस्य²⁹ पुनरुत्पत्तौ³⁰ प्रयोजनं³¹ पश्यामो³² ऽनवस्थां³³ च B5v G6r
 पश्यामः³⁴। न च³⁵ त्रयोत्पन्नस्य पुनरुत्पाद इष्यते³⁶। न चाप्य³⁷

¹ P: Ø; J: sarvem ² P: Ø; A, D-F, H, I, K, L: eta ³ G: apujya°
⁴ P: Ø; PsP_L: om. eva; Tib: n.e. eva ⁵ M: yatāvad ⁶ D: °dr̥ṣṭāntā-
 nāhidhānād ⁷ A: itida ⁸ I: uktaṃ ⁹ D: kāraṇa; N: gāraṇaṃ
¹⁰ Q: parataḥ ¹¹ A, D, E, H, L, M: atyu°; F: atyū°; I: atyupa-
 gachanaḥ ¹² A, C, E-H, J-N: vidyamānesya; Tib: n.e. vidyamānasya
 punarutpāde prayojanaṃ; em. by LVP (silently). See Translation note.
¹³ B, N: °utpāda ¹⁴ D: pramājanaṃ; N: om. prayojanaṃ pr̥cchyate |
 svata iti vidyamānaṃ hetutvena bravīṣi tad eva cotpadyata iti na ca
 vidyamānasya punarutpattau prayojanaṃ paśyāmo 'navasthāṃ ca
 paśyāmaḥ | na ca tvayotpannasya punarutpāda ¹⁵ P: pr̥cchate; A, C,
 G, M: pr̥chāte; I: v̥rchyate ¹⁶ F, K: svate ¹⁷ A-C, E-N om.; LVP:
 om. (PsP_L: svata iti hetutvena tad eva cotpadyata iti); Tib: bdag las
 zhes bya ba ni yod pa rgyu nyid dang de nyid skye'o zhes smras pa
 yin ¹⁸ C, G, J, M: hetvena ¹⁹ Q: bra///; A-M: bravīṣi; PsP_L: om.
²⁰ Q: Ø ²¹ Q: Ø ²² F: vacotpadyata ²³ D: cā ²⁴ D:
 vidyānasya ²⁵ Q: punaratpattau ²⁶ P: °na+; A, E, F, H, I, K, L:
 °na ²⁷ F, H: °ma ²⁸ Q: anavasthānaṃ ²⁹ P: [1].yāmāḥ; A, E, I,
 L: vaśyāmaḥ; G: °ma; H: vaśyāma; Tib adds yang (... zhing thug pa
 med par yang mthong ...) ³⁰ A, E, H, I: va; D: ce ³¹ M: ite; K:
 ipyate ³² Conj. by LVP: 'na[vasthā] ³³ A: vāpy; D: copy

N5v अनिष्ठेति¹ । तस्मान् निरुपपत्तिक² एव³ तव⁴ वादः⁵ स्वाभ्युपगम-
विरुद्धश्⁶ चेति⁷ ॥

D3v §25. किम् इयति⁸ चोदिते⁹ परो नाभ्युपैति¹⁰ यतो¹¹ हेतुदृष्टान्तोपादा-
L5r I7r J6r नसाफल्य¹² स्यात्¹³ । अथ स्वाभ्युपगमविरोधचोदनयापि¹⁴ परो न¹⁵

¹ A, E, M: eniṣṭeti; B, C, J-L, N: eniṣṭheti; D: atiṣṭheti; F: etiṣṭeti; G: eniṣṭati; H, I: aniṣṭeti; em. by LVP (silently): aniṣṭeti. Cf. *aniṣṭhādoṣa* below at PsP_M §95; BHSD s.v. *aniṣṭhāpada*; Tib: thug pa med par yang mi 'dod do ∴ na cāpy aniṣṭheti (the translators have added a translation for the *iṣyate* that is understood through *anuvṛtti* in the Skt). ² A, E, F, H, I, K, L: nirupattike; B, C, G, J, M, N: °ke; D: nirupayattika; em. by LVP (silently) ³ P: eṣa; Q: eka; D: e; I: evaḥ; Tib: n.e. eva ⁴ P: bhava; A, D: om.; B, C, E-N: tada; em. by LVP: tvad (compounded with following *vādaḥ*). P's reading may have resulted from a misreading of the *akṣara ta*, but could suggest the reading *bhavadvādaḥ* (cf. Speijer § 259 Rem.). ⁵ A: tadaḥ ⁶ A, E, H: syā...vinuddhaś; B, D, F, G, M, N: svātyupa°; I: bhyupagamavinuddhaś ⁷ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: cati ⁸ Q: iyati, but with two deletion marks above *ya*; A-C, E, G-N: iyam iti; D: iryavr(?)iti; F: imim iti; conj. by LVP: [tanmātreṇa]. LVP (PsP_L 15, n. 8) states that Cambridge (L) reads only *iti* at this point but it too attests *iyam iti*. Tib: 'di dag tsam zhig gis. De Jong (1978: 29) reads D as *iryacc(?) iti* and states, "Read *iyad iti?*" ⁹ A, D, E, F, H, I, K, L: vodite ¹⁰ P: nābhyupeti; D: nātyupati; F: nātyūpeti; G, N: nātyupaiti; H: nābhyuyaiti; K: nābhyupeti; M: rātyupaiti ¹¹ C, G, M: yamo ¹² A, E, H, I, L: °phalya; C: hatu°; D: °drṣṭāntoṣādāna°; F, K: °drṣṭāntāpā...lya; G: hatudrṣṭākopādāna°; K: drṣṭāntāpādānasāphalya; M: hatudrṣṭāntopādānasāphatyam ¹³ A: sāt ¹⁴ Em. with LVP: °virodha°. P, Q: °viruddha°; A, E, H, I: svātyuvyagamadiruddhacodanayāpi; B, G, L, M: svātyupagamaviruddha°; C, J, N: °viruddha°; D: svātyupagamaviruddhacādenayāpi; F: svātyūvyagamaviruddhacodanayāpi; K: svābhyuvyagamaviruddha°. LVP (PsP_L 15, n. 9) refers to PsP_L 11.14 and PsP_L 13.5 (these references are corrected on p. 597 to PsP_L 18.7 and 21.13)

PsPL 16

निवर्तते¹ । तदातिनिर्लज्जतया² हेतुदृष्टान्ताभ्याम्³ अपि नैव
 निवर्तते⁴ । न चोन्मत्तकेन सहास्माकं⁵ विवाद⁶ इति सर्वथा⁷ प्रिया- E4v
 नुमानताम्⁸ एवात्मन आचार्यः प्रकटयत्⁹ अस्थाने¹⁰ ऽप्य् अनु-
 मानं¹¹ प्रवेशयन्¹² । न च¹³ माध्यमिकस्य¹⁵ स्वतः¹⁶ स्वतन्त्रम्¹⁷ A5r

and translates “Même quand on lui démontre qu’il est en contradiction” Tib: rang gyi khas blangs pa dang ’gal bas brtsad pas kyang ¹⁵ P: om.; Q: Ø

¹ P: nivarteta; Q: Ø; A, C, E, F, H, K, L, M: nivarttata; G: nivarttata tadāpi nivarttata; I: nīvarttata; N: nivartteta; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: mi ldog ² A, E, F, H, I, K, L: tadāpinirlajjvatayā; B, C, G, J, N: tadāpinir°; M: tadāpinirlajjvatayā; PsPL: tadāpi nirlajjvatayā; Tib: n.e. api/ati (the prefix *ati* is sometimes left untranslated). De Jong did not notice that ms D reads *tadāti*° and thus did not include the emendation in his “Textcritical Notes.” ³ D, N: °tyām; F: °dṛṣṭāntāsām; M: °tātyām ⁴ Q: nivarteta; A-C, E, G, I, J, L-N: nivarttata; D: nivarttatā; F: vivarjata; H: nivarttataḥ; K: vivarttata; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ C, G, M: sabhāsmokaṃ; D: mahā°; F: sāhā° ⁶ A: vipāda; D: vivoda ⁷ A, E, H, I: savathā; Tib: de’i phyir, n.e. sarvathā; em. by LVP: tasmāt ⁸ F, K: piyā° ⁹ A: prakata(?)dyuti; E, F, H, I, K, L: prakāṭadyuti ¹⁰ A, C, E-M: °na; N: °na, repeats initial a; em. by LVP (silently) ¹¹ A, C, E-G, J-N: anumāna; H: anumātaya; I: atumātā; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² A, E, I: praśayena; B-D, G, J, K, M, N: praveśayena; F: pravasayena; H: prasayena; L: pravaśayena; em. by LVP ¹³ D: ne ¹⁴ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om.; D: va. LVP (PsPL 16, n. 2) reports that his mss read *ca* here, not mentioning that ms L (Cambridge) omits *ca*. ¹⁵ C, G, M: sā° ¹⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K: svata; Tib: n.e. svataḥ: dbu ma pa yin na ni rang gi rgyud kyi rjes su dpag par bya ba rigs pa yang ma yin te ¹⁷ A: svatabhram; D: svatamtum; E, I: svataṃbhram; H: svataṃdha(?)m

अनुमानं¹ कर्तुं² युक्तं³ पक्षान्तराभ्युपगमाभावात्⁴ ॥

F4v §26. तथा चोक्तम्⁵ आर्यदेवेन⁶ –

Q3v सदसत् सदसच्⁷ चेति⁸ यस्य⁹ पक्षो¹⁰ न¹¹ विद्यते।
उपालम्भश्च¹² चिरेणापि¹³ तस्य वक्तुं¹⁴ न¹⁵ शक्यते ॥

इति¹⁶ ॥

5

विग्रहव्यावर्तन्यां¹⁷ चोक्तम्¹⁸ –

M5r यदि काचन¹⁹ प्रतिज्ञा²⁰ स्यान्²¹ मे²² तत²³ एष²⁴ मे भवेद्²⁵ दोषः।

¹ A, C, E-N: °na; em. by LVP (silently) ² D, G: kartu ³ A: °ta -
⁴ A-C, E, H, J, L, N: °ntarābhyupamābhāvāt; D, G, M: °ntarātyupa-
mābhāvāt; F K: pathāntarātyupamābhāvāt; I: °ntarābhyupasābhāvāt;
em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ PsP_L: tathoktam; Tib: de skad du yang ...
bshad ⁶ H: °devana ⁷ Q: sadasa///; D: sadasatasadasrc ⁸ Q: Ø;
C, D, G, J: cati; M: ati ⁹ Q: Ø; A, I: yaśya; H: pasya ¹⁰ Q: Ø; A-N:
pakṣā; em. by LVP (silently) ¹¹ Q: Ø; F: nā ¹² A, E, H, I: upāra-
naś; B, F, K, L: upārambhaś; C, J, M, N: upārambhaś; G: upārabha;
em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ D: cireśāpi ¹⁴ B: vaktu; G: vakum; M:
vakṭhum ¹⁵ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ma ¹⁶ PsP_L om. iti; Tib: zhes
bshad do ¹⁷ A, E, H, I, K, L: °vyāpattinām; B, C, J, M: °vyāpattī-
nām; D: °vyāvarttinyām; F, G: °vyāpattinā; N: °vyāpattīnāñ; em. by
LVP (silently) ¹⁸ A, D, E, H, I: vaktam; J, N: cāktam ¹⁹ A-C, E,
F, H-N: °nam; D: vyāvana; G: kāmcanam; em. by LVP (silently)
²⁰ G: prattijñā ²¹ B: syānta; F, K: om. ²² A, E, H, I, L: e; F, K: de
²³ A, D, E, F, H, I, K, L: tat; B, C, G, J, M, N: tad; em. by LVP
²⁴ Em. by LVP (silently) to *eva*, although he notes (PsP_L 16, n. 6) that
his mss read *eṣa* and must have been aware that Tib attests *de*. Cf.
Bhattacharya et al. 1986: 61, n. 4 and Yonezawa 2008: 268. ²⁵ A, E,
I, L: bhevad; F, K: bheva; H: bhedad; M: bhavad

नास्ति¹ च² मम² प्रतिज्ञा³ तस्मान्⁴ नैवास्ति⁵ मे दोषः ॥

यदि किञ्चिद्⁶ उपलभेयं⁷ प्रवर्तयेयं⁸ निवर्तयेयं⁹ वा ।

K6r H6r

प्रत्यक्षादिभिर्¹⁰ अर्थैस्¹¹ तदभावान्¹² मे ऽनुपालम्भः ॥

C6v

इति ॥

5 §27. यदा चैवं¹³ स्वतन्त्रानुमानानभिधायिबं¹⁴ माध्यमिकस्य¹⁵ ।
तदा¹⁶ कुतो¹⁷ नाध्यात्मिकान्य¹⁸ आयतनानि¹⁹ स्वत²⁰ उत्पन्नानी-
ति²¹ स्वतन्त्रा प्रतिज्ञा²² यस्यां²³ साङ्ख्याः²³ प्रत्यवस्थास्यन्ते²⁴ —

I7v G6v

PsP_L 17

¹ D: va ² Em. with LVP: mama. P, Q: me; A-N: me; the *mama* attested by Sāṅkṛtyāyana's VV manuscript is needed in order to meet the requirements of the *āryā* metre of the verse (Sāṅkṛtyāyana 1937: 14; Yonezawa 2008: 268; cf. also Bhattacharya et al. 1986: 61). ³ I: pratijñāna ⁴ J: tasmon ⁵ A: taivasti; E, F, H, I, K, L: naivasti ⁶ Q: kicid ⁷ H: upalabhyayam ⁸ C, G, M: om.; H: pravarttayayam ⁹ C: tivarttayeyam; M: nivarttayam ¹⁰ A, C-N: athais; em. by LVP (silently) ¹¹ A: tedavān; E, H, I, L: tedabhāvān; F, K: tedabhāvāt ¹² F, K: ma ¹³ Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁴ A, F, K: svatantramavumānānabhi°; B: svatamtramanumānānabhi°; C, G, J, L-N: svatantramanumānā°; D: svatantramanumānānibhi°; E, H, I: svatantramavumānātabhi°; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁵ Q: mādhyami///; B: mādhyātmikasya; D: sã° ¹⁶ Q: Ø ¹⁷ Q: Ø; A-C, E-N: kṛtā; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁸ A, E, I, L: nādhyārmikāny°; C, J, K: nādhyārmikāny°; D: mādhyānmik°; F: nādhyārtmikāny°; G: nādhyātmikādy; H: nādhyārmikāṃny; M: nādhyātmikāry; N: nādhyārmikāny°; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁹ H: āyanānāni ²⁰ K: svarta ²¹ A: utpannāniti°; C, G, J, M, N: tpannānīti; L: utpannā | nīti ²² A, E, F, H, I, K, L: yasyā; D: yasvā ²³ A, C, G, M: sākhyāḥ ²⁴ P: pratyavasthāpsyante (the short vertical stroke for *ā* used before *akṣaras* with space-consuming lower bodies has been read by P's scribe as the initial *akṣara*-part *p*); A, E, H, I, L: pratyavasphāyante; B: °sthāyaṃte; C, F, G, J, K, N: °sthāyante; D:

को ऽयं प्रतिज्ञार्थः¹ । किं कार्यात्मकः² स्वतः³ उत कारणात्मक⁴
 इति⁵ । किं चातः⁶ । कार्यात्मकश्⁷ चेत्⁸ सिद्धसाधनम्⁹ । कारणा-
 त्मकश्¹⁰ चेद्¹¹ विरुद्धार्थता¹² । कारणात्मना¹³ विद्यमानस्यैव¹⁴
 सर्वस्योत्पत्तिमत¹⁵ उत्पादात्॥

इति॥

5

कुतो ऽस्माकं¹⁶ विद्यमानत्वाद्¹⁷ इति¹⁸ हेतुः¹⁹ । यस्य²⁰ सिद्धसाधनं²¹
 विरुद्धार्थता²² वा²³ स्यात् । यस्य सिद्धसाधनस्य²⁴ यस्याश् च

°sthātyante; M: prabhāvasthāyante; em. by LVP (silently): pratyava-
 sthāyante; Tib: phyir zlog par byed par 'gyur ba

¹ I: pratijñārtham; M: pratijñārthamḥ ² Q: kāryātmanah; F, K: kāryānmakah; em. by LVP: kāryātmakāt. Tib: 'bras bu'i bdag nyid las; the PsP translators, however, are citing from PP Tib. Q's reading is the result of deliberate interference. See Translation note and Appendix VIII.

³ D: svate; G: tyata. PsP Tib, PP Tib: bdag las zhes bya ba (svata iti) ⁴ Q: karaṇātmana; F, K: kāraṇānmaka; em. by LVP: kāraṇātmakād. Tib: rgyu'i bdag nyid las. See Appendix VIII.

⁵ Tib: n.e. iti ⁶ H, I: cāta; Tib: n.e. ca ⁷ Q: kāryātmanah; D: °makeś; em. by LVP: kāryātmakāc. Tib: 'bras bu'i bdag nyid las

⁸ A, D, E, F, H, K, L: ceta; G: cen ⁹ A: si≈sādhanaṃ; F: siddhasā-
 naṃ; K: °dhāne ¹⁰ Q: karaṇātmanaś; C, G, M: om.; em. by LVP: kāraṇātmakāc. Tib: rgyu'i bdag nyid las

¹¹ C, G, M: om.; H: cad

¹² C, G, M: om.; F: °tāḥ ¹³ D: kaparaṇātmanā ¹⁴ A, E, F, I, K, L: °syava; H: vidyagānasyava

¹⁵ D: sarvasyānpatti°; N: sarvasetpa°

¹⁶ A: 'smāvaṃ ¹⁷ Q: vidya/// ¹⁸ Q: Ø ¹⁹ Q: Ø; Tib: gtan tshigs

kyang ²⁰ D: yasmā ²¹ Em. with LVP: siddhasādhanaṃ. P, Q: om.;

A-N: om.; Tib: grub pa la sgrub pa nyid ²² D: varuddhārthatā; H:

°ta; J, N: virurddhārthatā (the small stroke attached to the r of

°rddhā° in J may be a cancellation mark); M: viraddharthatā

²³ Em. with LVP: vā. P, Q: om.; A-N: om.; Tib: dam ²⁴ D: sidhāsā-

विरुद्धार्थतायाः¹ परिहारार्थं² यत्नं³ करिष्यामः⁴ । तस्मात् परोक्त- P4r
दोषाप्रसङ्गाद्⁵ एव तत्परिहार आचार्यबुद्धपालितेन⁶ न वर्णनीयः⁸ ॥ L5v

§28. अथापि स्यात्⁹ – माध्यमिकानां¹⁰ पक्षहेतुदृष्टान्तानाम्¹¹ असि-
द्धेः¹² स्वतन्त्रानुमानानभिधायिबात्¹³ स्वत उत्पत्तिप्रतिषेधप्रतिज्ञार्थ-
साधनं¹⁴ मा भूद्¹⁵ उभयसिद्धेन¹⁷ वानुमानेन¹⁸ परप्रतिज्ञानिराकर-

dhanasya; A, E, F, I, K, L: siddhisādhanaśya; H: siddhisādhasya

¹ H: °yā ² P: °ā(rtha.); D, F: °ārtha ³ A, C, E, G-J, M, N: yanna; B, F, K, L: yanta; em. by LVP (silently) ⁴ P: kaviṣyāmas; F: kṛṇiṣyāmas ⁵ P: paroktadoṣapra°; A, E, H: parokadāṣapra°; B, C, G, J, M, N: paroktadoṣapra°; D: parākta°; I: parokadāṣaprasagād; L: paroktadāṣa°, but wavy line over *dā* indicates Nepalese *do*; conj. by LVP: paroktadoṣ[ā]pra°; Tib: thal bar mi 'gyur ba ⁶ I: ācābu° ⁷ C, G, J, M, N: om.; conj. by LVP: [na]. Tib: brjod par bya ba ma yin no. LVP has overlooked that L (Cambridge) attests *na*. ⁸ A: varsyānā(?)yah; E, H, I: varsyānīyah ⁹ D: smān ¹⁰ A, E, H, I: sā°; F: madhyamikāno; K: °kāno(?) ¹¹ A: pakṣehenudrṣṭāntānās; B: °drṣṭāntānāsu; C, G, M: pakṣahetu; D: °drṣṭāntānos; E, I: pakṣehetudrṣṭāntātās; F: °drṣṭāntānyas; H: pakṣehetudrṣṭāntatās; J, L, N: °nās; K: pakṣahatudrṣṭāntānās; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² A, F: asiddhe; B: siddheḥ; C, G, M: om. asiddheḥ svatantrānumānānabhidhāyivāt svata utpattipratīṣedhapratijñārtasādhanaṃ mā bhūd ubhayasiddhena vānumānena parapatijñānirākaraṇam, parapatijñāyās tu ¹³ D: °mānānābhi° ¹⁴ Q: °pratīṣedhapratī///; A: °pratīṣedhamprati°; F: upatti°; em. by LVP: °pratijñātārthasādhanaṃ. LVP (PsP_L 18, n. 6) notes “Le Tib. lit *pratijñā*, non pas *pratijñātārtha*,” but fails to add that his three manuscripts also attest *pratijñārtha*. De Jong (1978: 30) has already noted that ms D’s *pratijñārtha* is confirmed by Tib’s *dam bca’ ba’i don*. ¹⁵ Q: Ø ¹⁶ Q: ///d; D: bhū ¹⁷ D: ’bhaya°; H: abhaya° ¹⁸ Q: cā°; A, B, E, F, H, J-L: cā°; I: vātu°

णम्¹ परप्रतिज्ञायास्² तु स्वत्³ एवानुमानविरोधचोदनया⁴ स्वत्⁵
 एव⁶ पक्षहेतुदृष्टान्तापक्षालरहितैः⁷ पक्षादिभिर्⁸ भवितव्यम्⁹ ।
 ततश्च¹⁰ तदनभिधानात्¹¹ तद्दोषपरिहाराच्¹² च स एव¹³ दोष इति ॥ PsP_L 19
 उच्यते – नैतद्¹⁴ एवम्¹⁵ । किं कारणम्¹⁶ । यस्माद् यो¹⁷ हि यम्¹⁸
 अथ¹⁹ प्रतिजानीते²⁰ तेन²¹ स्वनिश्चयवद्²² अन्येषां²³ निश्चयोत्पाद- 5

¹ D: °nirokaraṇam; F K: °nikarākaṇam ² N: parampra° ³ A, E, H, I: sva ⁴ Q: °codanāyām; A, I: yavānumānavirodhacodanayā; B: °virocodanayā; C, M: evānumānunirodhavodanayā; D: °codanamā; G: evātamānanirodhavodanayā; H: yavānumānavirodhacoṭhadanayā; J, N: °nirodhacodanayā. *LT: codanāyām; Tib: gzhan gyi dam bca' ba la rang gi rjes su dpag pas 'gal ba brjod par ni bya dgos pas. See Translation note and Appendix IX. ⁵ A: ≈vata; F: svate ⁶ F K: eca; H: yeve ⁷ A, E, L: °drṣṭāntāpekṣārahitaiḥ; B: °drṣṭāntāpekṣārahitaiḥ; C, M, N: °drṣṭāntāpakṣārahitaiḥ; D: °drṣṭāntāpakṣārahitaiḥ; F: parokṣahetudrṣṭāntāpekṣārahitaiḥ; G: °drṣṭāntāpakṣārahite; H: as A, no visarga; I: as B, no visarga; K: parākṣahetudrṣṭāntāpekṣārahitaiḥ; J: °drṣṭāntāpakṣārehitaiḥ; em. by LVP: pakṣahetudrṣṭāntadoṣarahitaiḥ; Tib: phyogs dang gtan tshigs dang dpe'i skyon dang bral pa dag; *LT ms: apakṣātma; Yonezawa (2004: 133) accepts the MacDonald 2000 emendation *apakṣāla*. ⁸ F K: pakṣādibhi; H: yakṣādibhir ⁹ A: bhatitavyam; G: bhā° ¹⁰ Tib: n.e. ca ¹¹ C, G, M: tatadanabhi°; D: tedanahidhānāt; I: °dhānān ¹² A, E, F, H, I, K, L: tadoṣāparihātāc; C, G, J, M, N: tadoṣā°; D: tadoṣāparihārā; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ D: e ¹⁴ C, G, M: naivatad ¹⁵ F: enam ¹⁶ N: °ṇa ¹⁷ D: yā ¹⁸ C, G, M: parm. Yonezawa 2005a: 66 gives Q as attesting yā – the mark on the upper right corner of ya could be read as either yā or yaṃ ¹⁹ Q: dharmam; A, C, E-N: artha; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ Q: pratijā///; D: pratijonīte ²¹ Q: Ø ²² Q: ///d; D: ścayavad ²³ C, G: anyaṣām; H: aneṣām

नेच्छया¹ ययोपपत्त्यासाव्² अर्थो³ ऽधिगतः⁴ सैवोपपत्तिः⁴ परस्मा-
य⁵ उपदेष्टव्या⁶ । तस्माद् एष⁷ तावन्⁸ न्यायो⁹ यत्¹⁰ परेणैव¹¹ स्वा-
भ्युपगमप्रतिज्ञातार्थसाधनम्¹² उपादेयम्¹³ । स¹⁴ चायं परं प्रति
हेतुदृष्टान्तासम्भवात्¹⁵ स्वप्रतिज्ञामात्रसारतयैव¹⁶ केवलं¹⁷ स्वप्रति-

C7r M5v G7r

¹ D: niścayānpāda°; M: niścayotpādarechayā ² A, E, I, H: yayāpa-
patyādasāv; B, F, G, J-L, N: yayāpapatyā'sāv; C, M: yapāpapatyā'sav;
em. by LVP (silently) ³ A, E, I, H: ārthā; B, C, F, G, J-N: arthā; em.
by LVP (silently) ⁴ A: saiṣopapantiḥ; B: saivopapantiḥ; D: saivāpa-
pattiḥ; E, H, I: saiṣopapattiḥ; G: saivopapasti; L: sai≈opapattiḥ ⁵ A-
M: parasmād; N: pasmād; em. by LVP; Tib: gzhan la ⁶ A-C, E, J-N:
upadestavyā; D: upadeṣṭasyā; F: upadetavyā; G: upadyastavyā; H:
upādestavya; I: upadestatha; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ A: e; F: eva;
G: eya; I: e(?)ṣā ⁸ F: tācan; G: tovan ⁹ A-C, E-N: nyāye; D: nyo-
yo; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ Q: papatty (eyeskip back to
yayopapatty°); C, G, J, M, N: tat ¹¹ Q: antareṇaiva; A-C, E-N:
paraṇaiva; D: paraśaiva; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² B, F, G, M: svā-
tyupagama°; D: svātyupasama...nap; N: °sāadhanum; em. by LVP
(silently): svābhyupagata° ¹³ C, M: upādeyaṃ; C and M then
repeat the earlier section beginning with *athāpi syāt*, now including
what was dropped the first time: *athāpi syāt mādhyamikānām pakṣa-*
hetuḥṣṭāntānās asiddheḥ ... parapratiṣṭhāyās tu svataḥ; D: *uyādeyaṃ*;
F: *upādeyaḥ*; G: om. *upādeyaṃ*, and adds part of the dropped section:
mā bhad ubhayasiddhena cānumānena parapratiṣṭhānirākaraṇaṃ para-
pratiṣṭhāyām tu svataḥ; K, N: *upādeya* ¹⁴ Em.: sa. P: na; Q: na(?);
A-N: na; Tib: ma yin. LVP accepts the mss' *na*. He conjectures: na
cāyaṃ paraṃ prati [hetuḥ] |; he bases his conjecture on Tib: 'di ni
gzhan la gtan tshigs kyang ma yin no. *LT: tac. See Translation note.
¹⁵ A, E, H, I: °bhavāt followed by visarga ¹⁶ Q: svapratiṣṭhāna-
ṅga(?)ye(?)prāptatayaiva; the two uncertain *akṣaras* are written over
an erasure; the *akṣara pta* is written in the lower margin and marked
to be inserted before *ta* of °*tayaiva*; G: om. *svapratiṣṭhāmātrasārata-*
yaiva kevalaṃ svapratiṣṭhātārthasāadhanam; em. by LVP: *pratiṣṭhānusā-*

F5r J7r B6v ज्ञातार्थसाधनम्¹ उपादत्त² इति निरुपपत्तिकपक्षाभ्युपगमात्³ स्वा-
त्मानम्⁴ एवायं⁵ केवलं⁶ विसंवादयन्⁷ न शक्नोति⁸ परेषां⁹ निश्चयम्¹⁰
आधातुमिति। इदम्¹¹ एवास्य¹² स्पष्टतरं¹³ दूषणं¹⁴ यदुत¹⁵ स्वप्रतिज्ञाता-
र्थसाधनासामर्थ्यम्¹⁶ इति¹⁷ किम्¹⁸ अत्रानुमानबाधोद्भावनया¹⁹
प्रयोजनम्²⁰ ॥

5

§29. अथापि²¹ – अवश्यं²² स्वतो ऽनुमानविरोधदोष²³ उद्भावन-
यः²⁴ ॥

PsPL 20

ratayaiva; Tib: khas 'ches pa'i rjes su 'brangs pa. PsPL 19, n. 6 states that LVP's mss read *svāpratijñāmātrāsāratayaiva*^o; all read *sva*^o.

¹⁷ A: kevaram; I: visarga follows; N: lam

¹ Em. with LVP: svapratijñātārthasāadhanam. P: svapratijñānārthamā-
tram; Q: sva///m; A-Ē H-N: svapratijñātārthamātram; G: om.; Tib:
rang gi dam bca' ba'i don gi sgrub par byed pa (= svapratijñārtha-
sāadhanam) ² C, G, J, M, N: utpādatta; I: upādanta ³ Q: °pakṣa°;
D: °pakṣātyupaśamāt; F: °pakṣātyūpagamāt; G, M: °pakṣotyupaga-
māt; H: °pakṣyābhyupagamāt; N: °pakṣātpupagamāt ⁴ Q: svātmā-
namam ⁵ F, K: evāya; H: ovāya ⁶ D: viśamvādeyan ⁷ A: sak-
noti ⁸ A: pareṣā; Tib: gzhan la ∴ pareṣām (i.e., Tib without a plural
marker) ⁹ A, E, H, I: °yas; F: naścayas; L: na(?)ścayas; K: taśca-
yal(?) ¹⁰ B: avāśya ¹¹ I: spaṣṭaram; N: syaṣṭaratara; PsPL: spaṣṭa-
tara, compounded with following dūṣaṇam ¹² F: yadūta; I: yeduta
¹³ A: °sāmarthām; C, G, H, J, M, N: svapratijñātārthasāmarthyam; F:
svapratijñārthasā° ¹⁴ F, H: itiḥ ¹⁵ G: ki ¹⁶ P: °(b)ādho-

d+(āv)ānatayā; Q: °ānumānapācodbhāvanayā; A, E, H, L: °badhohā-
vanayā; F, K: °badhobhāvanayā; G: trānu...yo; I: attā°; M: °bādhobhā-
vanayo; N: °bādhodbhāvana; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁷ D:
prayājanam; N: yojanam ¹⁸ A: athācya°; E, F, H, I, K: athāvy
¹⁹ F, K: avāśya; H: avasyam; M: avaṇyam; N: evāśya ²⁰ Q: °vi///;
B: °nirodhadoṣa; C, G, M, N: anumona°; Tib: n.e. doṣa ²¹ Q:
///nīyaḥ; A, G: °nīya; D: udbhāvaṇnīyaṣṭa; M: utbhāvanīyaḥ

सो ऽप्य् उद्भावित¹ एवाचार्यबुद्धपालितेन² । न³ स्वत उत्पद्यन्ते⁴ D4r N6v
 भावास्⁵ तदुत्पादवैयर्थ्याद्⁶ इति वचनात्⁷ । अत्र हि तद्⁸ इत्य्⁹ l8v
 अनेन¹⁰ स्वात्मना¹¹ विद्यमानस्य¹² परामर्शः¹³ । तथा ह्य्¹⁴ अस्य¹⁵ 16

¹ A, E, H, I, L: uḥāvita; F: ūhāvita; K: ubhāvita; M: utbhāvita ² D: nuvācārya°; H: °naḥ; M: °nā ³ Q: katham kṛtvā yasmād evam tenoktam – written in the lower margin and marked for insertion before *na*; conj. by LVP: [katham iti cet]; Tib: ji ltar zhe na | gang gi phyir des ni 'di skad du bshad pa yin te |. See Translation note. ⁴ H: upatyayante ⁵ F: bhās ⁶ A, E, F, I: °vaiyathād; C, J-N: °vaiyathyād; D: udutpādacaiyathyād; G: tadupādavaiyathyād; H: tadatpādavaiyathād; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ K: vacanyat; N: v(?)vac(?)anāt ⁸ P: svata; A, B, D-F, H-L: svata; C, G, M, N: sveta; Tib: de dag; em. by LVP: tad. The explanatory statement (*vivaraṇavākya*) of the following sentence is explicating the reason *tadutpādavaiyathyāt* of Buddhapālita's *prasaṅga* statement and thus refers back to the two elements *tat* and *utpādavaiyathya*, not to *svata* of the proposition. The appearance of *svataḥ* in all mss but Q may have been influenced by the passage in PP in which Bhāviveka adduces the elements for an independent inference from MMK I.1, the “general thesis”; he draws the reason “because of [already] existing” for his inference out of the *kārikā*'s word *svataḥ* (cf. PP D 48b5-6; P 58a2; Ames 1993: 221). ⁹ F: iḥ; PsP_L: aty, which is corrected to iti (cf. PsP_L 597) ¹⁰ C, I, J, M, N: enena ¹¹ A-C, E-N: °no; D: svotmano; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² Q: vidyamānatvasya, *tva* written below the line ¹³ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): °marśaḥ. P: °marśas; Q: °marśaḥ; A-C, E-N: °marśas; D: °maśaṃs ¹⁴ Q: kiṃ kāraṇam tathā; conj. by LVP: [kasmād iti cet] tathā; Tib: ci'i phyir zhe na | 'di ltar. Ms Q's *kiṃ kāraṇam ta* is written in the lower margin and marked to be inserted between *parāmarśaḥ* and *tā* of the main text; the ‘x’ marking the point of insertion in the main text was written over an erased *akṣara*, possibly a *sta*. The *visarga* of *parāmarśaḥ* was added post-erasure. See Translation note. ¹⁵ C, G, J, M, N: jya ¹⁶ M: atra; em. by LVP: tasya. LVP (PsP_L 20, n. 3)

Q4r L6r ग्रहणकवाक्यस्यैतद्¹ विवरणवाक्यम्² न³ हि स्वात्मना³ विद्यमाना-
ना⁴ पुनरुत्पादे⁵ प्रयोजनम्⁶ इति। अनेन⁷ च⁸ वाक्येन⁹ साध्य-
साधनधर्मानुगतस्य¹⁰ परप्रसिद्धस्य¹¹ साधर्म्यदृष्टान्तस्योपादानम्¹²।
C7v H7r तत्र स्वात्मना¹³ विद्यमानस्येत्य¹⁴ अनेन¹⁵ हेतुपरामर्शः¹⁶। उत्पाद-

refers to the readings *atra*, *tasya* and *asya* in his mss, but both L and N read *asya*.

¹ A-C, E, F, H-L, N: grahaṇakuvākya°; G: graheṇakuvākya°; M: graheṇakuvākya°; conj. by LVP: [saṃ]grahē[okta]vākyaśyaitad. De Jong (1978: 30) notes Stcherbatsky's (1927: 99, n. 2) suggestion as *tasya saṃgrahavākyaśya* but it is actually *tasya grahaṇaka-vākyaśya*. Tib: mdor bzhag pa'i ngag de'i ² Em. with LVP: na. P: Ø; Q: kiṃ; A-N: kiṃ; Tib: ... yang skyes ba la dgos pa med. LVP refers to PsP_L 14.2: na hi svātmanā vidyamānānām padārthānām punarutpāde prayojanam asti. BP_{ed} 10.14-15: 'di ltar dngos po bdag gi bdag nyid du yod pa rnam la yang skye ba dgos pa med do ³ P: Ø; A-C, E-N: °no; D: svātsanā; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: bdag nyid du ⁴ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: vidyamāno; B, C, D, G, J, M: vidyamānām; N: vidyamānām; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ P: Ø; A, E: pūr°; D: puner°; H, I: pur° ⁶ P: Ø; D: prayojanaṃm ⁷ D: anuna ⁸ A: va; N: om. ⁹ G, I, K: vākyaṇa ¹⁰ C, J, M: sodhya°; D: °gatesya; G: sosādha-na°; N: sodhyasāadhanarmānugatasya ¹¹ G: °prasiddha ¹² Q: sādharma°; A, E: sādharma...danam; C, G, I, M: sādharmaḍṛṣṭāntasyotpādanam; F, K, L: sādharma°; H: sādharma...danam; J, N: °syotpādanam; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ C, G, J, M, N: °no; D: svotmanā ¹⁴ D: vidyamānasyebh; I: vidyamānasyatt ¹⁵ D: āneva ¹⁶ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): °śaḥ. P, Q: °śaḥ; A, E, F, I, K, L: °śa; B, C, G, H, J, M, N: °śaḥ; D: hetupasamarśa (*sa* could be Devanāgarī *rā*)

वैयर्थ्याद्¹ इत्य्² अनेन³ साध्यधर्मपरामर्शः⁴ ॥

तत्र यथानित्यः⁵ शब्दः⁶ कृतकत्वात्⁷ कृतकम्⁸ अनित्यं दृष्टं⁹ यथा
घटः¹⁰ तथा च¹¹ कृतकः¹² शब्दः¹³ तस्मात् कृतकत्वाद् अनित्यं¹⁴

K7r

PsPL 21

इति कृतकत्वम्¹⁵ अत्रोपनयाभिव्यक्तो हेतुः¹⁶ एवम्¹⁷ इहापि न¹⁸

G7v

5 स्वत उत्पद्यन्ते¹⁹ भावाः स्वात्मना²⁰ विद्यमानानां²¹ पुनरुत्पाद-
वैयर्थ्यात्²² ॥

A6r J7v

इह²³ स्वात्मना²⁴ विद्यमानं²⁵ पुरो²⁶ ऽवस्थितं²⁷ घटादिकं²⁸ पुनरुत्पा-
दानपेक्षं²⁹ दृष्टम्³⁰ । तथा च³¹ मृत्पिण्डाद्यवस्थायाम्³² अपि यदि³³

¹ C, G, J, N, M: °vaiyathyād; D: utpādavairyathyād; H: °vaiparthyād

² A, C, E, G-J, L-N: ibhy; em. by LVP (silently) ³ D: ane; I: enena

⁴ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): °śaḥ. P, Q: °śaḥ; A, E, I: sādharmaaparāmarṣaḥ; B, D, F, G, K-M: °śaḥ; C: °parammarṣaḥ; H: sādharmaaparāmarṣa; J, N: °paramarṣaḥ ⁵ P: yathā 'nimibya(h); Q: yathā na nityaḥ; I: °tya ⁶ D: śabda ⁷ P: Ø; Q: kṛtakatvānityatvāt;

F: kṛtakṛtvāt; Tib: byas pa mi rtag pa'i phyir. See Translation note. ⁸ G: kṛtakem ⁹ I: drṣṭa ¹⁰ P: Ø; D: ce ¹¹ F: kṛtaka ¹² P: Ø; A, C, E, G-N: śabda; F: śabde; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ P: Ø; D: atitya

¹⁴ M: kṛkasvam ¹⁵ G: evah ¹⁶ A, E, H, I: ta; D: ne ¹⁷ D: svata svate ¹⁸ H: upadyamte; I: utpadyate ¹⁹ H: svātmānām ²⁰ I: vidyasānām; M: °nā ²¹ A: °vaiyatpādavaiyarthīyāt; B: utpādevai°;

C: narutpādavaiyathyāt; F: °vairiyathyāt; G, J: °vaiyathyāt; M, N: punanutpādavaiyathyāt ²² Tib: 'di na ji ltar ÷ iha. Tib construes ji ltar with de bzhiñ du (tathā) of the next sentence. ²³ M: °nām

²⁴ A, E, H, I: vidyamāne ²⁵ A, E, H, I: om. ²⁶ A, E, H, I: om.; Tib: gnas zhing gsal ba ÷ 'vasthitam (= 'vasthitam vyaktam) ²⁷ Q: ghaṭādi

²⁸ A, E, H, I: om. punarutpādānapekṣam drṣṭam | tathā ca mṛtpiṇḍādyavasthāyām api yadi svātmanā vidyamānaḥ ghaṭādikam; D: °pakṣam; F: °utpādānampekṣam; C, G, J, N: °utpādana°; M: °utpādina° ²⁹ C, G, J, M, N: yathā ³⁰ D: dha; Tib: n.e. ca ³¹ B,

M6r स्वात्मना¹ विद्यमान² घटादिकम्³ इति मन्यसे⁴ । तदापि तस्य⁵ स्वा-
B7r त्मना⁶ विद्यमानस्य⁷ नास्त्य⁸ उत्पाद⁹ इति¹⁰ ॥

एवं¹¹ स्वात्मना¹² विद्यमानबेनोपनयाभिव्यक्तेन¹³ पुनरुत्पादप्रति-
P4v षेधाव्यभिचारिणा¹⁴ हेतुना स्वत एव¹⁵ साङ्ख्यस्यानुमानविरोधोद्भा-
I9r वनम्¹⁶ अनुष्ठितम्¹⁷ एवेति¹⁸ । तत् किम्¹⁹ उच्यते²⁰ तद् अयुक्तं²¹ 22

5

D, G, J, L-N: mṛta°; F, K: mṛtapīṇḍa°; em. by LVP (silently) 32 F: yadī

¹ C, G, M: svātmenā ² P: Ø; F, K: vidyamāne; L: vidyamāneṃ

³ C, G, M: ghaṭāḍikam; Tib: ... gal te rang gi bdag nyid du yod pa'i bum pa la sogs pa yod do snyam du sems na ∴ yadī svātmanā vidya-

mānaṃ ghaṭāḍikam iti manyase ⁴ C, G, M: manyasa; F, H: manyes-
e; I: manaseḥ ⁵ P: Ø; E, H, I, L: tasyaḥ ⁶ P: Ø; A-C, E-N: svātma-

no; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ A, E, H, I: vimānasya; C, G, J, M, N:

vidyamāna; D: vidyamānasva ⁸ A, E, H: rabhy; D: manasty; F, K:

ty; I: sty; L: sbhy; N: nāsbhy ⁹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: utpādam; C, G, J,

M, N: upādam; D: unpāda; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ H: itiḥ ¹¹ C,

G, J, M, N: eva ¹² P: Ø; A-C, E, G-N: °no; F: svātmanom; em. by

LVP (silently) ¹³ P: °tvenopanayābhivvyaktana; A: °tvainoparaya-

bhivvyaktana; B, C, E, F, H-L, N: °tvenoparayaābhivvyaktana; D: °tve-

nopenayāhivya(?)ktena; G: °vyana; M: vidyamānotvenoparayaābhi-

vyaktana; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁴ A, H, I: °utpādaḥpratimedhā°;

C: °pratishedhā°; D: °vyahicāriṇā; E, F, K: °utpādapratimedhā°; G:

°pratimadhyavya°; E, L: °utpādapratimedhā°; M: °pratimedhābhicā-

raṇā ¹⁵ D: evaṃ ¹⁶ A, B, E, F, H-L, N: °venam; C, G: °virodho-

dbhovenam; D: °mānanirodhodbhāvam; M: °virodhotbhāvena; em.

by LVP (silently) ¹⁷ B: anuṭiṣṭham; C, G, J, N: anuṣṭhitam; D: ānu°;

M: anuṣṭhitam ¹⁸ C, M: evati; D: e; G: avati; Tib: n.e. eva ¹⁹ I:

vim ²⁰ E, L: tat kim ucyate ta kim ucyate; I: ta kim ucyateḥ ²¹ D:

td (= t virāma d) ²² Q: uktam ayuktaṃ; D: amuktaṃ; F, K: ayukta

हेतुदृष्टान्तानभिधानाद्¹ इति² ॥

E5v

§30. न च³ केवलं हेतुदृष्टान्तानभिधानं⁴ न⁵ सम्भवति⁶ । परोक्तदोषा-
परिहारो⁷ ऽपि⁸ न सम्भवति । कथं कृत्वा । साङ्ख्या⁹ हि नैवाभिव्यक्त-
रूपस्य¹⁰ पुरो¹¹ ऽवस्थितस्य¹² घटस्य पुनरभिव्यक्तिम्¹³ इच्छन्ति¹⁴ ।

N7r F5v

5 तस्यैव¹⁵ चेह¹⁶ दृष्टान्तत्वेनोपादानं¹⁷ सिद्धरूपत्वात् । अनभिव्यक्त-
रूपस्य¹⁸ च¹⁹ शक्तिरूपपन्नस्योत्पत्तिप्रतिषेधविशिष्टस्य²⁰ साध्यत्वात्

C8r

¹ Q: °dṛṣṭānabhidhānād; A: °dṛṣṭātabhidhātād; B-E, G, H, J-N: °dṛ-
ṣṭānabhidhānād; F: °dṛṣṭā≈abhidhānād; I: hetuṃdṛṣṭānabhidhānād;
em. by LVP (silently) ² H: itiḥ ³ Tib: n.e. ca ⁴ D: hetuṣṭāntāna-
bhi°; F, K: hetudṛṣṭāntāna° ⁵ N: ta ⁶ P: Ø; D: maṃstevati; F:
°tiḥ ⁷ A: °doṣoṣariharo; B, D-F, H, I, K, L: °doṣoparihāro; C, G, J,
M: °doṣoparidoṣo; N: padoktadoṣoparidoṣo; em. by LVP to *parokta-*
doṣāparihāradoṣo on the basis of the dittography in his Paris and
Calcutta mss (= M and N), although he notes that Tib reads otherwise
(PsP_L 21, n. 2). Tib: gzhan gyis smras pa'i nyes pa ma bsal ba ⁸ A-
N om.; PsP_L: om. 'pi; Tib: yang ⁹ G: sākhya ¹⁰ Tib: n.e. eva
¹¹ F: pase ¹² H: pasthitasya ¹³ C, G: punarayivyaktim; D: puna-
rahivyaktim; I: om. punarabhivyaktim icchanti | tasyaiva ceha dṛṣṭā-
ntatvenopādānaṃ siddharūpatvāt | anabhivyaktarūpasya ca śaktirūpā-
pannasyotpattipratīṣedhaviśiṣṭasya; J, M, N: punarapivyaktim ¹⁴ C,
G, J, M, N: ichati ¹⁵ C, G, M: tasyava; J, N: tasyeva ¹⁶ A: vaiha;
D: cahe; E-H, L, M: veva ¹⁷ C, J: °tvenotpādānaṃ; G, M: °tveno-
tvādānaṃ; F, K: dṛṣṭāntatvenopādrānaṃ; Tib: n.e. upādāna ¹⁸ C, G,
J, M, N: anabhivayarūpasya; D: anebhi° ¹⁹ Q: om.; D, G: va ²⁰ A,
B, F, E, K, L: °pratīṣedhamviśiṣṭasya; C, G, J, M: °pratīṣedhamviśiṣṭa;
D: śaktirūpāpannasyānpatti...viśiṣṭasya; H: °rūpāpannasyotpattiprati-
vedhamviśiṣṭasya; N: °pratīṣedhamviśiṣṭa; LVP follows the readings
found in M and N which lack the genitive ending and therefore con-
joins °viśiṣṭa with the following word to form °pratīṣedhaviśiṣṭasā-
dhyatvār; Tib: skye ba bkag pas khyad par du byas pa ni bsgrub par
bya ba yin pa nyid kyi phyir

H7v कुतः¹ सिद्धसाधनपक्षदोषाशङ्का² कुतो वा हेतोर्³ विरुद्धार्थता-
 K7v शङ्केति⁴ । तस्मात् स्वतो⁵ ऽनुमानवाधाचोदनायाम्⁶ अपि यथोप-
 L6v वर्णितदोषाभावात्⁷ परोक्तदोषपरिहारासम्भव⁸ एवेत्य्⁹ असम्बद्धम्¹⁰
 एवैतद्¹¹ दूषणम्¹² इति विज्ञेयम् ॥

PsP_L 22

G8r J8r §31. घटादिकम्¹³ इति चादिशब्देन¹⁴ निरवशेषोत्पित्सुपदार्थ- 5
 सङ्ग्रहस्य¹⁵ विवक्षितत्वाद्¹⁶ अनैकान्तिकतापि¹⁷ पटादिभिर्¹⁸ नैव¹⁹

¹ C, G, M: kutrah ² P: °do(ṣāśa)[1]; A, E, F, H, I, L: °śakā; C, G, J, M, N: °saṃkā; D: °doṣoṣaṃkā; K: °dāṣāśaṃkā; em. by LVP (silently) ³ P: Ø; A: hotā; C, D, G, J, M, N: heto; E, F, H, I, K, L: hoto; em. by LVP (silently) ⁴ A, E, H, I: viruddhārthasaṃtāketi; F, K, L: viruddhārthasaṃtāketi ⁵ P: (s)+[1]; D: ṣato ⁶ P: Ø; A, E, L: numānumāmbodhyacādanāyām; B: numānanumānabodhacādanāyām; D: nusānabādhacā?≈pām; F: numāmbodhyacānahāyām; C, G, J, N: numāmbodhacādanāyām; H: as A, °yām; I: numānumāmbodhacādanāyām; K: numāmbodhyacānadāyām; M: nusāmbodhacādanāyām; em. with conj. by LVP: 'numāna[vi]rodhacodanāyām; Tib: rjes su dpag pas 'gal ba brjod pa na. See de Jong 1978: 30. ⁷ A: yathopavasyi(?)nedoṣābhāvata; B: °bhāvataḥ; C, G, J, N: °varṇitedoṣābhāvata; D: °varṇitedoṣobhāvāt; E: yathopavasmitedoṣābhāvata; F, H, I, K: yathopavasmitedoṣābhāvataḥ; L: yathopavaṇitedoṣābhāvata; M: °varṇitedoṣābhāvata; em. by LVP; Tib: ji skad smras pa'i nyes pa brjod pa med pa'i phyir ÷ yathopavarṇitedoṣābhāvāt ⁸ C, G, J, M, N: parakta°; D: parāktadoṣo° ⁹ A, E, H, I, L: evehby; D: emety ¹⁰ Q: asaṃbandham; A-C, E-H, J-N: asaṃbuddham; I: esaṃbuddham; em. by LVP (silently) ¹¹ A: evaitata; D: avaitat; G, M: evaita; I: evaitatad; N: evetad; Tib: 'di dag ÷ etat ¹² I: bhūṣaṇam ¹³ C, G, J, M, N: ghaṇadikam; F: paṭādikam ¹⁴ P: vādiśa-bdena; PsP_L om. ca; Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁵ Q: niraveśe°; A: °pitsupardartha°; C, M, N: niravaśeṣetpit°; D: niraveśeṣotpitsupadārtha°; G: nira-sta(?)śeṣet°; I: nīra° ¹⁶ D: vivajitatvāt ¹⁷ A, E: anaikānti; D: °ka-tyapi; F, H, I, K, L: anaikānti ¹⁸ Q: ghaṭāḍibhir; A, E, F, H, I, K, L:

सम्भवति॥

§32. अथ वायम्¹ अन्यः² प्रयोगमार्गः³ – पुरुषव्यतिरिक्तः⁴
पदार्थाः⁵ स्वत उत्पत्तिवादिनस् तत एव⁸ न स्वत⁹ उत्पद्यन्ते¹⁰
स्वात्मना विद्यमानत्वात् पुरुषवद्¹¹ इतीदम्¹² उदाहरणम् उदा-
हार्यम्¹³ ॥

§33. यद्यपि¹⁴ चाभिव्यक्तिवादिन¹⁵ उत्पादप्रतिषेधो¹⁶ न बाधकः¹⁸
तथाप्य¹⁹ अभिव्यक्ताव्²⁰ उत्पादशब्दं²¹ निपात्य²² पूर्वं²³ पश्चाच्च²⁴ 19v

bhi; B: ghaṭādibhir; C, D, G, J, M, N: ghaṭādibhi; em. by LVP: paṭādi-
bhir; Tib: snam bu la sogs pa dag gis ¹⁹ Tib: n.e. eva

¹ P: ∅; D: vāmam ² P: ∅; A-C, E-G, I-N: anya; H: atya; em. by LVP
(silently) ³ P: ∅; A: prajoga°; D: pramāga°; G: °mārga; I: °mārg-
taḥ; Tib: yang na sbyor ba 'di ni tshul gzhan yin te ∴ atha vāyam
anyaḥ prayogamārgaḥ ⁴ P: [3](vy).[1](r).(k)t+ḥ; A, E, F, K, L: puru-
ṣatiriktāḥ; C, M: °vyatiriktamḥ; G: °vyatiriktam; H: puruṣatiruktāḥ; I:
puruṣatiriktā ⁵ D: padārthauḥ; N: °thaḥ ⁶ I: °vāditaḥ ⁷ Q: tatra;
H: pata ⁸ D: eve; H: yeva; Tib: n.e. tata eva ⁹ M: ta ¹⁰ A: utya-
dyate; D: utpedyante ¹¹ A-C, E-N: puruṣaved; em. by LVP. LVP
(PsP_L 22, n. 5) reports that ms L reads *puruṣavad* but it too reads *pu-
ruṣaved*. ¹² A, B, D-F, H, K, L: atīdam; C, G, J, M, N: atīvam; I:
atidam; em. by LVP ¹³ A: udāhārya; C, G, J, M: udāhāryaḥ; N:
udāhāryaḥ; Tib: skyes bu bzhiñ no zhes dper brjod pa 'di nyid dper
brjod par bya'o ∴ puruṣavad itīdam udāharaṇam udāhāryam ¹⁴ C,
G, M: yadyaṣi ¹⁵ A, E, H, I, L: cābhivādina; C: cābhivyaktāḥ; F, K:
cābhicādina; G: cābhivyaktiḥ; M: cādhivyaktiḥ; Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁶ D:
°prativedho ¹⁷ D: ne; H: ta ¹⁸ G: °kats ¹⁹ D: tathāvy ²⁰ D:
abhiṣyevyaktāḥ ²¹ G: °śadvan ²² A, E, H: tipātya ²³ A, E-I, K,
L: pūrva ²⁴ A: paścā; M: paścān

M6v A6v चानुपलब्ध्युपलब्धिसाधर्म्येणोत्पादशब्देनाभिव्यक्तेर¹ एवाभिधानाद्²
 B7v अयं प्रतिषेधो³ नाबाधकः⁴ ॥

§34. कथं पुनर्⁵ अयं⁶ यथोक्तो ऽर्थो विनैवेत्थंविचाराभिधानाल्⁷

¹ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): cānupalabdhīyupalabdhisādharmyēnotpādaśabdenābhivvyakter. P: °sādharm(m)myiṇnotpāda°; Q: °sādharmmeṇotpāda°; A: nupalabdhāpalabdhisādharmeśo°; B: °sādharmeṇo°; C, M: cānupalabdhisādharmāṇo°; D: anupalabdhīyapalebdhisodharmonotpādaśabdenobhivvyakter; E, K, L: cānupalabdhya(?)palabdhisādharmeśo°; F: cānupaladhyapalabdhisādharmeṇo...vyaktar; G: cānupabdhisādharmmaṇo°; H, I: °dharmeśo°; J: cānupalabdhupalabdhisādharmeṇo°; N: cānupal(?)alabdhupalabdhisādharmmeṇo° ² C, G, J, M, N: avā°; D: evādidhānād ³ D: pratiśādhā; I: repeats pratiśedho; M: pratiśodho ⁴ A, E, H, I, L: °keḥ; C, G: nādhakāḥ; J, M, N: nādhakāḥ; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ C, G, J, N: punarṁ ⁶ P: ayam artho; D: aye ⁷ Em.: yathokto 'rtho vinaivetthaṁvicārābhidhānāl. P attests for the entire sentence: katham punar ayam artho yathoktacarccām vinaivetthaṁvicārānabhidhānāl labhyata iti; Q: katham punar ayam yathoktaś cārtho vinaivetthaṁvicārābhidhānāl labhyata iti; (paper mss for the concerned words:) A: yathoktaḥsvābhidhānaṁ vinaivya≈vicāro; B: yathoktaḥsvābhidhānaṁ vinaivetthaṁvicāro; C, G, J, M, N: yathoktaḥsvābhidhānaṁ vinaivya-sthaṁvicāro; D: yathoktaḥsvābhidhānaṁ vinaivetthaṁvivaṇo; E, H, I, K, L: yathoktaḥsvābhidhānaṁ vinaivyatthaṁvicāro; F: yathoktaḥsvābhidhānaṁ vinaivyarthamvicāro; Tib: yang ji skad smras pa'i don gyi rjod par byed pa med par rnam par dpyod pa 'di lta bu 'di ji ltar rnyed (De Jong [1978: 30] judges that Tib's second 'di should be deleted, but it reflects Skt *ayam*). LVP, in reliance on Tib, emends the sentence to read *katham punar ayam yathoktārthābhidhānaṁ vinā vyastavicāro labhyate*; although LVP (PsP_L 22, n. 8) reports that his mss all read "*vinaī vyasthaṁ vicāro*," ms L reads *vinaivyatthaṁvicāro*. I suspect that the scribe of a ms from which the paper mss descend was disturbed by the sentence (he may have had to deal with a reading like

PsPL 23

लभ्यत¹ इति चेत्² तद्³ उच्यते – अर्थवाक्यानि⁴ ह्येतानि⁵ महार्था-
नि यथोदितम्⁶ अर्थं सङ्गृह्य⁷ प्रवृत्तानि। तानि⁹ च¹⁰ व्याख्याय-
मानानि यथोक्तम् अर्थात्मानं¹¹ प्रसूयन्त¹² इति नात्र¹³ किञ्चिद्¹⁴

ms P's *anabhidhānāt*) and removed *abhidhānāt/anabhidhānāt*, adding *abhidhānam* before *vinā* (cf. Speijer §182, n. 1 on *vinā* construed with a following word). At least one of the two mss on which Tib is based appears to have contained the revised sentence. Ms P's *carccām* must be the result of deliberate change; the intended construal of *vinā* with the following ablative was overlooked and accusative *carccām* was introduced, which required the change of *abhidhānāt* to *anabhidhānāt*. Ms Q's *yathoktaś cārtho* may also be the result of deliberate change, or it may have come into Q's line because a dittography of the *akṣara rtho* (possibly resulting in the reading *yathoktārthārtho*) resulted in *rthā* being read/re-interpreted as *ścā*. *LT's author appears to have relied on a ms which read as PsP Tib's ms(s); he comments: *kathaṃ punar ayam uktaprayoge ayam vicāro jñāyatām* (cf. Yonezawa 2004: 122, 135 [fol. 2a2]).

¹ A, E, H, I, L: *latyata* ² D: *vet*; F: *cait*; H: *cyat* ³ D: *yad*; G: *om.*; H: *ta*; I: *ta* ⁴ A, E-L, N: *athavākyāni*; C: *athavy(?)ākyāni*; D: *°vā-khyāni*; M: *athavyakyāni*; em. by LVP. LVP overlooks the reading in M (Paris) when he reports that his mss read *atha vākyāni*. ⁵ A, B, E, F, H, I, K, L: *rhr̥tāni*; C: *ha(?)tāni*; D: *rhatāni* (*°rhr̥?*); G, J, M, N: *hrtāni*; em. by LVP, who records that all his mss read *hrtāni* (Cambridge reads *rhr̥tāni*), to *tāni*; Tib: 'di dag ni. De Jong's (1978: 30) emendation *hy etāni* is confirmed by P and Q. ⁶ A: *pathoditam*; H: *yathāditam* ⁷ A-N: *artha*; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ A: *saṃgrsva*; C: *saṃgr̥hna*; G: *sagr̥*; J: *saṃgr̥kṣy(?)a*; M: *saṃgr̥hū* ⁹ P: *om.*; G: *tā*; M: *om.*; Tib: *de dag* ¹⁰ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: *na ca*; C, G, M: *va* ¹¹ D: *arthātpādamaṇaṃ*; F: *athānmānaṃ*; H: *athātmānaṃ* ¹² P: *prasūyanta*; D: *°ntaḥ*; G: *prasūyakṣe*; H: *pramūyaṃtaḥ* ¹³ A-C, E-N: *cātra*; D: *vātra*; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁴ C, G, J, M, N: *cikid*; D: *kiuid*; I: *kiṃcīd*

C8v Q4v अनुपात्तं¹ सम्भाव्यते² ॥

§35. प्रसङ्गविपरीतेन³ चार्थेन⁴ परस्यैव⁵ सम्बन्धः। नास्माकं स्व-
 D4v N7v प्रतिज्ञाया⁶ अभावात्। ततश्च सिद्धान्तविरोधासम्भवः। परस्य च
 H8r यावद्⁸ बहवो⁹ दोषाः¹⁰ प्रसङ्गविपरीतापत्त्यापद्यन्ते¹¹। तावद्¹²
 अस्माभिर् अभीष्यत¹³ एवेति¹⁴। कुतो नु खल्व्¹⁵ अविपरीताचार्य-
 G8v E6r नागार्जुनमतानुसारिण¹⁶ आचार्यबुद्धपालितस्य¹⁷ सावकाशवचना-
 K8r J8v मिधायिबम्¹⁸। यतो¹⁹ ऽस्य परो ऽवकाशं²⁰ लभते²¹। निःस्वभाव-

PsP_L 24

¹ P: anupāntaṃ; A: anutpāmttaṃ; C, E, F, H-J, L: anutpāttam; G, M: anutpātta; N: anutpāttan; em. by LVP (silently) ² F: sabhāṣyate; H: °teḥ; Tib: srid ÷ sambhāvyate (causative). LVP (PsP_L 23, n. 2) reconstructs Tib's *ma bstan pa ... mi srid do as na ... anupadiṣṭam ... saṃbhavati*. ³ A: °viparītena; F: °viparītāvīparītena ⁴ Q: cārthe; I: vārthyana ⁵ G: yara° ⁶ D: pratijñāyā≈ ⁷ C, G, J, N: °nirodhā°; M: °nirodho° ⁸ D: yovad ⁹ D: bahavā ¹⁰ D: seṣāḥ; H, I: doṣā; M: doṣoḥ ¹¹ P: °viparīta°; A, C-E, I, L: °rītāpatyā°; H: praḥsaṃ-gavīparītāḥpatyā° ¹² C, G, M: tavad; D: tovad ¹³ Q: abhiṣyanta; A, C, E, G-J, M, N: abhiṣyata; D: ahīṣyata ¹⁴ A, E, F, I, K, L: evati; H: evatiḥ ¹⁵ A, E, H, I: ṣalv ¹⁶ Q: °nārgjunamatā°; A, H: avīparī-tācāryā°; C: °nārgjūsamatā°; D: avīparītāvāryanārgjunasatānūsāri-ṇa; G: °nārgjūsamatā°; J: °nārgjūsamatā°; N: nārgjuna° ¹⁷ A: °pālitasvam; D: āvarya°; E, H: °pālitasyam; I: °pārītasyam ¹⁸ A: mevakāśavacanābhīdhāyetvaṃ; C: °vacamābhīdhāyetvaṃ; E: meva-kāśavacanābhīdhāyetvaṃ; F, L: sme vakāśavacanābhīdhāyetvaṃ; G, M: °vacasābhīdhāyetvaṃ; H: mekkāśavacanābhīdhāyetvaṃ; I: meva-kaśavacatābhīdhāyetvaṃ; K: sme vakāśavacanābhīdhāyetvaṃ ¹⁹ A: yeto; I: yatva ²⁰ D: ≈ākāśaṃ; I: °vaśaṃ; M: cakāśaṃ ²¹ K: la-bhete; em. by LVP (silently): labheta

भाववादिना¹ च² सस्वभावभाववादिनः³ प्रसङ्ग⁴ आपाद्यमाने⁵ कुतः⁶
 प्रसङ्गविपरीतार्थप्रसङ्गिता⁷ । न हि शब्दा⁸ दाण्डपाशिका⁹ इव F6r I10r
 वक्तारम्¹⁰ अस्वतन्त्रयन्ति¹¹ । किं¹² तर्हि । सत्यां¹³ शक्तौ वक्तुर्¹⁴ वि-
 वक्षाम्¹⁵ अनुविधीयन्ते¹⁶ । ततश्च परप्रतिज्ञाप्रतिषेधमात्रफलत्वात्
 5 प्रसङ्गापादनस्य¹⁷ नास्ति प्रसङ्गविपरीतार्थापत्तिः¹⁸ ॥ L7r

¹ A: niḥsvabhāvanādinā; B, C, E-N: niḥsvabhāvabhāvanādinā; D: niḥsvabhāvehāvādinā; em. by LVP; Tib: n.e. bhāva: rang bzhin med par smra bas ² PsP_L: om. ca; Tib: n.e. ca ³ A, E, I: sasvabhāvādinah; C, G, J, M, N: svabhāvabhāvanādinah; D: sasvabhāvahāvevādinah; F, K, L: sasvabhāvabhāvādinah; H: as A, °dina; em. by LVP. LVP (PsP_L 24, n. 1) reports that his mss read °nādinah and °nādinā; M and N (Paris and Calcutta) read °nādinah but L (Cambridge) reads °vādinah. Tib: n.e. bhāva: rang bzhin dang bcas par smra ba la ⁴ D: samprasāṅge ⁵ Q: āpadyamāne; em. by LVP (printing error?): āpadyamāne; Tib: bsgrubs pa na ⁶ A, B, D-F, H, I, K, L: kṛtaḥ; C, J, M, N: kṛteḥ; G: kṛte; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ A: °prasagitā; C, G, M: om. prasaṅgaviparītārthaprasaṅgitā | na hi śābdā dāṇḍapāśikā iva vaktāram asvatantrayanti | kiṃ tarhi | satyāṃ śaktau vaktur vivakṣām anuvīdhīyante | tataś ca parapratijñāpratiśedhamātraphalatvāt; F: °tāḥ; I: °viparītārthapragitā; Tib: thal ba las bzlog pa'i don can du thal bar ga la 'gyur ⇨ kutaḥ prasaṅgaviparītārthaprasaṅgitā. LVP (PsP_L 24, n. 2) reconstructs Tib's Skt as *prasaṅgena viparītārthatāprasaṅgaḥ kutaḥ* but the Skt may have read as the mss do. ⁸ A, B, E, H-L, N: śābde; F: śa with stroke for i above the line ⁹ F: dāṇḍapāṇikā ¹⁰ D: vakṣāṃras ¹¹ A, B, E, K, L: asvamaṃtrayanti; D: asvaman-trayanti; F: aśvamatrayanti; H: as A, °tī; I, J, N: asvamantrayanti; em. by LVP; Tib: dbang med par byed pa ¹² D: ki ¹³ F: śatyāṃ ¹⁴ A, B, E, F, H-L, N: vaktu; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁵ H: vivakṣyām ¹⁶ I: anuvīdhīyante ¹⁷ A, E, H: °datasya; D: prasaṅgāyāda°; F: prasagā°; I: prasagāpādatasya ¹⁸ D: °viparītārthapattih; F: prasaṅ-gavirīrtā°; H: °viparītā°; K: prasaṅgavirātārtā°

§36. तथा चाचार्यो¹ भूयसा² प्रसङ्गापत्तिमुखेनैव³ परपक्षं⁴
निराकरोति⁵ स्म⁶ –

P5r नाकाशं⁷ विद्यते⁸ किञ्चित्⁹ पूर्वमाकाशलक्षणात्।
अलक्षणं¹⁰ प्रसज्येत¹¹ स्यात्¹² पूर्वं¹³ यदि¹⁴ लक्षणात्॥

रूपकारणनिर्मुक्ते¹⁵ रूपे¹⁶ रूपं¹⁷ प्रसज्यते¹⁸ ।

5

अहेतुकं¹⁹ न चास्त्य²⁰ अर्थः²¹ कश्चिद्²² आहेतुकः²³ क्वचित्²⁴ ॥

¹ Q: cāryo; D: cācāryā; H: cāryo ² F: kūyasā; N: bhūyasyā ³ C, G, J, N: °mukhainaiva; I: °mukhanaiva ⁴ A-F, H-M: °pakṣā; G, N: parakṣā; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ D: nirokaroti ⁶ Q: om. ⁷ D: nākiśaṃ ⁸ D: vidyaṃte ⁹ F: kicit ¹⁰ A: arakṣaṇaṃ ¹¹ A: prasaṃhyeta; B: prasatyeta; E, F, L: prasahyeta; H: pasahyetaḥ; I: prasaṃjyetaḥ ¹² F: syā; L: syā, half-*daṇḍa*, t ¹³ D, G: pūrva ¹⁴ D: yati ¹⁵ Em. with LVP: rūpakāraṇanirmukte. P, Q: rūpakāraṇanirmuktaṃ na rūpaṃ upalabhyate: mss P and Q substitute MMK IV.1ab for MMK IV.2ab, the verse-half attested in the other mss and Tib. MMK IV.2cd, as in the other mss, follows. A, E: rūpakārūṇanirmukta; B, C, G, J, K, M, N: rūpakārūṇa°; D: °nimuktaḥ; F: rūpakārūṇanirmukte; H: rūpakārūṇanirmukta; I: as A, °ktaḥ; L: rūpakārūṇanirmukta, with (Nepalese-script) wavy line over *kt* to indicate *kte*; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁶ A, E: rūye; I: rūpa ¹⁷ F, K: rūpa ¹⁸ A: prasaṃhyate; B, E, F, H, L: prasahyate; G: pasajyate ¹⁹ F: ahotukaṃ. LVP (PsP_L 24, n. 8) states that his mss read *āhetukam* but all read *ahetukaṃ*. The mss also read *ahetukaṃ* when the *kārikā* is presented in the fourth chapter (P is damaged; I do not have access to Q's fourth chapter). Ye (2011a: 68) accepts *āhetukaṃ*. Nāgārjuna uses the form *āhetuka* when the metre demands a long syllable (cf. MacDonald 2007: 34), but one is not required here. ²⁰ D: vā° ²¹ L: urthaḥ ²² C, G, J, N: kacid ²³ G: °ka; LVP emends to *ahetukaḥ* but makes reference (PsP_L 24, n. 8) to the reading *āhetukaḥ* in his mss. He accepts the reading *āhetukaḥ* for the *kārikā* at its occurrence in the fourth chapter and in his

इति¹ ।

PsP_L 25 तथा²

भावस्³ तावन् न निर्वाणं⁴ जरामरणलक्षणम्⁵ ।

प्रसज्येतास्ति⁶ भावो⁷ हि न⁸ जरामरणं⁹ विना ॥

B8r

5 इत्यादिना¹⁰ ॥

§37. अथार्थवाक्यत्वाद्¹¹ आचार्यवाक्यानां¹² महार्थत्वे¹³ सत्य् अनेक-

A7r

प्रयोगहेतुत्वं¹⁴ परिकल्प्येत¹⁵ । आचार्यबुद्धपालितवाक्यान्¹⁶ अपि

C9r

list of corrections at PsP_L 597 corrects the first chapter citation to *āhetukaḥ*. ²⁴ G: kṛcid

¹ PsP_L: om. iti ² H: tathāḥ; M: tadyathā; LVP: tadyathā; Tib: de bzhin du ³ D: havas ⁴ D: nivaṇaṃ ⁵ A, E, H, I: °ṇa; C: °mara-ṇamlakṣaṇaṃ; M: lakṣaṇaṃ ⁶ A, E, F, H, I: prasahyatāsti; B, L: prasahyetāsti; C, G, K: prasajyatāsti; D: prasajyetosti ⁷ A: bhāva; B, C, E-N: bhāvā; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ H: om. ⁹ A, C, D, E, G-I, M: °ṇa ¹⁰ A, E, H, I, L: vinebhyādinā; C, G, J: vinesvādinā; M: vitesvādinā ¹¹ C, G-I, N: arthārtha° ¹² A, E, H: °na; D: āvākyā-nāya; I: °nā ¹³ D: mahāthatve ¹⁴ Q: anekaprayogaṇiṣpattihetutvaṃ; A, B, E, F, H, I, K, L: anekaprayogaṇiṣpattihetutvaṃ; D: anekapramogaṇiṣpatti°; C, G, J, M, N: enekaprayogaṇiṣpatti°; PsP_L: °prayogaṇiṣpattihetutvaṃ; PsP Tib: sbyor ba du ma'i rgyu nyid (n.e. niṣpatti). It is difficult to explain P's loss of *niṣpatti* on paleographical grounds. PsP Tib does not copy in PP Tib at this point (PP Tib: sbyor ba'i tshig du ma dag gi gzhi) but rather translates from PsP Sanskrit. It would seem that Q and ms ı received the interpolated and explanatory reading *niṣpatti* from ms δ. It is possible that *niṣpatti* was in the ms related to δ used by the Tibetan translators, but was not appropriated by them. ¹⁵ Q: parikalpet; A-C, E-N: parikalpet; D: parikalpya; em. of *parikalpet* by LVP (silently) to *parikalpyate*. De Jong (1978: 30) accepts D's reading which he considers as confirmed by

किमिति न तथैव¹ परिकल्प्यन्ते² ।

H8v M7r §38. अथ स्यात्³ – वृत्तिकाराणाम्⁴ एष न्यायो⁵ यत् प्रयोगवाक्य-
विस्तराभिधानं⁶ कर्तव्यम्⁷ इति ।

I10v J9r एतदपि नास्ति⁸ । विग्रहव्यावर्तन्याम्⁹ वृत्तिं¹⁰ कुर्वताप्य¹¹ आचार्येण¹²
प्रयोगवाक्यानभिधानात्¹³ ॥

5

Tib's *rtoḡ na*; *rtoḡ nas*, however, would be the more usual equivalent for the gerund *parikalpya*. The *na* here more than likely represents part of the translation for *atha*, that is, it is the concluding particle of the oft-attested *ci ste ... na* (see, e.g., CŚT Tib-Skt Index [Suzuki 1994: 112] where *rtoḡ na* is listed as translating only present passive, present participle and optative forms, and the occurrences of *rtoḡ na* for *kalpyeta*, *parikalpyate* and *parikalpyeta* are preceded by *ci ste*).
¹⁶ A, E: °vākyaṭp; G: °buddhapālivākyaṭy; N: °vyākyaṭvy; em. by LVP of °vākyaṭy to °vyākhyānāny, even though his mss support the reading °vākyaṭy and he notes (PsPL 25, n. 3) that Tib “= vākyaṭi”; Tib: ngag dag.

¹ C: tatheva; D: tatyeva; Tib: n.e. eva ² A, E, H: parikalpet; B: parikalpyate; C, M, N: parikalpānte; F: parikalpante; G: parikalpāke; I: parikalpeta; K: parikal(?)paṃte; L: parikalpaṃte; em. by LVP (silently) ³ D: smād ⁴ Q: °kāraṇām; A, C: °kāraṇām; D: vṛttikoraṇom; F: °kānāṇām ⁵ A, E, F, H, I, K: tyāyo; C, G, M: nyāvo ⁶ A, C, E, F, H-J, L, N: payogavākyaṭyaviṣṭarā°; B, G, M: °viṣṭarā°; K: yayogavākyaṭyaviṣṭarā°; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ A: kartarvya ⁸ E: tāsti; F: nāsti ⁹ A, E, H, I, L: vighrahavyāpattatyām; B, J: °vyāpattanyām, C: °vyāparttinyām; D: °vyāvattanyām; F, K: °vyāpattavyām; G: °vyāpattimnyā; M: °vyāpattinyām; N: °vyāpattamnyām; em. by LVP: vighrahavyāvartanyā. LVP states that all his mss read *vighrahavyāpattibhyām* (but see L, M and N). Tib: rtsod pa bzlog pa'i ¹⁰ D: vṛtti ¹¹ A, B, E, G, J-M: kurvatopy; C, I, N: kurvvatopy; F: kūrvatopy; H: kurdhato-py; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² C, D, G, I, M: ācāryaṇa; H: ācāryena; K: ācāyemṇa ¹³ D: prayāgavākyaṭyānebhidhānāt

§39. अपि चात्मनस्¹ तर्कशास्त्रातिकौशलमात्रम्² आचिख्यासोर्³ N8r K8v
 अङ्गीकृतमध्यमकदर्शनस्यापि⁴ यत् स्वतन्त्रप्रयोगवाक्याभिधानम्। G9r
 तदतितराम्⁵ अनेकदोषसमुदायास्पदम्⁶ अस्य तार्किकस्योप-
 लक्ष्यते⁷। कथं कृत्वा। तत्र⁸ यत्⁹ तावद् एतद्¹⁰ उक्तम्¹¹ –

PsP_L 26

प्रयोगवाक्यं¹² ब्रू एतद्¹³ भवति – न परमार्थत¹⁴ आध्यात्मि-
 कान्य¹⁵ आयतनानि¹⁶ स्वत¹⁷ उत्पन्नानि¹⁸ विद्यमानत्वाच्च¹⁹

¹ D: vāt°; F, K: cātmatas ² A: tarkarśāstātīkau°; C, G, J, M, N: tarkaśāstrādi°; D: terkaśāmtrātikauśalampātram ³ A-C, E, F, H-N: āvikhyāsār; D: avikhyāsor; G: āvisyasār; conj. by LVP: āvi[ścikīrṣayā]; Tib: bstan par 'dod pas ⁴ Q: °madhyaka°; A, E: °darśasyāpi; H: aṅgi...darśasyāpi; I: °madhyamadarśasyāpi; Tib: dbu ma pa'i lta ba khas len bzhin du yang ⇨ aṅgīkṛtamadhyamakadarśanasyāpi (dbu ma pa'i lta ba presumes mādhyamikadarśana) ⁵ C, G, M: °rom ⁶ A, E, F, H-L, N: °samudāyospadam; C, G, M: °samudrāyospadam; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ A, E, G, H, I: °palabhyate; B, F, J-L, N: °palakṣate; C, J, M: °palakate; D: tarkikasyāpa°; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ A-C, E-N: om.; conj. by LVP: [tatra]; Tib: de la ⁹ A, E, H, I: yap ¹⁰ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: aiva; B, C, G, J, M, N: eva; em. by LVP: evam; Tib: 'di skad du ¹¹ A-C, E-N: yuktam ¹² P: prayogavākya ¹³ A, D, E, F, H-L: atad; C, G, M, N: ata; conj. by LVP: [atra] prayogavākyaṃ bhavati; Tib: n.e. etat: 'dir sbyor ba'i tshig tu 'gyur ba ni. PsP Tib cites from PP Tib: 'dir sbyor ba'i tshig tu 'gyur ba ni. ¹⁴ A-C, E-N: parārtha; conj. by LVP: para[m]ārtha[ta] ¹⁵ D: ādhyālmikāny ¹⁶ D, M: āyatenāni ¹⁷ G: svatantra ¹⁸ Q: om. utpannāni vidyamānatvāt caitanyavat || iti | kimartham punar atra paramārthata iti viśeṣaṇam upādīyate || lokasaṃvṛtyābhyupetasyotpādasāpṛatiṣedhyamānatvāt pratiṣedhe cābhyupetabādhāprasāṅgād iti cet | naitad yuktam saṃvṛtyāpi svata (eyeskip: svata utpannāni → svata utpattyanabhyupagamāt); D: ulpannāni ¹⁹ A, E: vidyamānatvāt

चैतन्यवत्¹ ॥

इति किमर्थ² पुनर्³ अत्र परमार्थत इति विशेषणम्⁴ उपादीयते⁵ ॥

E6v L7v §40. लोकसंवृत्याभ्युपेतस्योत्पादस्याप्रतिषिध्यमानत्वात्⁶ प्रतिषेधे
चाभ्युपेतबाधाप्रसङ्गाद्⁷ इति चेत्⁸ नैतद् युक्तं संवृत्यापि⁹ स्वत⁹
उत्पत्त्यनभ्युपगमात्¹⁰ ॥

5

§41. यथोक्तं सूत्रे –

¹ A: om. caitanyavat ॥ iti | kimarthaṃ punar atra paramārthata iti viśe-
ṣaṇam upādīyate ॥ lokasaṃvṛtyābhyupetasyotpādasyāpratiṣidhyamā-
natvāt; B, E, F, H-L, N: °vād; D: caivanyavad; C, G, M: caitavyavod;
em. by LVP ² C, G, M: kimarthaḥ; E, H-L, N: kimartha; F: kima-
tha; em. by LVP (silently) ³ D: puner; G: punav; Tib: n.e. punar
⁴ C, G, J, M, N: viśeṣam ⁵ B, C, E, G-N: upādāyate; F: upādāyete;
em. by LVP (silently) ⁶ C, E, H, J-L: °bhyupatasyo°; D: lokaśaṃkṛ-
tyātyuyetasyānpādasyāpratividhyamānatvāt; F: °saṃvṛtyātyūpatasyā-
tpādasyā°; G: °saṃvṛtyātyupatasyo°; I: °bhyupatasyotpāda=tiṣi-
dhya°; M: °saṃvṛtyātyupatasyo°; N: °bhyupatasyo...mānat; em. by
LVP (silently): °bhyupagatasyo°. De Jong (1978: 31) refers to PsP_L
26.3's *cābhyupetabādhāprasaṅgād* as support for the reading °*bhyu-*
petasyo°. ⁷ C: cābhyupata°; D: vātyuyamtabādhā°; F: cātyūpeta°;
G, M: cātyupata°; H: cābhyuyeta° ⁸ A, E: savṛtyāpi; F: savṛtyāpi
⁹ I: svataḥ ¹⁰ A, E, H, I: utpatyenabhyu°; B: utpattyenābhyu°; C, J,
N: utpastyenabhyu° (N: utpattyena°?); D: utpatyunatyupagamāt; F:
utpattenetyūpagamāt; G: utpastyanatyu°; K: utpattenabhyu°; L: utpa-
ttenabhyu°; M: utpastyenatyu°; em. by LVP (silently)

स चायं¹ बीजहेतुको² ऽङ्कुर³ उत्पद्यमानो न स्वयङ्कृतो⁴ ⁵
 परकृतो⁶ नोभयकृतो⁷ नाप्यहेतुसमुत्पन्नो⁸ नेश्वरकालाणुप्रकृति-
 स्वभावसम्भूतः⁹ ॥

इति।

5 तथा

बीजस्य सतो यथाङ्कुरो¹⁰ न च यो¹¹ बीजु¹² स चैव¹³ अङ्कुरो¹⁴ । F6v
 न च अन्यु¹⁵ ततो न¹⁶ चैव¹⁷ तद् एम्¹⁸ अनुच्छेदमशाश्वत¹⁹ C9v
 धर्मता²⁰ ॥

इति²¹ ।

¹ C, G, H, M: cāpam; D: vāyam ² C, G, J, M: °hetukām; D: °hetokā
³ A, E, F, H, I: ākula (ā conjoined with preceding word); B: āṅkula; C,
 G, J, M, N: 'kula; D: 'kuraṃ; K: 'ṃkula; L: '≈ula ⁴ G: svayumkṛto;
 M: svayatkṛto ⁵ F, K: om. ⁶ F, K: om. ⁷ D: nohaya°; I: °kṛtoḥ
⁸ M: °pano ⁹ A, E: °prakṛtiśvabhāva°; D: naiśvarakālā≈pra°; F, K:
 °kālānupakṛtiśva°; L: °kālāmuprakṛtiśva°; M: °kālāśuprakṛti°
¹⁰ D: °karo; F: yathākuro ¹¹ A-N: yā; em. by LVP (silently) ¹² A,
 F: bija; B, D, E, H-J, L, N: bījaṃ; C, G, M: bīja; K: bījaḥ; em. by LVP
 (silently) ¹³ G: caivī ¹⁴ G: kuro ¹⁵ A, E, F, H, I: anyū ¹⁶ K:
 ne ¹⁷ A, E, L: vaiva ¹⁸ Em.: em (cf. BHSD s.v. em). P, Q: evam;
 A-L, N: evam; M: evatadevam; PsP_L: evam. See Translation note.
¹⁹ I: anukṣ(?)edama°; em. by LVP (silently): °da aśāś°; Lalitavistara
 (Lefmann): °da aśāś°. The metre is not affected by the inclusion of
 the *m* of the mss' °dam, which I understand as a hiatus bridger. On
 the verse's metrical problems, see Translation note. ²⁰ P: ☉; D:
 dharmajeti (*sandhi* with following *iti*); N: dharmma ²¹ H: °tiḥ

l11r इहापि वक्ष्यति¹ –

B8v H9r प्रतीत्य² यद् यद् भवति न³ हि तावत्⁴ तद्⁵ एव तत्⁶ ।
न चान्यद्⁷ अपि तत्⁸ तस्मान् नोच्छिन्नं⁹ नापि शाश्वतम् ॥
इति¹⁰ ॥

§42. परमतापेक्षं¹¹ विशेषणम्¹² इति¹³ चेत्¹⁴ । तद्¹⁵ अयुक्तम्¹⁶ ।
J9v संवृत्यापि¹⁷ तदीयव्यवस्थानभ्युपगमात्¹⁸ । सत्यद्वयाविपरीतदर्शन- PsP_L 27
K9r G9v परिभ्रष्टा¹⁹ एव हि तीर्थिका²⁰ यावद्²¹ उभयथापि²² निषिध्यन्ते²³ ।
तावद्²⁴ गुण एव सम्भाव्यत इति²⁵ । एवं²⁶ परमतापेक्षम्²⁷ अपि²⁸
A7v विशेषणाभिधानं न युज्यते²⁹ ॥

¹ F, K: vakṣati ² A: pratitya ³ D: ne ⁴ D: tovat; H: tācat; I: tācan ⁵ M: om.; K: ted ⁶ A-C, E-G, I-N: bhavati; H: bhavatiḥ; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ Tib: n.e. ca ⁸ H: ttat; Tib: n.e. tat ⁹ P: nācchinnaṃ; G, M: °na ¹⁰ H: itiḥ ¹¹ D: paramatāyākṣaṃ ¹² N: viśeṣeṇaṃ; Tib: khyad par du byas ∴ viśeṣaṇaṃ ¹³ M: api ¹⁴ A-E, G-N: ce; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁵ Q: om.; F: om.; Tib: de yang ¹⁶ Q: om.; D: umuktaṃ ¹⁷ C: maṃvṛtyāpi; I: savī° ¹⁸ A, E, H, I: °bhyūpagamāt; B: °sthānetyupagamāt; D, G, M: °tyupagamāt; F: °tyūpagamāt ¹⁹ A-C, E, G, H, J, L-N: satyadvayādviparīta°; D: °viparīta°; F, K: satyadvayādviparītadarśanepari°; I: satyadvayādviparītadarśanaparitrastā°; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ H: torthikā ²¹ N: yāvud ²² C, G, J, N : ubhayayathāpi; M: ubhayeyathāpi ²³ A: nipidhyamte; B: °dhyate; C, E, M: °dhyamte; F, K, L: tiṣidhyamte; H, I: niṣidhyanteḥ ²⁴ M: tācat ²⁵ H: itiḥ ²⁶ B: eṃvaṃ; F: evem ²⁷ P: (para)matāp[2]; A, E: eramatāyekṣ; C, G, M: °pekam; D: °yekṣam; F, K, L: peramatāyekṣ; H: eramatāyech; I: eramatāyākṣ ²⁸ G: ayi ²⁹ G: puḥyate

§43. न चापि¹ लोकः² स्वत उत्पत्तिं प्रतिपन्नः³ यतस्⁴ तदपेक्षयापि⁴ N8v M7v
 विशेषणसाफल्यं⁵ स्यात्। लोको⁶ हि स्वतः परत इत्येवमादिकं⁵ D5r
 विचारमनवतार्य कारणात्⁷ कार्यम्⁸ उत्पद्यत⁹ इत्य्¹⁰ एतावन्मात्रं¹¹
 प्रतिपन्नः ॥

5 §44. एवमाचार्यो ऽपि व्यवस्थापयामासेति¹² सर्वथा विशेषण-
 वैफल्यम्¹³ एव निश्चीयते¹⁴ ॥

§45. अपि च यदि¹⁵ संवृत्योत्पत्तिप्रतिषेधनिराचिकीर्षुणा¹⁶ विशे-
 षणम् एतद्¹⁷ उपादीयते¹⁸ तदा स्वतो ऽसिद्धाधारः¹⁹ पक्षदोष²⁰ Q5r

¹ C, G: rāpi; Tib: n.e. ca ² A: tokaḥ; D: lākaḥ ³ D: yates ⁴ D: tadayekṣayopi; H: tadayakṣayāpi ⁵ A: viśaiśāphalyam; B, C, E-H, J-N: viśeṣasāphalyam; D: viśeṣesāphalam; I: viśeṣasāphalya; em. by LVP (silently) ⁶ D: lokā ⁷ H: kāyakāraṇāt ⁸ M: kāryām ⁹ A: utpadyarte; E: utpadyamte ¹⁰ C, G, M: rit; I: it ¹¹ H: tāvan°; I: āvan° ¹² P: Ø; B: °yāsāseti; I: vevasthā° ¹³ P: [2](ṣa)[1].(ai)phalyam; C, G, J, M: viśeṣeṇa°; D: °vaidaphalyam; F, K: viśeṣavai°; H: °phalam; N: viśepeṇa° ¹⁴ P: Ø; A, E, F, G, K-M: niściyate; D: niściyate; H: niściyateḥ; I: niściyete ¹⁵ P: Ø; D: padi ¹⁶ Q: °nirācīkīrṣuṇa vatad (the *akṣaras* after °*nirācīkīrṣuṇa* have been erased and *vatad* [for *etad*] *viśeṣaṇam* written as the correction); A, E, H: °ṣaṇa; C, G, N: °nirāvikīrṣuṇā; D: °pratiṣedhanīmacīkīrṣuṇā; F, K: °ṣaṇā; I: °pratiṣyedhanīrācīkīrṣaṇā; M: samvavṛtyo...nirāvikīrṣuṇā; Tib: n.e. pratiṣedha: kun rdzob tu skye ba dgag par 'dod nas ¹⁷ Q: see previous note; D: atad ¹⁸ H: upādiyateḥ ¹⁹ Em. by LVP: 'siddhādhāre. LVP (PsP_L 27, n. 5) writes, "La lecture des Mss. n'est pas constante, ici et infra 30.10.15," but at this point and at PsP_L 30.10, L, M, N (= Cambridge, Paris and Calcutta) and the other mss available to this study concur in reading 'siddhādhāraḥ (*asiddhādhāra* at 30.15 is in a compound). LVP adds, "Il faut, je crois, lire *asiddhādhāraḥ pakṣa*° (cf. 28.4)." ²⁰ A-C, E-L, N: °doṣe; M: doṣo; em. by

- P5v आश्रयासिद्धो¹ वा हेतुदोषः स्यात्²। परमार्थतः स्वतश्³ चक्षुराद्या-
 I11v यतनानाम्⁴ अनभ्युपगमात्⁵ ॥
- C10r §46. संवृत्या⁶ चक्षुरादिसद्भावाद्⁷ अदोष⁸ इति चेत्। परमार्थत इत्य्
 एतत्⁹ तर्हि कस्य¹⁰ विशेषणम्॥
- L8r §47. सांवृतानां¹¹ चक्षुरादीनां¹² परमार्थत¹³ उत्पत्तिप्रतिषेधाद्¹⁴ 5
 उत्पत्तिप्रतिषेधविशेषणं¹⁵ परमार्थग्रहणमिति चेत्। एवम्¹⁶ तर्ह्य्
 H9v एवम्¹⁷ एव वक्तव्यं¹⁸ स्यात् – सांवृतानां²⁰ चक्षुरादीनां²¹ परमार्थतो PsP_L 28
 नास्त्य्²² उत्पत्तिर्²³ इति। न चैवम्²⁴ उच्यते। उच्यमाने²⁵ ऽपि
 E7r J10r परैर्²⁶ द्वयसताम्²⁷ एव चक्षुरादीनाम्²⁸ अभ्युपगमात्²⁹ प्रज्ञासिसताम्³⁰

LVP (silently)

¹ A-C, E-N: āśrayasiddho; D: °siddhā; em. by LVP: āśrayasiddhau.
² D: syāta ³ D: pr̥svataś ⁴ A: °yatanām ⁵ B-D, G, M: anatyū°;
 F: anatyū° ⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: savṛtyā ⁷ A: °ādisabhāvād; B, E,
 F, H, K, L: °ādisambhāvād; C, J, M, N: °ādisambhāvād; G: °ādisam-
 bhāyād; I: °ādisambhāvād; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ P: ∅; D: edoṣa
⁹ Q: evan; I: atat ¹⁰ P: ∅; D: kaisya; G: tasya ¹¹ I: sāvr̥tānā
¹² P: ∅; D: cakṣurāhīnām ¹³ F: paramārtha; N: °thaḥ ¹⁴ A: utpa-
 tte°; C, N: °pratiśadhā; G, M: °pratiśadhā; H: utpantepratiśedhā; I:
 °pratiśedhā ¹⁵ F: °viśaṣaṇam; G: °pratiśedhaviśeṣaṇam; H: utpati-
 pratiśedhaviśeṣaṇam; M: utpāttapraśedhaviśeṣaṇam; Tib: skye ba
 'gog pa'i khyad par yin no; em. by LVP (silently): °viśeṣaṇe ¹⁶ M:
 eva ¹⁷ P: evan; C, G, M: evaṃm ¹⁸ Tib: n.e. eva ¹⁹ D, G: ca-
 ktavyam; N: °vya ²⁰ D: sāmpratānām ²¹ A, E, H, I: °ādinām
²² M: nāty ²³ A: atpattir ²⁴ A: om. ²⁵ D: caivaṃm ²⁶ I:
 ucyabhya ²⁷ D: ucyamāno ²⁸ A-C, E-N: ucyasatām; em. by LVP:
 vastusatām; Tib: rdzas su yod pa nyid du ²⁹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L:
 cakṣurīdīnām ³⁰ P: ∅; B, D, G, M, N: atyu°; F: atyūpagamātaḥ

चानभ्युपगमात्¹ परतो ऽसिद्धाधारः पक्षदोषः² स्यादिति न युक्तमेतत्॥ G10r B9r K9v

§48. अथ स्यात् – यथानित्यः³ शब्द इति धर्मधर्मिणोः⁴ सामान्यम्⁵
 एव गृह्यते⁶ न विशेषः। विशेषग्रहणे हि सत्त्वं अनुमानानुमेयव्यव-
 हाराभावः⁶ स्यात्। तथा⁷ हि यदि⁸ चातुर्महाभौतिकः⁹ शब्दो गृह्यते¹⁰
 स परस्यासिद्धः¹¹। अथाकाशगुणो¹² गृह्यते¹³ स बौद्धस्य¹⁴ स्वतो¹⁵
 ऽसिद्धः। तथा वैशेषिकस्यापि¹⁶ शब्दानित्यतां¹⁷ प्रतिजानानस्य यदि

PsPL 29

F7r

5

N9r

I12r

¹ P: ∅; A, E, H, K, L: dhyātenābhyyu°; B, G, M: dhyānenātyu°; C, J, N: dhyānenābhyyu°; D: dhā(?)nenātyupagam(?)ārthat; F: dhyātenā-tyū°; I: dhyātenābhyyupamāgat; em. by LVP: anabhyupagamāt (silently); Tib: khas ma blangs pa'i phyir dang | ² H: °doṣā ³ D: yathā-danirtyuḥ; I: yathā 'nībhyah ⁴ H: dharmadharmīnoḥ; K: °dharmi-ṇāḥ; N: °dharmmiḥ; Tib: chos dang chos can gnyis spyi; em. by LVP (silently): linked with the following word to create the compound *dharmadharmisāmānyam*. De Jong (1978: 31) points to the compound *dharmadharmisāmānyam* at PsPL 29.5 which, in contrast to the case here, has been translated as *chos dang chos can spyi*, that is, without indicating Skt's dual declension. ⁵ I: sāmānem ⁶ D: anu-mānānumeyaivya°; H: °bhāva ⁷ H: tadā; I: bhatā ⁸ A: yahi ⁹ D: cāturmabhāhautikaḥ ¹⁰ Q: gr̥hyet; A, E, H, I: gr̥hyateta; C, G, M: gr̥hya ¹¹ A, E, H: parato 'siddhaḥ; I: as A, °ddha ¹² A: °ṇā ¹³ Q: gr̥hyeta; N: gr̥hāte ¹⁴ P: ∅; A, C, E, G-N: baiddhasya; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁵ F: to; M: svabhāto ¹⁶ A-C, E, G-N: °syā; F: vaiseṣikasyā; Tib: bye brag pa ... yang; PsPL: om. api ¹⁷ A-C, E-N: śabdo°; I: śabdonityetām; em. by LVP (silently)

A8r कार्यः¹ शब्दो गृह्यते² स परतो³ ऽसिद्धः⁴ । अथ अभिव्यङ्ग्यः⁵ स
M8r स्वतो⁶ ऽसिद्धः । एवं⁷ यथासम्भवम्⁸ । विनाशो ऽपि यदि⁹ सहेतुकः
स बौद्धस्य स्वतो¹⁰ ऽसिद्धः¹¹ । अथ¹² निर्हेतुकः¹³ स परतो ऽसिद्धः¹⁴
इति¹⁵ । तस्माद्¹⁶ यथात्र¹⁷ धर्मधर्मिसामान्यमात्रम्¹⁸ । एवम्¹⁹ इहापि
C10v धर्मिमात्रमुत्सृष्टविशेषणं ग्रहीष्यत²⁰ इति चेत्²¹ ।

5

¹ H: kārya ² P: grhyata; Q: grhyeta; A, D, E: grhyete; C, G, M: grhyata; F, J, K, L, N: grhyeta ³ D: parāto ⁴ D: dasiddhaḥ ⁵ Q: vānyaḥ; A: vyāryā; B, J: vyaṅgyaḥ(?); C, D, G, M: vyaṅgāḥ; E, F, I, K, L: vyargyaḥ; H: vyargaḥ; PsP_L: vyaṅgyaḥ; Tib: mngon par gsal bar byas pa yin (abhivyaṅktaḥ). Cabezon (1992: 279), translating from the quotation of the passage in the sTong thun chen mo, records *mngon par gsal bar bya ba*. ⁶ G: svate ⁷ I: eve ⁸ G: °sabhavam ⁹ F: yayi ¹⁰ N: svataḥ ¹¹ N: om. ¹² Q: om. ¹³ P: nirahetukaḥ; A: nirhatukaḥ; D: nihe° ¹⁴ G: paro 'siddhaḥ; em. by LVP: parasyāsi-ddha; Tib: pa rol po la ma grub. Earlier in the paragraph, *pha rol po la ma grub* translates *parasyāsiiddhaḥ* (its complement *bauddhasya svato 'siddhaḥ* is translated *rang nyid sangs rgyas pa la ma grub pa yin*); *gzhan la ma grub* translates *parato 'siddhaḥ* (its complement *svato 'siddhaḥ* is translated *rang la ma grub*). The form *parataḥ* attested in the mss may be considered the complement to *svataḥ* (the second instance of *bauddhasya svato 'siddhaḥ* is translated *sangs rgyas pa rang la ma grub pa yin*). ¹⁵ C, G, J, M, N: om. ¹⁶ N: yasmād ¹⁷ C: yathāte; G, M: yathātre ¹⁸ I: °sāmātyamātram ¹⁹ G: evas; conj. by LVP: e[va grhyate (half *daṇḍa*) e]vam. Tib merely clarifies with its preceding 'dzin pa what is understood through *anuvṛtti* in the Skt; see de Jong 1978: 31. ²⁰ A, E, H, I: grahīpyata; C, D, M: grahī-ṣyeta; G: grhīṣyeta; L: grahī≈yata ²¹ A: cat

PsPL 30

न¹ चैतदेवम् । यस्माद्² यदैवोत्पादप्रतिषेधो³ ऽत्र⁴ साध्यधर्मो
 ऽभिप्रेतः⁵ । तदैव धर्मिणस्⁶ तदाधारस्य विपर्यासमात्रासादिता-
 त्मभावस्य⁷ प्रच्युतिः⁸ स्वयम् एवानेनाङ्गीकृता⁹ । भिन्नौ¹⁰ हि
 विपर्यासाविपर्यासौ¹¹ । तद् यदा¹² विपर्यासेनासत्¹³ सच्चेन गृह्यते¹⁴
 5 तैमिरिकेणैव¹⁵ केशादि¹⁶ । तदा¹⁷ कुतः¹⁸ सद्भूतपदार्थलेशस्याप्य¹⁹
 उपलब्धिः²⁰ । यदा चाविपर्यासाद्²¹ अभूत्²² नाध्यारोप्यते²³ वितैमि-

H10r

L8v

J10v G10v

¹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ta ² G: tasmād; Tib: 'di ltar ÷ yasmāt ³ D: yadaivātpāda°; I: °pratiṣyadhō; M: °pratiṣadhō; Tib: n.e. eva ⁴ D: tre ⁵ A, E, H, I: pratas; D: hipretas ⁶ A, E, F, H, K, L: dharmīṇes; G: dharmmeṇas; I: dharmmines ⁷ Q: °mātrasādītā°; D: °ātmahāva-sya; N: viparyāsemāditātma° ⁸ F: °ti; I: pratpratiḥ ⁹ A: avāne-nāgīkṛtā; D: evānenāṅgīkṛtā; E, I, L: avāne°; G: evātenāṅgīkṛtā; H: avanenāṅgīkṛtā; Tib: 'dis rang nyid kyis khas blangs pa nyid ÷ sva-yam evānenāṅgīkṛtā ¹⁰ D: hinnau ¹¹ D: viparyāsaviyayāsau ¹² Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): yadā. P, Q: yathā; A-H, J-N: yathā; I: yathāpi; Tib: gang gi tshe ¹³ A, B, E, F, H-L, N: viparyāse-nosat; C, G, M: viparyāseno; D: viparyāsenosat, after o, *saṃvṛtiḥ syād | ata evokta* (= eyeskip forward [end of paragraph]) but then deleted by enclosure in square brackets; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁴ N: grhyete ¹⁵ A, E, H: temitirikeneva; B, F, K, L: temi°; C, G, J, M, N: tamī°; I: temitirakeneva; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁶ M: keśodī ¹⁷ G: tada ¹⁸ I: kuta ¹⁹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: °padārthalaśa°; C: sadbhūtaparārthalasyāpy; D: sudbhūtapadārthalaśesyāty; G: sambhū-taparārthalasyāpy; J, N: sadbhūtaparārthalasasyāpy; M: sambhūtaparārthalapy; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ C, G: apalabdhiḥ; M: āpala-bdhiḥ ²¹ A, H: cāpiparyā°; D: cāvoyathāsād; Tib: n.e. ca ²² F: adbhūtaṃ ²³ Q: na samāropyate (°samā° is a correction); A, E, F, H, I, K: nādhāropite; B, C, G, J, L-N: nādhārōpīte; D: nādhōropyate; em. by LVP (silently): nādhāropitaṃ; Tib: sgro mi 'dogs pa. Yotsuya (1999: 101) retains LVP's reading and assigns de Jong's (1978: 31) emendation *nādhārōpyate* (confirmed by ms P) to the

K10r रिक्केणेव¹ केशादि² तदा³ कुतो³ ऽसद्भूतपदार्थलेशस्याप्य⁴ उपलब्धिर्
येन⁵ तदानीं⁶ संवृतिः⁷ स्यात्॥

अत एवोक्तम्⁸ आचार्यपादैः⁹ –

I12v यदि किञ्चिद्¹⁰ उपलभेयं¹¹ प्रवर्तयेयं¹² निवर्तयेयं¹³ वा।
प्रत्यक्षादिभिर्¹⁴ अर्थैस्¹⁵ तदभावान् मे ऽनुपालम्भः॥

5

इति॥

B9v यतश्चैवं¹⁶ भिन्नौ विपर्यासाविपर्यासौ¹⁷ अतो¹⁸ विदुषाम्¹⁹ अविप-
र्यासावस्थायां²⁰ विपरीतस्यासम्भवात्²¹ कुतः²² सांवृतं चक्षुर्²³ यस्य

variant level. He further reports H, I and J as reading *nādhyāropyeta* but none of the three attest this reading.

¹ A: vitemirikerameva; B: vitaimiriṇeva; C, E, G, I, J, L-N: vitemi°; D: vitemitirikeṇeva; F, K: mirikeṇeva; H: vitesirikerameva; em. by LVP (silently) ² Tib: de'i tshe na yang ⇨ tadā ³ C, G, J, M, N: kutoḥ ⁴ A: madbhūta°; E, H-L, N: sad°; C, G: sad...laśasyāpy; D: 'sabbhūtapadārthalaśesyāpy; F: °padārthalenasyāpy; M: satbhūtaḍārthalasasyāpy ⁵ Q: tvena; C: ṣyana; G: yāna; M, N: yana ⁶ D: tadānām; I: °nī ⁷ D: °ti; G: savṛtiḥ; N: daṃvṛtiḥ ⁸ F: yevoktam; Tib: adds kyang ⁹ A: ācāryāpāḍaiḥ; B: °padair; D: ācāryaryāḍaiḥ; H: ācāryayadai ¹⁰ H: kiṃci ¹¹ I: upalabhayaṃ. The *parasmaipāda* suffix with *upa√labh* is unusual (as opposed to its use in Pāli); perhaps BHS? ¹² I: pravarttayayaṃ; J: pravarttaṣeyaṃ ¹³ C, G, M: om.; H: °nivarttayepaṃ; N: nivarttayaṃ ¹⁴ H: pratakṣādibhir; M: tyakṣādibhir; N: pratakādibhir ¹⁵ D, G: arthes; M, N: athais ¹⁶ B: caiva; Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁷ A: viparyyāsāvipyaryāsāvipyaryāsav; E, H, I: °sav ¹⁸ B, C, G, J, M, N: eto ¹⁹ N: viduḥkhām; Tib: n.e. vidu-ṣām ²⁰ D: avipayati | vasthāyām; em. by LVP (silently): aviparītāvasthāyām ²¹ D: vipatāṃtasyā°; I: viparītasyātasam° ²² A, E, H, I: kuta ²³ C, G, J, M, N: cakṣu

धर्मिबं¹ स्यादिति न² व्यावर्तते³ ऽसिद्धाधारः⁴ पक्षदोष आश्रयासिद्धो
वा⁵ हेतुदोष⁶ इत्य् अपरिहार⁷ एवायम्⁸ ॥

N9v E7v

§49. निदर्शनस्यापि⁹ नास्ति साम्यम्¹⁰ । तत्र हि शब्दसामान्यम्¹¹
अनित्यबसामान्यं¹² चाविवक्षितविशेष¹³ द्वयोरपि संविद्यते¹⁴ । न ब्र
5 एवं¹⁵ चक्षुःसामान्यं¹⁶ शून्यताशून्यतावादिभ्यां¹⁷ संवृत्याङ्गीकृतं¹⁸
नापि¹⁹ परमार्थत इति नास्ति²⁰ निदर्शनसाम्यम्²¹ ॥

Q5v C11r P6r
D5v

¹ N: °tva ² I: ta ³ Tib: ldog pa med pa nyid pas ÷ na vyāvartate [...] iti ⁴ Em. by LVP (silently): 'siddhādhāre ⁵ Tib: gzhi ma grub pa'i phyogs kyi skyon ang | gzhi ma grub pa'i gtan tshigs kyi skyon ÷ 'siddhādhāraḥ pakṣadoṣa āśrayāsiddho vā hetudoṣaḥ. Cp. Tib §45 (= LVP 27.8) gzhi ma grub pa'i phyogs kyi nyes pa 'am | gzhi ma grub pa'i gtan tshigs kyi skyon for a reflection of the same construction with vā. ⁶ C, G, M: doṣar ⁷ D: āparihāra; F: eparihāra; K, L: aparihāra ⁸ H: yevāyaṃ ⁹ C, G, J, M, N: nidarśasyāpi ¹⁰ P: śāmyaṃ; G: mātmyaṃ ¹¹ Q: śabdasāmānyamānyam; C, G, M: śabdamsā°; D: vadasāmānyam; H: saṣṭasāmānyam; I: śabatsāmānyam ¹² A, E: atityasāmānyam; B, F, H-J, N: anityasāmānyam; C, G, M: om.; K, L: anityamāmānyam; conj. by LVP: anitya[tā]sāmānyam; Tib: mi rtag pa nyid kyi spyi ¹³ A, E, F, K: vāvivarjitaviśeṣa; B, C, G, J, M: vā°; D: vovivakṣita°; H: cāvivarjitaviśeṣa; I: vāviva~itaviśeṣa; L: vāvivajitaviśeṣa ¹⁴ H: °teḥ ¹⁵ A: aṃva; C: aṃñ; E, F, H, I, K, L: eva; G: añ; M: aṃ ¹⁶ A: °sāmānya; I: cakṣusa° ¹⁷ A: śūnyatāvā-dibhām; B, K: °vādityām; D: śūnyatāvādityām; F: śūnyatāśūnyatāvā-tyām; G, M: °vādityāt ¹⁸ Q: sāmvrtyā°; A, E, H, I: gīkṛtaṃ; D: samvrtyām-gākṛta; F: āgākṛtaṃ; G: mavṛtyā°; K, L: rgīkṛtaṃ ¹⁹ A, B, E-N: nopi; C: no | pa; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ D: nyasti ²¹ Q: nidarśanasāmānyam; A: nidarśanāsāmyam; F, K: sāmānyam; em. by LVP (silently): nidarśanasya sāmānyam. De Jong does not record D's variant. Yotsuya (1999: 105, n. 114) relegates H, I and J's reading to the variant level. Tib: dpe la yang 'dra ba yod pa ma yin (the closing phrase mirrors the opening line of this specific refutation).

§50. यश्¹ चायम्² असिद्धाधारपक्षदोषोद्भावेन³ विधिः⁴ एष⁵ एव⁶
 A8v सच्चाद्⁷ इत्य् अस्य⁸ हेतोर्⁹ असिद्धार्थतोद्भावेन¹⁰ योज्यः¹¹ । इत्थं¹² PsP_L 31
 F7v चैतद्¹³ एवं¹⁴ यत् स्वयमप्य्¹⁵ अनेनायं¹⁶ यथोक्तो ऽर्थो¹⁷ ऽभ्युप-
 गतस्¹⁸ तार्किकेन¹⁹ । कथं कृत्वा²⁰ ।
 M8v H10v सन्त्य²¹ एवाध्यात्मिकायतनोत्पादका²² हेत्वादयः²³ । तथा तथा- 5
 I13r गतेन²⁴ निर्देशात्²⁵ । यद् धि²⁶ यथा²⁷ तथागतेन²⁸ निर्दिष्टम्²⁹ ।

¹ G, H, M: paś ² P: asiddhādhārah pakṣadoṣodbhāvane; A: asiddhādhārayakṣadoṣābhābhane; B, C, G, J, N: °doṣādbhāvane; D: asiddhya-dhārapakṣadoṣodbhāvena; E, I, L: °doṣābhāvane; F: asiddhadhārapekṣadoṣābhārane; H: asiddhadhārayakṣadoṣahāvane; K: °dhārapekṣadoṣābhārane; M: °doṣādbhāvane; em. by LVP (silently) ³ A, E, H, I: om.; B, C, F, G, J-N: vidhin; em. by LVP (silently) ⁴ A, E, H, I: ṣa; D: eṣā. LVP (PsP_L 30, n. 5) mistakenly reports that his manuscripts attest *eṣa eva sattvādibhyaḥ svaheṭor*. ⁵ A: satvā≈ ⁶ A: ≈≈; B, C, E-N: asva ⁷ A: ≈≈r ⁸ A, E, H, K, L: asiddhārthatābhāvane; B: °ārthatādbhāvane; D: °ārthavodbhāvane; F: °ārthābhāvane; I: as A, °na; M: °ārthatotbhāvane. Tib: gtan tshigs 'di la ma grub pa'i skyon brjod pa la ⇨ asya heṭor asiddhārthatodbhāvane. Tib's skyon provides symmetry with *nyes pa* (doṣa) of the compound in the relative clause. LVP adds a conjectured *api* (PsP_L 30.16: *asiddhārthatodbhāvane* [°pi] *yojyaḥ*) on the basis of Tib's yang (gtan tshigs 'di la ma grub pa'i skyon brjod pa la yang sbyar bar bya'o). yang may represent *api* but it may more likely be an interpretation of the *ca* found at the beginning of the sentence. ⁹ C, G, J, N: yājyaḥ ¹⁰ G: naitad; M: raitad ¹¹ P: eva ¹² Tib: 'dis rang nyid kyis ⇨ svayam apy anena ¹³ C, D, G, M, N: anenoyam ¹⁴ A, D-F, I, K, L: 'tho; H: tho; M: 'rpyo ¹⁵ D, F, G: tyupagatas ¹⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: tārkiyeṣa; D: tārkiyeṣa ¹⁷ PsP_L: om. katham kṛtvā; Tib: ji ltar zhe na ¹⁸ A, B, E, H, I: saty; C, N: sans; G: sanm; M: sam ¹⁹ D: evādhyaṇmikāyatenonpādako; H: amvādhyaṭmi°; I: avādhyaṭmi°; M: evādhyaṭmi:kāya° ²⁰ D: hatvādayaḥ; G: detvādayaḥ ²¹ Q: gatena ²² C, J: niderśāt; D:

तत् तथा¹ । तद्यथा शान्तं² निर्वाणम्॥

J11r

इति।

अस्य³ परोपक्षिप्तस्य⁴ साधनस्येदं⁵ दूषणम् अभिहितम्⁶ अनेन –

G11r

को हि⁷ भवताम्⁸ अभिप्रेतो⁹ ऽत्र¹⁰ हेत्वर्थः¹¹ । संवृत्या¹² तथा¹³
 5 तथागतेन निर्देशाद्¹⁴ उत¹⁵ परमार्थत¹⁶ इति। संवृत्या¹⁷ चेत्¹⁸
 स्वतो¹⁹ हेतोर् असिद्ध्यर्थता²⁰ । परमार्थतश्²¹ चेत्²² –

K10v

न²³ सन्²⁴ नासन्²⁵ न सदसन्²⁶ धर्मो निर्वर्तते²⁷ यदा।

L9r

vinirdeśāt²³ A: ~i; D: i; I: bhi. PsP Tib mirrors PP Tib. ²⁴ G: tathā ²⁵ A, B, E, F, H, K, L: tathāgatenā; C, G, M: gatenā; I: tathāgate; J, N: gathāgatenā; em. by LVP (silently): tathāgatenāsti ²⁶ Q: nirddaṣṭan; G: nirddeṣṭan

¹ D: om.; H: tat tathāh ² F: śanta; G, K, M: śānta ³ I: a ⁴ D: paroyakṣiptasya ⁵ C, D, G, M, N: °asyadam ⁶ Q: abhimatam; D: ahihitem ⁷ Tib: n.e. hi. The passage has been copied (with minor changes) from PP Tib. ⁸ Q: bhagatām ⁹ C, G: ehipratā; D: ahipretā; M: ehipraptā; N: abhipratā ¹⁰ G: gra ¹¹ D: hetvairthaḥ; H: hatv° ¹² A, G: savṛtya; E, H, I: °tya ¹³ M: om. ¹⁴ A, E, I: nirde; F, H, K, L: nirded ¹⁵ G: u ¹⁶ C: paramāta; G: °te; I: paramārtha; M: pamāta; PsP Tib reflects PP Tib's don dam par gsungs pa'i phyir ¹⁷ C, M: °tya; G: savṛtya ¹⁸ D: vet; N cat ¹⁹ A: satya; B, C, G, J, L-N: svatā; D: syatā; E, F, H, I: satā; K: tyāta; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ A-C, E-G, I-N: °to; H: asiddhārthatva; em. by LVP (silently). D adds: | tadyathā | śāntam nirmāṇam (sic) iti (= eyeskip back to end of first PP citation in §50 [PsP_L 31.3]) ²¹ A: paramārthanaś; F: paramarthata; I: °tas ²² A-N: ceta; em. by LVP (silently) ²³ H: naṃ ²⁴ I: saṃn ²⁵ A, E, F, H, I, L: nāsun ²⁶ P: sadaśad ²⁷ A-C, E, G-J, L, M: nivartyate; D: nirvartyate; F, K: nivaṛtyata; N: nivatyāve; em. by LVP (silently)

सदसदुभयात्मककार्यप्रत्ययबनिराकरणात्¹ तदा –

कथं निर्वर्तको² हेतुर्³ एवं⁴ सति न⁴ युज्यते॥

नैवासौ⁵ निर्वर्तको⁶ हेतुरिति वाक्यार्थः⁷ । ततश्⁸ च परमार्थतो⁹
निर्वर्त्यनिर्वर्तकबासिद्धेर्¹⁰ असिद्धार्थता विरुद्धार्थता¹¹ वा
हेतोः¹² ॥

5

इति॥

यतश्¹³ चैवं¹³ स्वयमेवामुना न्यायेन¹⁴ हेतोर्¹⁵ असिद्धिर्¹⁵ अङ्गीकृता-
नेन¹⁶ तस्मात्¹⁷ सर्वेष्व¹⁷ एवानुमानेषु¹⁸ वस्तुधर्मोपन्यस्तहेतुकेषु¹⁹

B10r N10r

¹ P: sadaśad°; Q: °nirākaṇāt; A: °ātmakakāyapratyaya°; C, G, J, N: °ātmeka°; E, H, I, K, L: °ātmakakāyāpratyaya°; F: °ātmakāyāpratyaya-
yatvanirākaraṇot; M: °āmeka°; em. by LVP (silently) ² P: nirvatta-
tako; A-C, E-N: nivarttako; em. by LVP (silently) ³ A, E, H, I, K, L: eva; F: aiva ⁴ Em.: na. P, Q: hi; A-N: hi; PsP_L: hi; PsP Tib: mi. See
note on MMK I.7 (Translation §143). ⁵ D: naivasmai; M: °so
⁶ A, B, D-I, K, L, M: nivarttako; C, N: nivattako; J: v(?)ivattako; em.
by LVP (silently) ⁷ N: °thāḥ ⁸ I: tataḥś ⁹ N: parathato
¹⁰ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): nirvartyanirvartakatvāsī-
ddher. P: nirvatya°; Q: °nirvvartakāsiddher; A, B, E, H, I, K, L: ni-
vartyanivarttaka°; C, G, J, N: nivarttakatvā 'siddher; D: nivartyaniva-
rtyakatvādasiddhair; F: nivartyanivarttakṛtvā 'siddher; M: as C, om.
avagraha ¹¹ D: °to ¹² J, N: hetār ¹³ Em. with LVP (LVP
emends silently): caivaṃ. P, Q: caiva; A-C, E-N: caiva; D: civaṃ;
Tib: de ltar, n.e. ca ¹⁴ A-D, F, G, I-N: nāyena; E, H: tāyena; em. by
LVP (silently) ¹⁵ A: asiddhi | r; E, H, K, L: asiddhi || r; F: asiddhi r
¹⁶ A, E, I, K, L: aṃgīnena; D: aṃgīkṛtonena; F: aṃginena; H: aṃgi-
naṃna ¹⁷ A, E, H, I: sarveṣ ¹⁸ D: ecānu°; F: evānusānesāneṣu;
Tib: n.e. eva ¹⁹ Q: °hetuṣu; D: vastudharmāpanya°; G, M: °dha-
rmopavyasta°; H: vatsudharmo°

स्वत¹ एव² हेत्वादीनामसिद्धत्वात् सर्वाण्य³ एव⁴ साधनानि⁵ व्या-
हन्यन्ते⁶ ।

§51. तद्यथा –

C11v

न परमार्थतः परेभ्यस्⁷ तत्प्रत्ययेभ्य⁸ आध्यात्मिकायतन- 113v
जन्म⁹ परत्वात् तद्यथा घटस्य¹⁰ ॥

अथ वा¹¹

PsPL 32

न¹² परे परमार्थेन विवक्षिताश्च¹³ चक्षुराद्याध्यात्मिकायतन-
निर्वर्तकाः¹⁴ प्रत्यया¹⁵ इति प्रतीयन्ते¹⁶ परत्वात्¹⁷ तद्यथा¹⁸
तन्वादयः¹⁹ ॥

¹ D: svate ² C, G, J, M, N: eve; H: yeva; Tib: rang la ÷ svata eva
³ A, E, H, I: sarvann; B, F, G, J-M: sarvānn; C, N: sarvvānn; D: sar-
vān; em. by LVP (silently) ⁴ A, E, H, I: evamā; Tib: n.e. eva ⁵ A,
E, F, H, I, K, L: sādhanāvi; M: sādharāni ⁶ I: °nyate ⁷ A, C, E, G-
J, L-N: parebhya; B: paretya; D: paratyas; em. by LVP (silently)
⁸ B, D: °yetya; C: tatpatya°; F: tatpratyebhya; G: tatpatya; I: tapra-
tya°; M: tatpratya; N: tatpatya≈tya ⁹ A, E, H, I, M: °kāyata-
janma; D: ādhyātmakāyatena°; F: °janme ¹⁰ A, E, F, H, I, K, L:
°syā; C, G, M, N: paṭasya; PsPL: paṭasya; *LT: ghaṭasya; PsP Tib:
bum pa; PP Tib: bum pa ¹¹ H: vyā ¹² F: ta ¹³ C: | vevakṣitāś;
D: vivarjitāś; G: vivakṣiś; N: vicakṣitāś ¹⁴ A, B, E, H-J, L: °ātmī-
kāyatanavivarttakāḥ; C, G, M: °nivattakāḥ; D: °ātmakāyatanavivar-
ttakauḥ; F: cākṣurādhyātmikāyenanivartakā; K: °ātmikāyanani-
varttakāḥ; N: °kāyatanavivarttakāva; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁵ I:
pratya ¹⁶ D: pratyāyante; N: pratyeyante. De Jong (1978: 31),
noting D's *pratyāyante* and Tib's *nges te*, tentatively suggests *pratyā-
yante*. P and Q, however, attest *pratīyante*. ¹⁷ I: paratvā ¹⁸ Q:
yathā ¹⁹ A-N: tatvādaya; em. by LVP (silently)

H11r इति¹ परत्वादिकम्² अत्र³ स्वत⁴ एवासिद्धम्⁵ ॥

§52. यथा चानेन⁶

J11v उत्पन्ना⁷ एवाध्यात्मिका⁸ भावास्⁹ तद्विषयविशिष्टव्यवहार-
करणात्¹⁰ ॥

E8r G11v A9r इत्थस्य¹¹ पराभिहितस्य¹² हेतोरसिद्धार्थताम् उद्भावयिषुणेदम्¹³ 5
उक्तम्¹⁴ –

अथ¹⁵ समाहितस्य योगिनः प्रज्ञाचक्षुषा¹⁶ भावयाथात्म्यं¹⁷
पश्यत¹⁸ उत्पादगत्यादयः¹⁹ सन्ति²⁰ परमार्थत²¹ इति साध्यते।

¹ C, M: i ² F: paratvādīkam ³ D: atu ⁴ D: svate ⁵ A: °ddha
⁶ P: cānye; A, F, I, K, L: vā°; H: vāneto (o sandhi); M: cānyeno (o
sandhi); Tib: n.e. ca ⁷ C, G: otpanno (initial o sandhi); D: ātpannā
(sandhi with previous a); M: om. ⁸ D: evodhyātmikā ⁹ C, G, M:
°os ¹⁰ C, M: °vyavabhākaraṇād; D: °viśiṣṭatyavyavahāra°; F, K:
taviṣaya°; G: °vyavabhākaruṇād; N: °vyavahākaraṇād; em. by LVP:
tadviṣayiviśiṣṭa°, citing PsP Tib: de dag gi yul dang ldan pa'i tha
snyad khyad par can byed pa'i phyir. See Translation note and the
occurrence below. ¹¹ A, E, H, I: itya ¹² I: parābhitasya ¹³ Em.
with LVP (LVP emends silently): udvibhāvayīṣu°. P, Q: udvibhāva°, A,
E, F, H-L, N: udvibhāvayīṣuṇeday; B: udvibhāva°; C: udvibhyavayī-
p(?)uṇeday; D: udvibhāvāyeṣuṇeday; G: udvibhyavayipuṇeday; M:
udvityavayipuṇeday. I am not aware of the verb ud-vi√bhū being at-
tested and am unable to explain the mss' reading. ¹⁴ F, K: ukta
¹⁵ A, E, H, I, L: aya ¹⁶ D: °ṣo ¹⁷ F, K: °yathātsyaṃ; G: °yathā°;
N: °yathātsyaṃ ¹⁸ D: paśyete; M: paśyatu ¹⁹ G: utpādatabyā-
dayaḥ; M: upāda° ²⁰ A, H: sanni ²¹ M: paramārtha

तदा¹ तद्विषयविशिष्टव्यवहारकरणहेतोर्² असिद्धार्थता³ गतेर्⁴ K11r
 अप्य् उत्पादप्रतिषेधाद्⁵ एव निषेधात्॥ M9r

इति एवं स्वकृतसाधने ऽपि⁶

अगतं⁷ नैव⁸ गम्यते⁹ अध्वबाद्¹⁰ गताध्ववत्¹¹ ।

5 इति अध्वबहेतोः¹² स्वतो ऽसिद्धार्थता¹³ योज्या¹⁴ ॥ F8r

¹ D: taddā ² A: °hetoraṇaher; C, G, H, J, M, N: tadviṣayā°; D: °hetur; em. by LVP: 1) tadviṣayi°, 2) (silently) °karaṇād iti hetor, but cp. *adhvatvahetoḥ* in Candrakīrti's following parallel comment. PsP Tib: de dag gi yul dang ldan pa'i tha snyad khyad par can byed pa'i phyir ro zhes bya ba'i gtan tshigs; PP Tib: de dag gi yul dang ldan pa'i tha snyad byed pa'i phyir ro zhes bya ba'i gtan tshigs. See the Translation note for the previous instance of this reason. ³ A, E, F, H, K, L: asiddhārthaḥtā; C, G, J, M: esiddhā°; D: asiddhārthatā; I: asiddhārthaḥātā ⁴ F: gartet; H: garet ⁵ A-C, E-N: utpādanīṣedhād; D: utpādanīṣodhād ⁶ F, H: piḥ ⁷ P: Ø; D: agadaṃ; I: agata. LVP conjectures a preceding *paramārthato* on the basis of Tib's *don dam par*. Q, A-N: without *paramārthato*. P's leaf has broken off, but there is just enough space within the boundaries of the damage for the text as in the edition above, and no extra space for the conjectured *paramārthato*. See Translation note. ⁸ A, E, H, I: vaiva; C, G, M: neve ⁹ F: gamyaṃte ¹⁰ P: Ø; A: adhatvāt; C: °tād; E, F, H, I, K: adhatvād; G: adhataṃ; L: adv(?)atvād; M: °tā ¹¹ P: [3](v)āḍ; A, E, F, H, I, K: gatādhavad; D: °vah; L: gatādhv(?)ād ¹² P: Ø; A-N: athahetoḥ; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ Em. by LVP (silently): svata evāsiddhārthatā, apparently on the basis of Tib: rang nyid la ma grub pa'i don nyid ¹⁴ C, G, M, N: yājyā; D: yodyā

§53. न परमार्थतः¹ सभागं² चक्षू रूपं³ पश्यति⁴ चक्षुरिन्द्रियत्वात्
तद्यथा⁵ तत्सभागम्⁶ ।

PsP_L 33

तथा⁷

न चक्षुः प्रेक्षते⁸ रूपं भौतिकत्वात्⁹ स्वरूपवत्¹⁰ ।

l14r

खरस्वभावा न मही भूतत्वात् तद्यथानिलः¹¹ ।

5

¹ A-N: paramārthaḥ; conj. by LVP: paramārtha[ta]ḥ ² A: samārga; D: sambhāgam; conj. by LVP: [sāśrayam]; Tib: brten pa dang bcas pa'i mig; Stcherbatsky (1927: 115, n. 5) emends to *sabhāgam*. LVP in AKBh_{tr} I.78, n. 2 refers back to PsP_L 32 and n. 8 and corrects to *sa-bhāgam*. ³ Em. with LVP: rūpaṃ. P, Q: om.; A-N: om.; PsP Tib: mig ni gzugs la lta bar mi byed; PP Tib: mig ni gzugs la lta bar mi byed. In AKBh_{tr} I 78, n. 2, LVP emends *rūpaṃ* to *rūpāṇi*. Note, however, that the AKBh citation *sabhāgaṃ cakṣū rūpāṇi paśyati* just a few sentences previous to Bhāviveka's inference in PP is translated *rtēn mtshung mig ni gzugs mams lta* (PP D 76b5); only *gzugs* appears in the PP inference (PP D 76b7). ⁴ A: paśyatiś ⁵ H: tadyathā ⁶ F, K: °bhāga ⁷ Tib: zhes bya ba dang | de bzhin du ∴ tathā ⁸ C, G, M: prakṣate ⁹ A, E, H: tautikatvāt; C: bhautakatvāt; I: tautikata-tvāt ¹⁰ D: svarūpacat; G: om.; em. by LVP: rūpavat. LVP (PsP_L 33, n. 1) incorrectly reports his mss as attesting *sarūpavat* and states that he bases his text on Tib's *gzugs bzhin no*. MHK 3.41ab attests *svārū-pavat*. Tib adds *zhes bya ba dang* between the inferences. ¹¹ A, E, F, I, K, L: tadyathā alina; B, C, J, M, N: tadyathā || alina; D: tadyathā | anila; G: tadyathā || ali; H: tadyathā alinar; LVP (PsP_L 33, n. 2) emends to *tadyathānila* (*ityādiṣu*) but mistakenly reports that his mss (L, M, N) read *tadyathā nalina*.

इत्यादिषु¹ हेबाद्यसिद्धिः² स्वत एव³ योज्या⁴ ॥

L9v

§54. सच्चाद्⁵ इति चायं⁶ हेतुः⁷ परतो ऽनैकान्तिकः⁸ – किं सच्चाच्⁹

C12r

चैतन्यवन्¹⁰ नाध्यात्मिकान्यायतनानि¹¹ स्वत¹² उत्पद्यन्ताम्¹³

उताहो घटादिवत् स्वत उत्पद्यन्ताम्¹⁴ इति¹⁵ ।

N10v B10v

5 §55. घटादीनाम्¹⁶ अपि¹⁷ साध्यसमबान्¹⁸ नानैकान्तिकतेति¹⁹

P6v

PsP_L 34 चेत²⁰ । नैतद्²¹ एवं²² तथानभिधानात्²³ ॥

§56. ननु च²⁴ यथा²⁵ परकीयेष्ु²⁶ अनुमानेषु²⁷ दूषणम्²⁸ उक्तम्²⁹ ।

एवं स्वानुमानेष्वपि यथोक्तदूषणप्रसङ्गे³⁰ सति स एवासिद्धाधारा-

H11v

¹ Tib: zhes bya ba la sog pa dag tu yang ÷ ityādiṣu ² H: °siddhi; I: hetvādesiddhiḥ; N: °dyahiddhiḥ ³ F: ev; Tib: rang nyid la ÷ svata eva ⁴ P: Ø; A, E, G-I, K, L: yojya; B, C, D, J, M, N: yojyam; F: ojya; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ P: Ø; A, E, H, I, K, L: setvād; C: sa-svād; M: sas(?)vād ⁶ P: Ø; A, C, E, H-J, L, N: cāya; F: vāha; G, K, M: vāya; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ F: yetuḥ; I: hetu ⁸ H, I: °ka ⁹ P: (s)attvā(c); A, B, E, I, K, L: sattyāc; D, F, M: satvā; G: nattvāc; H: sattyā ¹⁰ M: caitavyavat ¹¹ P: °ātmikānyāya(t)a[1]ni; D: °ātmikānyāyate ¹² D: om. ¹³ P: Ø; D: °tom; H, I: °tās ¹⁴ P: [1]+(p).dy.ntām; D: unpannadyantom ¹⁵ A, E, I: i, followed by a blank space with a line over it; H: i ¹⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K: ghaṭādinām ¹⁷ PsP_L: om. api; Tib: yang ¹⁸ P: °samatvan; F: °matān ¹⁹ A, E, K, L: tānai°; I: tānaikāntikaḥteti ²⁰ A, E, F, H, L: cain; B: ce; D: ven; I: cai; K: cait ²¹ H: tetad; I: tu(?)tad; K: retad ²² C: evīm(?); G, M: evī; I: avam ²³ D: tadyathānahidhānāt; F: °dhātād; H: tathāvidhānāt ²⁴ A, E, I: va; D: ra; H: pa ²⁵ E, H, I: yathām ²⁶ A: parakiyeṣu; N: parakiyemv ²⁷ I: anamāneṣu ²⁸ I: duṣṣaṇam; N: °ṇas ²⁹ M: uktem ³⁰ P: Ø; C, G, J, N: °dūṣaṇampra°; D: yethokta°; M: °dūṣaṇamprasam

- J12r सिद्धहत्वादिदोषः¹ प्राप्नोति। ततश्च² यश्चोभयोर्³ दोषो⁴ न
 G12r तेनैकश्चोद्यो⁷ भवतीति⁸ सर्वम् एतद् दूषणम्⁹ अयुक्तं जायत
 इति॥
- D6r Q6r उच्यते – स्वतन्त्रम्¹¹ अनुमानं¹² ब्रुवतामयं दोषो जायते। न वयं¹³
 स्वतन्त्रम्¹⁴ अनुमानं प्रयुज्महे¹⁵ परप्रतिज्ञानिषेधफलत्वाद्¹⁶ अस्मद-
 K11v नुमानानाम्¹⁷। तथा हि परश्चक्षुः पश्यतीति¹⁹ प्रतिपन्नः²⁰। स

¹ P: [8]-(e)tvādidoṣaḥ; B, D-F, H, K, L: °hetvādidoṣaḥ; C, G, J, N: evāsiddhārāsiddhahetvādidoṣaḥ; I: evāsiddhāḥdhārā°; M: evāsiddhārāsiddhehetvādidoṣaḥ ² A, I: nataś ³ Tib: n.e. ca ⁴ P: Ø; C, M, N: paś; D: ya | ś; em. by LVP (silently): ya ⁵ P: [2](yo)r; A-C, E, G-J, L, N: cobhaya; D: codbhayor; F, K: cobhaco; M: cābhaya; em. by LVP (silently): ubhaya. I presume that *ca* belongs to the citation. Cf. PsPL 34, n. 1, where the citation as it appears in the Sarvadarśanaśaṅgraha is cited by LVP as *yaś cobhayaḥ samo doṣo ...* ⁶ C, G, M: ṣo ⁷ C, G, J, M, N: codyā ⁸ A, E, H, I, M: bhavatiti; F: dbhavatīti; PsPL: (printing error): bhavavīti ⁹ A, D, H, I: eta; C, G, J, N: ed; M: e ¹⁰ M: dūṣaṇ ¹¹ P: om. svatantram anumānaṁ bruvatām ayaṁ doṣo jāyate, possibly due to an eyeskip from °yate of *ucyate* to °yate of *jāyate*; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: svatatram; D: svatantram ¹² F: amārna; G: anumānu ¹³ C, G: cayaṁ ¹⁴ H: śva° ¹⁵ P: prayuñjāmahe; A-F, I, J-L, N: prayuñjyāmahe; G: prayujyānāhe; H: prayuntyāmahe; M: prayujyāmāhe; em. by LVP; LVP incorrectly reports L, M, and N as reading *prayuñjāmahe*. ¹⁶ Tib: gzhan gyi dam bca' ba 'gog pa tsam gyi 'bras bu can yin pa'i phyir ¹⁷ A: °anumatānām; B: °nānām; Tib: n.e. asmat ¹⁸ Q: paraṁ; G: para; em. by LVP: paraṁ. See Translation note. ¹⁹ H: paśyatiti ²⁰ H: °nna

तत्प्रसिद्धेनैवानुमानेन¹ निराक्रियते² – चक्षुषः स्वात्मादर्शनधर्मम्³ A9v
 इच्छसि⁴ परादर्शनधर्माविनाभाविवं⁵ चाङ्गीकृतम्⁶ तस्माद् यत्र⁷ I14v
 यत्र⁸ स्वात्मादर्शनम्⁹ तत्र¹⁰ तत्र¹¹ परदर्शनम्¹² अपि नास्ति¹³ ।
 तद्यथा घटे¹⁴ । अस्ति¹⁵ च चक्षुषः¹⁶ स्वात्मादर्शनम्¹⁷ तस्मात् पर-
 दर्शनम्¹⁸ अप्यस्य नैवास्ति¹⁹ । ततश् च²⁰ स्वात्मादर्शनविरुद्धं²¹

¹ Q: tatprasiddhenānu°; A, C, D, E, G-J, L-N: tatapra°; B: tatamptra°; F, K: tataprasiddhainānuna; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: n.e. eva

² F: nirākriyete ³ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): svātmādarśanadharmam. P: Ø (only final *m* preserved); Q: svātmā 'darśanadharmmadarśanam; A: °daśāna°; B-D, F, J-N: °darśanaṃdharmam; E: °daśanaṃdharmam; G: svānmādarśanaṃdharmam; H: syātmādaśanaṃdharmim; I: °daśanaṃdharmmam ⁴ De Jong emends to *icchadbhiḥ*; see Translation note. ⁵ Em.: parādarśana°. P, Q: paradarśana°; A: para...bhāvitam; B-E, G, J-N: paradarśana°; F: para...vinātmivitvam; H: para...vināmāvitam; I: paradaśana...bhāvitam. LVP accepts the reading *paradarśana*°. See Translation note. ⁶ A, E, H: vāṃgī°; F: cāgī°; I: vāṃgīkṛta ⁷ A: yanna ⁸ D: om. ⁹ A, E, F, K, L: °darśanay; H, I: syātmādarśanay ¹⁰ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om.; N: tratra ¹¹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om. ¹² A, E, F, H, I, K, L: om. ¹³ A: sāsti; E: nā || sti; H, I: nāsi; L: nā | sti ¹⁴ H: ghaṭam; Tib: dper na bum pa bzhin no ÷ tadyathā ghaṭe ¹⁵ H: aṣṭi ¹⁶ P: cakṣuḥ ¹⁷ M: tasmā ¹⁸ G: °darśanaṃm ¹⁹ Tib: n.e. eva ²⁰ P, Q: see following note; Tib: n.e. ca ²¹ Em. with LVP: svātmādarśana° (PsP_L: svā[tmā]darśana°). P: cādarśanaviruddha (*cā*° represents the text's preceding *ca* conjoined with *ādarśana*°); Q: cātmadarśana° (*cā*° represents the text's preceding *ca* conjoined with *ātma*°); B, E, I, K, L: svadarśana°; C, G, M: svadarśananiruddha; D: svadarśana; J, N: svadarśanaviruddha; Tib: rang gi bdag nyid mi lta ba dang 'gal bar. *sva* was presumably dropped by ms ζ (see Stemma) and thus does not appear in either P or Q; the *akṣara tmā* was then dropped from P.

नीलादिपरदर्शनं¹ स्वप्रसिद्धेनैवानुमानेन² विरुध्यत इति ॥

M9v एतावन्मात्रम् अस्मदनुमानैर्³ उद्भाव्यत⁴ इति कुतो ऽस्मत्पक्षे⁵
यथोक्तदोषावतारो⁶ यतः समानदोषता⁷ स्यात् ॥

E8v §57. किं पुनर् अन्यतरप्रसिद्धेनाप्य⁸ अनुमानेनास्त्य⁹ अनुमान-
बाधा¹⁰ ॥

5

C12v अस्ति । सा च¹¹ स्वप्रसिद्धेनैव¹² हेतुना¹³ । न¹⁴ परप्रसिद्धेन¹⁵ ।
लोकत¹⁶ एव दृष्टत्वात् । कदाचिद् धि¹⁷ लोके ऽर्थिप्रत्यर्थिभ्यां¹⁸ PsP_L 35

¹ A-C, F, G, I-N: °na; D: om.; E, H: nīrādi-paradarśana; em. by LVP (silently) ² C, G: svaprasiddhanai°; M: svapraddhinai° ³ P: Ø; A: amṣadanumāner; B, C, F, G, J, K, M, N: °ner; D: °anumānaṃr; E, H, I, L: ammadanumāner; em. by LVP (silently). Tib: n.e. asmat (instead gang gi phyir = yasmāt) ⁴ I: udbhāṣeta; M: utbhā° ⁵ H: °pakṣa; I: °smatyakṣe ⁶ A: °domāvatārā; B-N: °rā; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ F, K: °doṣetā; G: °doṣātā; H: °doṣanā; N: °doṣa ⁸ Q: om. api; D: °praśiddhenāpy; F, K: abhyatara°; I: aṇetara° ⁹ D: anu-
mānenosty; G: umānemāsty ¹⁰ A, E, H, L: anusānabādhyā; D, G: °bādhyā; F, K: anusānubādhyā; I: anusanabādhyā; M: anusānabādhyā
¹¹ C, G, M: ra; LVP (PsP_L 34, n. 9) reports that his mss read *asti sāra*, but this is correct only as regards ms M (Paris). ¹² A: svaprasid-
dhanaiva ¹³ D: hetumā; M: henā; Tib: rang nyid la grub pa'i gtan
tshigs nyid kyis ÷ svaprasiddhenaiva hetunā ¹⁴ D: ni; H: om.
¹⁵ D: paraipra°; F, K: prasiddhedhenaiva hetunā na paraprasiddhena;
H: om. ¹⁶ D: lokate ¹⁷ A, C, E, F, G, H-N: vi; em. by LVP (silently)
¹⁸ Q: rthipratyaye rthibhyām; I: °rthipratya; M: °thi°

प्रमाणीकृतस्य¹ साक्षिणो² वचनेन³ जयो⁴ भवति पराजयो⁵ वा⁶ F8v L10r
 कदाचित्⁷ स्ववचनेनैव⁸ परवचनेन⁹ तु न जयो नापि¹¹ परा- N11r H12r
 जयः¹² । यथा च¹³ लोके¹⁴ तथा न्याये¹⁵ ऽपि¹⁶ । लौकिकस्यैव व्यव- J12v B11r
 हारस्य¹⁷ न्यायशास्त्रे¹⁸ प्रस्तुतत्वात्¹⁹ । G12v

5 §58. अत एव च¹⁹ कैश्चिद्²⁰ उक्तम् – न परतः प्रसिद्धिवशाद्²¹
 अनुमानबाधा²² परप्रसिद्धेर्²³ एव निराचिकीर्षितत्वाद्²⁴ इति²⁵ ।

¹ F, H: pramāṇi°; I: om. pramāṇīkṛtasya sākṣiṇo vacanena jayo bhavati parājayo vā kadācit svavacanenaiva paravacanena tu na jayo nāpi parājayaḥ | yathā ca ² M: sākṣiśo ³ A, E, F, H, K, L: vacanana ⁴ D: jayā ⁵ D: °yā ⁶ D: vāji ⁷ A, E, F, H, K, L: kadāci ⁸ F: svavacanenaivaḥ; em. by LVP (silently): svavacanena; Tib: rang gi tshig kho nas ⁹ D: paravaicanena ¹⁰ C, J, M, N: ja | yo; D: jayā; F: kṣayo; G: ja || yo; H: janayo; K: ≈yo ¹¹ C, G, M: pi ¹² G, M: °yāḥ ¹³ Q: om.; D: va; Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁴ H: nyāya ¹⁵ D: pa ¹⁶ Q: vyahārasya; H: vyahārasya ¹⁷ C, G, M: °śāstra; D: °śāsta ¹⁸ D: pastutatvāt; N: °tvāta ¹⁹ F: caḥ; Tib: n.e. ca ²⁰ F, K: kaiś-caid ²¹ P: °vasād; A, B, D-F, H, K, L, N: °balād; C, J: °balod; G: prasiddhabalod; I: prasiddhabalād; M: prasibalod; PsP_L: °balād; Tib: grags pa'i dbang gis ²² D: °bodhā; F, K: anumānubādhā ²³ A-N: parasiddher; LVP retains L, M and N's reading in his edition but notes (PsP_L 35, n. 1) that Tib attests *gzhan la grags pa* and states, "Lire *paraprasiddher*." ²⁴ A, E, H, I, L: nirāvikīrṣatvād; B: nirāci-kīrṣatvād; C, G, J, M: nirovikīrṣatvād; D, N: nirocīkīrṣatvād; F: nirā-siddher eva nirāvikīrṣatvād; K: nirā-siddher eva nirāvikīrṣatvād; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁵ A: iti; G, M: iti; I: yati; E, K, L: eti

K12r §59. यस् तु¹ मन्यते² – य एव³ तूभयविनिश्चितवाची⁴। स साधनं⁵
दूषणं⁶ वा। नान्यतरप्रसिद्धसन्दिग्धवाचीति⁷। तेनापि⁸ लौकिकी⁹
व्यवस्थाम् अनुरुध्यमानेन¹⁰ यथोक्त¹¹ एव¹² न्यायो¹³ ऽभ्युपेयः¹⁴ ॥

l15r §60. तथा¹⁵ हि नोभयप्रसिद्धेनैवागमेनागमबाधा¹⁶। किं¹⁷ तर्हि।
स्वप्रसिद्धेनापि¹⁸। स्वार्थानुमाने¹⁹ तु सर्वत्र²⁰ स्वप्रसिद्धिरेव गरीय- 5

¹ Tib: n.e. tu ² H: tamnyate ³ Tib: n.e. eva ⁴ Q: °vādī; A-C, E, G, I-L, N: bhūbhaya...vādī; D: bhūtayaviniścītavāgī; F: bhūbhayaviniścītavādī; H: bhūbhayaviniścītavādī; M: bhūbhapa; LVP (PsPL 35, n. 3) records that his mss read *bhūbhaya*° and emends the text to read *ubhaya*°; Tib: n.e. tu (unless the *ni* after *de* is intended as such) ⁵ H: mādhanam; em. (?) by LVP (silently): pramāṇam; Tib: sgrubs pa ⁶ I: duḥkhaṇam ⁷ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): nāyatara-prasiddhasandigdghavācīti. P: nyataraprasiddhasandigdghavācīti (the initial *akṣara nā* has been lost due to a correction); Q: °vādīti; A: °prasiddhesadm(?)isadigdghavācīti; B, J, N: °prasiddhes°; C: nāyataraprasiddhesavdigdhavācīti; D: °prasiddhamśamdiścavācīti; E, F, I, K, L: °prasiddhesadigdghavācīti; G: nāyataraprasiddhesāvdigdghavācīti; H: °prasiddhesadidhgavācīni; M: as C, °vāvīti ⁸ H: nevāpi ⁹ D: lokikīṃ; F: laukikī; G, M: °kī; N: laukīṃ ¹⁰ Q: āśrityānumānena (*āśritya* is a correction; Q's original reading has been erased); A-C, E-N: anuruddhamānena; D: anurupyamānena; conj. by LVP: anurudhyamānen[ānumāne]; Tib: 'jig rten kyi tha snyad kyi rnam par gzhaḡ pa la brten nas rjes su dpag pa la ∴ laukikīṃ vyavasthām anurudhyamānena (cp. Q). See Translation note. ¹¹ I: yathākta ¹² P: om. ¹³ A, E, H, I: tyāyo; C, G, M: vyāmo ¹⁴ A: °ya; D, F, G, N: 'tyupeyaḡ ¹⁵ A-N: yathā; em. by LVP ¹⁶ A: °prasiddhenavāgamenāgacādhām; B-C, G, J, N: °prasiddhenavāgamenā°; D: °bodhā; E, H, I, L: °prasiddhenavāgamenāgabādhā; F, K: tobhayamprasiddhenavāgamenāgabādhā; M: notbhayaprasiddhenavāgamenā°; em. by LVP ¹⁷ A: kīṃ ¹⁸ D: svaprasiddhanopi ¹⁹ F: °nupāne; LVP corrects PsPL's *svarthānumāne* to *svārthānumāne* in his "Additions et

PsPL 36

सी¹ नोभयप्रसिद्धिः² । अत एव तर्कलक्षणाभिधानं³ निःप्रयोजनं⁴
 यथास्वप्रसिद्धयोपपत्त्या⁵ बुद्धैस्⁶ तदनभिज्ञविनेयजनानुग्रहाद्⁷ A10r
 इत्यलं प्रसङ्गेन। प्रकृतमेव व्याख्यास्यामः⁸ ॥

§61. परतो ऽपि नोत्पद्यन्ते⁹ भावाः¹⁰ पराभावाद्¹¹ एव¹² । एतच्¹³ च

5 न हि¹⁴ स्वभावो भावानां¹⁵ प्रत्ययादिषु¹⁶ विद्यते।

इत्य् अत्र¹⁷ प्रतिपादयिष्यति¹⁸ । ततश्च¹⁹ पराभावाद्²⁰ एव नापि²¹
 परत²² उत्पद्यन्ते।

अपि च

Corrections” (p. 597). ²⁰ D: sarvatu

¹ A, E, H, I: gayasī ² G: °pralabdhīḥ; I: °prasiddhaḥ ³ D: taka=a-
 kṣaṇobhidhānaṃ; F, K: tarkāla° ⁴ A: niḥṣayojanaṃ; D: prayoja-
 naṃ; F, K: niḥpa°; G: °na; I: niḥ || ṣayojanaṃ ⁵ Q: yathāsvampra°;
 A, C-N: yathāsvampra°; B: yathātvamprasiddha°; em. by LVP (si-
 lently); Tib: rang la ji ltar grags pa'i 'thad pas ⁶ N: baddhais ⁷ A:
 tada | nabhiḥjñavitayaja°; D: tadanabhiḥjvineyajanā°; E: tada | nabhi-
 jñavinayaja°; H: tadaḥ || tabhiḥjñavinayaja°; I: tadanabhiḥjñatinayaja°;
 Tib: de kho na mi shes pa'i ÷ tadanabhiḥjñā° ⁸ D: tyākhyāsyāmaḥ;
 F: vākhyā°; M: vyākhyāsyāmaḥ; N: vyākhyārsyamaḥ ⁹ A, B, E, H,
 L: nopapadyamte; C, F, G, I, J, K, M, N: nopapadyante; D: nopapa-
 dyamtaṃ; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ P: bhāvā; A: om. ¹¹ A: parā-
 bhācād; D: parābhāvod ¹² Tib: n.e. eva ¹³ Q: evaṃ; C, G, M:
 evac; Tib: 'di ¹⁴ A, E, H, I: di ¹⁵ I: °nāmḥ ¹⁶ C, M: pratyeyādi-
 ṣu ¹⁷ D: atu; G: a; Tib: der ÷ atra ¹⁸ A, H: prativādayiṣyati; D:
 °yiṣyasi; E, F, K, L: prativāda°; I: pratiṣāda° ¹⁹ Tib: n.e. ca ²⁰ A,
 E, F, H, I, K, L: parābhāvābhāvād; C, G, M: parāsvavād ²¹ A, E, H,
 I: tāpi ²² D: parate; N: pata

- C13r अन्यत्¹ प्रतीत्य² यदि नाम परो ऽभविष्यज् जायेत³ तर्हि बहुलः⁴
 शिखिनो⁵ ऽन्धकारः⁶ ।
 सर्वस्य⁷ जन्म⁸ च भवेत्⁹ खलु¹⁰ सर्वतश्च¹¹ च तुल्यं परत्वम्¹¹
 H12v अखिले¹² ऽजनके¹³ ऽपि यस्मात्॥
- M10r J13r इत्यादिना¹⁴ परत¹⁵ उत्पत्तिप्रतिषेधो¹⁶ ऽवसेयः¹⁷ ॥
- G13r §62. आचार्यबुद्धपालितस्¹⁸ तु व्याचष्टे¹⁹ –
- P7r न²⁰ परत उत्पद्यन्ते²¹ भावाः सर्वतः²² सर्वसम्भवप्रसङ्गात्²³ ।
 इति²⁴ ।
- N11v §63. अत्राचार्यभाविवेको²⁵ दूषणम् आह²⁶ –

¹ D: anyata; G: anyan ² D: pratyītya; I: °tye ³ A, B, D, E, H-L, N: jāyet; C, G, M: jāyat; F: jāye; em. by LVP (silently) ⁴ A-N: baha-
 laḥ; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ A, E, H, I: śiṣino ⁶ D: 'dhakārah; F:
 'ndhakaḥ; N: °ra ⁷ G: sarvasva ⁸ D: jatma ⁹ C, G, M: bhavat
¹⁰ P: khaluḥ; Q: kalu; A: khala ¹¹ D: paralaim; H, I: paratom
¹² C, G, J, M, N: akhila ¹³ A-N: janake; conj. by LVP: [']janake
¹⁴ D: inā; K: ityāhinā ¹⁵ F, K: parama ¹⁶ G: °prativedho ¹⁷ P:
 'vaśeyah; Q: madhyamakāvatārād avaseyah; C, G, M: veseyah; conj.
 by LVP (based on Tib): [madhyamakāvatārāt], added after *ityādinā*.
 Tib: dbu ma la 'jug pa las nges par bya'o. See Translation note.
¹⁸ A: acāryya° ¹⁹ A, E, H, I: vyāvaste ²⁰ A-C, E-N: ra; em. by
 LVP (silently) ²¹ F, K: utpadyate ²² C, D, G, M: om. ²³ H:
 savarsabhavaḥpra°; N: sarvasambhuva° ²⁴ PsP_L: om. iti; Tib: ...
 phyir ro || zhes ²⁵ Q: °bhāvaviveko; A: avācāryabaviveko; B, C, E-
 N: atrācāryabhāvaviveko; D: atrācāryaryabhāvaviveko; PsP_L: om.
 atra; Tib: 'di la slob dpon legs ldan 'byed ²⁶ F: āhaḥ

PsPL 37

तद्¹ अत्र² प्रसङ्गवाक्यत्वात् साध्यसाधनविपर्ययं³ कृत्वा⁴ स्वतः⁵
 उभयतो⁶ ऽहेतुतो वोत्पद्यन्ते⁷ भावाः कुतश्चित्⁸ कस्यचिद्⁹ L10v K12v I15v
 उत्पत्तेर्¹⁰ इति प्राक्पक्षविरोध¹¹ इति¹² । अन्यथा¹³ सर्वतः सर्व- E9r
 सम्भवप्रसङ्गाद्¹⁴ इत्यस्य साधनदूषणानन्तःपातिबाद्¹⁵ असङ्ग- B11v
 5 तार्थम्¹⁶ एतत्॥

इति¹⁷ ।

एतद्¹⁸ अप्य् असङ्गतार्थ¹⁹ पूर्वम्²⁰ एव प्रतिपादितत्वाद्²¹ दूषणान्तः- Q6v
 पातिबाच्²² च²³ परप्रतिज्ञातार्थदूषणेनेति²⁴ यत्²⁵ किञ्चिद्²⁶ एतद्²⁷ F9r

¹ A, E: tada; D: tay; G: tatrat ² A, E, H, I: om., but leave a space with a line drawn over it; F, K: apra; L: apr(?)a ³ A: mādhya°; C, G: °viparyayaṇ; I: °viparjyayaṇ; M: °viparyapra ⁴ C, M: kṛtvāt; G: katvāt ⁵ D: svate ⁶ B: ubhayo ⁷ F: vāḥ utpadyante ⁸ A: kutacit; L: kutasci ⁹ A, E, H, I: kasyacicid ¹⁰ P, Q: utpattir; F: utpater ¹¹ P: prāpakṣyavirodha; A, E, H, I: prakapakṣa°; D: prākapakṣāṃvarodha; F, K: prākapakṣa° ¹² PsPL: om. iti ¹³ C, M: avyathā ¹⁴ I: sarvvasabhāprasagād ¹⁵ A, E: dhānadūṣaṇāṇaṃtaḥyālitvād; B: °dūṣaṇāṇaṃtaḥpālitvād; C, G, J, M, N: °pālitvād; F, K: dhānadūṣaṇāṇaṃtaḥpālitvād; H: dhānadūṣaṇāṇaṃtaḥpālitvād; I: dhānadūṣaṇāṇaṃtaḥpālitvād; L: as A, °taḥpālitvād; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁶ I: aśaṃga° ¹⁷ PsPL: om. iti; Tib: zhes ¹⁸ A: evaṃdam; B, C, E-N: etadam; em. by LVP ¹⁹ A: amagatārthaṃ; D, M: °tha; G: asagatārtha; Tib: don 'brel pa med pa ma yin ²⁰ D: pūrvam ²¹ N: °tvā ²² P: dūṣaṇāṇantaḥ°; D: dūṣaṇānte | pātittvā; F: dūṣaṇāntanrpatitvāc ²³ H: cā ²⁴ C, G, J, M, N: °duṣaṇeti; D: °naiti; Tib: gong kho nar bstan zin pa 'i phyir dang | gzhan gyis dam bcas pa 'i don sun 'byin bar byed pa yin pa dang | sun 'byin pa nyid kyang yin pa 'i phyir ∴ pūrvam eva pratipāditatvād dūṣaṇāntaḥpātittvāc ca parapratijñātārthadūṣaṇeneti ²⁵ A: yata; D, H: yet ²⁶ Q: kinchid; D: kiṃ-rid ²⁷ D: āitad

इति न पुनर्¹ यत्न² आस्थीयते³ ॥

PsPL 38

§64. द्वाभ्यामपि नोपजायन्ते⁴ भावा⁵ उभयपक्षाभिहितदोषप्रसङ्गात्⁶
प्रत्येकम्⁷ उत्पादासामर्थ्याच्च⁸ च। वक्ष्यति⁹ हि¹⁰ –

स्याद्¹¹ उभाभ्यां¹² कृतं¹³ दुःखं¹⁴ स्याद्¹⁵ एकैककृतं¹⁶ यदि।

इति¹⁶ ॥

5

D6v §65. अहेतुतो ऽपि नोत्पद्यन्ते¹⁷

हेताव्¹⁸ असति कार्यं¹⁹ च कारणं²⁰ च न विद्यते।

A10v इत्यादिवक्ष्यमाणदोषप्रसङ्गात्²²

¹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: puna ² D: yanna; H: yatsn(?)a ³ D: āsthāya-
te; G, H: āsthiyate ⁴ C, G, M: noyante; D: lopajānte; F: ≈opa°; I:
nopajñāyante ⁵ A: bhāvāṭha ⁶ A: bhaya...doṣasaṃgrān; C: °pra-
sagāt; E, H, L: °doṣasaṃgrān; F: °doṣagrāt; I: °doṣasaṃtrān; J: °pra-
sagān; K: °doṣasaṃgrāt ⁷ A: pranyakam; D, I: pratyakam; F: pra-
tyekam ⁸ A, H, I: utpādāsīsāmarthyāc; E: utpādā~āsāmarthyāc
⁹ P: vakṣyāti; H: vakṣyahi ¹⁰ H: ti ¹¹ H: sād ¹² D: ubhātyām
¹³ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: kṛte ¹⁴ A: duḥkha; F, H: dukham ¹⁵ A, C, E-
N: aikaikam; B, D: ekaikam; conj. by LVP: ekaika[kṛtam]; Tib: re re
byas ¹⁶ A: iti ¹⁷ C: votpadyante; D: notyadyante; H: notedyamte
¹⁸ A-N: hetov; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁹ H: kāryāmñ ²⁰ G: om.;
M: °ṇa ²¹ A, E, H, I, M: om. ²² A, C, E, G, H, J, N: iti || vakṣya-
māna°; B, F, M: iti | vakṣyamāna°; D: °māna°; F: iti (space) vakṣya-
māna°, I: iti || vakṣyamānaḍoṣaprasagāt; K, L: iti || vakṣyamāna°;
PsPL: iti vakṣyamāna°. Tib: zhes bya ba la sogs pas 'chad par 'gyur
ba'i skyon du thal bar 'gyur ba'i phyir

गृह्येत¹ नैव² च जगद्³ यदि⁴ हेतुशून्यं स्याद्⁵ यद्वद्⁶ एव⁷ गगनो- C13v
त्पलवर्णगन्धौ⁸ ।

इत्यादिदोषप्रसङ्गाच्च⁹ च ॥

§66. आचार्यबुद्धपालितस्¹⁰ बाह —

5 अहेतुतो नोत्पद्यन्ते¹¹ भावाः¹² सदा¹³ च¹⁴ सर्वतश्च¹⁵ सर्व-
सम्भवप्रसङ्गात्¹⁷ ॥

H13r

इति¹⁸ ॥

§67. अत्राप्य¹⁹ आचार्यभाविवेको²⁰ दूषणमाह —

¹ C, G, I, M: gr̥hyata; H: gr̥heta ² F: naida ³ A, E, H, I, K, L: kṣagad; F: kṣagac ⁴ F: cadi; G: yahi ⁵ A: sād ⁶ F: ≈advad ⁷ D: e ⁸ P: °gandhād; A, E, H: gaṇotpalavarṇagaṃdhāv; C, G, J, M: gagaṇātpala°; D: gamanovarṇagaṃdhāv; F: gagaṇotpalavarṇagandhād; I: gaṇotparavarṇa°; K: as F, °dhāv; N: as C, °varṇa° ⁹ A, E, H, I, L: ibhyādi°; F: °gā ¹⁰ A, E, I, K, L: āryabuddhapālita; C, G, J, M, N: °ta; F: āryabaddhapālita; H: āryabuddhapāli; em. by LVP (silently) ¹¹ B, F, K: notpadyate; D: nānyadyante ¹² H: °vā ¹³ D: kadā ¹⁴ D: cit | ¹⁵ D: ata; N: savātaś ¹⁶ D: va ¹⁷ P: sarvva-sambhāprasāṅgād; A, E, H: sava°; C, J, N: °prasagād; D: sambhava-prasāṅgād ¹⁸ D: ikim; PsP_L: om. iti; Tib: zhes ¹⁹ A-C, E-N: om. api; PsP_L: om. api; Tib: yang ²⁰ A, E, H, I, K, L: °bhāvivekā; B: °bhāvaviveka, va inserted from above; D: °bhavivekā; F: acāryabhāvivekā; I: °bhāvavivekā

G13v J13v

l16r

PsPL 39

अत्रापि प्रसङ्गवाक्यत्वाद्¹ यदि विपरीतसाध्यसाधनव्यक्तिर्² वा-
 क्यार्थ³ इष्यते⁴ तदैतद्⁵ उक्तं भवति – हेतुत उत्पद्यन्ते⁶ भावाः⁷
 कदाचित्⁸ कुतश्चित्⁹ कस्यचिद्¹⁰ उत्पत्तेर्¹¹ आरम्भसाफल्यार्त्¹²
 च¹³ इति सेयं¹⁴ व्याख्या¹⁵ न युक्ता¹⁶ प्रागुक्तदोषात्¹⁷ ॥

इति¹⁸ ॥

5

¹ A, E, H, I: *saṃgavākyatvāt*; F: *prasaga°*; G: *pratyakṣavākyatvāt*
² P: *viparītasādhyaśādhanaavyaktir*; A, E, H, I: *viparītasādhana-*
vyakti; B, C, G, J, M, N: *°vyakti*; F, K, L: *viparītasādhanaavyakti*; PsPL:
viparītasādhyaśādhanaavyaktivākyārtha (= conjoined with following
 compound); PsP Tib: *gal te bsgrub par bya ba dang sgrub par byed pa*
bzlog pa gsal ba ngag gi don du mngon par 'dod na ³ C, G, M: *vā-*
kyārtharit; D: *tha*; J, N: *°thaḥ* ⁴ I: *dūṣyate* ⁵ A: *daita*; E, H, I:
daitad ⁶ A, F, K: *utpatte*; E, H, I, L: *utpante* ⁷ G: *°ā* ⁸ C, G, M:
om.; I: *kadācitta* ⁹ F: *kutacit* ¹⁰ N: *om.* ¹¹ P: *utpada(n)t(e)*; Q:
utpattir; F, G: *upatter*; I: *utpanter* ¹² Em. with LVP: *ārambhasāpha-*
lyāc. P: *cārambhasadbhāvād*; Q: *ārambhasadbhāvād*; A, E, H, L: *ā-*
rambhasammāvād; B, I: *ārambhasaṃbhāvād*; C, F, G, J, K, M: *āram-*
bhasaṃbhāvād; D: *ārambhasabhāvād*; N: as C, *°sambhā°*; PsP Tib:
rtsom pa 'bras bu dang bcas pa nyid du 'gyur ba'i phyir. The *akṣara*
pha must have been read or interpreted as *dbha*, and *l* of *lyā* inter-
 preted as or changed to *va*; the rest of the word must have been “cor-
 rected” once *°sadbhāvāc* was thought to be the correct reading. LVP
 (PsPL 39, n. 2) erroneously records his mss as reading *ārambhasad-*
bhāvād iti and *°saṃbhavād iti*. ¹³ Em. with LVP (LVP emends si-
 lently): ca. P, Q: *om.*; A-N: *om.* The *akṣara cca*, of which the lower *ca*
 – prior to reaching ms ζ – had probably degenerated to a black
 smudge that caused the *akṣara* to be read as *t virāma*, would have
 finally been changed to *d* (see previous note) for the sake of *sandhi*.
¹⁴ G: *sayam*; I: *syayam* ¹⁵ Q: ☉; A-C, E-N: *vyākhyā*; em. by LVP
 (silently) ¹⁶ D: *yukta* ¹⁷ D: *doṣād*; G, I: *prāguptadoṣād* ¹⁸ G: *īti*

§68. तद्¹ एतद्² अयुक्तं³ पूर्वोदितपरिहाराद्⁴ इत्य् अपरे⁴ ॥

K13r N12r N12v

§69. यच् चाप्युक्तम्⁵ ईश्वरादीनाम्⁶ उपसङ्ग्रहार्थम्⁷ । तदपि न युक्तम्⁸ ईश्वरादीनां⁸ स्वपरोभयपक्षेषु⁹ यथाभ्युपगमम्¹⁰ अन्तर्भावाद¹¹

M10v

¹ Tib: n.e. tat ² I: aktaṃ ³ D, M: pūrvādita° ⁴ D: apara; N: aparad iti ॥ ॥ atha khalu tāni daśabhuvanaṣṭhitadevaputrasahasrāṇibhagavatodharṃmadeśanāmanavataṛaṃsanavagāhatānāpy anadhis(or m?)uvyamamāni utthayāsanet yaḥ prakrāntāni ॥ pramuditābhūmisthitādevā imaṃ sarvvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ vivalābhūmisthitādevā imaṃ sarvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ prabhākariḥbhūmisthitādevā imaṃ sarvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ aściṃṣmatibhūmisthitādevā ima sarvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ suraṅgaśābhūmisthitādevā imaṃ sarvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ abhimuṣibhūmisthitādevān imaṃ sarvvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ duraṅgaṃābhūmisthitādevān ima sarvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ acalābhūmisthitādevān ima sarvvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ sādhumatibhūmisthitādevān ima sarvvaḍharṃmān iti ॥ dhammameghobhūmisthitādevān imaṃ savadhamān iti ॥ imān tathāgatasya dharṃmadeśanāṃ śrutvā vigatārāgān sarvvaḍharṃmān paśyanti vikalpana paśyanti ॥ dānapāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā śīlapāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā kṣāntipāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā vīryapāratāṃ utpāditābhāvanā dhyānapāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā prajñāpāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā upāyapāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā prañidhipāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā varapāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā jñānapāramitāṃ utpāditābhāvanā ॥ evaṃ asvabhāvo nanāvaraṇāt ॥ tenākāśasthitena cekasākālaṃ kurvanti ॥ cittamanoramasamjñitaśreṣṭhāḥ svarṇṇavimānaṃ j(?)laṃtimanojñāḥ (this last line occurs in PsP_M §80) ⁵ P: om. uktam; A-N: om. uktam; PsP_L: om. uktam. The translators of Tib appear to have considered *īśvarādīnām upasaṅgrahārtham* to be a citation; these exact words do not occur in the first chapter of Bhāviveka's PP (Candrakīrti is merely summarizing). PsP Tib: gang yang dbang phyug la sogs pa nye bar bsdu ba'i phyir yin no zhes bya ba de yang rigs pa ma yin te ÷ yac cāpy uktam *īśvarādīnām upasaṅgrahārtham* tad api na yuktam ⁶ A, E: °ādīnām; F: īśva°; H: īśvarādīnām; M: īśca° ⁷ P: upasaṅgrahārthah; D: apa°; F: °tha; G: upasaṅgrahagrāhārthan ⁸ H: īśva°; M:

L11r इति¹ ॥

§70. तस्मात् प्रसाधितमेतन् नास्त्य² उत्पाद इति। उत्पादासम्भवाच्च³ सिद्धो ऽनुत्पादादिविशिष्टः⁴ प्रतीत्यसमुत्पाद⁵ इति⁶ ॥

§71. अत्राह – यद्येवम्⁷ अनुत्पादादिविशिष्टः⁸ प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादो
B12r व्यवस्थापितो⁹ भवद्भिर्¹⁰ यत् तर्हि भगवतोक्तम्¹¹ – 5

अविद्याप्रत्ययाः¹² संस्कारा¹³ अविद्यानिरोधात्¹⁴ संस्कार-
निरोधः¹⁵ ॥

īśva°; N: īśvarādanām⁹ D: svaparābha°; G: °bhayayakṣeṣu; I: °pakṣaṣu¹⁰ P: yathā cābhyupagāmam; A, E, H, K, L: °bhyupagam; D: yathātyupagem; F: yathātyupagam; I: yabhupagam; M: yathātyupagan¹¹ C, M: antabhāvād; F, K: attarbhāvād; G: antayāvād; I: abharbhāvād; N: anyabhād

¹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: repeat from *seyaṃ vyākhyā to iti* (with minor scribal variants); H begins the dittography with *esaṃ vyākhyā*; B: repeats *seyaṃ vyākhyā na yuktā prāg uktadoṣād iti* ॥; Tib: n.e. iti

² A, E, I: nāsbhy; F: nāty; H: nārabhy; K: nāḥbhy, (L could be read as *nās(h?)bhy*)³ Tib: n.e. ca (the previous sentence in Tib ends, however, with *la*)⁴ C, G, M: nūtpādiviśiṣṭaḥ; D: 'nūtpādādiviśiṣṭaḥ⁵ I: pratitya°⁶ Tib: n.e. iti⁷ D, I: yadyavam⁸ B: anūtpādiviśiṣṭaḥ

⁹ F, K: vyavasthānapito; em. by LVP (silently): vyavasthito¹⁰ A, E, H: bhavatiḥ; D: bhavāmbhaḥ; F, G, I, K, M: bhavati; Tib: n.e. bhavadbhiḥ¹¹ A, E, K, L: hemavatārktam; B, C, F, G, J, M, N: hemavatārktam; H, I: hevamatārktam; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: n.e. uktam¹² A: °patyāyāḥ; F: °yā; H, I: °patyāyāḥ¹³ D: saṃskārādih¹⁴ C, G, M: °nirodhaḥ; F: °dhā; K: °nirādhah¹⁵ A: maṃskāranirādhah; C, G, M: om.; E, H, K, L: °nirādhah; I: saskāranirādhah. Tib adds a following *ces bya ba* and in accord with Tib, LVP (silently) adds *iti*; LVP does not, however, add *iti* after the other citations in this section for which Tib attests a closing *zhes bya ba*. None

तथा¹

अनित्या² बत³ संस्कारा⁴ उत्पादव्ययधर्मिणः⁵ ।

PsPL 40

उत्पद्य⁶ हि निरुध्यन्ते⁷ तेषां⁸ व्युपशमः⁹ सुखम्¹⁰ ॥

E9v

तथा¹¹

of the manuscripts attest *iti* after °*nirrodhaḥ*.

¹ C, G, J, M, N: *tathāpi*; Tib connects the quotations, both here and before each of the following translated *tathās*, with a *dang* ² Q: *anityāś ca* (*śca* is a correction); C, G, J, M, N: *nityā*; em. by LVP (silently): *anityāś* ³ A, E, H, I: *vate*; B, C, F, J-N: *cate*; G: *cāte*; LVP (PsPL 39) retains the reading *ca te* found in his mss. De Jong (1978: 32) corrects to *anityā bata* in reliance on ms D, PsP Tib (*kṛe ma ... mi rtag*) and Udānavarga I.3. ⁴ I: *saskārā* ⁵ A, E, H, I: °*vyayadharmitaḥ*; F: °*vyayadharmitaḥ*; ⁶ J: *upadya*; M: *utpādyā*; N: *unpādyā* ⁷ A: *tirurudhatte*; E, K, L: *nirurudhyante*; F: *ni | rurudhyante*; H, I: *tirurudhyante*; ⁸ M: *śām* ⁹ A, E, H, I: *vyupadāmaḥ*; C, M: *vyupasa-
samaḥ*; D, N: *vyupa°*; F: *vyupaśama*; G: *vyupasaṇaḥ* ¹⁰ P: (*sukh*)_a+; A, E, H, I: *murkha*; C, G, M, N: *sukhan*; F: *mūrkhā*; K, L: *surkha*; em. by LVP (silently): *sukhaḥ*. See Translation note. ¹¹ P: Ø, damage to P after *sukham* is such that approximately the next 10-11 *akṣaras* are missing; when the text becomes readable again, the words *yaduta catvāra* appear; Q: *iti tathā utpādād vā tathāgatānām anutpādād vā tathāgatānām sthitir aiśā dharmāṇām dharmatā dharmmadhātus tathā kāmābhāvaḥ paraṃ sukham*; A: *tathā utpādād vā tathāgatānām utpādād vā tathāgatānā sthitaudevaiśā dharmānā dharmatā*; B, C, J, N: *tathā utpādād vā tathāgatānām utpādād vā tathāgatānām sthitaudevaiśā dharmāṇām dharmatā*; D: *tathā utpādād vā tathāgatānām enutpādād vā tathāgatānā sthitaudevaiśā dharmatā*; E, H, I: *tathā utpādād vā tathāgatānām mutpādād vā tathāgatānā sthitaudevaiśā dharmānā dharmatā*; F, K, L: *tathā utpādād vā tathāgatānām utpādād vā tathāgatānā sthitaudevaiśā dharmāṇām dharmatāḥ*; G: *tathā utpād vā tathāgatānām utpādād vā tathāgatānā sthitaiveśā dharmānā dharmatā*; M: *tathā utpādād vā ta-*

H13v A11r I16v
C14r F9v

एको¹ धर्मः सत्त्वस्थितये² यदुत चत्वार³ आहाराः⁴ ॥

द्वौ धर्मौ⁵ लोकं⁶ पालयतो⁷ हीश्⁸ चापत्राय्य⁹ च ॥

इत्यादि¹⁰ ।

तथा

परलोकाद् इहागमनम्¹¹ इहलोकाच्¹² च परलोकगमनम्¹³ ॥ 5

G14r

इत्य् एवं निरोधादिविशिष्टः¹⁵ प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादो¹⁶ देशितो भगव-

J14r K13v

ता¹⁷ स कथं न विरुध्यत¹⁸ इति ॥

thāgatānām utpādād vā tathāgatānām sthitaivaiṣā dharmānā dharmatā;
PsP_L: tathā utpādād vā tathāgatānām anutpādād vā tathāgatānām
sthitaivaiṣā dharmānām dharmatā; PsP Tib: zhes bya ba dang | de
bzhin du | de bzhin gshegs pa rnams byung yang rung | de bzhin
gshegs pa rnams ma byung yang rung | chos rnams kyi chos nyid 'di
ni gnas pa kho na ste zhes bya ba dang |. See Translation note.

¹ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ekau ² P: Ø; D: °yeṃ; I: °sthitoye ³ A,
E, H, I: vatvāra ⁴ F: °rā ⁵ Q: dharmmo; A, E, F, H, K, L: dhar-
moka; C, G, J, M: dharmo; I: dharmokaḥ; N: dharmā; em. by LVP
(silently) ⁶ P: Ø; A, E, H, I: loka; F, K, L: lo ⁷ C, G, J, M, N: pāla-
to; I: pālayeto ⁸ A, H: hriś ⁹ Q: cāpyatrāpyam; A, B, D-F, H-L, N:
°pyaś; C, G, M: cāpatrāpaś; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ B: °dih
¹¹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ihāgam; C: ihāgamanebh(?); G, M: ihāgama-
neś; D: iphāgamanam ¹² D: ihaloko ¹³ D: om. ¹⁴ D: gamanam;
G: palokagamamam ¹⁵ F, G, H, I: °ṣṭa; M: nirodhādiśiṣṭaḥ ¹⁶ D:
pratītyasumu°; H: pratityaḥsam° ¹⁷ H: °tāḥ; I: bhāvatā; Tib: n.e.
bhagavatā ¹⁸ A-N: nirudhyata; LVP (PsP_L 40, n. 5) retains his mss'
reading but notes, "Le Tib. fournit une lecture préférable: *virudhyate*
('gal ba). Le sens paraît être *katham na sūtravirodhaḥ*."

यत¹ एव² हि³ निरोधादयः प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादस्योपलभ्यन्ते⁴ अत⁵
 PsP_L 41 एवेदं⁶ मध्यमकशास्त्रं⁷ प्रणीतम्⁸ आचार्येण⁹ नेयनीतार्थसूत्रान्त-
 विभागोपदर्शनार्थम्¹⁰ । तत्र य¹¹ एते¹² प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादस्योत्पादा-
 दय¹³ उक्ताः¹⁴ न ते¹⁵ विगताविद्यातिमिरानास्रवज्ञानविषयस्व- P7V
 5 भावापेक्षया¹⁶ । किं¹⁷ तर्हि¹⁸ । अविद्यातिमिरोपहतमतिनयनज्ञान-

¹ H: eta ² A-C, E, G, I-N: evā; F: ecā; H: yevā; em. by LVP: evam;
 Tib: de ltar ³ B, C, G, M, N: ha; J: haṃ; Tib: n.e. hi ⁴ P: Ø; D:
 °pādasyāpalatyatye; F, I, K: °bhyate; N: °syoparabhyante; Tib: thos pa
 (gang gi phyir de ltar rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba 'gag pa la sogs pa
 dag yod par thos par 'gyur ba) ⁵ P: Ø; D: atra; J: ate ⁶ P: Ø; A, E,
 F, H, I, K, L: eveda ⁷ Q: madhyaka°; N: madhyaka° ⁸ C, G, M:
 pañītam; H: prañetam ⁹ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ācārveṇa; C, D, G, N:
 ācāryaṇa ¹⁰ P: ne(y)a(n)+[4](nt)+[3]°; A: neyatītārthasūtrānām-
 tavibhāgo°; B, J, N: neyatītārthasūtrāntavibhāgo°; C, G, M: nayatī-
 tārthasūtrāntavidbhāgo°; E, H, I: neyatītārthasūtrānām-tavibhāgo°;
 F: neyatīnītārthamvi...ārtha; K: neyatīnītārthasūtrāntavi...tha; L: as
 B, °sūtrāṃta°; em. by LVP (silently) ¹¹ M: pa ¹² A, E, F, H, K, I:
 hate (L's initial *e* could be read as *ha*); C, G, M: eta; Tib: n.e. ete
¹³ P: pratītyasamutpā(d).[1]tpādāḍaya; A, E, H, I: pratītyasamutpā-
 daudaya; B, C, G, J, M, N: pratītyasamutpādodaya; D: pratītyasamut-
 pādādaṣṭa; F, K, L: pratītyasamutpādaudaya; conj. by LVP: pratītyasa-
 mutpād[asyotpād]āḍaya ¹⁴ A-C, E-N: ukto; em. by LVP (silently)
¹⁵ D: ta ¹⁶ P: vigatāvidyātāimirāṇām sarvajñāṇām viṣaye svabhāvā-
 pekṣayā; A, E, F, I, K, L: vigatā; B: vigatāvidyātāinirāśravajñānavi-
 ṣayasvabhāvopekṣayā; C, G, J, M: vigatāvidyātāinirāśravaviṣayasva-
 bhāvopekṣayā; D: vigatāvidyātāimirāmāśravajñānaviṣaya°; H: viga-
 to; N: as C: °viṣayesva°; em. by LVP: vigatāvidyātāimirā[nā]sravavi-
 ṣayasvabhāvāpekṣayā; Tib: ma rig pa'i rab rib dang bral pa dag gi ye
 shes zag pa med pa'i yul gyi rang bzhin la ltos nas ¹⁷ A, E, F, H, I,
 K, L: om.; C, G, J, M, N: ki; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁸ A, E, F, H, I,
 K, L: om.; C, G, J, M, N: tahy; em. by LVP (silently)

विषयापेक्षया¹ ॥

N13r §72. तच्चदर्शनापेक्षया² तूक्तं³ भगवता⁴ –

Q7r एतद्⁵ धि भिक्षवः⁶ परमं⁷ सत्यं⁸ यदुतामोषधर्मं⁹ निर्वाणं¹⁰ सर्व-
संस्काराश्च¹¹ च मृषा¹² मोषधर्माणः¹³ ॥

इति¹⁴ ।

5

तथा

¹ P: °nayanajñ+[nā]p+kṣayā; Q: °viṣayāpakṣeyā; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: vidyātimiropahamati°; D: °nayamajñānaviṣamāpekṣayā; N: °jñānavi-
yāpekṣayā; Tib ma rig pa'i rab rib gyi blo gros kyis mig nyams par
byas pa dag gi shes pa'i yul la ltos nas ² A, E: tatvadaśanā°; D:
repeats the compound; I: tatodar° ³ A-C, E-G, I-M: bhūktam; H, N:
bhūkta; em. by LVP (silently) ⁴ Q: bhavatā; F: °tāḥ; N: repeats ete
pratītyasamutpādadaya ukto na te vigatāvidyātinirāśravaviṣayesva-
bhāvopekṣayā ki tathy āvidyātimiropahatamatinayanajñvānaviṣayāpe-
kṣayā || tatvadarśanāpekṣayā bhūktam bhugavatā ⁵ Q: eta; B: om.
etad dhi bhikṣavaḥ paramaṁ satyaṁ yadutāmoṣadharmam nirvāṇam
sarvasaṁskārāś ca mṛṣā moṣadharmāṇaḥ || iti | tathā nāsty atra tathatā
vā ⁶ N: bhikṣāvaḥ ⁷ P: Ø; A, E, H, K, L: parammaṁ; C, G, M:
paraman; D: parama ⁸ P: Ø; A, E, F, H, I, K, L: bhatyaṁ ⁹ P: Ø;
A, C: yadutāmoṣadharmā; D: dutāmopadharmaṁ; E-I, J: ṣadutā...-
dharmā; K-M: °dharmā; N: yedutā...dharmā; LVP emends (silently):
°dharma; Q's reading °dharmaṁ is also supported by mss P, B and
D's readings for the citation at PsPl 237.11-12. ¹⁰ P: Ø; A, E, F, H,
I, K, L: virvāṇam ¹¹ C, F, I, K, L: °saskārāś; D: °saṁskāmās; H:
°saṁkārā ¹² F: maṣā ¹³ A, E, H, I: mona; D: °dharmyāṇa; F:
noṣadharmān ¹⁴ Em. by LVP: ityādi; Tib: zhes bya ba la sogs pa;
the damage in P's moṣādharmā[6]nās(ty a)tra would appear to
allow for the extra akṣara contained in ityādi. Q, however, attests
only iti.

नास्त्य् अत्र¹ तथता² वा³ अवितथता⁴ वा। मोषधर्मकम्⁵ अप्य्⁶
 एतत्⁷ प्रलोपधर्मकम्⁸ अप्य् एतद्⁹ मृषाप्य्¹⁰ एतत्¹¹। मायेयं¹²
 बाललापिनी¹³।

इति।

5 तथा

I17r

फेनपिण्डोपमं¹⁴ रूपं वेदना बुद्बुदोपमा¹⁵।
 मरीचिसदृशी¹⁶ सञ्ज्ञा¹⁷ संस्काराः¹⁸ कदलीनिभाः¹⁹।
 मायोपमं च विज्ञानम्²⁰ उक्तम् आदित्यबन्धुना²¹ ॥

L11v M11r

PsP_L 42

C14v

¹ P: (a)tra; D, G: utra ² A: tathānā; G: tathābhā ³ B: om.; D: vāḥ
⁴ D: °to; H: avitathātā ⁵ G: modharmmakam ⁶ D: avy ⁷ A, C,
 E-N: atat; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: 'di dag ÷ etat ⁸ A, B, E, I, L:
 pralāpa°; C, G, M: palopa°; F: prulāpāyadharmakam; H: om.; K:
 pralāya°; N: °ka; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: n.e. pralopadharmakam
 apy etad ⁹ A, C-E, G, I, J, L-N: atat; H: om.; em. by LVP (silently)
¹⁰ A, E, H: mṛṣāp; F, I, K: om. ¹¹ D: etata; F, I, K: om.; G: atat
¹² D: māyayaṃ; H: māyaya ¹³ D: balalopinī; PsP Tib: 'di dag ni
 brdzun pa sgyu ma byis pa 'drid pa ÷ mṛṣāpy etad māyayaṃ bālālāpi-
 nī. ¹⁴ A, C, E-I, K, M: henapiṇḍopama; B, J, L, N: °ma; D: phena-
 tiṇṇopamam; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁵ A, E, H, I, K, L: buddhado-
 mapāṃ; B: °mām; C, J, N: °mam; D: bubudoyamā; F: buddhadoma-
 mām; G, M: °mam; em. by LVP (silently). ¹⁶ A, B, E, H: marīcīśa-
 dṛṣī; C, G, K, J, L, M: marīcī°; F: marīcīśadṛṣī; I: marīcīśadṛṣī; N:
 marīcīmadṛṣī; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁷ G: saññā; I: saññāḥ ¹⁸ A,
 E, H, I, K, L: saskārāḥ; F: suṣkārāḥ ¹⁹ A, E, H, I: °nibhāvāḥ; F, K,
 L: °nibhābhāḥ; M: kadarī° ²⁰ M: adds following ṛṣām ²¹ P: Ø;
 D: ādibhya°; N: aditya°; conj. by LVP: [iti]

एवं धर्मान्¹ वीक्षमाणो² भिक्षुर्³ आरब्धवीर्यवान्⁴ ।
 H14r दिवा वा यदि⁵ वा रात्रौ सम्प्रजानन्⁶ प्रतिस्मृतः ।
 प्रतिविध्येत्⁷ पदं⁸ शान्तं⁹ संस्कारोपशमं¹⁰ शिवम्¹¹ ।
 B12v निरात्मत्वं¹² च धर्माणाम् ॥
 इत्यादि¹³ ॥

¹ P: [1]r(m)ān; A, B, E, F, H-L: dharmani; D: dharmākam – owing to an eyeskip back to *moṣadharmakam*, D's scribe repeats the text from *moṣadharmakam* up to and including the then correctly scribed *dharmān*; C, G, M, N: dharmmani; em. by LVP (silently) ² Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): vīkṣamāṇo. P: a(ve)kṣamāṇ(o); Q: avekṣ///; A-C, E, G-N: vekṣamāna; D: avekṣamāṇo; F: vekṣamāṇata
³ Q: ⊗ ⁴ P: [3](y).(v)ān; Q: ///vīryavān; A: ārapravīryavān; D: orab-dha°; E, I: °vīryavān ⁵ A: ≈di ⁶ G: saṃprajānaṃ; em. by LVP (silently): saṃprajñānaṃ ⁷ P: pratividdheta, there may be a *virāma* under *t*; A-M: pratividhya; N: pratibimbe; em. by LVP: pratividhyet
⁸ A: papeśā; B: pade; C, G, J: padeśa; E, F, H, I, K-N: padeśā; em. by LVP ⁹ P: sāntaṃ; F: sāmntaṃ ¹⁰ P: saṃskāropasamaṃ; A, H: saṃskāroyamasam; B, C, E-G, J-L, N: saṃskāropamasam; D: °paśa-sam; I: saskāroyamasam; M: °opasamaṃ; em. by LVP (silently)
¹¹ N: śim ¹² Conj.: nirātmatvaṃ; P: iti | nirātmatvāc; Q: iti || nirātmatvāc; A, E, H, I: iti nitātmakatvāc; B, K, L: iti nirātmakatvāc; C, G, J, M, N: iti || nirātmakatvāc; D: iti nirātmakātvo; F: as B, °kattvāc; PsP_L: (iti ||) nirātmakatvāc; PsP Tib: chos rnams bdag med pa nyid བ (the mss') iti nirātma(ka)tvāc ca dharmāṇām, with *chos rnams bdag med pa nyid* construed as an object of *rtogs par 'gyur* (*pratividhyet*). See Translation note. ¹³ B: ityādiḥ

§73. यस्यैव¹ देशनाभिप्रायानभिज्ञतया² सन्देहः³ स्यात् – का⁴ ह्य⁵
 अत्र देशना⁶ तत्त्वार्था का⁷ नु⁸ खल्व् आभिप्रायिकीति⁹ – यश्चापि¹⁰ G14v D7r
 मन्दबुद्धितया¹¹ नेयार्था¹² देशनां¹³ नीतार्थाम् अवगच्छति¹⁴ J14v A11v
 तयोर्¹⁵ उभयोर्¹⁶ अपि विनेयजनयोर्¹⁷ आचार्यो¹⁸ युक्त्यागमाभ्या¹⁹
 5 संशयमिथ्याज्ञानयोर्²⁰ अपाकरणार्थम् इदम्²¹ आरब्धवान्²² । तत्र K14r
 न स्वत इत्यादिना²³ युक्तिर् उपवर्णिता²⁴ ।

¹ H: paśyaivam; I: °vya ² D: daśanābhiprāyāṇabhiññateyā; N: deśa-
 nabhi° ³ A-C, E-N: °deha; em. by LVP (silently) ⁴ A-C, E-N: ko;
 em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ A, E, F, H, I, K-M: jy ⁶ C, J, M, N: dar-
 śanā; D: deśano; G: darśano ⁷ A-C, E-N: ko; em. by LVP (silently)
⁸ A, E, F, H, I, K: ma; L: n(?)a; N: mu; Tib: dgongs pa can ni 'dir
 gang zhig yin snyam du ∴ kā nu khalv ābhiprāyikīti, i.e., Tib adds
 'dir to the second part of the question (the translators may have mis-
 read the *akṣara nu* for the *akṣara tra*) ⁹ Q: abhi° ¹⁰ Tib: n.e. api
¹¹ E, F, I, K, L: bhanda° ¹² A, B, E, F, H, K, L: °thā; C, G, J, M, N:
 rthā; I: nyāyārthā; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ A: meśanā; B, C, E, G,
 H, J-N: neśanām; D: neśanā; F: neśatām; I: neśanyam; em. by LVP
 (silently) ¹⁴ F: apagacchati ¹⁵ A, C-E, G-N: tayār; em. by LVP
 (silently) ¹⁶ D: uhayor ¹⁷ C, J, M, N: °yon; G: °yo ¹⁸ D: ācīr-
 yā; G: cāryo; M: ā ¹⁹ A, E, H, I: yukatyāga°; D: yuktyaga°; K, F:
 yūrukatyāgamābhyām; G: °tyām ²⁰ P: śaṁśaya°; A-C, E-N: °mi-
 thyājñānamār; D: śaṁśayamidhyājñānāyor; em. by LVP (silently):
 °mithyājñānāpākaraṇārtham, that is, LVP deletes the final *mār* (=
 degenerated *yor*) and connects the compound to the following one.
 Tib: the tshom dang log pa'i shes pa dag ²¹ A-C, E-N: itam; D:
 itām; em. by LVP (silently) ²² A, E, F, H, I: °vāt; D: āraghavān
²³ C, G, M: isādinā ²⁴ A: upavarimatā; E, H, I, K, L: upavaṇitā; F:
 upavaṇitāḥ

	तन् ¹ मृषा ¹ मोषधर्म ² यद् ³ भगवान् ⁴ इत्य् ⁵ अभाषत ⁵ ।	
	सर्वे ⁶ च मोषधर्माणः ⁷ संस्कारास् ⁸ तेन ⁹ ते ⁹ मृषा ¹⁰ ॥	
N13v	पूर्वा ¹¹ प्रज्ञायते ¹¹ कोटिर् ¹² नेत्य् ¹³ उवाच ¹⁴ महामुनिः ¹⁵ ।	
E10r	संसारोऽनवराग्रो ¹⁶ हि नास्यादिर् ¹⁷ नापि पश्चिमम् ¹⁸ ॥	PsP _L 43
I17v	कात्यायनाववादे ¹⁹ चास्तीति ²⁰ नास्तीति ²¹ चोभयम् ²² ।	5
F10r	प्रतिषिद्धं ²³ भगवता भावाभावविभाविना ²⁴ ॥	

¹ C, G, J, M: mṛpā; I: mṛkhā ² P: °dharma; A-C: °dharma; E-N: °dharma; LVP: °dharma. PsP_L's quarter is unmetrical. ³ A, E, H, L: yav(?); G: ya; I: yat(?); F, K, M: yat ⁴ F, K: vagavān; G: jñagavān; I: yagacān ⁵ Q: abhāṣat; A, E, H, I: abhāṣat ⁶ C, G, M: sarva ⁷ A, E, F, H: °ṇa; I: ṇā; K, L: only upper dot of the *visarga* ⁸ I: saskārās ⁹ A-C, E-N: om.; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁰ D: tam ¹¹ C, M: prajñāpate; F, K: prajñāyame; N: prajñā, then repeats, on account of an eyeskip, from [prajñā]namār apākaraṇārtham itam up to and including prajñāyate ¹² A-C, E-N: koṭi; D: kṛti; em. by LVP (silently) ¹³ A, E, H, I, L: ne'ty ¹⁴ A, E, L: ūvāca ¹⁵ A, E, F, J, K, L: °ni; C: muhyamuni; G, M, N: muhāmuni; J: ink-dot below initial *m* (J's descendants read as *u*); em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁶ C, J, N: 'navarā'grā; D: 'nakarāgo; G, M: °grā ¹⁷ A-C, E, F, H-N: rāsmādi; D: °ādi; G: rātmādi; em. by LVP (silently) ¹⁸ D: yeścimaṃ ¹⁹ A-E, G-M: kātyāyānāvavāde; F: kātyātaśācavāde; N: kātyāyānāvevāde; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁰ Em. with LVP: cāstīti; P: cāsti; Q: ca asti; A, B, E, K, L: ca || asti; C, G: va || aṣṭi; D: cā asyi; F, I: ca asti; H: caḥ || asti; J, N: ca | asti; M: va | aṣṭi. MMK XV.7: cāstīti; the syllable is metrically required. ²¹ A: om.; B, C, E, F, H, J-M: nāsti; D: nāstī; G: nāṣṭi; I: nā; N: om. LVP (PsP_L 43, n. 1) erroneously states that his mss attest *nāstīti*. ²² D: codbhayaṃ ²³ A, B: °dha; H: pratiṣidhaṃ ²⁴ I: °vibhāvanā

इत्यादिनागमो¹ वर्णितः ॥

§74. उक्तं चार्याक्षयमति सूत्रे² –

कतमे³ सूत्रान्ता नेयार्थाः कतमे नीतार्थाः । ये⁴ सूत्रान्ता⁵ मार्गा-
वताराय⁶ निर्दिष्टा⁷ इम⁸ उच्यन्ते नेयार्थाः⁹ । ये¹⁰ सूत्रान्ताः¹¹
5 फलावताराय¹² निर्दिष्टा¹³ इम¹⁴ उच्यन्ते नीतार्थाः¹⁵ । यावद्¹⁶ C15r
ये¹⁷ सूत्रान्ताः¹⁸ शून्यतानिमित्ताप्रणिहितानभिसंस्काराजातानु-

¹ A-C, E-N: ityādinā agamo; D: ityādināmāgamā; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: la sogs pa ∴ ityādinā ² C: cāryokayamati°; G: cāryontaya-mati°; M: vāryokayamati°; N: °mati ³ N: om. katame sūtrāntā ne-yārthāḥ katame nītārthāḥ | ye sūtrāntā mārgāvatārāya nirdiṣṭā ima ucyante neyārthāḥ | ye sūtrāntā phalāvatārāya nirdiṣṭā ima ucyante nītārthāḥ | yāvad ye ⁴ D: ya; H: e ⁵ D: sūtrāntā ⁶ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: yārgāva° ⁷ C, J, M: nirdiṣṭā ⁸ A-C, E-M: ita; em. by LVP (silently) ⁹ C, G, M: °thā; H: nyāyārthāḥ ¹⁰ H: e ¹¹ I: °tā ¹² A, E, F, H, I, K: °yar; D: °rāpa ¹³ A, F: dīniṣṭā; H, I: di || niṣṭā; E, K, L: di | niṣṭā ¹⁴ A, B, E, F, H, I, K, L: ime ¹⁵ D: nayāthāḥ; I: tītārthāḥ ¹⁶ G: om. ¹⁷ C, M: ya; G: om. ¹⁸ P: sūtūāntāḥ; Q: sūtrāntāḥ ātmasatvajīvapoṣapudgalamanujamānavakārakavedakanā-nārutabhāṣā asvāmikāḥ svāmikavan nirdiṣṭās ta ucyamte neyārthāḥ yāvad ye sūtrāntāḥ; F: sutrāntāḥ; G: om.; L: sūtrātāḥ. PsP Tib: mdo sde gang dag bdag dang | sems can dang | srog dang gso ba dang | skyes bu dang | gang zag dang | shed las skyes dang | shed bu dang | byed pa po dang | tshor ba po dang | sgra rnam pa sna tshogs su bshad pa dang | bdag po med pa la bdag po dang bcas par bstan pa de dag ni drang ba'i don zhes bya'o ||; PsP Tib's citation has been copied in from the Tibetan translation of the Akṣayamatisūtra. See Translation note.

H14v L12r

त्पादाभावनिःसत्त्वनिर्जीवनिःपुद्गलास्वामिकविमोक्षमुखा¹ निर्दि-
ष्टाः² त उच्यन्ते³ नीतार्थाः। इयम्⁴ उच्यते⁵ भदन्त शारद्वतीपु-
त्र⁶ नीतार्थसूत्रान्तप्रतिशरणता⁷ न नेयार्थसूत्रान्तप्रतिशरणता⁸ ॥

¹ Q: °praṇītānabhi...ābhāvāḥ niḥsatvanirjīvaniṣpudgalā{ḥ}svāmika-
vimokṣamukhā; A: °utpādobhāvaniḥ | satvanirjīvaniḥpra..lātyāmika-
vimokṣamukhā (‘..’ here and below stands for a space with a line
drawn over it, indicating loss of an *akṣara*); B: °utpādobhāvaniḥsa-
tvanirjīvaniḥpuṅgalābhyāmikavimokṣamukhāni; C: °jātā’nutpādobhā-
vaniḥ | satvanirjīvaniḥpuṅgalābhyāmimokṣamukhāni; D: °jātā’nutpā-
dābhācāniḥsatvanirjīvaniḥpugalāmyāmikavimokṣam; E: °jātā’nutpā-
dobhāvaniḥ || satvanirjīvaniḥpra..lātpāmikavimokṣamikhāni; F: °ut-
pādobhāvaniḥ satvanirjīvaniḥpuṅgalāsyāmikavimokṣamukhani; G: as
C, double *daṇḍa*; H: °nimittā | praṇihitānabhisamṣkārajātānutpādo-
bhāvaniḥ || satvanirjīvaniḥpra..lātpāmikavimokṣamukhāni; I: °saskārā-
jātā’nutpādobhāvaniḥ satvanirjīvatipra..lātyāmikavimokṣamukhāniḥ;
J: °jātā’nutpādobhāvaniḥ | satvanirjīvaniḥpuṅgalābhyāmikavimokṣa-
mukhāni; K: as L, °puṅ(?)gala°; L: °jātā’nutpādobhāvaniḥ || satvanir-
jīvaniḥpuṅgalātyāmikavimokṣamukhāni; M: as C, °puṅgala°; N: as
J: °puṅgalā°. Conj. by LVP: °[nirātma]°; PsP Tib: *bdag med pa*, on
the basis of *bdag med pa* in Akṣayamatīnirdeśasūtra Tib; see Braarvig
1993: II, 118 (Braarvig does not mark *nirātma* as a conjecture). LVP
(PsP_L 43, n. 4) notes that his mss read “°ābhyāmika, °sika” for °āsva-
mika, but N and L (= Calcutta and Cambridge) respectively read °ā-
bhyāmika, °ātyāmika while M (Paris) reads °ābhyāmi. ² D, F, K:
nidiṣṭās ³ C, G, M: °ta ⁴ PsP Tib: ’di dag ⇨ iyam ⁵ B, E, F, H,
L: ucyante; C, G, J, K, M, N: ucyante; I: ucyatya; em. by LVP (silent-
ly) ⁶ A, H, I: sāradvatī° ⁷ P: nītārthasūtānta°; Q: °pratisaraṇatā;
A-C, E, I-L: °pratisaraṇatā; F: °pratisaraśatā; G: °sūtrāntāpratisara-
ṇatā; H: °sūtrāntāpratisaraṇatā; N: °sūtrāntāpratisaraṇatā ⁸ P:
om. sūtrānta; A-N: om. sūtrānta; PsP Tib: *mdo sde*, copied from
Akṣayamatīnirdeśasūtra Tib. A, E: °pratisaraṇete; B, C, F-N: °prati-
saraṇate; D: °pratosaraṇagate (final *e* represents *sandhi* with follow-
ing *i*); em. by LVP: °sūtrānta°

PsP_L 44 इति ॥

तथार्यसमाधिराजसूत्रे¹ –

नीतार्थसूत्रान्तविशेष² जानती³ यथोपदिष्टा⁴ सुगतेन⁵ शून्यता⁶ ।

G15r M11v

यस्मिन् पुनः⁷ पुद्गल सत्त्व पूरुषो⁸ नेयार्थ⁹ तां¹⁰ जानति सर्व-

J15r

5 धर्मान्¹¹ ॥

इति¹² ॥

¹ A-C, E-N: tathācārya°; I: tathāsūtrā°; PsP_L: tathā cārya° ² I: nta-viśeṣa ³ E, H, I: jātaṭī; G, J, M: jāneṭī; em. by LVP (silently): jānati. SR: jānati. *Lṭ's author also found *jānatī* in his PsP ms, recorded it and glossed it with *jānāti*. Ms P at the equivalent for PsP_L 276.5 also attests *jānatī*. The first quarter is in Indravamśā metre, which expects a long final syllable. On the lengthening of historic *i* to *ī* in BHS verses even in cases of short *i* at the end of *pāda*, see BHSG §3.12, §26.2. ⁴ P: °diṣṭā; A-C, E-N: °deṣṭā; D: yathoyadiṣyaṃ; em. by LVP (silently): °diṣṭā. SR: °diṣṭā. Ms P attests °diṣṭām at the equivalent for PsP_L 276.6. (*viśeṣa* can be understood as an accusative [°ṣā] or as a nominative, the latter when one presumes an unstated *iti* [*iti jānāti*]). ⁵ I: śurātena ⁶ Em. with LVP (LVP emends silently): śūnyatā. P, Q: °tām; A-E, G-N: °tām; F: śumnyatām; SR: śūnyatā. P also attests °tām at the equivalent for PsP_L 276.6. ⁷ D: pura ⁸ Q: poṣo; B, J, M: puṃgalasatvapuruṣo; H, I, K, L, N: puṃgalasatvapuruṣo; em. by LVP (silently): °ṣā; SR: pūruṣo. P attests *pūruṣo* at the equivalent for PsP_L 276.7. ⁹ A: neyār; C, G, M: nayārtha; E: neyārthā; H: nayārthā; I: neyārthām; em. by LVP: neyārthato (LVP reads *neyārthata(ṃ)* as one word. LVP [PsP_L 44, n. 1] records his mss as reading “*neyārthata, °tām*” but Cambridge and Paris read *tām* while Calcutta reads *tān*). SR: neyārthatām. PsP Tib: drang ba'i don tu. ¹⁰ P, Q: tā; A, E, H, I: tā; PsP Tib: de. Ms P attests *tām* at the equivalent for PsP_L 276.8. ¹¹ P: śarvvadharmān. P attests *sarvadharmān* at the equivalent for PsP_L 276.8. ¹² PsP_L: om. iti

§75. तस्माद्¹ उत्पादादिदेशनां² मृषार्था³ प्रतिपादयितुं⁴ प्रतीत्य-
K14v B13r समुत्पादानुप्रदर्शनम्⁵ आरब्धवान्⁶ आचार्यः⁷ ॥

l18r §76. ननु चोत्पादादीनाम्⁸ अभावे⁹ सति यदि¹⁰ सर्वधर्माणां¹¹ मृषा-
A12r ब्रप्रतिपादनार्थम्¹² इदम्¹³ आरब्धवान्¹⁴ आचार्यः¹⁵ । नन्व¹⁶ एवं
सति¹⁷ यन्¹⁸ मृषा न तद्¹⁹ अस्तीति²⁰ न²¹ सन्त्य²² अकुशलानि²³ 5
कर्माणि²⁴ । तदभावान्²⁵ न सन्ति दुर्गतयः²⁶ । न²⁷ सन्ति²⁸ कुशला-
P8r नि²⁹ कर्माणि³⁰ । तदभावान्³¹ न सन्ति सुगतयः³² सुगतिदुर्गत्य-

¹ C: tarsmād; E, F, I, K, L: tasmā ² A, E, H, L: itpādādi°; F, I, K: ityādādi°; Tib: bstan pa rnams ÷ deśanām ³ A, F, H: °thā ⁴ A-C, E-N: prativādayitum; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ Q: °pādānudarśanam; A: pratityasamutpādānupadarśanām; B, C, G, J, L-N: °pādānupadarśanam; D: °pādānuyadarśanam; E, I: °pādānupadarśatām; F, K: °samutpānupadarśanam; H: pratitya...dānupadarśanātām; em. by LVP: °pādānudarśanam; Tib: rjes su ston pa. Cf. BHSD, s.v. *anupradarśita* “pointed out, shown.” ⁶ P: āracavān ⁷ F: °ya ⁸ A, E, H, I, L: vot°; D, J: cāt°; M: cotpādāvīnām ⁹ H: amāve ¹⁰ F, I: yadiḥ ¹¹ A, C, E, G-J, M, N: °nā; D: °dharmaviṣaṃ ¹² D: iday; F, K: idadh ¹³ A, E, K, L: anārtham idam ārabdhavān; F: ārārtham idam ārabdhavāv; H: as A, °bdhamān; I: ānārtham idamam ārabdhavān ¹⁴ F: °ya; I: ānāryyaḥ ¹⁵ B, D-G, I, K, L: natv ¹⁶ I: satī ¹⁷ M: ya ¹⁸ F, K: nad ¹⁹ D: astītir; H: astiti ²⁰ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: nevā; B, C, G, J, M, N: ne; em. by LVP (silently) ²¹ Q: satyaṃ; A: sanny; C, G, M: sans; H: sann ²² Q: kuśalāni; G: akulāni; H: ekuśalāti; I: akuśalāti ²³ M: kamāṇi ²⁴ I: tebhāvon ²⁵ A, E, F, H, I, K, L: ta ²⁶ C: dur≈atayaḥ; D: durgayaḥ; G: adds following *ucyante* (eye-skip into next section) ²⁷ C: om.; G, M: om. ²⁸ A, E: śaṃti ²⁹ A, E, H, I: kulāni ³⁰ P, Q: om.; A: karmmaṇi ³¹ Q: tadābhāvān; A, E, H, I: tabhāvā; B, F, G, J-N: tadabhāvā; em. by LVP (silently) ³² I: śugatayaḥ

सम्भवाच्च¹ च² नास्ति संसार³ इति सर्वारम्भवैयर्थ्यम्⁴ एव⁵ स्यात्॥

उच्यते⁶ – संवृत्तिसत्यव्यपेक्षया⁷ लौकिकस्येदं सत्याभिनिवेशस्य⁸

C15v N14r

प्रतिपक्षभावेन⁹ मृषार्थता¹⁰ भावानां¹¹ प्रतिपाद्यते¹² ऽस्माभिः। नैव¹³

ब्र¹⁴ आर्याः¹⁵ कृतकार्याः¹⁶ किञ्चिद्¹⁷ उपलभन्ते¹⁸ यन्¹⁹ मृषा

5 वामृषा²⁰ वा²¹ स्यादिति। अपि च²² येन हि सर्वधर्माणां²³ मृषाब्र²⁴

परिज्ञात²⁵ किं तस्य कर्माणि सन्ति संसारो²⁶ वास्ति। न चाप्य²⁷

H15r

¹ A: °saṃbhavārthab; B: °saṃbhavādh; C: °saṃbhavābhavā≈; D: °bhavā; E, H, I, L: °saṃbhavārthamb; F, K: °saṃbhavārtha; G, M: °saṃbhavābhavāb; J: °saṃbhavām; N: °saṃbhavāb; em. by LVP (silently) ² A, B, E, G-J, L-N: dha; C: ≈; F, K: pra; em. by LVP (silently) ³ Tib: bde 'gro dang ngan 'gro med pa'i phyir 'khor ba yang (construes *ca* with *saṃsāra*) ⁴ C, G, J, M, N: °vaimarthyam; D: °vaiyathyam; H: sarvārammavaiyartham ⁵ A, C, E-N: evā; em. by LVP (silently) ⁶ A-C, E, F, H-N: ucyante; G: om.; em. by LVP (silently) ⁷ Q: °vyapekṣāyām; A, E, I, K, L, N: saṃvṛttisasyavya°; C, G, M: saṃvṛttisasyavyapakṣayā; D: °satyavyajejyā; F: sarvavvatisasyavyapekṣayā; H: saṃvṛttisasyavyapyakṣayā; J: saṃvṛttisasyavyapekṣayā; em. by LVP (silently) ⁸ P: °nivesasya; A-C, E-G, J-L, N: loka°; D: lokasyadaṃsatyādibhini°; H: loka...nivesaśya; I: lokasyadaṃ°; M: lāka°; PsP_L: loka° ⁹ D: pratiyakṣa°; G: °bhāvana ¹⁰ C, G, M: mṛṣārtha; F, K: °tāḥ ¹¹ A: bhāvātām ¹² Q: pratipādyante; D: pati° ¹³ A-C, E-N: naive; em. by LVP (silently); Tib: n.e. eva ¹⁴ C, G, J, M, N: ty ¹⁵ P: āryaḥ ¹⁶ Q: om.; H: om.; Tib: n.e. kṛta-kāryaḥ ¹⁷ A, E, H, I: kicid ¹⁸ P: upalambhante; A: upabhalanne; E, H, L: upabhalante; F, K: upalalante; G: upalanbhe; N: upaladbhante ¹⁹ G: ya; M: yat; N: yen ²⁰ A, E, H, I: om.; D: vāmrtā; PsP_L: om. vā ²¹ A: cā ²² D: cā ²³ A, E, H, I: °ṇā; D: °dharmārṇā; F, K: dhar-māṇām ²⁴ F: mṛtvam; Tib: brdzun ba'i don can nyid ÷ mṛṣātvam (*mṛṣārthatvam) ²⁵ Q: parijñānam; A, E, H, I: °tvaḥ; B-D, F, G, J-N: °taḥ; em. by LVP (silently) ²⁶ D: °rā ²⁷ A, E, F, H: vāpy; I: py

असौ कस्यचिद्¹ धर्मस्यास्तिब² नास्तिब³ वोपलभते⁴ ॥

PsPL 45

यथोक्तं भगवतार्यरत्नकूटसूत्रे⁵ –

चित्तं⁶ हि काश्यप परिगवेष्यमाणं न लभ्यते। यन् न लभ्यते⁷ तन्
नोपलभ्यते। यन् नोपलभ्यते तन्⁸ नैवातीतं⁹ नानागतं¹⁰ न
प्रत्युत्पन्नम्। यन् नैवातीतं नानागतं न प्रत्युत्पन्नं तस्य नास्ति⁵
स्वभावः¹¹। यस्य नास्ति स्वभावस् तस्य¹² नास्त्युत्पादः। यस्य
नास्त्युत्पादस् तस्य नास्ति निरोधः ॥

L12v

J15v

इति विस्तरः ॥

यस्¹³ तु विपर्यासानुगमान् मृषाबं धर्माणां नावगच्छति प्रतीत्य-
भावानां¹⁴ स्वभावम् अभिनिविशते¹⁵। स धर्मेष्¹⁶ इदं सत्याभिनिवे- 10

Q7v

¹ A, E, H, I: kasyavi; D: kasyāṃcad; F, K, L, M: kasyaci ² Q: °āsti-
tām; A, E, H, I: °tva; N: dharmesyā° ³ Q: om.; D: nāntitvaṃ
⁴ A, E, H, I: nāstitvaṃ copalabhyate; B, C, F, G, J-N: co°; D: copala-
hate; em. by LVP (silently) ⁵ From this point on, the paper manu-
scripts consulted are limited to B, D, J, and L (see Manuscript De-
scription). ⁶ D: ci | rttā; L: vittam ⁷ D: om. yan na labhyate
⁸ D: ta ⁹ D: naikatitvaṃ ¹⁰ B, J: nānāgate; L: nonāgate ¹¹ B:
svabhāvābhāvaḥ; L: svabhābhāvaḥ ¹² L: ta ¹³ Tib: gang dag ∴
yah (the Sanskrit's singular form has been understood as having a
general sense) ¹⁴ L: om. pratītyabhāvānām svabhāvam abhinivīśate
sa dharmeṣv idamśatyābhiniveśitayābhinivīṣaḥ san karmāṇy api
karoti saṃsāre 'pi saṃsarati; PsP Tib: dngos po rnam rang bzhin yod
par rtogs nas mngon par zhen pa ∴ pratītyabhāvānām svabhāvam
abhinivīśate ¹⁵ D: abhinivīśateḥ ¹⁶ D: dharmāṣv

शितयाभिनिविष्टः¹ सन्² कर्माण्यपि करोति। संसारे ऽपि संसरति।
विपर्यासावस्थितत्वात्³ न भव्यो⁴ निर्वाणम् अधिगन्तुम्⁵ ॥

§77. किं पुनर्⁶ मृषास्वभावा अपि पदार्थाः सङ्क्षेशव्यवदाननिबन्धनं⁷ B13v
भवन्ति⁷ ॥

5 भवन्ति⁸। तद्यथा मायायुवतिस्⁹ तत्स्वभावानभिज्ञानां तथागत- D7v
PsPL 46 निर्मितश् चोपचितकुशलमूलानाम् ॥

उक्तं हि दृढाध्याशयपरिपृच्छासूत्रे¹⁰ –

तद्यथा कुलपुत्र मायाकारनाटके प्रत्युपस्थिते मायाकारनिर्मितां
स्त्रियं दृष्ट्वा कश्चिद् रागपरीतचेताः¹¹ पर्षच्छारद्यभयेनोत्थायास-
नाद्¹² अपक्रमेत्¹³। सो ऽपक्रम्य ताम्¹⁴ एव¹⁵ स्त्रियमशुभतो
10 मनसिकुर्यात्¹⁶। अनित्यतो¹⁷ दुःखतः शून्यतो ऽनात्मतो¹⁸ मन-

¹ Q: °niveśatayā abhiniviṣṭaḥ; B, J: idaṃsatyābhiniveśitamābhini-
viṣṭaḥ; D: idaṃsatyādiniveśitayābhiniviṣṭaḥ; conj. by LVP: idaṃsa-
tyābhiniviṣṭaḥ; em. by de Jong (1978: 33): °abhiniveśi-
tayā°; PsP Tib: 'di bden par mngon par zhen pa nyid kyi sgo nas
mngon par zhes par 'gyur ² P: sat; B, J: sat ³ Q: °tvān tu; D:
viparam(?)āsāvastitatyān; L: °sthita≈ān; PsP Tib: ... las kyang byed
cing 'khor ba na yang 'khor bar 'gyur la | phyin ci log la gnas pas
mya ngan las 'das pa thob pa'i skal ba can du yang mi 'gyur ro ||
⁴ B, D, J, L: bhavyā ⁵ L: asigantum ⁶ J: puna ⁷ D, J: bhavati
⁸ B, D, J, L: om. bhavanti; PsPL: om. bhavanti; PsP Tib: 'gyur te
⁹ B, J, L: °yuvati ¹⁰ D: dṛḍhāśaya° ¹¹ Q: °parita° ¹² D: par-
ṣṭhachāradyabhayenātthayāsanād; J: °bhayenātthāyāsanād ¹³ D, J,
L: aya° ¹⁴ P: om. ¹⁵ P: iva; L: e ¹⁶ D: °kuyad; PsP Tib: mi
sdug pa dang | mi gtsang ba dang ⇨ aśubhato manasikuryāt ¹⁷ D:
itityuto ¹⁸ P: Ø; B, D: °tā; J: 'nānmatā

सिकुर्यात्॥

इति विस्तरः ॥

विनये च¹ – यन्त्रकारकारिता यन्त्रयुवतिः² सद्भूतयुवतिशून्या³
सद्भूतयुवतिरूपेण⁴ प्रतिभासते⁵ । तस्य च⁶ चित्रकरस्य⁷ कामरागा-
स्पदीभूता⁸ ॥

5

तथा⁹ मृषास्वभावा अपि भावा¹⁰ बालानां सङ्क्षेशनिबन्धनं¹¹
भवन्ति¹² ॥

PsPL 47

J16r §78. तथार्यरत्नकूटसूत्रे¹³ –

अथ खलु तानि¹⁴ पञ्चमात्राणि भिक्षुशतानि¹⁵ भगवतो धर्मदेश-
नामनवतरन्त्य अनवगाहमानान्य¹⁶ अनधिमुच्यमानानि¹⁷ 10

¹ L: va ² Q: yantraṣuṭiḥ ³ B: °yuvatiḥśūnyā ⁴ B, J, L: 'sad°; PsP Tib: n.e. sadbhūtayuvatirūpeṇa pratibhāsate | tasya ca ⁵ D: prañibhāsate ⁶ L: va ⁷ PsPL: citrakārasya ⁸ Em. following LVP: °rāgāspadībhūtā. P, Q: °rāgāspadabhūtā; B, J, L: °rāgāspadabhūtā; D: kāyarāgāspadabhūtā ⁹ Tib: dpe de bzhin du ÷ tathā ¹⁰ B, J, L: bhāvo ¹¹ Em.: saṅkleśanibandhanam. P, Q: saṅkleśavyavadānanibandhanam; B, D, J, L: saṅkleśavyavadānanibandhanam; PsPL: saṅkleśavyavadānanibandhanam; Tib: kun nas nyon mongs pa'i rgyu. See Translation note. ¹² P: om. ¹³ PsP Tib: de bzhin du 'phags pa dkon mchog brtsegs pa las kyang ¹⁴ PsP Tib n.e. tāni ¹⁵ P: Ø; D: bhikṣugātāni ¹⁶ P: Ø; B: anavagāhāt(?)ānāpy; J, L: anavagāhātānāpy ¹⁷ B, J: anadhimucyāmāni; D: enadhimudhyamānāni; L: anadhimucyāmāni mucyāmāni

उत्थायासनेभ्यः¹ प्रक्रान्तानि। अथ² भगवान्³ येन मार्गेण⁴
भिक्षवो⁵ गच्छन्ति स्म तस्मिन् मार्गे⁶ द्वौ⁷ भिक्षू⁸ निर्मिमीते⁹ स्म।

अथ तानि पञ्च भिक्षुशतानि¹⁰ येन¹¹ तौ द्वौ भिक्षू¹² तेनोपसङ्का-
मन्ति¹³ स्म। उपसङ्कम्य ताव्¹⁴ अवोचन्¹⁵ कुत्रायुष्मन्तौ¹⁶ गमि-
ष्यथः। निर्मितकाव्¹⁷ अवोचतां¹⁸ गमिष्याव¹⁹ आवाम्²⁰ L13r

¹ D: utthāyāsunebhyah ² Q: atha khalu; PsP_L 338.5: atha (om. kha-
lu); KP_{ed} Skt §141.3: atha khalu ³ PsP_L: bhagavān [tasyām velā-
yām]. *bhagavāms tasyām velāyām* appears in the, according to Kragh
(2003: 93, n. 3), *interpolated* chapter 17 citation (PsP_L 336.3ff.) and in
KP_{ed} Skt (it does not occur in the corresponding PsP Tib for the PsP
chapter 1 passage which is, however, based on KP Tib and not on PsP
Skt). Candrakīrti's KP ms may not have contained it, or he may have
slightly abbreviated the passage. One could, on the other hand, con-
jecture that *tasyām velāyām* was dropped due to an eyeskip from °ām
of *bhagavāms* to °ām of *velāyām*. ⁴ D: ta; J: om. te; PsP_L: ete (mār-
geṇaite) ⁵ D: bhikṣuvo ⁶ P: rgge ⁷ D: dvo ⁸ B, J, L: bhikṣu
⁹ D: nimi°; N: nirmmite ¹⁰ P: ☉; D: °tāni ¹¹ P: Ø; L: yana; LVP
conjectures a following *mārgēṇa* on the basis of PsP Tib's *lam* and
also *mārgēṇa* in the later occurrence of the KP citation (cf. PsP_L
338.7); KP_{ed} §141.6: mārgēṇa. The word is not necessary. ¹² B, J, L:
bhikṣu. LVP (PsP_L 47, n. 3) adds a following *nirmitakau* in square
brackets on the basis of PsP_L 338.7. He remarks that PsP Tib also
supports the emendation but it is without an equivalent for *nirmita-
kau*. KP_{ed} Skt: nirmito; KP_{ed} Tib: sprul pa'i. Ms P for the citation in
PsP chapter 17 attests *nirmitakau*. A dropping of *nirmitakau* from the
above passage is difficult to explain on paleographical grounds, and
the sentence makes sense without it. ¹³ B: °mati ¹⁴ KP_{ed} Skt:
evam ¹⁵ P: Ø; J: avocat ¹⁶ P: Ø; B: °manto; D: °mand(?)o
¹⁷ L: °kāc. KP_{ed} Skt: tāv; KP_{ed} Tib: de gnyis kyis. PsP Tib: sprul pa
gnyis kyis ¹⁸ L: avovatām ¹⁹ J, L: °yāca ²⁰ B, J, L: ārām

P8v अरण्यायतनेषु¹ । तत्र² ध्यानसुखस्पर्शविहारैर्³ विहरिष्यावः । यं⁴
 हि भगवान्⁵ धर्मं⁶ देशयति⁷ तमावां नावतरावो⁸ नावगाहावहे⁹
 नाधिमुच्यावह¹⁰ उत्तस्यावः¹¹ सन्नस्यावः¹² सन्नासम् आपद्या-
 वहे¹³ । अथ¹⁴ तानि¹⁵ पञ्च¹⁶ भिक्षुशतान्येतद् अवोचन्¹⁷ वयमप्य्
 आयुष्मन्तौ¹⁸ भगवतो धर्मदेशनां¹⁹ नावतरामो²⁰ नावगाहामहे⁵
 नाधिमुच्यामह उत्तस्यामः²¹ सन्नस्यामः²² सन्नासम् आपद्यमा-

¹ L: aranyāya° ² KP_{ed} Skt: om. tatra ³ P: dhyāṇaśakha° (final *r* attested); J: °rai; L: dhyānamukhasparśaviharai. KP_{ed} Skt: sukham phāṣaṃ (vihariṣyāmaḥ); KP_{ed} Tib: bsam gtan gyi bde ba la reg par gnas par bya bar ('dong). PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib ⁴ L: ya. KP_{ed} Skt: (preceding) tat kasmād dhetor; KP_{ed} Tib: de ci'i phyir zhe na. PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib ⁵ D: bhamavān. LVP (PsP_L 599) emends to *bhagavan*; the nominative form is, however, correct. ⁶ L: dharma ⁷ D: repeats from [*dvau bhi*] *kṣū tenopasaṃkrāṃanti sma* to *yaṃ hi bhagavān dharmam deśayati*. KP_{ed} Tib attests *chos bstan pa*; PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib ⁸ D: nāvatarāvo; J: °ve(?); L: nāvatarāvova. KP_{ed} Skt: dharmadeśanām nāvatarāvo; KP_{ed} Tib: chos bstan pa de la mi 'jug ste; PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib ⁹ B, J, L: nāvagāhavahe; D: nācagāhavahe ¹⁰ D: °hai ¹¹ D: tatrasyāveḥ ¹² B, J, L: om.; PsP_L: om. santrasyāvaḥ; KP_{ed} Skt: saṃtrasāvaḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: kun tu dngangs; PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib ¹³ KP_{ed} Skt: āpadyāvahe | tāv āvām āraṇyāyataneṣu sukhaṃ vihariṣyāmaḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: kho ba cag dgon pa'i gnas rnams su bsam gtan gyi bde ba la reg par gnas pa rnams kyis gnas par bya'o; PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib ¹⁴ KP_{ed} Skt: om. atha ¹⁵ KP_{ed} Skt: tāni apy ¹⁶ L: paca ¹⁷ P: Ø; J: avocad ¹⁸ P: Ø; D: °maṇṭo; PsP_L: °maṇṭo; PsP Tib: tshe dang ldan pa dag |; KP_{ed} Skt: ayuṣmaṇṭo (also used for vocative dual, cp. KP_{ed} § 141.7 [VD 2002: 49]: *kutra āyuṣmaṇṭo gamiṣyathāḥ*); KP_{ed} Tib: tshe dang ldan pa dag (kho bo cag kyang bcom ldan 'das kyis chos bshad pa la mi 'jug) ¹⁹ P: °nāṃn; D: °nā ²⁰ D: nāvatarāho; L: nāṃvatarāmā ²¹ J: om. ²² J, L: samtrāśam

हे। तेन¹ वयम् अरण्यायतनेषु² ध्यानसुखस्पर्शविहारैर्³ विहारि-
 ष्यामः⁴। निर्मितकाव्⁵ अवोचतां⁶ तेन⁷ ह्य आयुष्मन्तः⁸ सङ्गा-
 स्यामो न⁹ विवदिष्यामः¹⁰। अविवादपरमो¹¹ हि श्रमणधर्मः¹²।
 कस्यायुष्मन्तः¹³ प्रहाणाय प्रतिपन्नाः। तान्य्¹⁴ अवोचन्¹⁵ राग-
 द्वेषमोहानां¹⁶ प्रहाणाय वयं प्रतिपन्नाः। निर्मितकाव्¹⁷ अवोचतां¹⁸
 किं पुनरायुष्मतां संविद्यन्ते रागद्वेषमोहा¹⁹ यान् क्षपयिष्यथ²⁰।
 तान्य्²¹ अवोचन्²² न ते ऽध्यात्मं²³ न बहिर्धा नोभयमन्तरेणोप-
 लभ्यन्ते²⁴। नापि ते ऽपरिकल्पिता उत्पद्यन्ते। निर्मितकाव्

PsP_L 48

J16v

¹ D: tene. KP_{ed} Skt: te; KP_{ed} Tib: de'i phyir; PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib
² Q: āraṇyā° ³ KP_{ed} Skt: dhyānasukhavihārair; KP_{ed} Tib: bsam
 gtan gyi bde ba la reg par gnas pa rnams kyis. PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib
⁴ L: vi | hariṣyāmaḥ ⁵ D: °kāma ⁶ L: acocatām ⁷ B, J, L: tenā;
 D: tanā; KP_{ed} Skt: om. tena hi. KP_{ed} Tib: de'i phyir; PsP Tib as KP_{ed}
 Tib. The word order of KP_{ed} Skt differs: nirmītakāv avocatā saṃgā-
 yisyāma vayaṃ āyuṣmaṃto ⁸ P: ayuṣya(n)taḥ ⁹ B: om. ¹⁰ P:
 vivādiṣyāmaḥ; B, J, L: vivādiṣyāmaḥ ¹¹ Q: avivādādaparamo;
 PsP_L: °paramā ¹² P: ∅; B, J, L: śravaṇadharmāḥ; D: śuvaṇadhar-
 maḥ; PsP_L: śramanasya dharmāḥ; PsP Tib: dge sbyong gi chos; KP_{ed}
 Skt: śramaṇadharmāḥ; cf. PTSD samaṇadhammaṃ ¹³ P: ∅; J: ka-
 syāyuṣmaḥ. This sentence and the next are not attested in KP_{ed} Skt or
 KP_{ed} Tib. See Translation note. ¹⁴ P: (t).[1]; D: māny ¹⁵ P:
 [1]+(ocan); Q: avocana; D: avācan ¹⁶ J: rāgādve(?)śamohāṇā
¹⁷ D: acocatām. KP_{ed} Skt: prāhuḥ ¹⁸ L: rāgadvegamaḥ ¹⁹ P:
 kṣayīṣyathaḥ; B: °thas; J, L: °thaḥ; KP_{ed} Skt: kṣapayīṣyatha
²⁰ KP_{ed} Skt: te. PsP chapter 17 citation: te ²¹ D: avocana. KP_{ed} Skt:
 āhu ²² Q: ādhyatmyan; KP_{ed} Skt: ādhyātmena ²³ D, L: °pala-
 tyante

अवोचतां¹ तेन ह्य² आयुष्मन्तो³ मा⁴ कल्पयत मा विकल्पयत⁵ ।
यदा चायुष्मन्तो⁶ न कल्पयिष्यथ न विकल्पयिष्यथ⁷ तदा⁸ न
रङ्गथ⁹ न विरङ्गथ¹⁰ । यश्च¹¹ न रक्तो¹² न विरक्तः¹³ स शान्त
इत्युच्यते । शीलमायुष्मन्तो न संसरति न परिनिर्वाति ।
समाधिः¹⁵ प्रज्ञा विमुक्तिर् विमुक्तिज्ञानदर्शनम्¹⁶ आयुष्मन्तो न 5
संसरति न परिनिर्वाति । एभिश्च चायुष्मन्तो धर्मैर्¹⁷ निर्वाणं

¹ L: acovatām ² KP_{ed} Skt: om. hi ³ P: ayuṣyant(o); J, L: °tau
⁴ KP_{ed} Skt: māsman ⁵ P: [4]yātā; B, J, L: om.; conj. by LVP: [mā
vikalpayata]; PsP Tib: mam par ma rtog cig; KP_{ed} Skt: māsman (read:
māsmān; cf. VD 2002: 51, n. 345) vikalpayata; KP_{ed} Tib: rnam par
ma rtog cig ⁶ KP_{ed} Skt: om. ca ⁷ D: vikalpamiṣyatha ⁸ D: tedā.
KP_{ed} Skt: tadā āyusmaṁto ⁹ B: rakṣatha; J: kṣyatha; L: rajyatha
¹⁰ P: viraṁkṣyatham na rakto na viraktaḥ yaś ca, that is, yaś ca ap-
pears only after viraktaḥ; B, J: virakṣatha; L: virakṣathah; KP_{ed} Skt:
viraṁkṣyathah yaś cāyusmaṁto na rakto na viraktaḥ (KP_{ed} §143.11)
¹¹ D: paś ¹² KP_{ed} Skt: cāyusmaṁto ¹³ Q: arakto (cārakto ∴ ca na
rakto); B, L: racakto; J: ca(?)kto ¹⁴ B: viracaktaḥ; J, L: vicaktaḥ
¹⁵ P: samādhiprajñāvimuktivimuktijñānadarśanam ∴ samādhīḥ prajñā
vimuktir vimuktijñānadarśanam; KP_{ed} Skt, VD (2002: 51): as P. I am
not familiar with the *samahāra* compound attested by both P and the
KP_{ed} Skt ms being used in other works and thus accept Q's reading.
De Jong (1978: 223), basing his emendation on ms D's reading *sa-*
mādhīḥ prajñāvimuktivimuktijñānadarśanam for the citation as found
in PsP_L chapter 17 and KP_{ed} §144, corrects the chapter 17 text to read
samādhiprajñā°. The compound *śīlasamādhiprajñāvimuktivimukti-*
jñānadarśanaskandhān occurs a number of times in the Aṣṭa but P's
and the KP_{ed} Skt ms's *samahāra* compound does not. ¹⁶ Q: °darśa-
nam eva ¹⁷ B, D, J, L: dharma

सूच्यते¹ एते च धर्माः² शून्याः प्रकृतिविविक्ताः³ । प्रजहीतै-
 तामायुष्मन्तः सज्ज्ञां⁴ यदुत परिनिर्वाणमिति । मा च सज्ज्ञायां⁵ L13v
 सज्ज्ञां⁶ काष्टे⁷ मा च सज्ज्ञया⁸ सज्ज्ञां⁹ परिज्ञासिष्ट¹⁰ । यो हि¹¹
 सज्ज्ञया¹² सज्ज्ञां¹³ परिजानाति¹⁴ सज्ज्ञाबन्धनम्¹⁵ एवास्य¹⁶ तद्
 5 भवति । सज्ज्ञावेदयितनिरोधसमापत्तिम्¹⁷ आयुष्मन्तः समापद्य- D8r
 ध्वम् । सज्ज्ञावेदयितनिरोधसमापत्तिसमापन्नस्य¹⁸ भिक्षोर्¹⁹

¹ P, Q: śū° ² P: dharmā ³ PsP_L: °viviktā. KP_{ed} Skt: viviktā agrā ...; VD 2002: 51: vivektā agrā(hyāh); KP_{ed} Tib: dben pa gzung du med pa; PsP Tib as KP_{ed} Tib; ms P for the chapter 17 citation: viviktā agrāhyā niśceṣṭāh ⁴ B, D, J: saṃjñā; L: saṃjñāh ⁵ Em.: sañjñāyām. P, Q: saṃjñāyāh; B, D, J, L: saṃjñāyāh. Ms P for the chapter 17 citation: saṃjñāyām; KP_{ed} Skt: mā ca saṃjñāyā saṃjñā kārṣvaḥ (emend to *kārṣṭa*; cf. VD 2002: 51, n. 348) mā asaṃjñāyā; KP_{ed} Tib: 'du shes la yang 'du shes su ma byed cig ⁶ P: saṃjñā; B, D, J, L: saṃjñā ⁷ B, D, J, L: kāṣṭi ⁸ Em.: sañjñāyā. P, Q: saṃjñāyāh; B, J, L: saṃjñāyāh; D: sañjñāyāca; PsP_L: saṃjñāyām; PsP Tib: 'du shes kyis; ms P for the chapter 17 citation: saṃjñāyā; KP_{ed} Skt: saṃjñāyā; KP Tib: 'du shes kyis ⁹ P, Q: saṃjñā; D: saṃjñāyā ¹⁰ B, J: °ṭaḥ; D: pariññāmiṣṭa ¹¹ KP_{ed} Skt: om. hi ¹² Em.: sañjñāyā. P, Q: saṃjñāyāh; B, D, J: saṃjñāyāh; L: om.; PsP_L: saṃjñāyām; ms P for the chapter 17 citation: saṃjñāyā; PsP Tib: 'du shes kyis; KP_{ed} Skt: saṃjñāyā; KP_{ed} Tib: 'du shes kyis ¹³ Q: saṃjñā; D, J, L: saṃjñā ¹⁴ P: pariññāti saṃjñāti; ms P for the chapter 17 citation: om. saṃjñāti; KP_{ed} Skt: om. saṃjñāti ¹⁵ L: sañjñābandhanam; PsP Tib: de'i de ni 'du shes la yongs su bcings pa yin; KP_{ed} Tib: de ni de'i 'du shes kyis bcings pa yin ¹⁶ D: evāmya ¹⁷ D: °vedayitenir° ¹⁸ D: saṃjñāvadayaṭānanodha°; KP_{ed} Skt: mā ca kalpayatha mā vikalpayathaḥ saṃjñāvedayita[ni]ro[dha]° (cf. VD 2002: 51); KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. mā ca kalpayatha mā vikalpayathaḥ; PsP chapter 17 citation: n.e. mā ca kalpayatha mā vikalpayathaḥ ¹⁹ D: bhakṣā; L: bhikṣo

B14v	नास्त्य ¹ उत्तरिकरणीयम् ² इति वदावः ॥	
Q8a	अथ ³ तेषां पञ्चानां ⁴ भिक्षुशतानाम् ⁵ अनुपादायाश्रवेभ्यश्च ⁶ चित्तानि विमुक्तान्यभूवन् ⁷ । तानि ⁸ विमुक्तचित्तानि ⁹ येन ¹⁰ भगवांस् ¹¹ तेनोपसङ्गान्तान्य ¹² उपसन्कम्य ¹³ भगवतः पादौ शिरोभिर् ¹⁴ अभिवन्द्यैकान्ते ¹⁵ न्यषीदन् ¹⁶ । अथायुष्मान् ¹⁷ सु- भूतिस् तान् ¹⁸ भिक्षून् ¹⁹ एतद् अवोचत् ²⁰ कुत्रायुष्मन्तो ²¹ गताः कुतो वागताः। ते ²² ऽवोचन् ²³ न क्वचिद् ²⁴ गमनाय ²⁵ न कुतश्चि- दागमनाय भदन्त ²⁶ सुभूते भगवता धर्मो ²⁷ देशितः। आह ²⁸ को ²⁹	PsP _L 49

¹ B, J, L: nīsty; D: nāmsty ² B, J, L: uttarī°; PsP_L: uttarī°; de Jong (1978: 33) refers to BHSD s.v. *uttari*. KP_{ed} Skt: uttare karaṇīyam
³ KP_{ed} Skt (instead of *atha*): asmiṃ khalu punar dharmaparyāye bhāṣyamāṇe, which appears in ms P's PsP chapter 17 citation as: asmin khalv api dharmaparyāye nirmittakabhikṣubhyām bhāṣyamāṇam
⁴ Q: Ø; D: yaṃjanā ⁵ Q: ///nām ⁶ B, J, L: anupādāyāśriyebhyaś; D: anupādāyāśreyetyāś ⁷ KP_{ed} Skt: om. abhūvan ⁸ KP_{ed} Skt: te
⁹ D: vimuktavittani ¹⁰ L: yana ¹¹ L: bhavāṃs ¹² B: °saṃkrāti; J: °saṃkrānti; L: °saṃkrāṃti ¹³ J: upasakramya ¹⁴ B, D, J, L: śīrasā (conjoined with following word); PsP_L: śīrasā (conjoined with following word); KP_{ed} Skt: śīrobhir; P and D for the PsP chapter 17 citation (cf. de Jong 1978: 223): śīrobhir ¹⁵ D: abhivantyaikānte; J: abhivadyaikānte. KP_{ed} Skt: vyanditvā ekāṃte ¹⁶ P: nyaśīdan; D: nyasīdanā; J, L: nyasīdan; PsP_L: nyasīdan ¹⁷ J: °māt ¹⁸ P: tāna
¹⁹ D: bhikūn ²⁰ P: evāvocat; D: avocana; ms P for the chapter 17 citation: om. eva; KP_{ed} Skt: om. eva ²¹ P: kutāyu°. KP_{ed} Skt: kva nu khalv āyusmaṃto ²² J: om. ²³ J: om. ²⁴ KP_{ed} Skt: akvacid ÷ na kvacid ²⁵ D: gamanoya ²⁶ B, L: bhagavanta; J: bhagavantah
²⁷ D: dharmā ²⁸ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir
²⁹ D: kā

नामायुष्मतां¹ शास्ता। आहुर्² यो³ नोत्पन्नो⁴ न परिनिर्वास्यति।
 आह⁵ कथं युष्माभिर्⁶ धर्मः श्रुतः। आहुर्⁷ न बन्धाय⁸ न
 मोक्षाय। आह⁹ केन यूयं विनीताः¹⁰। आहुर्¹¹ यस्य न कायो¹² न
 चित्तम्। आह¹³ कथं यूयं प्रयुक्ताः¹⁴। आहुर्¹⁵ नाविद्याप्रहाणाय¹⁶
 5 न विद्योत्पादनाय¹⁷। आह¹⁸ कस्य यूयं श्रावकाः। आहुर्¹⁹ येन
 न प्राप्तं नाभिसम्बुद्धम्²⁰। आह²¹ के²² युष्माकं सब्रह्मचारिणः²³। P9r

¹ D: nyamā° ² KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ ³ L: co ⁴ D: nonpanno. KP_{ed} Skt: yotpanno ∴ yo notpanno ⁵ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtīr āha; subhūtīr n.e. in KP_{ed} Tib. KP_{ed} Skt also attests preceding questions and answers not attested here in PsP or in KP_{ed} Tib; see KP_{ed} §146.1-3 Skt ⁶ D: yuṣmabhi. KP_{ed} Skt: punar yuṣme; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. punar ⁷ KP_{ed} Skt: te āhur; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ⁸ B, J, L: badhyāya; D: banthāya; PsP_L: bandhanāya; KP_{ed} Skt: bandhanāya; ms P for chapter 17 citation: bandhāya ⁹ KP Skt_{ed}: (preceding) subhūtīr āha | kathaṃ yūyaṃ pra-
[yu]ktā (cf. VD 2002: 52) te āhu | na yogāya na prayogāya | na prahā-
ṇāya | subhūtīr; KP_{ed} Tib n.e. subhūtīr, etc. ¹⁰ D: vinītā ¹¹ D: āha
¹² D: kāyo na kāmo. KP_{ed} Skt (for the entire sentence): yasya na kāya-
pāriṇīṣpattir na cittapracāraṃ; KP_{ed} Tib: su la lus med cing sems med
 pas ¹³ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtīr āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtīr ¹⁴ KP_{ed} Skt
 (for the sentence): kathaṃ yuṣmābhi prayujyamānā vimuktāḥ; KP_{ed}
 Tib: khyed ji ltar brtson ¹⁵ D: āha ¹⁶ B, J, L: °prahānāya; D: no-
 vidyā° ¹⁷ Q: vidyotpadāya; D: °nayā ¹⁸ B: om. KP_{ed} Skt: subhū-
 tīr āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtīr ¹⁹ D: āha. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed}
 Tib: n.e. te ²⁰ D: nāhi°. KP_{ed} Skt (for the sentence): yasya na prāpto
 nā[bhi]saṃbuddhaḥ (cf. VD 2002: 52) ²¹ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtīr āha;
 KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtīr ²² KP_{ed} Skt: keva; VD 2002: 52: ke (°)va
²³ D: saṃbramācārīṇaḥ

आहुर्¹ ये² त्रैधातुके नोपविचरन्ति³ । आह⁴ कियच्चिरेणायुष्मन्तः⁵
परिनिर्वास्यन्ति⁶ । आहुर्⁷ यदा⁸ तथागतनिर्मितकाः⁹ परिनि-
र्वास्यन्ति । आह¹⁰ कृतं युष्माभिः करणीयम् । आहुर्¹¹ अहङ्कार-
ममकारपरिज्ञानतः¹² । आह¹³ क्षीणा युष्माकं क्लेशाः । आहुर्¹⁴

L14r

¹ D: āha. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ² B, L: yai; D: mai; J: yaim ³ Q: nopavicarati; D: nopaviceranti; L: nopavivaranti; J: nopavicaranti. KP_{ed} Skt continues with *na pracaram(tī)*, which is not reflected in KP_{ed} Tib. PsP Skt attests its equivalent for the sentences given at KP_{ed} §147.2-6 (*keva cireṇa ...*) only after the sentence *āhur ye traidhātuke nopavicaranti* (this sentence occurs in KP_{ed} Skt at §147.7). These sentences in the KP citation in PsP chapter 17 follow the order of those here in chapter 1. The order of the sentences in KP_{ed} Tib concurs with that of PsP Skt. PsP Tib agrees with KP_{ed} Tib. ⁴ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir ⁵ L: kiyacireṇāyūṣmataḥ ⁶ D: parinivasyanti. KP_{ed} Skt (for the sentence): keva cireṇa yūyaṃ parinirvāsyathaḥ ⁷ D: āha. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ⁸ KP_{ed} Skt for the sentence: yāvaccireṇa tathāgatanirmi[ta]kāḥ parinirvāsyamṭāḥ tāvaccireṇa vayaṃ parinirvāsyāmaḥ ⁹ Q: °nimitakāḥ; J: tathāgatañnirmitakāḥ; L: °nimitikāḥ; PsP_L: °nirmitāḥ; ms P for the chapter 17 citation: tathāgatanirmitāḥ; ms P likewise attests °nirmitāḥ in the sentence *yaṅgāminas tathāgatanirmitāḥ* both here (toward end of citation) and in the chapter 17 citation. KP_{ed} Skt: °nirmi[ta]kāḥ (cf. VD 2002: 52) ¹⁰ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir. In KP_{ed} Skt, this sentence is preceded by: subhūtir āha | kṛtaṃ yuṣmābhi svakārtha te āhuḥ arthānupalabdhatvāt. These sentences do not appear in KP_{ed} Tib. ¹¹ D: āha; J: om. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ¹² KP_{ed} Skt: kārakānupa[la]bdhitvāt (cf. VD 2002: 52). KP_{ed} Tib: ngar 'dzin pa dang | nga yir 'dzin pa yongs su shes pas so (= PsP Skt and Tib) ¹³ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir ¹⁴ D: āha; J, L: āhur. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te

अत्यन्तक्षयात्¹ सर्वधर्माणाम्। आह² धर्षितो युष्माभिर् मारः।
 आहुः³ स्कन्धमारानुपलम्भात्। आह⁴ परिचरितो⁵ युष्माभिः⁶
 शास्ता⁷। आहुर्⁸ न कायेन न वाचा⁹ न¹⁰ मनसा¹¹। आह¹² J17v
 विशोधिता¹³ युष्माभिर् दक्षिणीयभूमिः¹⁴। आहुर्¹⁵ अग्राहतो
 5 ऽप्रतिग्राहतः। आह¹⁶ उत्तीर्णो¹⁷ युष्माभिः¹⁸ संसारः। आहुर्¹⁹ B15r
 अनुच्छेदतो²⁰ ऽशाश्वततः। आह²¹ प्रतिपन्ना युष्माभिर् दक्षि-
 णीयभूमिः²²। आहुः²³ सर्वग्राहविमुक्तिः²⁴। आह²⁵ किङ्गामिन

¹ D: ratyanyajamāt; L: abhyantakṣayāt ² KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir ³ D: āha. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ⁴ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir ⁵ B, D, J, L: °tā ⁶ D: °bhi ⁷ D: om. KP_{ed} Skt: tathāgataḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: ston pa ⁸ D: āha. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ⁹ KP_{ed} Skt: om. na vācā ¹⁰ Q: om. ¹¹ KP_{ed} Skt: cittena ¹² KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir ¹³ D: vośiṣitā. KP_{ed} Skt: sthitā; KP_{ed} Tib: sbyangs ¹⁴ Q: dakṣiṇīyā°; B, J, L: dakṣiṇīya°; D: dantakṣaṇīya°; KP_{ed} Skt: dākṣiṇeyabhūmauḥ; as reflected in VD (2002: 52), the two dots interpreted in KP_{ed} Skt as a *visarga* actually function as a punctuation marker. ¹⁵ D: āha. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ¹⁶ J: om.; L: āhu. KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir ¹⁷ KP_{ed} Skt: chinnā; KP_{ed} Tib: brgal ¹⁸ D: yuṣmābhiva ¹⁹ D: āha. KP_{ed} Skt: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ²⁰ D: anucchaṇḍato. KP_{ed} Skt (for the sentence): anuccheda aśāsvatatvāt ²¹ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir āha; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir ²² Em. following LVP: dakṣiṇīyā°; P, Q: dakṣiṇīyā°; D: dakṣiṇīyā°; B, J, L: dakṣiṇīya°; KP_{ed} Skt: śramaṇaśramaṇabhūmau (VD: sets the first *śramaṇa* in curly brackets; it is not marked as deleted in the KP ms) for dakṣiṇīyabhūmiḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: sbyin pa'i gnas kyi sar ²³ D: āha. KP_{ed} Skt: tena punar āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te punar ²⁴ B, D, J: °vinirmuktitaḥ; L: sarvagrāsavinirmuktitaḥ; PsP_L: °vinirmuktitaḥ. KP_{ed} Skt: asaṃgāvīmuktau; KP_{ed} Tib: 'dzin pa thams cad las rnam par grol ba'i phyir. Ms P for the chapter 17 citation:

आयुष्मन्तः। आहुर्¹ यङ्गामिनस् तथागतनिर्मिता² इति ह्या-
 युष्मतः सुभूतेः³ परिपृच्छतस् तेषां च⁴ भिक्षूणां⁵ विसर्जयतां⁶
 तस्यां⁷ पर्षद्यशानां भिक्षुशतानाम्⁸ अनुपादायाश्रवेभ्यश्च⁹ चित्तानि
 विमुक्तानि द्वात्रिंशतश् च प्राणिसहस्राणां¹⁰ विरजो विगतमलं¹¹
 धर्मेषु धर्मचक्षुर्¹² विशुद्धम् ॥

PsP_L 50

5

इति¹³ ॥

एवं मृषास्वभावाभ्यां तथागतनिर्मिताभ्यां¹⁴ भिक्षुभ्यां¹⁵ पञ्चानां
 भिक्षुशतानां व्यवदाननिबन्धनं कृतमिति ॥

§79. उक्तं चार्यवज्रमण्डायां¹⁶ धारण्याम्¹⁷ –

°vimuktitaḥ ²⁵ KP_{ed} Skt: subhūtir [āha] (see VD 2002: 53); KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. subhūtir

¹ D: āha; J: om.; KP Skt_{ed}: te āhuḥ; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. te ² D: °tā; L: ta-thāganirmitaḥ ³ D: subhūtaḥ ⁴ Q: pañca; B, J, L: om.; PsP_L: om. ca. VD (2002: 53): (ca) ⁵ Q: bhikṣuśatānām; J: °ṇā ⁶ J: viśarjaya-tām ⁷ D: tasmā ⁸ D: °śetānām. KP_{ed} Skt: bhikṣuśatānām paṃcānām ca bhikṣuñīśatānām; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. paṃcānām ca bhikṣuñīśatānām ⁹ D: anuyādā° ¹⁰ P: prāṇasahasrāṇām. KP_{ed} Skt: prāṇisa-hasrāṇām sadevamānuṣikāyām prajāyām; KP_{ed} Tib: n.e. sadevamānu-ṣikāyām prajāyām ¹¹ P: °mala(m); D: °mala ¹² P: °ṣu; B, J, L: °ṣu; PsP_L: °ṣuḥ ¹³ LVP adds a preceding *iti* (viśuddham | iti || ity evam), which is not found in any of the mss ¹⁴ Q: bhikṣubhyām tathāgatanirmitābhyām (see next note); L: °nirmityām ¹⁵ Q: om.; D: bhikṣutyām ¹⁶ B: cāyaṃvajra°; D: vāryavajra°; J: cāyaṣaja-maṇḍāyām; L: cāyavajamaṇḍāyām ¹⁷ PsP Tib adds a following *kyang*.

तद्यथा मञ्जुश्रीः काण्डं च प्रतीत्य मथनीं च प्रतीत्य पुरुषस्य¹ ²
हस्तव्यायामं³ प्रतीत्य धूमः⁴ प्रादुर्भवत्य्⁵ अग्निर् अभिनिर्वर्तते⁶ ।
स चाग्निसन्तापो⁷ न⁸ काण्डसन्निश्चितो⁹ न मथनीसन्निश्चितो¹⁰ न
पुरुषस्य¹¹ हस्तव्यायामसन्निश्चितः¹² । एवमेव मञ्जुश्रीर् असद्वि-
पर्यासमोहितस्य¹³ पुरुषपुद्गलस्योत्पद्यते¹⁴ रागपरिदाहो द्वेष-

¹ J: puruṣa ² P: om. ca; B, D, J, L: om. ca; conj. by LVP: hastavyā-
yāmaṃ [ca] ³ D: °vyāyāsaṃ; PsP Tib: gtsub shing dang gtsub stan
la brten | mi'i lag pa'i rtsol ba la brten nas du ba 'byung; VMD Tib P:
gtsub shing dang gtsub stan la yang brten | mi'i lag pas gtsub la yang
brten nas ⁴ D: ṣṭamaḥ ⁵ D, J, L: prādurbhavatīti ⁶ Q: abhipra-
vartate; B, J, L: abhinivarttate; D: ebhi°; PsP Tib, VMD Tib P,
Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: mngon par 'grub; VMD Tib Phug brag
2: 'byung bar 'gyur ⁷ P: cāgnisantātpor; Q: cāgnisampāto; D: cā-
gnisamtopo; PsP Tib, VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1 & 2:
n.e. santāpaḥ ⁸ D: va ⁹ Em. following LVP: °sanniśrito; P, Q:
°sanniḥśrito; B, D, J, L: °saṃniḥśrito ¹⁰ Em. following LVP: ma-
thanīsañniśrito; P: araṇisañniśrito; Q: °saṃniḥśrito; B, J, L: °san-
niḥśrito; D: °saṃniḥśrito. ¹¹ P, B, D, J, L: conjoined with following
compound (puruṣahasta°); PsP_L: puruṣahasta° ¹² Q: °sanniḥśritaḥ;
D: °sanniḥśritaḥ; J: °vyāyāmaṃsañniḥśritaḥ ¹³ Q: °viparyāsa-
saṃmohitasya; D: asadvīyaryāsamāhitasya; PsP Tib: n.e. viparyāsa:
med pa las skyes bu gang zag rmongs pa la; VMD Tib P, Gondhla,
sTog, Phug brag 1 & 2: n.e. viparyāsa. VMD Tib, however, construes
asat with *paridāha*: skye bu¹ gang zag rmongs pa la 'dod chags dang |
zhe sdang dang | gti mug gyis yong su gdung ba² med³ pa⁴ 'byung⁵
ste |; ¹ VMD Tib Gondhla: om. skye bu; ² sTog: ba'i; ³ sTog: me; ⁴ Phug
brag 1: bar; ⁵ Gondhla: om. 'byung; VMD Tib Phug brag 2: rmongs
pa'i skye bu dag la | 'dod chags dang gti mug gyis yong su gdung ba |
med bzhin tu byung ste | ¹⁴ B, J: °puṃgalasyotpadyante; D: °pud-
galasyātpadyate; L: as B, °puṅgala°

J18r परिदाहो¹ मोहपरिदाहः। स च परिदाहो नाध्यात्मं² न बहिर्धा
 L14v नोभयम् अन्तरेण³ स्थितः⁴। अपि तु मञ्जुश्रीर्⁵ यद्⁶ उच्यते मोह
 इति तत्⁷ केन कारणेनोच्यते⁸ मोह इति। अत्यन्तमुक्तो हि⁹
 मञ्जुश्रीः सर्वधर्मे¹⁰ मोहस् तेनोच्यते¹¹ मोह इति। तथा¹²
 नरकमुखा¹³ मञ्जुश्रीः सर्वधर्मा¹⁴ इदं¹⁵ धारणीपदम्। आह कथं 5
 D8v भगवन् इदं¹⁶ धारणीपदम्। आह नरका¹⁷ मञ्जुश्रीर् बाल-
 B15v पृथग्जनैर्¹⁸ असद्विपर्यासविठपिताः¹⁹ स्वविकल्पसम्भूताः²⁰। PsPL 51
 आह कुत्र भगवन् नरकाः समवसरन्ति। भगवानाह आकाश-
 समवसरणा²¹ मञ्जुश्रीर् नरकाः। तत् किं मन्यसे²² मञ्जुश्रीः²³

¹ D: °dāhā ² P: nādhyātma; Q: nādhyātmīyam ³ D: antaraṇa
⁴ D: sthita. PsP Tib, VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: gnyi ga
 med par yang mi gnas ÷ nobhayam antareṇa sthitaḥ (*antareṇa* is
 intended in its BHS sense of “between”); VMD Tib Phug brag 2:
 gnyis ka’i bar na gnas pa ma yin ⁵ D: mañjuśrī; L: °śrī ⁶ PsP
 Tib, VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: n.e. yat; VMD Tib
 Phug brag 2: gang ⁷ D: tata ⁸ D: kaṣṇaṇācyata ⁹ P: om.
¹⁰ P: Ø; L: sarvadharmar ¹¹ P: Ø; D: tenocyade ¹² P: Ø; L: tatho
¹³ PsP Tib, VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1 & 2: chos thams
 cad ni sems can dmyal ba’i sgo ¹⁴ L: sarvadharmar (then repeats)
 mohas tenoccyate moha iti || tatho narakamṣmukhā mañjuśrīr ¹⁵ L:
 om. idaṃ dhāraṇīpadam | āha katham bhagavann idaṃ dhāraṇīpadam
 | āha narakā mañjuśrīr ¹⁶ J: ida ¹⁷ PsP Tib, VMD Tib P, Gondhla,
 sTog, Phug brag 1 & 2 translate *narakāḥ* as *sems can dmyal ba* (*dag*)
 throughout ¹⁸ D: bālavṛtaṣagjanair; J: bālamṛthagjanair; L: bola°
¹⁹ D: °vidyapitāḥ; J, L: viṭhavitāḥ ²⁰ D: svavilakalpa° ²¹ P: Ø; L:
 ākāśasamavasamavasaraṇā ²² P: Ø; L: manyasa ²³ P: Ø; D: vi-
 sarga formed like *dr*

स्वविकल्पसम्भूता¹ नरका² उत³ स्वभावसम्भूताः। आह स्ववि-
कल्पेनैव⁴ भगवन्⁵ सर्वबालपृथग्जना⁶ नरकतिर्यग्योनियमलोकं⁷
सज्जानन्ति। ते चासत्समारोपेण⁸ दुःखां⁹ वेदनां¹⁰ वेदयन्ति¹¹ P9v
दुःखम्¹² अनुभवन्ति त्रिष्वप्य¹³ अपायेषु¹³ ॥

5 यथा चाहं¹⁴ भगवन्¹⁵ नरकान् पश्यामि तथा नारकं¹⁶ दुःखम्।
तद्यथा भगवन्¹⁷ कश्चिदेव¹⁸ पुरुषः सुप्तः स्वप्नान्तरगतो¹⁹ नरक- Q8v

¹ P: [1](vi)ka[1](s)ambhūtā; B, D, J: °tāḥ; L: svavikalpamsambhūtāḥ
² B, D, J, L: naraka ³ Q: u ⁴ D: svavikalpyanaiva ⁵ Q: bhavan
⁶ Q: om. sarva; PsP Tib, VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1 &
2: n.e. sarva ⁷ Q: narakapretatiryagyoni°; D: °tiryāsyoni°; Q's
preta is not reflected in PsP Tib or VMD Tib (P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug
brag 1 & 2). The fact that *LT's author glosses *yamaloka* with *pretāḥ*
indicates that his PsP ms did not attest *preta* (cf. *LT 2004: 124, 141
[fol. 2b3]). ⁸ D: °ropeṇēḥ ⁹ P: duṣkhaṃ; L: duḥkhā ¹⁰ D: ce-
danām ¹¹ D: vadayaṃti ¹² P: duṣkhaṃ ¹³ D: apāyeṣa ¹⁴ Q:
nāhaṃ; D: vāhe; PsP Tib: ma khums; VMD Tib: mi/ma mthong.
Tibetan for the entire sentence: PsP Tib: bdag gis ni ji ltar sems can
dmyal ba ma khums pa de bzhin du sems can dmyal ba'i sdug bsngal
yang ma khums so ||; VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: bdag
gis sems can dmyal ba ji ltar mi mthong ba de bzhin du | sems can
dmyal ba rnams¹ mi mthong ste | sems can dmyal ba'i² sdug bsngal³
yang ma mchis so ||; ¹sTog: dmyal ba pa rnams; ²sTog: dmyal ba pa'i;
³Gondhla: sdug bsngal ba'i sdug bsngal; Phug brag 1: sdug bsngal ba;
VMD Tib Phug brag 2: ji ltar sems can dmyal ba ni bdag gis ma
mthong ngo || de bzhin du sems can dmyal ba pa yang ma mthong ste
|| sems can dmyal ba'i sdug bsngal yang ma mthong ngo ||. See Trans-
lation note. ¹⁵ D: bhagavana; L: bhagava ¹⁶ P: Ø; D: māraḥkaṃ;
L: prāraḥkaṃ ¹⁷ P: Ø; D: bhagavanam ¹⁸ PsP Tib, VMD Tib: n.e.
eva ¹⁹ D: °taraśato

गतम्¹ आत्मानं सञ्जानीते² । स तत्र कथितायां³ सम्प्रज्वलिता-
याम्⁴ अनेकपौरुषायां⁵ लोहकुम्भ्यां⁶ प्रक्षिप्तमात्मनं सञ्जानीयात्⁷ ।
स⁸ तत्र खरां⁹ कटुकां¹⁰ तीव्रां¹¹ दुःखां¹² वेदनां वेदयेत् । स तत्र
मानसं¹³ परिदाहं सञ्जानीयाद्¹⁴ उच्चसेत्¹⁵ सन्त्रसेत्¹⁶ सन्त्रासम्¹⁷

J18v

¹ P: nara(k).[2](m); D: narakaśatam ² Q: saṃjānīyet (final *t* originally read *te* but *e* has been erased and a *virāma* added) ³ B: ka°
⁴ Q: prajvalitāyām ⁵ D: anaka°; PsP Tib: skyes bu du ma dang ldan pa; VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: 'dom du ma mchis pa; VMD Tib Phug brag 2: mi du mas. See Translation note. ⁶ L: lo-khakumtyām ⁷ P: ☉; D: saṃjī(?)nīyāt; L: saṃjīyāt ⁸ P: om. sa tatra kharām kaṭukām ⁹ L: khanām ¹⁰ D: kadukām ¹¹ D: tīkam; PsP Tib: drag cing mi bzad la brnag par dka' zhing yid du mi 'ong ba ÷ kharām kaṭukām tīvrām; VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: sdug bsngal gyi tshor ba myong bar rab tu 'tshal te ÷ kharām kaṭukām tīvrām duḥkham vedanām vedayet; VMD Tib Phug brag 2: sdug bsngal gyi tshor ba myong nas ¹² D: duḥkhā ¹³ L: mānaṃ-pasaṃ ¹⁴ PsP Tib: myong bar 'gyur ÷ saṃjānīyāt ¹⁵ P: uttrasana ¹⁶ P: santrasa(n)ā; B, D, J, L: om.; PsP Tib: skrag par 'gyur | dngangs par 'gyur (*santraset) | kun tu dngangs par 'gyur ÷ uttraset santraset santrāsam āpadyeta; VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: 'jigs (Gondhla: |) skrag ste sngangs ÷ uttraset santraset santrāsam āpadyeta; VMD Tib Phug brag 2: sngangs kun tu sngangs | kun tu rab tu sngangs par gyur ÷ uttraset santraset santrāsam āpadyeta. Cp., e.g., Aṣṭa 3.12: ... nottrasyati na saṃtrasyati na saṃtrāsam āpadyate. PsP Tib (unlike VMD Tib) sets the verbs describing the man's fear in a separate sentence (the new sentence begins after *myong bar 'gyur*) which commences with *de de na* (*sa tatra). ¹⁷ P: Ø; D: saṃtrā; L: satrāsas

आपद्येत¹। स तत्र प्रतिविवुद्धः² समानो³ ऽहो दुःखम्⁴ अहो
 दुःखमिति क्रन्देच्च⁵ छोचेत्⁶ परिदेवेत्⁷। अथ तस्य⁸ मित्रज्ञाति-
 सालोहिताः⁹ परिपृच्छेयुः¹⁰ केनैतत्¹¹ तव¹² दुःखमिति। स तान्
 मित्रज्ञातिसालोहितान्¹³ एवं वदेद्¹⁴ नैरयिकं¹⁵ दुःखम्¹⁶ अनु-
 भूतम्। स तान् आक्रोशेत्¹⁷ परिभाषेताहं¹⁸ च¹⁹ नाम नैरयिकं
 दुःखमनुभवामि यूयं च मे²⁰ उत्तरि²¹ परिपृच्छथ²² केनैतत्²³ तव²³
 दुःखमिति। अथ²⁴ ते मित्रज्ञातिसालोहितास् तं पुरुषमेवं
 वदेयुर्²⁵ मा भैर्²⁶ मा भैर्²⁷ भोः²⁸ पुरुषा सुप्तो²⁹ हि ब्रम् न

¹ Em. following LVP: āpadyeta. P: Ø; Q: āpadyate; B, D, J, L: āpadya-
 te ² P: Ø; Q: vibuddhaḥ; D: °ddha; J, L: pati° ³ PsP Tib: sad par
 gyur zhing rlom pa dang bcas pas ÷ prativibuddhaḥ samānaḥ; VMD
 Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: slar sad (Gondhla: bsad) pa ÷ pra-
 tivibuddhaḥ samānaḥ; VMD Tib Phug brag 2: n.e. prativibuddhaḥ
 samānaḥ ⁴ P: Ø; L: duḥkh ⁵ P: Ø; Q: krandeta; D: krandata
⁶ P: Ø; B, J, L: ścoce; D: ścocen ⁷ P: Ø; Q: parivet; D: paridevat
⁸ D: tasva ⁹ B: °sārohitāḥ; D: °jñātimālohitāḥ; J: °jñānisārohitāḥ;
 L: °sārohitām ¹⁰ L: paripr̥ch(?)eyu ¹¹ B: kinatat; D: kenet(?)at;
 J: kenatat; L: kenata; PsP_L: kena tat; PsP Tib: 'di ltar ÷ etat; VMD
 Tib: n.e. etat ¹² P: (ta)vā; B, D, J: te; L: tre; PsP_L: te ¹³ B: °sāro-
 hitān; D: mitrajñāti° ¹⁴ B, J: vedayet; D: vaden; L: vadayet
¹⁵ Q: adds following *me*; D: nairayirkama; PsP Tib: nges; VMD Tib:
 bdag ¹⁶ L: duḥkhamm ¹⁷ Q: akrośeta; D: okrošen ¹⁸ B, D, J, L:
 paribhāset | a° (J: ||); PsP_L: paribhāset (half-*danḍa*) a° ¹⁹ D: va
²⁰ Although classical Sanskrit's sandhi rules would dictate a change
 to *ma*, I accept the mss' *me* in the present citation. ²¹ PsP Tib: n.e.
 me uttari; VMD Tib: nga la ²² Em. following LVP: °tha. P: Ø; Q:
 °ta; B, D, J, L: °ta ²³ L: tave ²⁴ D: first repeats sa tām mitrajñāti-
 sālohitān evaṃ vadet nairayikaṃ duḥkham anubhūtaṃ ²⁵ D, L °yu
²⁶ D: mā hai ²⁷ Q: mā bhir; L: om.; D: mā hair; PsP_L: om. mā
 bhair; Tib: ma 'jigs shig ²⁸ Q: bho ²⁹ D: sapto

B16r

ब्रमितो गृहात् कचिन् निर्गतः¹ । तस्य पुनरपि स्मृतिर् उत्पद्येत²
 सुप्तो³ ऽहम्⁴ अभूवम्⁵ । वितथमेतन् मया परिकल्पितम्⁶
 अभूतम्⁷ इति । स पुनर् अपि⁸ सौमनस्यं⁹ प्रतिलभते ॥

तद्यथा भगवन् स पुरुषो¹⁰ ऽसत्समारोपेण¹¹ सुप्तः¹² स्वप्नान्तर-
 गतो¹³ नरकगतम् आत्मानं¹⁴ सञ्जानीयात्¹⁵ एवम्¹⁶ एव भगवन्¹⁷ 5
 सर्वबालपृथग्जना असद्रागपर्यवनद्धाः¹⁸ स्त्रीनिमित्तं कल्प-
 यन्ति¹⁹ । ते स्त्रीनिमित्तं²⁰ कल्पयित्वा ताभिः²¹ सार्धं रममाणम्²²
 आत्मानं²³ सञ्जानन्ति²⁴ । तस्य²⁵ बालपृथग्जनस्यैवं²⁶ भवत्य्²⁷
 अहं पुरुष²⁸ इयं स्त्री ममैषा स्त्री । तस्य तेन²⁹ छन्दरागपर्य-

¹ D: nirgataih ² Q: utpadyate; B, J, L: utpadyate; PsP_L: utpadyate
³ D: suptoḥ ⁴ J: haṁm ⁵ Q: abhūd; B: anubhūvaṁ ⁶ Q: pari-
 parikalpitam ⁷ Q: anubhūtam; B, D, J, L: anubhūtam; LVP (PsP_L
 52, n. 1) does not include *anubhūtam* or emend to *abhūtam*, but does
 note that his mss read *anubhūtam*; PsP Tib: yang dag pa ma yin pa 'di
 bdag gis kun tu brtags so ⇨ vitatham etan mayā parikalpitam abhū-
 tam. VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: yang dag pa ma yin pa
 dngos po med pa de la bdag gis brtags pa lta zhig ste | dngos po ci
 yang med do; VMD Tib Phug brag 2: bdag gis phyin ci log gis brtags
 par gyur to ⁸ D: eti ⁹ D: saumenasyaṁ; J: somanasyaṁ ¹⁰ P:
 Ø; D: puruṣāḥ ¹¹ P: Ø; B, J, L: °samārāpeṇa; D: samārāyev(?)ā
¹² J: supta ¹³ P: Ø; J: svantaragato ¹⁴ L: ātsāmaṁ ¹⁵ D: evay
¹⁶ D: °vat ¹⁷ Q: asadvāsanāparyava°; L: asaḍāga°; PsP Tib: bden
 pa ma lags pa'i 'dod chags kyis kun nas bcings pa; VMD Tib P:
 mchis pa ma lags pa'i 'dod chags kyis kun tu dkris pas ¹⁸ Q: kal-
 panti ¹⁹ Q: strīnittaṁ ²⁰ L: tābhi ²¹ D: vamaṁānaṁm; J: °mā-
 naṁ; L: ramamāśam ²² J: om. ²³ J: saṁjānaṁanti; L: saṁjānaṁti
²⁴ Q: tasyaivaṁ ²⁵ J: pṛthag° ²⁶ D: bhavatā (ā sandhi) ²⁷ D:
 °ṣaḥ ²⁸ B, J, L: imaṁ ²⁹ J, L: tena tasya

वस्थितेन¹ चित्तेन भोगपर्येष्टौ² चित्तं³ क्रामति⁴ । स ततोनिदानं⁵ J19r
 कलहविग्रहविवादं सञ्जनयति । तस्य प्रदुष्टेन्द्रियस्य वैरं⁶ सञ्जा-
 यते⁷ । स तेन सञ्ज्ञाविपर्यासेन कालगतः समानो⁸ बहूनि⁹
 कल्पसहस्राणि नरकेषु दुःखां वेदनां वेदयमानमात्मानं सञ्जा-
 नाति¹⁰ ॥

5

तद्यथा भगवंस्¹¹ तस्य पुरुषस्य मित्रज्ञातिसालोहिता¹² एवं वद-
 न्ति मा भैर् मा भैर् भोः¹³ पुरुष । सुप्तो हि बम् । न बम्¹⁴ इतो¹⁵
 गृहात् कुतश्चिन्¹⁶ निर्गत इति । एवम् एव¹⁷ भगवन् बुद्धा भगव-
 न्तश्¹⁸ चित्तविपर्यासविपर्यस्तानां¹⁹ सत्त्वानाम्²⁰ एव²¹ धर्म²² L15v

¹ D: °paryavasthitamṇa; J, L: chandarāgaparyavasānaddhāḥ, repeat (now with previous deletions included): strīnimittam kalpayanti te strī nimittam kalpayitvā tābhiḥ sārddha ramamāṇaṁ ātmānaṁ saṁ-jānanti || tasya bālaprthagjanasyaivaṁ bhavaty ahaṁ puruṣa imaṁ strī mamaīśāṁ strī tasya tena chandarāgaparyavasthiteṇa; PsP Tib: 'dun pa'i 'dod chags ÷ chandarāga° ² B, J, L: bhogaparyastau; D: bhā-gaparyasṭhau; PsP_L: bhogaparyeṣṭim; PsP Tib: spyod tshol bar ³ D: nittam ⁴ B, J, L: krāmayati; PsP_L: krāmayati; PsP Tib: 'jug par 'gyur ⁵ L: tatonidrānaṁ ⁶ Em. following LVP: vairam. P: vairah; Q: vairasya; B, D, J, L: vairah ⁷ Q: jāyate ⁸ D: samāloka; PsP Tib: rlom pa dang bcas pa ÷ samānaḥ: rlom pa dang bcas pa de 'du shes phyin ci log des 'chi ba'i dus bgyis par gyur nas ÷ sa tena saṁ-jñāviparyāseṇa kālagataḥ samāno ⁹ J: bahūni ¹⁰ B: saṁjānāṁti; J, L: saṁjananti ¹¹ B: °vāms; D: °vana ¹² J: °sālohitāsālohitā; L: °sālohitāti ¹³ P, Q: bho; D: bhāḥ ¹⁴ D: svam ¹⁵ B, J, L: itā ¹⁶ P: kutaścitan ¹⁷ L: e ¹⁸ PsP Tib: bcom ldan 'das rnam kyis kyang ¹⁹ B, D: caturviparyāsa°; L: catraviparyāsa°; J: catuvi...stā-nā; PsP Tib, VMD Tib: phyin ci log bzhis ÷ cittaviparyāsa°. The traditional four errors are not topical in the passage. ²⁰ J: sattvo-nām ²¹ J: eva ²² J, L: dharma

देशयन्ति¹ नात्र स्त्री न पुरुषो² न³ सत्त्वो⁴ न जीवो⁵ न पुरुषो⁶ न
 पुद्गलः⁷ । वितथा⁸ इमे सर्वधर्माः⁹ । असन्त¹⁰ इमे सर्वधर्माः¹¹ ।
 विठपिता¹² इमे सर्वधर्माः । मायोपमा¹³ इमे सर्वधर्माः । स्वप्नोप- PsP_L 53
 B16v मा इमे सर्वधर्माः । निर्मितोपमा इमे सर्वधर्माः । दकचन्द्रोपमा¹⁴
 इमे सर्वधर्माः । इति विस्तरः¹⁵ । त इमां¹⁶ तथागतस्य धर्मदेशनां 5
 D9r श्रुत्वा विगतरागान् सर्वधर्मान्¹⁷ पश्यन्ति । विगतदोषान्¹⁸
 सर्वधर्मान्¹⁹ पश्यन्ति²⁰ । विगतमोहान्²¹ सर्वधर्मान् पश्यन्ति ।
 J19v अस्वभावान्²² अनावरणान् । त आकाशस्थितेन चेतसा कालं

¹ D: daśayaṃti ² B, D, J, L: °ṣā ³ D: ne ⁴ B, J, L: satvā ⁵ D: jīvā ⁶ Q: poṣo ⁷ B, J: puṃgalo; L: puṃgalo ⁸ D: nitathā ⁹ Q: sarvadharmā ¹⁰ P: om. asanta ime sarvadharmāḥ | viṭhapitā ime sarvadharmāḥ; Q: om. asanta ime sarvadharmāḥ; PsP Tib: chos 'di dag thams cad ni yod pa ma yin pa | chos 'di dag thams cad ni phyin ci log gis bsgrubs pa ÷ asanta ime sarvadharmāḥ | viṭhapitā ime sarvadharmāḥ; VMD Tib: chos 'di dag thams cad ni med pa'o | chos 'di dag thams cad ni rnam par bsgrubs pa'o ÷ asanta ime sarvadharmāḥ | viṭhapitā ime sarvadharmāḥ ¹¹ D: °dharmāse ¹² D: vithayitā ¹³ J: māye(?)pamā ¹⁴ B, J, L: udaka°; D: dekecandropamā; PsP_L: udaka° ¹⁵ B, J, L: viṣṭaraḥ ¹⁶ PsP Tib: de bzhin du ÷ imām: de bzhin du de dag de bzhin gshegs pa'i chos bstan pa thos nas; VMD Tib P, Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: de dag gis de bzhin gshegs pa'i chos (P: chos de) thos nas ÷ ta imām tathāgatasya dharmadeśanām śrutvā; VMD Tib Phug brag 2: de rnam de bzhin gshegs pa las chos thos pas ¹⁷ D: sarvasarvadharmāḥ ¹⁸ B, D, J, L: om.; PsP_L: om. vigatadoṣān; PsP Tib supports *doṣa* (BHS for *dveṣa*): zhe sdang dang bral pa; VMD Tib Gondhla, sTog, Phug brag 1: zhe sdang ma mchis pa; VMD Tib P, Phug brag 2: zhe sdang dang bral ba ¹⁹ B, D, J, L: om.; PsP_L: om. sarvadharmān ²⁰ B, D, J, L: om.; PsP_L: om. paśyanti ²¹ D: °māhān ²² D: athabhavon

कुर्वन्ति¹। ते कालगताः समाना² निरुपधिशेषे³ निर्वाणधातौ P10r
परिनिर्वान्ति। एवम् अहं⁴ भगवन् नरकान्⁵ पश्यामि॥

इति॥

§80. उक्तं चार्योपालिपरिपृच्छायाम्⁶ –

5 भय दर्शित⁷ नैरयिकं⁸ मे सत्वसहस्र⁹ सवेजित¹⁰ नैके।
न¹¹ च विद्यति कश्चिह¹² सत्वो¹³ यो च्युतु¹⁴ गच्छति घोरम् अपा-
यम्¹⁵ ॥

¹ J: kuvanti ² B, D, J, L: sāmānāḥ; PsP_L: sāmānāḥ ³ D: °ṣa ⁴ D: ehaṃ ⁵ Q: nārakān ⁶ L: cāryopāriṣṭhāyām ⁷ D: darśitai
⁸ D: vairayikaṃ; L: °ka ⁹ B, J, L: °sahasraṃ; D: °sahasvaṃ
¹⁰ Em. following LVP and Python (1973: 59): savejita. P: saṃvejitu;
Q: saṃvejita; B, J, L: vejituṃ; D: vajituṃ. *saṃvejita* appears in P's
equivalents for PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. A prosodically short nasal
(*sāvejita*) probably stands behind P and Q's readings, but this short
nasal can only be written either as *saṃvejita* (nasalization marked but
prosodically incorrect) or as *savejita* (prosodically correct but nasali-
zation unmarked). *sāvejitu* is also possible; cf. BHSG §8.30. ¹¹ D:
ra ¹² Q: kaściha, but a *di* from the lower margin is marked to be
inserted after °ci; B, D, J: kaścit; L: ka | ścit. Like Python (1973: 59),
I understand *kaściha* as intending *kaśc'iha*; P attests *kaściha* here and
in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. ¹³ D: satvā;
PsP_L: satva; Python (1973: 59): sattva. The (irregular) *dodhaka* metre
(see PsP_L 53, n. 4) expects a long syllable. P also attests *satvo* in the
passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. ¹⁴ P: cyutta; Q:
cyuta; D: vyatu. P attests *cyutta* (probably a misreading of *cyutu*) in
its passage equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 but *cyutu* in the passage
equivalent to 234.11f. The *a/u* variation may merely represent differ-
ent ways of writing a vowel that was perhaps close to ǝ or ə and for
which a specific grapheme was not available. ¹⁵ D: ayāyaṃ

न च कारणकारक¹ सन्ती² येहि³ कृता असितोमरशस्त्राः⁴ ।

कल्पवशेन तु पश्यति तत्र कायि पतन्ति अपायि⁵ तं शस्त्राः॥

PsP_L 54

चित्रमनोरमसज्जितपुष्पाः⁷ स्वर्णविमान जलन्ति⁸ मनोज्ञाः ।

¹ Em. following Python: *kāraṇakāraka*. P, Q: *kārakakāraṇa* (P attests this reading in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f.); B: *kārakakāraṇam*; D, J, L: *kārakakāraṇa*; Python (cf. 1973: 59; 128, n. 6) discards LVP's *kāraṇa* for *kāraṇa-kāraka* on the basis of the Upālipariṣṭhā Tib and Chinese. PsP Tib: gang dag ral gri mda' chen mtshon 'byin pa'i || gnod pa byed pa yod pa ma yin te. BHSD s.v. *kāraṇā*: "torture, torment, esp. applied to the torments of hell."

² PsP_L and Python: *santi*. Ms P also attests *santī* in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. The *dodhaka* metre expects a long final syllable. On the lengthening of historic *i* to *ī* in BHS verses, see BHSG §3.12; even in cases of short *i* at the end of *pāda*, BHSG §26.2.

³ D: *yaṃhi* ⁴ Em. following LVP and Python: °*tomaraśastrāḥ*. P: °*tomaravarśāḥ*; Q: °*tomaravarśāḥ*; B, J, L: °*tomaravarśāḥ*; D: *isito-mamaiv(?)arśāḥ*; P attests °*śastrā* in the passage equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and °*śastrāḥ* in the passage equivalent to 234.11f. PsP_L's °*tomaraśastrāḥ* may represent a silent emendation. ⁵ B, J: *āpāyi*; D: *ayāpi*; LVP connects *apāyi* with the next word to form *apāyita* ⁶ D: te

⁷ Em. following LVP and Python: °*puṣpāḥ* (Python, however, presents *citra manorama sajñita puṣpāḥ*). Like Python, I accept PsP_L's °*sajñita*°, which is based on the faulty reading °*sajñitā*° attested by either the Calcutta or Paris ms used by LVP (Cambridge, i.e., my ms L, reads °*saṃjñitā*°) and has descended from ms J's °*saṃjñitā*°. P: *citrāmanoramasamjñitaśreṣṭhāḥ* (similarly in the equivalent passage in P for PsP_L 191.2-9 but °*sajñitā*° in the passage equivalent to PsP_L 234.11f.); Q: *cittāmanoramasamjñitaśreṣṭhāḥ*; B, J, L: °*saṃjñitaśreṣṭhāḥ*; D: °*saṃjñitaśreṣṭoḥ*. Upālipariṣṭhā and PsP Tib: sna tshogs yid dga' me tog kha bye zhing ||. PsP Tib has been copied in from Upālipariṣṭhā Tib. ⁸ Q: *jvalanti*; B, L: *jvalamti*; J: *jvalanti*; P attests *jvalanti* in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. The

तेष्वपि कारकु¹ नास्तिह² कश्चित्³ ते ऽपि च स्थापित कल्प-
वशेन ॥

कल्पवशेन⁴ विकल्पितु⁵ लोकः सज्ज्ञगहेण⁶ विकल्पितु⁷ बालः ।
सो⁸ च⁹ गहो¹⁰ अगहो¹¹ असभूतो¹² मायमरीचिसमा¹³ हि¹⁴
विकल्पाः ॥

5

इति ॥

dodhaka metre requires a short syllable.

¹ P: kāraka; Q: kārakan; B, J, L: kāraka; P reads *kāraku* in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. ² Q: nāstiha; I understand *nāstiha* as intending *nāst'iha* ³ PsP_L and Python: kaści; the *dodhaka* metre expects a long syllable. ⁴ D: kalpa ⁵ P: cakalpitu; B, J: vikalpatu; D: yatu; L: vikalpayatu; Tib: rnam brtags. P attests *vikalpitu* in the passage equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 but *tu vikalpita* in that equivalent to PsP_L 234.11f. ⁶ Em. following LVP and Python: sañjñagraheṇa. P: sañjñagraheṇa; Q: sañjñāgrahaṇa; B, L: °grahaṇa; D: sañjñāprahaṇa; J: sañjñāgrahaṇa. P attests *sañjñagraheṇa* in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. The *dodhaka* metre requires a short syllable. ⁷ Q: vikalpito; B, J, L: vikalpayatu; D: cikalpapatu ⁸ B, L: sā ⁹ P: tra, but P attests *ca* in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. ¹⁰ Em. following LVP and Python: gaho. P, Q: graho; B, J, L: graho; D: grahā (*ā* sandhi). P attests *graho* in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. The *dodhaka* metre requires a short syllable. ¹¹ Em. following LVP and Python: agaho. P, Q: 'graho; B, J: 'graho; D: agreho; L: om. P attests 'graho in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. The *dodhaka* metre requires a short syllable. ¹² P: 'sabhūto; Q: 'sadbhūto; B, J: asadbhūto. P attests respectively *sadbhūto* and 'sadbhūto in the passages equivalent to PsP_L 191.2-9 and 234.11f. ¹³ B: māyāma°; Python (1973: 60) presents *māyāma*° but the *dodhaka* metre demands a short syllable. ¹⁴ B: hita

तदेवम् असत्स्वभावा¹ भावाः स्वविपर्यासविठपिता² बालानां
सङ्क्षेशहेतवो³ भवन्ति संसार इति स्थितम्⁴ ॥

यथा च⁵ मृषास्वभावानां पदार्थानां सङ्क्षेशव्यवदानहेतुबन्ध⁶ तथा
मध्यमकावताराद् विस्तरेणावसेयम्⁷ ॥

L16r §81. अत्राह⁷ – यदि स्वतः परत उभयतो ऽहेतुतश्च च नास्ति 5
J20r भावानामुत्पादः⁸ तत्⁹ कथम्⁹ अविद्याप्रत्ययाः संस्कारा इत्युक्तं
Q9a भगवता¹⁰ ॥

उच्यते – संवृतिर्¹¹ एषा¹² न तच्चम् ॥

§82. किं संवृते¹³ व्यवस्था न वक्तव्या¹⁴ ॥

B17r इदम्प्रत्ययतामात्रेण¹⁵ संवृतेः¹⁶ सिद्धिर् अभ्युपगम्यते¹⁷ । न तु पक्ष- 10
चतुष्टयाभ्युपगमेन¹⁸ सस्वभाववादप्रसङ्गात्¹⁹ तस्य चायुक्तत्वात्²⁰ ।

¹ P: asvabhāva; B, D, J, L: atasvabhāva; PsP_L: ete 'svabhāva; Tib yod pa ma yin pa'i rang bzhin can ² Q: °viparyasa°; Tib: n.e. sva ³ P: saṃklesa° ⁴ L: sthite ⁵ Tib: n.e. ca ⁶ P: °āvaśeṣyaṃ; B, J, L: viṣṭareṇā°; D: °nāveseṣyaṃ ⁷ D: atrāhā ⁸ B, D, J, L: tatra; PsP_L: tatra; Tib: n.e. tat ⁹ D: kath ¹⁰ D: °to ¹¹ B, J, L: saṃvṛti ¹² B, D, J, L: evā; PsP_L: eva; Tib: 'di. De Jong (1978: 33) emends to eṣā on the basis of Tib and D's reading saṃvṛtir eṣeti at its equivalent for PsP_L 67.11. ¹³ B, D: °te; J, L: savṛte ¹⁴ B: vyavasthānaṃ vaktavyā ÷ vyavasthā na vaktavyā; J: vyavasthānaṃ varvyakta ('1' written over kta, '2' over rvyā) ÷ vyavasthā na vaktavyā; PsP_L: vyavasthānaṃ vaktavyam; Tib: ci kun rdzob kyi rnam par gzhag pa brjod par bya ba yin nam zhe na ¹⁵ D: °pratayayātāmatriśa ¹⁶ B, D, J, L: °taḥ ¹⁷ D: etyupa°; L: abhupa° ¹⁸ B: °catuṣṭayātyupa°; D: ṣṭayātyupagameṇa ¹⁹ P: svabhāva°; Q: sasvabhāvasvabhāvavāda°; D: sasvabhāvadhāda°; Tib: dngos po rang bzhin dang bcas pa smra bar

PsPL 55 इदम्प्रत्ययतामात्राभ्युपगमे¹ हि सति हेतुफलयोर्² अन्योन्यापेक्षबान्
नास्ति स्वाभाविकी³ सिद्धिर् इति⁴ नास्ति सस्वभाववादः⁵ ॥ अत
एवोक्तम् –

स्वयङ्कृतं परकृतं⁶ द्वाभ्यां कृतम् अहेतुकम्⁷ ।

5 तार्किकैर्⁸ इष्यते⁹ दुःखं त्वया¹⁰ तूक्तं¹¹ प्रतीत्यजम् ॥

इति ॥

इहापि वक्ष्यति¹² –

प्रतीत्य कारकः¹³ कर्म तं प्रतीत्य¹⁴ च कारकम् ।

कर्म प्रवर्तते नान्यत् पश्यामः सिद्धिकारणम् ॥

10 इति ॥

भगवताप्येतावन्मात्रम् एवोक्तम्¹⁵ – तत्रायं धर्मसङ्केतो यदुता-
स्मिन्¹⁶ सतीदं भवत्यस्योत्पादादिदमुत्पद्यते । यदुताविद्याप्रत्ययाः¹⁷
संस्काराः¹⁸ संस्कारप्रत्ययं विज्ञानम्¹⁹ इत्यादि²⁰ ॥

thal bar 'gyur ba'i phyir ²⁰ D: vāyu°

¹ D: °pratyayavāmātrātyupagame; L: idaṃpratyataḥtāmātrā° ² B, J, L: °yār ³ J: svābhāvikām ⁴ D: eti ⁵ D: sasvabhāvapādaḥ; L: °vādaṃ; Tib: dngos po rang bzhin dang bcas par smra ba(r) ÷ sasva-
bhāvapādaḥ ⁶ P: parākṛtaṃ; D: om. ⁷ L: ahetuṃ ⁸ P: tākim-
kair; D: tārkiker; J: tākikair ⁹ D: iṣyete ¹⁰ D: tvayo ¹¹ B, D: bhūtaṃ; J, L: bhūtaṃ ¹² B, J, L: vakṣyatam iti ¹³ P: kārakaṃ
¹⁴ L: pratītyā ¹⁵ D: evaktaṃ ¹⁶ Q: yadudasmin; D: °smi ¹⁷ L: yadutāvidyapretyayāḥ ¹⁸ P: om. ¹⁹ D: vijñānaṃ ²⁰ B: °dih

§83. अत्र केचित् परिचोदयन्ति¹ –

अनुत्पन्ना भावा इति किम्² अयं³ प्रमाणजो⁴ निश्चय⁵ उता-
 प्रमाणजः। तत्र यदि प्रमाणज⁶ इष्यते⁷ तदेदं⁸ वक्तव्यम्⁹ –
 कति प्रमाणानि किलक्षणानि किंविषयाणि¹⁰ किं स्वत उत्पन्नानि
 किं परत उभयतो ऽहेतुतो¹¹ वेति¹²। अथाप्रमाणजः स न¹³ युक्तः 5
 प्रमाणाधीनत्वात् प्रमेयाधिगमस्य। अनधिगतो ह्यर्थो न विना
 प्रमाणैर् अधिगन्तुं¹⁴ शक्यत इति प्रमाणाभावादार्थाधिगमाभावे
 सति¹⁵ कुतो भवतो ऽयं¹⁶ सम्यग्निश्चय¹⁷ इति न युक्तमेतद् अनु-

¹ P: pare codayanti. The scribe wrote *pari*° but then erased the medial *i* to change *pari* to *pare* (*pare* may represent a deliberate change).

² Q: om. ³ Q: om.; B, J, L: iyaṃ ⁴ D: °jā; J, N: °jyo; L: pramāṇa-kro ⁵ P: Ø; B, J, L: niścaye; D: niśca uya ⁶ P: Ø; L: pramāṇajaḥ || tatra yaḍi pramāṇaja ⁷ P: Ø; L: iṣyata ⁸ P: tadevaṃ; Q: om.; D: tadadaṃ; Tib: n.e. tadā ⁹ P: vā(kt)+[1]; L: vektavyaṃ ¹⁰ B, J, L: °ni; D: kiṃciṣayāṇi ¹¹ B, D, J, L: °tā ¹² Tib: ci bdag las skyes pa zhig gam | gzhan nam gnyi ga 'am rgyu med pa las yin zhes bya ba ∴ kiṃ svata utpannāni kiṃ parata ubhayato 'hetuto veti ¹³ J: n ¹⁴ J: adhigantu ¹⁵ Tib: tshad ma med pas don rtogs pa yang med na ∴ pramāṇābhāvād arthādhigamābhāve sati ¹⁶ P: Ø; B, D, J, L: om.; PsP_L: om. bhavato; Tib: khyod kyī. The lack of *bhavato* in the paper mss may be due to an eyeskip from °to of *kuto* to °to of *bhavato*. The missing part of P's line of writing might allow for *bhavato*. ¹⁷ P: Ø; Q: om.; Tib: 'di. Q's loss of 'yam may have occurred when Q's scribe's eye skipped from *yam* to *sam* of *samyag*° (the *akṣara mīya* is written as a conjunct). Although *avagrahas* occur less frequently in the palm-leaf mss than in the paper mss, there is a slightly unusual *daṇḍa* with a thick middle preceding *samyag*° in Q which may represent the misinterpretation of an *avagraha* (Q reads *bhavataḥ | samyag-ni*°). ¹⁸ P: Ø; D: samyakaniśyaya; J: °niścaye

त्पन्ना¹ भावा इति। यतो वायं² निश्चयो भवतो³ ऽनुत्पन्ना भावा
 इति भविष्यति। तत एव ममापि⁴ सर्वभावाः⁵ सन्तीति। यथा⁶ L16v
 चायं⁷ ते निश्चयो⁸ ऽनुत्पन्नाः सर्वभावा⁹ इति। तथैव¹⁰ ममापि¹¹ P10v
 सर्वभावोत्पत्तिर्¹² भविष्यति। अथ ते नास्त्य् अयं¹³ निश्चयो
 5 ऽनुत्पन्नाः¹⁴ सर्वभावा इति। तदा स्वयमनिश्चितस्य परप्रत्यायना- B17v
 सम्भवाच्¹⁵ छास्त्रारम्भवैयर्थ्यम्¹⁶ एवेति¹⁷ सन्त्य् अप्रतिषिद्धाः¹⁸
 सर्वभावाः¹⁹ ॥

इति॥

उच्यते – यदि कश्चिन्²⁰ निश्चयो नामास्माकं²¹ स्यात्। स प्रमाण-
 10 जो²² वा स्यादप्रमाणजो²³ वा। न²⁴ ब्रूति। किं कारणम्। इहानिश्च-

¹ P: Ø; B, J, L: °no; PsPL: anīṣpannā ² P: vācāyaṃ; Q: nāyaṃ; B, J, L: cāyaṃ ³ B, J, L: bhavetā ⁴ P: Ø; B, J, L: mayāpi; D: mamāyi
⁵ P: Ø; D: °bhāvā; L: dv(?)ibhāvāḥ ⁶ J: tathā ⁷ D: vāyaṃ; L: cāya
⁸ L: śvayo ⁹ P: sarvadharmā; B, D, J, L: sarvadharmā; PsPL: sarva-
 dharmā; Tib: dngos po thams cad. The citation in PsP Tib has been
 directly translated from PsP Sanskrit, i.e., was not, like the majority
 of the citations in the PsP, copied in from a pre-existing Tibetan trans-
 lation of the source work. ¹⁰ L: tathaica ¹¹ L: sasāpi ¹² D:
 °bhāvātṣṭi; J: °patti; L: rvabhāvātṣṭi ¹³ P: Ø; B, D, J, L: om.
 ayaṃ; Tib: 'di ¹⁴ P: Ø; B, J, L: °nā ¹⁵ P: Ø; B, D, J, L: paraprā-
 tyayanā° ¹⁶ P: Ø; D: °rambhavayathām ¹⁷ L: aveti ¹⁸ Q: °si-
 ddhāḥ; B: °dhā; J, L: apratiddhā ¹⁹ L: sarvabhāṣā ²⁰ D: kaści
²¹ J, L: nāsmākaṃ; conj. by LVP: nā[mā]smākaṃ ²² D: °jā ²³ B,
 D, J, L: °jā ²⁴ D: ra

- D9v यसम्भवे¹ सति स्यात् तत्प्रतिपक्षस्² तदपेक्षो³ निश्चयः⁴ । यदा ब⁵
 अनिश्चय⁶ एव तावदस्माकं नास्ति । तदा कुतस् तद्विरुद्धो⁷ निश्चयः
 स्यात् सम्बन्धन्तरनिरपेक्षत्वात्⁸ । खरविषाणस्य⁹ ह्रस्वदीर्घतावत् ।
 यदा चैवं¹⁰ निश्चयस्याभावः । तदा कस्य¹¹ प्रसिद्ध्यर्थ¹² प्रमाणानि PsP_L 57
 Q9v परिकल्पयिष्यामः¹³ । कुतो¹⁴ वैषां¹⁵ सङ्ख्या लक्षणं¹⁶ विषयो¹⁷ वा¹⁸ 5
 भविष्यति¹⁹ स्वतः परत उभयतो ऽहेतुतो²⁰ वा समुत्पत्तिर्²¹ इति
 J21r सर्वम्²² एतन्²³ न वक्तव्यमस्माभिः ॥

¹ Q: ihaniścaya°; B, J: ihāniścayasebhāve; D: ihāniścayasambhava; L: ihāniścayasabhave ² P: pratipakṣyas; B: tatpratipekṣas ³ Q: tadāpekṣo; B, J, L: °śā; D: tadaprakṣā ⁴ Tib adds *yang*: de'i gnyen por gyur pa'i nges pa yang ⁵ B, J, L: sv; Tib: n.e. tu ⁶ Q: aniścaya ⁷ P: ⊗; B: teviruddhā; D: tadviruddhā; J: tavidriddhā; L: tavidriddhāviruddhā; PsP_L: tadviruddhāviruddho. LVP (PsP_L 56, n. 4) notes that Tib suggests *tadviruddho*: Tib: de dang 'gal ba. Stcherbatsky (1927: 136, n. 4) emends to *tadviruddho*. ⁸ P: ⊗; Q: saṃbandhyantarapekṣatvāt; B, J, L: sabandhya°; Tib: 'brel pa can gzhan la ma ltos pa'i phyir ⁹ P: ⊗; B: kharavikhāṇasya ¹⁰ P: vain; Tib: n.e. ca ¹¹ B: kasya tadā ¹² B, L: °tha; D: pratiddhyartham; J: prasiddhārtha ¹³ P: (pa)ri[1]yiṣyāmaḥ; D: parikatthayiṣyāmaḥ ¹⁴ D: bhavo; Tib: grangs dang mtshan nyid dang yul dang | bdag gam gzhan nam gnyi ga 'am rgyu med pa las skye zhes bya bar yang ga la 'gyur te ∴ kuto vaiṣāṃ saṅkhyā lakṣaṇam viṣayo vā bhaviṣyati svataḥ parata ubhaya-to 'hetuto vā samutpattir iti ¹⁵ B, J, L: caiṣāṃ ¹⁶ D: lekṣaṇam ¹⁷ B, D, J, L: viṣayā ¹⁸ P, Q: om. ¹⁹ B, J, L: hayiṣyati ²⁰ Em. following LVP: 'hetuto. P, Q: om. 'hetuto; B, D, J, L: om. 'hetuto; Tib: rgyu med pa las ²¹ D: mamutpattir; L: emu | tpattir ²² D: sa-vaṃm ²³ J, L: ebhan

§84. यद्येवं निश्चयो नास्ति भवतः¹ कथं पुनर्² इदं³ निश्चितरूपं
वाक्यम्⁴ उपलभ्यते⁵ भवताम्⁶ – न स्वतो⁷ नापि⁸ परतो न द्वाभ्यां
नाप्यहेतुतो⁹ भावा¹⁰ भवन्तीति¹¹ ।

उच्यते¹² – निश्चितम्¹³ इदं¹⁴ वाक्यं¹⁵ लोकस्य स्वप्रसिद्धयैवोप-
5 पत्त्या¹⁶ नार्याणाम्॥

§85. किं¹⁷ खल्व्¹⁸ आर्याणाम् उपपत्तिर्¹⁹ नास्ति ।

केनैतद् उक्तम्²⁰ अस्ति²¹ वा नास्ति²² वेति²⁴ । परमार्थो ह्य²⁵ आर्यस्
तूष्णीभावः²⁶ । ततः कुतस् तत्र प्रपञ्चसम्भवो यत²⁷ उपपत्तिर् अनु-

¹ P: (bh)avā(t)ā(h); B, D: sarvataḥ; J, L: sarvata; PsP_L: sarvataḥ; Tib: khyod la ² P: Ø; D: pranar; L: puna ³ P: Ø; L: ditam ⁴ Q: vā-
hyam ⁵ B, J, L: upalabhate ⁶ P: bhavatā(m); B, J, L: bhavato; Tib: khyed cag gi (*khyod la* was used as the equivalent for *bhavataḥ*). *bha-
vatām* at PsP_L 57.4 must represent a silent correction made by LVP on
the basis of Tib or be the result of a scribal error that entered L's
tradition (the two mss used by LVP in addition to L both descend
from J, which attests *bhavato*). ⁷ P: Ø; D: svaṭī ⁸ P: Ø; D: nāmpi
⁹ B, D, J, L: °tā ¹⁰ B, J, L: bhāvyabhavantīti ¹¹ Tib: n.e. bhavanti
¹² B, J, L: ucya ¹³ L: iścitam ¹⁴ D: īdam ¹⁵ P: vākya
¹⁶ Em. following LVP: svaprasiddhayaivopapattyā. P: svaprasiddha-
yevopapattyā; Q: svapraddhayai°; B, J, L: svaprasiddheyamcopapa-
attyā; D: °yaivāpayattyā ¹⁷ D, J: ki ¹⁸ D: bhūlv; Tib: n.e. khalu
¹⁹ D: apapattir; J, L: °tti ²⁰ B, J, L: ustam ²¹ D: atti; L: | sti
²² L: om. ²³ L: om. ²⁴ P: ceti; B, J, L: ceti ²⁵ J: āryam; conj. by
LVP: āry[āṇam]; Tib: 'phags pa rnam kyī don dam pa ÷ paramārtho
hy āryas ²⁶ Q: tūṣṇīmbhāvas; B, D: tuṣṇībhāvas; J, L: bhūṣṇībhā-
vas; PsP_L: tūṣṇīmbhāvah. ²⁷ B, D, J, L: yad; PsP_L: yad; Tib: gang la.
yataḥ is the conjunction usually employed by Candrakīrti in such
constructions.

पपत्ति¹ वा स्यात्॥

§86. यदि ह्य आर्या² उपपत्तिं³ न⁴ वर्णयन्ति केन⁵ खल्विदानीं⁶
परमार्थं⁷ लोकं बोधयिष्यन्ति॥

L17r न खल्व् आर्या⁸ लोकसंव्यवहारेणोपपत्तिं⁹ वर्णयन्ति। किं तु लोकत
एव या प्रसिद्धोपपत्तिः¹⁰ तां¹¹ परावबोधार्थम्¹² अभ्युपेत्य¹³ तयैव¹⁴ 5
B18r लोकं¹⁵ बोधयन्ति¹⁶। यथैव¹⁷ हि विद्यमानाम्¹⁸ अपि शरीरा-
शुचितां¹⁹ विपर्यासानुगतां²⁰ रागिणो²¹ नोपलभन्ते²² शुभाकारं
चाभूतम्²³ अध्यारोप्य²⁴ परिक्रिश्यन्ते²⁵। तेषां वैराग्यार्थं²⁶ तथागत-
निर्मितो²⁷ देवो²⁸ वा शुभसज्जाया²⁹ प्राक्³⁰ प्रच्छादितान्³¹ काय-
दोषान्³² उपवर्णयेत् – सन्त्य³³ अस्मिन् काये³⁴ केशा इत्यादिना³⁵ 10
ते च तस्याः³⁶ शुभसज्जाया³⁷ विगमाद्³⁸ वैराग्यम्³⁹ आसादयेयुः⁴⁰। PsPL 58

1 J: aṇu° 2 P: ā+yā; D: āya; J: āṛṣā 3 D: upetṭiṃ 4 P: n.; D: ne
5 Q: ke 6 L: °nī 7 J, L: °tha 8 J: āyā 9 D: lokasaṃvyavahāro-
ṇopapattiṃ 10 D: prasiddhāpa° 11 Tib: de dag ∴ tām, possibly
because tām was understood to represent a collection of reasonings
12 B: pravabo°; J, L: pavabodhārtham 13 D, L: atyuyetya 14 B, J,
L: mamaiva 15 B: laukaṃ 16 D: byādhayanti 17 D: yathiva;
Tib: n.e. eva, n.e. hi 18 B: °māṇām 19 L: śarirā° 20 D: vipaya-
sminu(?)setā 21 J: rāgino 22 P: nopalabhyante; D: nāmapalabha-
nte 23 B, J, L: adhyāroṣya 24 L: pariklisya 25 B: vairāgyā-
nām; D: vairoṇyārtham; J: vairāgyārṇ(?)ā; L: vairāgyārām 26 B, J,
L: °ta; D: °nirmītā 27 B, D, J, L: devā 28 B, J, L: °śubha° 29 D:
prāka 30 L: chādītān 31 B, D, J, L: kāmadoṣa°; Tib: lus kyi skyon
32 D: santv 33 B, L: kāya 34 B, J, L: dinā; conj. by LVP: [ityā]di-
na; Tib: zhes bya ba la sogs pas 35 B, J, L: tasyā 36 B, J, L: °yām
37 B, J, L: viṣamā; conj. by LVP: vimuktā; Tib: bral pas 38 D: verā-
gyam 39 L: °yeṣuḥ

- एवम् इहाप्य¹ आर्यैः² सर्वथाप्यनुपलभ्यमानात्मकं भावानाम्³
 अविद्यातिमिरोपहतमतिनयनतया⁴ विपरीतं स्वभावमध्यारोप्य J21v
 क्वचिच्⁵ च⁶ कश्चिद्⁷ विशेषमतितरां परिक्लिश्यन्ति पृथग्जनाः⁸ । तान्
 इदानीम्⁹ आर्यास्¹⁰ तत्प्रसिद्धयैवोपपत्त्या¹¹ परिबोधयन्ति – यथा¹²
 5 विद्यमानस्य घटस्य¹³ न मृदादिभ्य¹⁴ उत्पाद इत्य् अभ्युपेतम्¹⁵ ।
 एवम् उत्पादात्¹⁶ पूर्व¹⁷ विद्यमानस्य¹⁸ घटस्य विद्यमानत्वान्¹⁹
 नास्त्य्²⁰ उत्पाद²¹ इत्य् अवसीयताम्²² । यथा च²³ परभूतेभ्यो²⁴
 ज्वालाङ्गारादिभ्यो²⁵ ऽङ्कुरस्योत्पत्तिर्²⁶ नास्तीत्य् अभ्युपेतम्²⁷ । एवं
 विवक्षितेभ्यो²⁸ ऽपि बीजादिभ्यो²⁹ नास्तीत्य् अवसीयताम्³⁰ ॥
 10 §87. अथापि स्यात् – अनुभव एषो ऽस्माकम्³¹ इति ।

¹ D: ihāryy; Tib: de bzhin du 'di na so so'i skye bo dag kyang ÷ evam
 ihāpi ... prthagjanāḥ ² D: āyāih; J: āyāih; L: aryāih ³ D: bhāvā-
 vām ⁴ Q: °hatamati | nayanatayā ⁵ D: kvaci ⁶ P: ye; Q: yo; D:
 pra; Tib: rang bzhin ... dang | 'ga' zhig tu khyad par 'ga' zhig lhag
 par sgro btags nas ⁷ P: kecid; D: kaicid; L: kañci ⁸ D: °janā
⁹ B, J, L: īdānīm ¹⁰ D: āyāyais ¹¹ P: tatpraśiddhyaivopapattyā; Q:
 °siddhayevo° (yai has been erased and replaced with ye); B: tatprasi-
 ddhayevo°; J, L: tatprasiddhayecopa° ¹² Tib: n.e. yathā ¹³ D:
 ghaṭasva ¹⁴ B, D, L: mṛdāditya ¹⁵ Q: abhyupeyam; B: upetam; D:
 atyupetam; J: utyupetam; L: aṭhyupetam ¹⁶ P: utpādānu; B, J, L:
 utpādā ¹⁷ Q: pūrvva ¹⁸ Tib: yod pa la yang ¹⁹ J: °tvā ²⁰ J:
 sty ²¹ D: atpāda ²² P: avaśīyatām; L: avasoyatām ²³ Q: om.; L:
 va ²⁴ D: pala°; L: °tetyo ²⁵ B, J, L: jvālāmṛgādibhyo ²⁶ D:
 dūṃkurasyātpatti; L: 'ṅkurasyātpattir ²⁷ B: atyu°; D: atyupatam
²⁸ J: vikṣitebhyo ²⁹ L: bāmjādibhyo ³⁰ P: avaśīyatām ³¹ Tib:
 'di ni kho bo cag gis nyams su myong ba yin ÷ anubhava eṣo 'smā-
 kam

P11r एतदप्ययुक्तम्। यस्माद्¹ अनुभव एष² मृषानुभवत्वात्³ तैमिरिक-
द्विचन्द्राद्यनुभववद्⁴ इति। ततश्च⁵ चानुभवस्यापि साध्यसमत्वात् तेन
प्रत्यवस्थानं⁶ न युक्तमिति⁷ ॥

L17v §88. तस्माद्⁸ अनुत्पन्ना भावा इत्य् एवं⁹ तावद् विपरीतस्व-
रूपाध्यारोपप्रतिपक्षेण¹⁰ प्रथमप्रकरणारम्भः¹¹ । इदानीं¹² कचिद् यः⁵
कश्चिद्¹³ विशेषो ऽध्यारोपितः¹⁴ । तद्विशेषापाकरणार्थं¹⁵ शेषप्र-
करणारम्भो¹⁶ गन्तृगन्तव्यगमनादिको¹⁷ ऽपि निरवशेषो विशेषो¹⁸

¹ Q: yasmā; Tib: 'di ltar nyams su myong ba ni brdzun pa'i don can yin ÷ yasmād anubhava eṣa mṛṣā ² L: eva eṣa ³ D: °tvot ⁴ P: °dvicandrādyannabhavavad; B, L: °anubhavat; J: °dvicendrāghanubhavat; conj by LVP: °anubha[va]vad; Tib: n.e. ādi ⁵ Tib: n.e. ca ⁶ J: pratyasthānam ⁷ Tib: zhes de dag la grags pa nyid kyis khong du chud par mdzad pa yin no, i.e., Tib translates *iti* and then the words *tān tatprasiddhayaiva paribodhayanti*, which occur in the earlier Sanskrit sentence that sets forth, using the example of a pot, the proof of non-arising from self. *upapattiyā* of the Sanskrit sentence has not been translated. ⁸ Tib: de'i phyir dngos po rnam skye ba med pa yin no || de ltar re zhig de'i rang bzhin phyin ci log lhag par sgro btags pa'i gnyen poṣ rab tu byed pa dang po brtsams pa yin no ÷ tasmād anutpannā bhāvā ity evaṃ tāvad viparītasvarūpādhyāropa-pratipakṣeṇa prathamaprakaraṇārambhaḥ ⁹ D: avaṃ ¹⁰ B, J: °ā-dhyāroyapra°; D: °ādhyārāpapa°; L: viparītatasvarūpādhyārāyapratipakṣeṇa ¹¹ D: °prakaraṇācambha; J: prathamakaraṇārambhaḥ; L: prathamaprakaraṇārambhaḥ ¹² L: idr(?)ānī; Tib: de nas ÷ idānīm ¹³ J, N: kacid ¹⁴ L: dhyāropi | tas ¹⁵ B: °viśeṣāprākaraṇārtham ¹⁶ B, J: śeṣaprakaraṇārtham śeṣaprakaraṇārambhaḥ; L: śeṣaprakaraṇārtham śeṣaprakaraṇārambhaḥ ¹⁷ D: ganty(?)gantavya° ¹⁸ Q: om.; D: viśeṣā

नास्ति प्रतीत्यसमुत्पादस्येति¹ प्रतिपादनार्थम्² ॥

§89. अथ स्यात् – एष एव प्रमाणप्रमेयव्यवहारो³ लौकिको B18v
ऽस्माभिः⁴ शास्त्रेणानुवर्णित⁵ इति।

तदनुवर्णनस्य⁶ तर्हि फलं वाच्यम्⁷ ॥ J22r

PsPL 59 §90. कुतार्किकैः⁸ स नाशितो⁹ विपरीतलक्षणाभिधानेन। तस्या-
स्माभिः सम्यगलक्षणम्¹⁰ उक्तमिति चेत्।

एतदप्युक्तम्। यदि हि¹¹ कुतार्किकैर्¹² विपरीतलक्षणप्रणयनकृत¹³
लक्ष्यवैपरीत्यं¹⁴ लोकस्य¹⁵ स्यात्। तदर्थं प्रयत्नसाफल्यं¹⁶ स्यात्। न D10r
चैतदेवमिति व्यर्थ¹⁷ एवायं प्रयत्न¹⁸ इति ॥

¹ Q: prafītyasamutpādasyaiva (Tib n.e. eva); L: °syati; Tib: n.e. iti

² D: °tha ³ B, J, L: °prameyamvyavahāra ⁴ D: °bhi ⁵ D: śśā-
streṇā°; J, L: °vaṇita ⁶ L: tadanuvarṇ(?)asyā ⁷ B, J, L: vākyaṃ

⁸ Tib: rtog ge pa dag gyis ∴ kutārkikaiḥ. Tib adds an interpreted in-
strumental: rtog ge pa dag gyis ... de brlag par byas baṣ ... ⁹ D: °tā;

L: °tau ¹⁰ D: samyakalakṣaṇam ¹¹ Q: om.; Tib: n.e. hi ¹² D:
kumālike ¹³ P: °naṃ kṛtaṃ; Q: °praṇayaṃ kṛtaṃ; D: °lakṣaṇa-

praṇaṃyanaṃ kṛtaṃ; J, L: °naṃ kṛtaṃ; PsPL: °naṃ kṛtaṃ. Tib: gal te
'jig rten la rtog ge ngan pas mtshan nyid phyin ci log brjod pas byas
pa'i mtshon bya phyin ci log yod par 'gyur na ni. Vaidya (1960b:
20.15) emends silently to °praṇayanāt kṛtaṃ. See Translation note.

¹⁴ P: na lakṣye vaiparītyaṃ; B: lakṣā(?)vai°; J: lakṣavai° ¹⁵ L: loka

¹⁶ J: prayakṣāphalyaṃ ¹⁷ D: vyartham ¹⁸ B, J, L: prayatnam

§91. अपि¹ च यदि² प्रमाणाधीनः³ प्रमेयाधिगमस्⁴ तानि प्रमाणानि
केन परिच्छिद्यन्त इत्यादिना विग्रहव्यावर्तन्या⁵ विहितो दोषः।
तदपरिहारात्⁶ सम्यग्लक्षणद्योतकत्वमपि नास्ति॥

§92. किं च यदि स्वसामान्यलक्षणद्वयानुरोधेन⁷ प्रमाणद्वयमुक्तम्।
यस्य तल्⁸ लक्षणद्वयं⁹ किं¹⁰ तल्¹¹ लक्ष्यम्¹² अस्त्यथ नास्ति।⁵
यद्यस्ति तदा तदपरं¹³ प्रमेयम् अस्तीति¹⁴ कथं प्रमाणद्वयम्¹⁵। अथ
नास्ति लक्ष्यं तदा लक्षणमपि निराश्रयं नास्तीति कथं प्रमाणद्वयम्॥
वक्ष्यति हि –

लक्षणासम्प्रवृत्तौ¹⁶ च न लक्ष्यम्¹⁷ उपपद्यते¹⁸।

लक्ष्यस्यानुपपत्तौ च¹⁹ लक्षणस्याप्य²⁰ असम्भवः॥

10

इति॥

PsP_L 60

¹ Q: not available as a witness because fol. 10 is missing (see Yonezawa 2005b: 160). Fol. 9b ends with *prayatna iti* |. Fol. 11a resumes with *dhānam aduṣṭam iti*, i.e., it begins part-way through the compound *viśeṣaṇābhīdhānam* in the first sentence of PsP_M §102 (PsP_L 66.9). ² Q: Ø; D: yati ³ Q: Ø; B, J: °na; L: prasānādhāna ⁴ Q: Ø; D: prameyādhigamas; L: prame | yādhigamas ⁵ Q: Ø; D: °nyā ⁶ Q: Ø; D: °parihārāta; L: °parihārot ⁷ Q: Ø; D: svasāmānalakṣaṇa° ⁸ Q: Ø; D: ta; N: tam ⁹ Q: Ø; L: lakṣaṇamdvayaṁ ¹⁰ Q: Ø; J: ki ¹¹ Q: Ø; B, J, L: om.; D: ta; PsP_L: om. tal ¹² P: lakṣam; Q: Ø; J, L: lakṣam ¹³ P: param; Q: Ø ¹⁴ Q: Ø; D: ahīti ¹⁵ Q: Ø; D: pranānadvayaṁ ¹⁶ Q: Ø; B, J, L: lakṣaṇāsamvṛttau ¹⁷ Q: Ø; D: lakṣam ¹⁸ Q: Ø; D: upadyate ¹⁹ Q: Ø; D: va ²⁰ Q: Ø; J, L: lakṣaṇa°

§93. अथ¹ स्यात् – न लक्ष्यते ऽनेनेति² लक्षणम् । किं तर्हि ।
कृत्यल्युटो³ बहुलमिति कर्मणि ल्युटं कृत्वा लक्ष्यते तदिति
लक्षणम् ॥

एवम्⁴ अपि⁵ तेनैव⁶ तस्य⁷ लक्ष्यमाणत्वासम्भवाद्⁸ येन तल्⁹ L18r J22v
5 लक्ष्यते¹⁰ तस्य करणस्य कर्मणो ऽर्थान्तरत्वात्¹¹ स एव दोषः ॥

§94. अथ¹² स्यात् – ज्ञानस्य करणत्वात्¹³ तस्य च¹⁴ स्वलक्षणान्त-
र्भावाद्¹⁵ अयमदोष इति ।

¹ Tib: ci ste yang ÷ atha ² Q: Ø; J, L: 'naneti ³ P: kṛtyalyuṭor; Q: Ø; B: kṛtyapluṭo; D: kṛtyaṭo ⁴ Q: Ø; B, D, J, L: tena evam; Tib: n.e. tena ⁵ Q: Ø; D: āpi ⁶ Q: Ø; D: tanaiva; PsP_L: tenaitasya (i.e., without *eva* and with the following *tasya* understood as *etasya*); Tib: te nyid kyis ⁷ Tib: n.e. tasya ⁸ Q: Ø; J, L: lakṣamāṇa° ⁹ Q: Ø; D: yemana; PsP_L: yenaital; Tib: gang gis de ¹⁰ Q: Ø; D: lakṣate ¹¹ P: Ø; Q: Ø; D: 'rthāntecatvāt ¹² P: Ø; Q: Ø; J, L: athā ¹³ Q: Ø; J: karaṇat ¹⁴ Q: Ø; D: na ¹⁵ P: svalakṣaṇa°; Q: Ø

B19r उच्यते¹ – इह भावानाम्² अन्यासाधारणम्³ आत्मीयं यत्⁴ स्व-
रूपम्। तत् स्वलक्षणम्। तद्यथा पृथिव्याः काठिन्यम्⁵। वेदनाया
अनुभवः⁶। विज्ञानस्य विषयं⁷ प्रति विज्ञप्तिः। तेन⁸ हि तद्वान्⁹

¹ Q: Ø; B, J, L: om., but include in following dittography (see next note) ² Tib: re zhiḡ 'dir (*iḥa tāvat), n.e. bhāvānām. tāvat may have entered a Skt ms because the upper part of the line was damaged at this point. *bhā* would have been mistaken for *tā*, and the *ās* of *vā* and *nā*, which may have been written in superscript style, might not have been visible; *n* was then read or interpreted as *t* and the word read as *tāvat*. The damage may have led to *ma* being read as initial *a*, i.e., as the initial *a* of *anyāsādhāraṇam*. ³ Q: Ø; B: anyāsādhāraṇasya (followed by a dittography, which was evidently in ms κ, subsequently in ms λ, and as a result also passed on to mss J and L:) lakṣyamāṇatvāt saṃbhavād yena tal lakṣyate || tasya karaṇasya karmaṇo 'rthāntaratvāt sa eva doṣaḥ || atha syāt jñānasya karaṇatvāt tasya ca svalakṣaṇāntarbhāvād ayam adoṣa iti || ucyate || iḥa bhāvānām; J: as B, °lakṣyamāṇatvāsam° ... °svalakṣaṇāntarbhāvād ...; L: anyāsādhāraṇasya lakṣamāṇatvā sambhavād yana ta lakṣyate || tasya karaṇasya karmmaṇorthāntaratvāt sa eva doṣaḥ atha syāt jñānasya karaṇatvāt tasya ca svalakṣaṇāntarbhāvād ayam adoṣa iti || ucyate || iḥa bhāvānām ⁴ Q: Ø; D: mat ⁵ Q: Ø; J: kathinyaṃ; L: °ya ⁶ Q: Ø; B, J: anubhāvā; D, L: anubhāvā; PsP_L: viṣayānubhavo; Tib: myong ba. P: attests a following *yāvat*; *prthivī* has been assumed by P's scribe or an earlier scribe or scholar to represent the *rūpa skandha* and *yāvat* thus to be a necessary inclusion accounting for the lack of reference to the *sañjñā* and *saṃskāra skandhas*. Note, however, that the *saṃskāra skandha* is not assigned a specific characteristic in the AK, and is described in AK I.15ab merely as the *skandhas* different from the other four *skandhas*. Neither PsP Tib nor the paper mss attest *yāvat*, and its loss is difficult to explain paleographically. ⁷ Q: Ø; B, J, L: viṣamaṃ; PsP_L: viṣayaprativijñaptiḥ for viṣayaṃ prati vijñaptiḥ; Tib: rnam par shes pa'i yul so sor rnam par rig pa ÷ viṣayaṃ prati vijñaptiḥ. MA VI.203a: viṣayaṃ prati vijñaptiḥ. Cp. Li and Steinkellner 2008: 16, n. 7. ⁸ Q: Ø; D:

लक्ष्यत¹ इति कृत्वा। प्रसिद्ध्यनुगतां² च³ व्युत्पत्तिम्⁴ अवधूय कर्म-
साधनम्⁵ अभ्युपगच्छतां⁶ विज्ञानस्य च करणभावं प्रतिपद्यमा-
नेनेदम्⁷ उक्तं भवति – स्वलक्षणस्यैव⁸ कर्मता स्वलक्षणान्तरस्य
करणभावश्चेति। तत्र यदि विज्ञानस्वलक्षणं करणम्। तस्य
व्यतिरिक्तेन⁹ कर्मणा भवितव्यमिति स एव दोषः ॥

§95. अथ स्यात् – यत् पृथिव्यादिगतं¹⁰ काठिन्यादिकं¹¹ विज्ञान-
गम्यम्¹²। तत्¹³ तस्य कर्मास्त्य¹⁴ एव¹⁵ तच्¹⁶ च स्वलक्षणाव्यति-
रिक्तमिति।

एवं तर्हि विज्ञानस्वलक्षणस्य कर्मत्वाभावात् प्रमेयत्वं¹⁷ न स्यात्।
कर्मरूपस्यैव¹⁸ स्वलक्षणस्य¹⁹ प्रमेयत्वात्। ततश्च²⁰ द्विविधं प्रमेयं

J23r

tam ⁹ Q: Ø; B, J, L: tadvāna. Tib: des de mtshon par byed pas ∴
tena hi tadvān lakṣyata iti kṛtvā; LVP (cf. PsP_L 60, n. 6) interprets the
reading in his mss to be *tena hi tad vā na lakṣyate* and emends on the
basis of Tib to *tena hi tal lakṣyate*.

¹ Q: Ø; B: lakṣeta; D: lakṣata; J, L: lakṣete ² Q: Ø; B, J, L: prasi-
ddhānugatām; PsP_L: prasiddhānugatām; Tib: rab tu grags pa dang rjes
su 'brel pa'i ³ P, Q: Ø; D: va ⁴ P: Ø; Q: Ø; D: vyatpattim ⁵ P:
Ø; Q: Ø; D: kerma° ⁶ Q: Ø; B: abhyupagacchati; D: atyuyagaccha-
tā; J, L: atyupagacchati; PsP_L: abhyupagacchati. See Translation note.
⁷ Q: Ø; D: °mānenadam; PsP_L: pratipadyamānenety ⁸ Q: Ø; D:
svalakṣamesyaiva; J, L: svalakṣaṇasauva ⁹ Q: Ø; D: vyatiriktamna
¹⁰ Q: Ø; J: °gata ¹¹ Q: Ø; D: kāṭhanyādikam; J: kāthi° ¹² Q: Ø;
B: vijñāgamyam, but written correctly in the dittography which fol-
lows; J: vijñānagaṣyam ¹³ P, Q: Ø; J, L: tet ¹⁴ P, Q: Ø; D: kartāsty
¹⁵ P, Q: Ø; D, J, L: ava; Tib: n.e. eva ¹⁶ P, Q: Ø; D: tec ¹⁷ Q: Ø; D:
pramaṇyatvam ¹⁸ Q: Ø; D: °syeva ¹⁹ Q: Ø; B, J, L: svalakṣaṇa-
doṣa, now repeat from beginning of paragraph (B: atha syād yat ...
karmarūpasyaiva svalakṣaṇasya, J: atha syād yat ... karmarūpasyaiva

L18v P11v स्वलक्षणं¹ सामान्यलक्षणं चेत्य² एतद् विशेष्य वक्तव्यम्³ – किञ्चित्
 स्वलक्षणं⁴ प्रमेयं⁵ यल्⁶ लक्ष्यते इत्येवं⁷ व्यपदिश्यते⁸ । किञ्चिद्⁹
 अप्रमेयं¹⁰ यल्¹¹ लक्ष्यते ऽनेनेति¹¹ व्यपदिश्यते इति । अथ तदपि
 कर्मसाधनम्¹² । तदा तस्यान्येन¹³ करणेन भवितव्यम्¹⁴ । ज्ञाना-
 B19v न्तरस्य¹⁵ करणभावपरिकल्पनायाम्¹⁶ अनिष्टादोषश्¹⁷ चापद्यते¹⁸ ॥ 5

§96. अथ मन्यसे – स्वसंवित्तिर्¹⁹ अस्ति । ततः²⁰ स्वसंवित्त्या
 ग्रहणात् कर्मतायां²¹ सत्यामस्त्य एव²² प्रमेयान्तर्भाव इति ।

svalakṣaḥlakṣaṇasya; L: atha syād yat ... evaṃ tarhi vijñānasvalakṣasya ... karmarūpasyaiva svalakṣaṇa(?)sya) ²⁰ Tib: n.e. ca

¹ Q: Ø; L: svalakṣamāṇaṃ ² Q: Ø; B: bhavaty; D: rasy; J: laty; L: raty ³ Tib: khyad par 'di tsam zhig brjod par bya dgos (*etāvad viśeṣaṇaṃ vaktavyam?) ∴ etad viśeṣya vaktavyam ⁴ Q: Ø; D: tyala-kṣaṇaṃ ⁵ Q: Ø; D: pramayaṃ; L: prameyaṃ prameya ⁶ P: ya(l); Q: Ø; D: ya ⁷ Q: Ø; D: ityavaṃ ⁸ Q: Ø; D: vyavapadiśyataṃ ⁹ Q: Ø; J, L: kiṃci ¹⁰ Q: Ø; B, J, L: prameyaṃ ¹¹ P: [2](ti); Q: Ø; D: 'nenaiti ¹² P, Q: Ø; D: karmesādhanaṃ ¹³ P, Q: Ø; L: syānye-na ¹⁴ P, Q: Ø; B, J, L: °vya ¹⁵ P, Q: Ø; D: jñānanterasya ¹⁶ Q: Ø; D: °parikalpyanāyām ¹⁷ P: Ø, medial *i* is visible; Q: Ø; B, J, L: anityādoṣaś; em. by LVP: *anavasthādoṣaś*. LVP (PsP_L 61, n. 4) reports that his mss read *tadānityādoṣa*. De Jong (1978: 34) tentatively suggests *aniṣṭā doṣāś cāpadyante* on the basis of D, referring to PsP_L 210.6 (correct to 210.16) where Tib attests *thug pa med par thal ba'i phyir* for PsP_L's *aniṣṭādoṣaprasaṅgāt*; mss P and D, however, both attest *aniṣṭhādoṣaprasaṅgāt* at their equivalents for PsP_L 210.16. Cf. *aniṣṭhā* earlier at PsP_M §24. ¹⁸ P, Q: Ø; B: copapadyate; D: cāpadyante ¹⁹ P: Ø; Q: Ø; J, L: svasavittir ²⁰ Q: Ø; D: tate ²¹ Q: Ø; D: °yā ²² Q: Ø; D: ava ²³ Q: Ø; D: prameyāntabhāva

PsPL 62

उच्यते – विस्तरेण मध्यमकावतारे स्वसंवित्तिनिषेधात्¹ स्वलक्षणं
 स्वलक्षणान्तरेण² लक्ष्यते³ तदपि स्वसंवित्तेति न युज्यते⁴। अपि⁵
 च तदपि नाम ज्ञानं स्वलक्षणव्यतिरेकेणासिद्धम्⁶ असम्भवाल्⁷
 लक्ष्याभावे⁸ निराश्रयलक्षणप्रवृत्त्यसम्भवात् सर्वथा⁹ नास्तीति¹⁰
 5 कुतः¹¹ स्वसंवित्तिः ॥

तथा चोक्तमार्यरत्नचूडपरिपृच्छायाम् –

स चित्तम् असमनुपश्यंश्¹² चित्तधारां¹³ पर्येषते¹⁴ – कुतः स्वि¹⁵

¹ Q: Ø; J: svasaṃvṛtti° ² P: Ø; Q: Ø; J: svalakṣyaṇā°; L: °ntaraṇa
³ P, Q: Ø; D: lakṣaṇaṃ ⁴ P, Q: Ø; D: yujyete ⁵ P, Q: Ø; J: tad api ||
 api ⁶ Q: Ø; B: °vyatirekenā°; D: °siddhyam; J: °vyatirekenāsi-
 ddhem; L: °vyatirakenāsiddhem; PsPL: °vyatirekeṇāsiddher; *LT:
 °vyatirekeṇāsiddham; Tib: rang gi mtshan nyid las tha dad par ma
 grub (la) ⁷ P: asaṃbhavā(l); Q: Ø; D: °asaṃbhava ⁸ Q: Ø; D:
 °bhavova ⁹ P, Q: Ø; J: sarvvatathā; L: sarvata ¹⁰ P, Q: Ø; L: thā-
 stīti ¹¹ P, Q: Ø; B, J, L: tataḥ ¹² Em. following LVP: asamanupa-
 śyaṃś. P: samanupaśyan; Q: Ø; B, D, J, L: samanū°; PsP Tib: yang
 dag par rjes su ma mthong bas. RCP Tib (P): yang dag par rjes su ma
 mthong bas. The sentence also appears at BCAP 392.4, where, unless
 LVP has silently emended the passage, *asamanupaśyaṃś* represents
 the ms reading, and at ŚiS 235.3, where the participle with alpha pri-
 vative is likewise attested. ¹³ Q: Ø; J: cittadhānām ¹⁴ Q: Ø; D, L:
 paryaśate ¹⁵ Em.: kutaḥ svit. P: kutaścīt; Q: Ø; B, D, J, L: kutaścīt.
 PsPL: kutaścīt. PsP Tib's *sems gang* (RCP Tib: *ga*) *las byung zhes* sup-
 ports the emendation. The corruption to *kutaścīt* may have required
 two steps: *kutaḥsvit* to *kutasvit*, the latter then “corrected” to *kutaścīt*;
 or possibly only one step: *svi* of *svid* was read/interpreted as *ści*,
 which caused the scribe to view the *vigraha* as a mistake and thus to
 drop it.

J23v तस्योत्पत्तिर्¹ इति। तस्यैव² भवति – आलम्बने³ सति⁴ चित्तम्
 उत्पद्यते⁵। तत्⁶ किम्⁷ अन्यद्⁸ आलम्बनम्⁹ अन्यच्⁹ चित्तमथ
 D10v यदेवालम्बनं तदेव चित्तम्। यदि तावद्¹⁰ अन्यद्¹⁰ आलम्बनम्¹¹
 अन्यच्¹² चित्तम्। तदा¹³ द्विचित्ता¹⁴ भविष्यति। अथ यदेवा-
 लम्बनं तदेव चित्तम्। तत्¹⁵ कथं चित्तं¹⁵ चित्तं समनुपश्यति। न
 च¹⁶ चित्तं¹⁷ चित्तं¹⁸ समनुपश्यति। तद्यथापि नाम तथैवासिधार-

¹ Em. following LVP: tasyotpattir. P: tasyautpattir; Q: Ø; B, J, L: tasyopapattir; D: tasyāpayattir ² Q: Ø; L: tasyaiva. BCAP citation: om. tasyaivaṃ bhavati; ŚiS citation attests tasyaivaṃ bhavati ³ Q: Ø; D: ālasbana ⁴ PsP Tib: dmigs pa yod pa las ÷ ālambane sati ⁵ P: sṛ(m)utpā[2]; Q: Ø ⁶ P, Q: Ø; L: tā; Tib: de yang 'di snyam du sems te ÷ tat ⁷ P, Q: Ø; L: kiṃm ⁸ P: [2]bāṇam; Q: Ø; B, J, L: ārambanam ⁹ P, Q: Ø; D: anya. ŚiS citation: om. anyac (and the following word) cittam. BCAP presents the sentence as: tat kim anyac cittam anyad ālambanam. PsP and RCP Tib: ci dmigs pa de yang gzhan la (RCP: |) sems de yang gzhan nam | ¹⁰ Q: Ø; L: enyad ¹¹ P: (c)ālambanam; Q: Ø ¹² Q: Ø; B, J, L: anya; D: anyā ¹³ The citations of the passage in ŚiS and BCAP attest *tad*. PsP Tib: gal te re zhig (RCP Tib om. re zhig) dmigs pa yang gzhan la sems kyang gzhan (RCP Tib adds a following *yin*) na ni sems de gnyis su 'gyur ro ¹⁴ Q: Ø; D: °to ¹⁵ Em. with de Jong (1978: 34): cittam. P: c+tt+nā; Q: Ø; D: cittamna; B, J, L: cittena. PsP and RCP Tib: sems kyis sems de ji lar mthong bar 'gyur. LVP (PsP_L 62, n. 6) retains the reading *cittena cittam* found in his mss, noting, however, that ŚiS 235.6 and BCAP 393.1 attest *cittam cittam*. ¹⁶ Q: Ø; J: om. ŚiS and BCAP: hi ¹⁷ Q: Ø; B: cittena ¹⁸ Q: Ø; L: citta

PsPL 63

या सैवासिधारा¹ न² शक्यते छेत्तुम्³। न तेनैवाङ्गुल्यग्रेण⁴ तद्⁵
 एवाङ्गुल्यग्रं⁶ शक्यते स्प्रष्टुम्⁷। एवमेव न तेनैव⁸ चित्तेन तदेव⁹
 चित्तं शक्यं द्रष्टुम्¹⁰। तस्यैवं¹¹ योनिशः¹² प्रयुक्तस्य या चित्तस्या-
 नवस्थानतानुच्छेदाशाश्वतता¹³ न कूटस्थता नाहेतुकी न प्रत्यय- L19r
 विरुद्धा न ततो नान्यतो न सैव¹⁴ नान्या तां चित्तधारां चित्तलतां
 चित्तधर्मतां चित्तानवस्थिततां¹⁵ चित्ताप्रचारतां¹⁶ चित्तादृश्यतां¹⁷
 चित्तास्वलक्षणतां¹⁸ तथा जानाति तथा पश्यति यथा¹⁹ तथतां B20r

¹ Q: Ø; D: sevāsīdhārā; J: vāsīdhārā ² Q: Ø; D: naḥ ³ Q: Ø; B: chetum; D: chatum. ŚiS and BCAP present: tadyathā na tayaivāsīdhārāyā saivāsīdhārā śakyate chettum ⁴ Q: Ø; D: tanaiva°; L: tenaivāgulya≈raṇa ⁵ Q: Ø; D: ted ⁶ Q: Ø; D: avā°; J: evāṃgulyaṃgram ⁷ Q: Ø; J: mraṣṭam. ŚiS and BCAP: spraṣṭum śakyate ÷ śakyate spraṣṭum ⁸ Q: Ø; D: tanaiva ⁹ Q: Ø; L: eva cittaena tad eva ¹⁰ Q: Ø; D: draṣṭumḥ; L: draṣṭu. The sentence appears in ŚiS as: naiva cittaena tad eva cittaṃ śakyate draṣṭum, and in BCAP as: evaṃ eva tenaiva cittaena tad eva cittaṃ draṣṭum. PsP and RCP Tib: sems de nyid kyis (RCP adds *kyang*) sems de nyid mthong bar mi nus so. The BCAP citation ends here; the ŚiS citation omits the rest of our text and continues with a later section. ¹¹ Q: Ø; D: tasyavaṃ ¹² P: yonisaḥ; Q: Ø ¹³ P: °sthātānocchedaśāśvatatā; Q: Ø; B, D: °sthānatānochedaśāśvatatā; J: °sthānatāmochedaśāśvatatā; L: °sthānatāmochadaśāśvatatā. PsP Tib and RCP Tib: gang sems mi gnas pa | chad pa ma yin pa | rtag pa ma yin pa | (RCP: om. |) ¹⁴ Q: Ø; B, J, L: syaiva; D: seva ¹⁵ Q: Ø; D: °sthitetām ¹⁶ P: cittapradhāratām; Q: Ø; D: cittāṃpracāratām; PsP Tib and RCP Tib: sems rgyu ba med pa ¹⁷ Q: Ø; L: cittadṛśyaṃtām ¹⁸ Em.: cittāśvalakṣaṇatām. P: cittasvalakṣaṇatām. Q: Ø; B, D, J: cittasvalakṣaṇatām; L: om.; PsPL: cittasvalakṣaṇatām; Tib: sems kyī rang gi mtshan nyid ¹⁹ Q: Ø; B: tathā

न¹ च² विरोधयति³ । तां⁴ च चित्तविवेकतां तथा प्रजानाति तथा
पश्यति । इयं कुलपुत्र⁵ चित्ते⁶ चित्तानुपश्यना⁷ स्मृत्युप-
स्थानमिति ॥

तदेवं नास्ति स्वसंवित्तिः⁸ । तदभावात् किं केन लक्ष्यते⁹ ॥

§97. किं च¹⁰ भेदेन वा तल्¹¹ लक्षणं¹² लक्ष्यात्¹³ स्यादभेदेन वा ।⁵
तत्र यदि तावद्¹⁴ भेदेन¹⁵ तदा लक्ष्याद्¹⁶ भिन्नत्वाद्¹⁷ अलक्षणवल्

¹ P: ca; Q: Ø ² P: na; Q: Ø; L: vi ³ Q: Ø; B, J, L: nirodhayati; PsP Tib: 'khrug par mi byed pa; RCP Tib: 'khrugs par mi byed pa. De Jong (1978: 34) suggests that Tib may be translating *vilodayati*; he refers to BHSD entry *virolayati* ("stirs, agitates"); LC (referring to Mvy 5339) gives *dkrugs pa* and *bsrubs pa* as translation equivalents for *virolitaḥ*. ⁴ Q: Ø; PsP Tib and RCP Tib: de bzhin nyid ji lta ba de bzhin du sems de dag dben pa nyid du rab tu shes | de bzhin du mthong ba ÷ tāṃ ca cittavivekatāṃ tathā prajānāti tathā paśyati. The **yathā tathatām* on which RCP Tib's *de bzhin nyid ji lta ba* is based (PsP Tib has been copied from RCP Tib) may have been a later addition (i.e., the phrase had not entered our ms tradition but had already been brought into the ms used for the RCP translation). The meaning of *yathā tathatām* could be seen as carrying over from PsP Skt's previous sentence. ⁵ Q: Ø; conj. by LVP: kulaputra [bodhisattvasya]; PsP Tib and RCP Tib: rigs kyi bu byang chub sems pa'i. I suspect that *bodhisattvasya* represents a later addition, i.e., one that had not entered our manuscript tradition but was already in the ms used for RCP Tib. ⁶ PsP Tib: sems la sems kyi rjes su lta ba'i dran pa nye bar gzhaḡ pa'i spyod pa yongs su dag pa'o zhes gsungs so ÷ citte cittānu- paśyanā smṛtyupasthānam iti. LVP (PsP_L 63, n. 7) reconstructs °*smṛ- tyupasthānacaryā pariśuddhā*. ⁷ Q: Ø; J: °paśyatānā ⁸ Q: Ø; D: svayaṃvittis ⁹ Q: Ø; B, D, J, L: lakṣate ¹⁰ Q: Ø; D: na ¹¹ Q: Ø; D: ta ¹² P: lakṣyaṇaṃ; Q: Ø; D: lakakṣaṇaṃ ¹³ Q: Ø; D: lakyata ¹⁴ Q: Ø; L: tāva ¹⁵ Q: Ø; L: hedena ¹⁶ Q: Ø; L: lakṣyā ¹⁷ Q: Ø;

PsP_L 64 लक्षणमपि न तल्लक्षणम्¹। लक्षणाच्² च³ भिन्नबादलक्ष्यवल्⁴ J24r
 लक्ष्यमपि न लक्ष्यम्। तथा लक्ष्याद्⁵ भिन्नबाल्⁶ लक्षणस्य⁷ लक्षण-
 निरपेक्षं⁸ लक्ष्यं⁹ स्यात्। ततश्च न¹⁰ तल् लक्ष्यं¹¹ लक्षणनिरपेक्षबात्
 खपुष्पवत्। अथाभिन्ने¹² लक्ष्यलक्षणे¹³। तदा लक्षणादव्यतिरिक्त-
 5 बाल्¹⁴ लक्षणस्वात्मवद् विहीयते लक्ष्यस्य लक्ष्यता। लक्ष्याच्¹⁵
 चाव्यतिरिक्तबाल्¹⁶ लक्ष्यस्वात्मवल्¹⁷ लक्षणमपि न लक्षणस्व-
 भावम्¹⁸ ॥

यथा चोक्तम्¹⁹ –

10 लक्ष्याल्²⁰ लक्षणम् अन्यच्²¹ चेत्²² स्यात् तल् लक्ष्यम्²³
 अलक्षणम्²⁴ ।
 तयोरभावो ऽनन्यत्वे²⁵ विषष्टं कथितं त्वया ॥

L: hinnatvād

¹ Q: Ø; D: talakṣaṇa ² Q: Ø; D: om. ³ Q: Ø; D: va ⁴ Q: Ø; D:
 °va ⁵ Q: Ø; L: lakṣyā ⁶ Q: Ø; D: bhanatvā; L: hinnatvāl ⁷ Q: Ø;
 J: lakṣyaṇasya ⁸ P: °nirapekṣyaṃ; Q: Ø; J: lakṣyaṃniranapekṣaṃ;
 L: lakṣyaṇaniranapekṣyaṃ ⁹ Q: Ø; D: lakṣaṃ ¹⁰ Q: Ø; D: na taś ca
 na ¹¹ Q: Ø; D: lakṣaṃ; L: om. ¹² Q: Ø; D: °bhinna ¹³ Q: Ø; J:
 lakṣaṇe ¹⁴ Q: Ø; D: °tvā ¹⁵ Q: Ø; D: °yā ¹⁶ Q: Ø; D, L: °tvā
¹⁷ Q: Ø; D: °va ¹⁸ P: kṣaṇasvabhāvaṃ; Q: Ø ¹⁹ P: yathoktaṃ; Q:
 Ø ²⁰ P: lakṣyā; Q: Ø; D: lakṣā ²¹ Q: Ø; D: anya ²² Q: Ø; D:
 ceda ²³ Q: Ø; B: syāl ²⁴ Q: Ø; B: om.; D: ta ²⁵ Q: Ø; B, J, L:
 lakṣaṇam ²⁶ Q: Ø; B: alakṣaṇam tat ²⁷ Q: Ø; B, J, L: 'nyatve;
 conj. by LVP: '[na]nyatve

P12r इति। न च विना तच्चान्यत्वेन¹ लक्ष्यलक्षणसिद्धाव्² अन्या गतिर्³
अस्ति॥

तथा च⁴ वक्ष्यति –

एकीभावेन⁵ वा सिद्धिर्⁶ नानाभावेन⁷ वा ययोः।

न विद्यते तयोः सिद्धिः कथं नु⁸ खलु विद्यते॥

5

इति⁹ ॥

§98. अथावाच्यतया¹⁰ सिद्धिर्¹¹ भविष्यतीति चेत्।

नैतदेवम्। अवाच्यता हि नाम परस्परविभागपरिज्ञानाभावे¹² सति
भवति। यत्र च विभागपरिज्ञानं नास्ति¹³ तत्रेदं¹⁴ लक्षणम् इदं¹⁴

L19v लक्ष्यम्¹⁵ इति विशेषतः परिच्छेदासम्भवे सति द्वयोर्¹⁶ अप्य्¹⁰
अभाव¹⁷ एवेति। तस्मादवाच्यतयापि नास्ति सिद्धिः॥

¹ P: tattvonyatvena; Q: Ø; J: tattvānvetvena; L: tattvānvatvena ² P: lakṣyakṣaṇasiddhāv; Q: Ø ³ Q: Ø; D: gativ ⁴ Q: Ø; D: ce ⁵ Q: Ø; J: ekībhāve ⁶ Q: Ø; D: siddhin ⁷ Q: Ø; D: ninābhāvena ⁸ P: na; Q: Ø; B, J, L: na; conj. by LVP: [nu]. P for PsP's citation of MMK II.21 (PsP_L 105.7-8); na; P also attests na in PsP's subsequent citation of II.21cd (PsP_L 105.10); D for PsP's citation of MMK II.21: nu; D also attests nu in PsP's subsequent citation of II.21cd; B for PsP's citation of MMK II.21: nu; B attests na in PsP's subsequent citation of II.21cd. Tib: de gnyis grub pa ji ltar yod ⁹ Q: Ø; L: itiḥ ¹⁰ Q: Ø; B, D, J, L: athāvācyateyā; PsP_L: atha vocyate [avācyata]yā; Tib: ci ste brjod du med pa nyid du ¹¹ Q: Ø; J: siddhi ¹² Q: Ø; D: °va ¹³ Q: Ø; D: tatradaṃ ¹⁴ Q: Ø; L: om. idaṃ ¹⁵ Q: Ø; L: om. ¹⁶ Q: Ø; D: dgrayor ¹⁷ Q: Ø; D: ebhāva

PsP_L 65 §99. अपि च यदि ज्ञानं¹ करणं विषयस्य परिच्छेदे कः कर्ता²। न
च³ कर्तारमन्तरेणास्ति करणादीनां सम्भवः⁴। छिदिक्रियायाम्⁵ B20v
इव। अथ⁶ चित्तस्य तत्र कर्तृत्वं⁷ परिकल्प्यते⁸। तदपि न युक्तं J24v
यस्माद्⁹ अर्थमात्रदर्शने¹⁰ चित्तस्य व्यापारो ऽर्थविशेषे¹¹ चैतसानाम्।

5 तत्रार्थदृष्टिर्¹² विज्ञानं तद्विशेषे¹³ तु चैतसाः¹⁴ ॥

इत्य् अभ्युपगमात्¹⁵। एकस्यां हि प्रधानक्रियायां¹⁶ साध्यायां¹⁷
यथास्वं गुणक्रियानिर्वृत्तिद्वारेणाङ्गीभावोपगमात्¹⁸ करणादीनां कर-

¹ P: vijñānam; Q: Ø ² Q: Ø; D: kattām; J: kattā ³ P: om. (a *ca* is, however, written in the margin as a correction to be added to P's text); Q: Ø ⁴ Q: Ø; B, J, L: saṃbheda; D: saṃbheva ⁵ Q: Ø; D: °kriyām; Tib: gcod pa'i bya ba bzhin ⁶ Q: Ø; D: athāpa ⁷ P: kaṭṭvām; Q: Ø ⁸ Q: Ø; B, J, L: parikalpate ⁹ Tib: 'di ltaṛ ÷ yasmāt ¹⁰ Q: Ø; B, J, L: arthamātradarthane; D: arthane; PsP_L: arthamātradarśanam; Tib: don tsam lta ba ni sems kyi bya ba yin la. The translators may have thought that *darśana* is, strictly speaking, the *vyāpāra*. ¹¹ Q: Ø; D: °viśeṣā; J, L: °viśeṣo; conj. by LVP: 'rthaviśeṣa[darśanam]; Tib: don gyi khyad par lta ba ni sems las byung ba rnam kyi bya ba yin te; Tib supplies what has been elided in Skt ¹² Em. following LVP and MAV: tatārthadrṣṭir. P: tatārthadrṣṭi; Q: Ø; B, D, J, L: tatārthadrṣṭi ¹³ Q: Ø; J: tadviśeṣe ¹⁴ Q: Ø; D: caitasyā ¹⁵ Q: Ø; D: atyupagamāt; L: utyupagamāt ¹⁶ Q: Ø; J: pradhāna° ¹⁷ Q: Ø; D: om. ¹⁸ P: guṇapradhānabhāvenāṅgābhāvopagamāt syāt; Q: Ø; B, J, L: °bhāvopagamanāt; D: °nirvṛtidvāreṇāṅgābhāvopagamanāt. The text of P has obviously been tampered with, the first compound having been changed to a *dvandva* in instrumental abstract: "as subsidiary [action] and principal [activity]." PsP Tib: ji lta bu'i bya ba phal pa sgrub pa'i sgo nas ... yan lag gi ngo bor gyur pa las. De Jong (1978: 34) views D's °āṅgābhāvopagamanāt as supported by Tib's yan lag gi ngo bor gyur pa las and emends to °āṅgabhāvopagamanāt;

णादिबम्¹। न चेहज्ञानविज्ञानयोर्² एका प्रधानक्रिया। किं तर्हि³।
अर्थमात्रपरिच्छित्⁴ विज्ञानस्य⁵ प्रधानक्रिया⁶। ज्ञानस्य⁷ बर्थविशे-
षपरिच्छेद इति नास्ति ज्ञानस्य⁸ करणबम्। नापि⁹ चित्तस्य कर्तृबम्।
ततश्च¹⁰ स एव दोषः॥

§100. अथ¹¹ स्यात् – अनात्मानः सर्वधर्मा इत्यागमात् कर्तुः⁵
सर्वथाभावात्¹² कर्तारमन्तरेणापि विद्यत एव¹³ क्रियादिव्यवहार
इति¹⁴।

एतदपि नास्ति । आगमस्य सम्यगर्थानवधारणात्¹⁵। एतच्च¹⁶
चोक्तं¹⁷ मध्यमकावतारे॥

PsPL 66

I assume that P and the other mss preserve the correct reading (D's *ā* more likely represents the vertical stroke for *ī* than an intrusion), and that Tib reflects the translators' mistake or interpretation (or Q's reading). The doubly expressed "becoming" in °*āṅgībhāvopagamāt* may be for the sake of emphasis.

¹ D: karaṇādatvaṃ ² Q: Ø; D: °yar ³ Q: Ø; J: tahy ⁴ Q: Ø; B: atha...chitti; J, L: °chitti ⁵ P: jñānasya; Q: Ø; B: vijñānatva. The text of P has been tampered with and *vijñānasya* switched with the following *jñānasya*, a change possibly influenced by the order of the components of the preceding *dvandva jñānavijñānayoḥ*. ⁶ Q: Ø; D: pradhāna ⁷ P: vijñānasya; Q: Ø; D: sya. See two notes earlier. Tib expands with *shes pa'i gtso bor gyur pa'i bya ba*. ⁸ P: vijñānasya; Q: Ø. The previous switch in P of *vijñānasya* and *jñānasya* demands that *vijñāna* be understood here as synonymous with the instrument *caitta/caitasa*. ⁹ Q: Ø; D: nu(?)pi ¹⁰ Tib n.e. ca ¹¹ Q: Ø; D: athā ¹² Q: Ø; B, D: sarvathā | abhāvāt; J: sarvathā (end of line) a-bhāvāt; L: sarvathā || abhāvāt ¹³ B: iti ¹⁴ Q: Ø; B: eva ¹⁵ Q: Ø; D: samāgarthā° ¹⁶ Q: Ø; D: eted; PsPL: etad ¹⁷ Q: Ø; B: api cok-taṃ; D: yoktaṃ; J, L: acoktaṃ; PsPL: evoktaṃ; Tib: 'di yang ... bstan

§101. अथापि स्यात् – यथा शिलापुत्रकस्य¹ शरीरं राहोः² शिर
इति शरीरशिरोव्यतिरिक्तविशेषणासम्भवे³ ऽपि⁴ विशेषणविशेष्य-
भावो⁵ ऽस्ति। एवं⁶ पृथिव्याः स्वलक्षणमिति स्वलक्षणव्यतिरिक्त-
पृथिव्यसम्भवे⁷ ऽपि भविष्यतीति।

- 5 नैतदेवमतुल्यत्वात्। शरीरशिरःशब्दयोर् हि बुद्ध्यादिपाण्यादिवत्⁸
सहभाविपदार्थान्तरसापेक्षताप्रवृत्तौ शरीरशिरःशब्दमात्रालम्बन-
बुद्ध्युपजनने⁹ जनः¹⁰ सहचारिपदार्थान्तरसाकाङ्क्ष¹¹ एव वर्तते –

J25r L20r

zin

¹ Q: Ø; B: śirā°; L: śibhāputra° ² Q: Ø; D: rāhāḥ ³ Q: Ø; B, D, J: °viśeṣeṇā° ⁴ Q: Ø; D: śi ⁵ Q: Ø; D: viśeṣaṇeviśeṣahāvo ⁶ Q: Ø; D: avam ⁷ Tib with *la sogs pa* after *sa*, appearing to have read °*pr-thivyādyasambhave* ⁸ Em. following LVP: buddhyā dipāṇyādivat. P: [2]dipāṇyādimat; Q: Ø; B, D, J, L: °ādimat. Tib: blo dang lag pa la sogs pa ltar ⁹ Em.: °mātrāmbanabuddhyupajanane. P: °mātrāmbano buddhyupajananaḥ; Q: Ø; B, J: °mātrāmbano buddhyupajananaḥ; D: °mātrāmbano °buddhyāpajanamaḥ; L: °mātrāmbano buddhyāpajananaḥ; PsP_L: °mātrāmbano buddhyupajananaḥ; Tib: lus dang mgo'i sgra tsam la dmigs pa'i blo skyes pa lta zhig. The emendation °*āmbanabuddhy*° is suggested by Tib's *dmigs pa'i blo*; P, B and J's reading are rejected because it is unusual to have *āmbana*, normally the attribute of a mental act, taken in reference to a person. Tib's *lta zhig* is, however, difficult to understand; LVP proposes an equivalence to °*ga zhig* and *la la zhig*. My emendation of the mss' text assumes an eyeskip from *na* of *upajanane* to *na* of *janah* which caused the dropping of °*ne ja*°. ¹⁰ Em.: janah. P: om. janah; Q: Ø; B, D, J, L: om. janah; PsP_L: om. janah ¹¹ P: °kāṅkṣā; Q: Ø; D: saavyāri°

B21r निराचिकीर्षया¹ शिलापुत्रकराहुविशेषणध्वनिना² लौकिकसङ्केतानु-
विधायिना प्रतिपत्तुः³ काङ्क्षाम् उपहन्तीति⁴ युक्तम्। इह तु काठिन्या-
दिव्यतिरिक्तपृथिव्याद्यसम्भवे⁵ सति न युक्तो विशेषणविशेष्यभावः ॥

§102. तीर्थिकैर्⁶ व्यतिरिक्तलक्ष्याभ्युपगमात्⁷ तदनुरोधेन⁸ विशेष-
णाभिधानम्⁹ अदुष्टमिति चेत्¹⁰ ।

PsP_L 67

नैतदेवम्¹¹ । न हि तीर्थिकपरिकल्पिता युक्तिविधुराः¹² पदार्थाः स्व-
समये ऽभ्युपगन्तुं¹³ न्याय्याः । प्रमाणान्तरादेर्¹⁴ अप्य¹⁵ अभ्युपगम-
प्रसङ्गात्¹⁵ ।

§103. अपि च पुद्गलादिप्रज्ञासिवत्¹⁶ स्वशरीरोपादानस्य¹⁷ शिलापुत्र-
कस्योपादातुर्¹⁸ लौकिकव्यवहाराङ्गभूतस्य¹⁹ विशेषणस्याविचार-

10

¹ Q: Ø; B: viśeṣaṇānamtarasabandha°; J, L: viśeṣaṇāntarasabandha°; D: °nirāvakīrṣayā. PsP_L: viśeṣaṇānantarasambandha°. Stcherbatsky (1927: 150, n. 4) corrects to *viśeṣaṇāntarasambandha*; he also emends *khyad par gzhaḡ* as found in Tib P, N and G (see PsP_L 66, n. 4) to the correct reading *khyad par gzhan* (attested in D and C).
² P: Ø; Q: Ø; B, J, L: śīrā°; D: śīloputrakalāhu° ³ P, Q: Ø; D: prati-
patuḡ; J: pratikartuḡ; L: pratiparttuḡ; PsP_L: pratikartuḡ; Tib: rtogs pa
po'i ⁴ P, Q: Ø; LVP: apahantīti; Tib: sel bar byed do zhes ⁵ Q: Ø;
L: °vyatiriktamprthi° ⁶ Q: Ø; J: tīrthikai ⁷ Q: Ø; D: vyatiriktāla-
kṣyātyupamāt; B, J: vyatiriktālākṣyā°; L: vyatiriktālākṣyātyupagamāt
⁸ Q: Ø; D: tadanurādhena ⁹ Q again available as a witness ¹⁰ P:
na ce+; D: nen; J: yat; L: pren ¹¹ P: Ø; J: aivaḡ ¹² Tib: rigs pa
dang 'gal ba dag (yuktiviruddhāḡ?) ÷ yuktividhurāḡ ¹³ P: Ø; B:
tyupagantum; D: 'tyupagantum; L: tyupagantam ¹⁴ Q: om.; Tib:
n.e. api ¹⁵ P: Ø; B, L: atyupa°; D: atyupagamaprasaṅgāḡ ¹⁶ P: Ø;
B, D, J, L: puṅgalādi° ¹⁷ Tib: n.e. sva. PsP_L: saśarīro°. LVP (cf.
PsP_L 67, n. 3) finds *sa*° and *sva*° in his manuscripts. ¹⁸ P: (śi)[1]-

प्रसिद्धस्य¹ सद्भावात्² शिरोपादानस्य³ च⁴ राहोर्⁵ उपादातुः सद्भा-
वाद् अयुक्तम्⁶ एतन् निदर्शनम्॥

§104. शरीरशिरोव्यतिरिक्तस्यार्थान्तरस्यासिद्धेस्⁷ तन्मात्रस्योप-
लम्भात्⁸ सिद्धमेव निदर्शनमिति चेत्⁹।

5 नैतद्¹⁰ एवम्¹¹। लौकिके¹² व्यवहार इत्थं विचाराप्रवृत्तेर्¹³ अवि-
चारतश्च¹⁴ च लौकिकपदार्थानामस्तिबात्। यथैव¹⁵ हि¹⁶ रूपादिव्य-
तिरेकेण¹⁷ विचार्यमाण आत्मा न¹⁸ सम्भवति। अपि च लोकसंवृत्या J25v
स्कन्धानुपादायास्यास्तिबम्। एवं राहुशिलापुत्रकयोर्¹⁹ अपीति
नास्ति निदर्शनसिद्धिः²⁰। एवं पृथिव्यादीनां यद्यपि काठिन्यादिव्य-
तिरिक्तं²¹ विचार्यमाणं²² लक्ष्यं नास्ति लक्ष्यव्यतिरेकेण²³ च लक्षणं²⁴

+(u)+raṇa(syo)pādātu+; B, J, L: śilāputrakasyapādātu; D: śilāputraka-
syāpādātu; PsP_L: śilāputrakasy[o]pādātur ¹⁹ J: lauki || kavyavarām-
ga°; L: lauki | kavya°

¹ Q: °āvicāraṃprasiddhasya; B, J, L: °syā ² L: sahāvāt ³ D: dra-
pādānasya; J: upānasya ⁴ D: pa; L: va ⁵ L: nāhor ⁶ P: a(yu)[2];
B, J, L: ayoktam; D: amektam ⁷ P: ∅; B, J, L: °vyatiritasvārthā°

⁸ P: ∅; B, J: °syoparaṃbhāt; L: °syāparaṃbhāt ⁹ P: ∅; D: ce

¹⁰ P: ∅; D: naivad ¹¹ P: ∅; Q: eva; D: eyaṃ ¹² Q: laukika; note
the later *laukike vyavahāre* (PsP_M §105 reply) as well as *laukiko vyav-*
ahārah (same reply). ¹³ J: vicārāprvrtter ¹⁴ B: avivārataś

¹⁵ Tib: n.e. eva ¹⁶ Tib: n.e. hi ¹⁷ P: ∅; B, L: °kena; D: °keśa; J:

°kana ¹⁸ D: ṇa ¹⁹ B, L: °śirā° ²⁰ D: darśanasiddhiḥ ²¹ P: ∅;

Q: kaṭhinya°; D: °vyaitiriktam ²² P: ∅; D: °ṇa ²³ B, J, L: °kena

²⁴ J: lakṣyaṇam

L20v निराश्रयम्¹ तथापि संवृतिर् एषेति² परस्परापेक्षामात्रया³ सिद्ध्या⁴
 सिद्धिं व्यवस्थापयां⁵ बभूवुर्⁶ आचार्याः। अवश्यं⁷ चैतद्⁸ एवम्
 B21v अभ्युपेयम्⁹। अन्यथा हि संवृतिर्¹⁰ उपपत्त्या¹¹ न वियुज्येत¹²। PsPL 68
 तदेयं¹³ तत्त्वम् एव¹⁴ स्यात्¹⁵ न संवृतिः। न चोपपत्त्या¹⁶ विचार्य-
 माणानां¹⁷ शिलापुत्रकादीनाम्¹⁸ एवासम्भवः¹⁹। किं²⁰ तर्हि। वक्ष्य- 5
 माणया²¹ युक्त्या²² रूपवेदनादीनाम्²³ अपि नास्ति सम्भव इति
 तेषाम्²⁴ अपि संवृत्या शिलापुत्रकादिवन्²⁵ नास्ति त्वम्²⁶ आस्थेयं

¹ B, J, L: eveti; Tib: 'di ni kun rdzob tu yod ÷ saṃvṛtir eṣā ² B: paraspārāpekṣayātrayo; J, L: paraspārāpekṣayātrayo; D: paraspārāmekṣyamātrayo; PsPL: paraspārāpekṣayā tayoh; Tib: phan tshun ltos pa tsam gyis. LVP (PsPL 67, n. 7) considers Tib's *ltos pa tsam gyis* to represent *apekṣāmātreṇa*. De Jong (1978: 35) emends to *paraspārāpekṣāmātratayā*, claiming that D reads *paraspārāmekṣyamātratayā*; he has, however, misread D's °mātrayo as °mātratayā. ³ Tib: phan tshun ltos pa tsam gyis grub pa'i sgo nas ÷ paraspārāpekṣāmātrayā siddhyā ⁴ P: Ø; B: °yā; J, L: vyavasthāyayām ⁵ D: babhūpur; J: babhūvūr; L: babhūvun ⁶ Q: avaśya ⁷ Tib: n.e. ca ⁸ D, L: atyu° ⁹ L: saṃvṛti ¹⁰ L: om. upapattiyā na viyujiyeta | tadeyam tattvam eva syāt, na saṃvṛtiḥ | ¹¹ P: viyujiyet; Q: viyujiyate; B, D, J: viyujiyet. Tib: de lta ma yin na kun rdzob 'thad pa dang ldan pa ma yin nam ÷ anyathā hi saṃvṛtir upapattiyā na viyujiyeta ¹² P: tadā; B, D, J: tadevam; PsPL: tad eva; Tib: des na 'di ¹³ B, J: evam ¹⁴ J: syātan ¹⁵ D: cāpapatyā; L: cāpapattiyā; Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁶ P: Ø; L: vicāryamāśānām ¹⁷ P: [1].(ā)putrakādīnām; B, J: śirā°; L: śirāputrakādīnā-≈yām ¹⁸ P: Ø; D: avā° ¹⁹ P: (kin); D: kīm ²⁰ P: Ø; D: vakṣya-māśayā ²¹ P: Ø; L: yukatyā ²² L: °vedanādīnām ²³ J: taśām ²⁴ P: śilāputrasyevā (ā sandhi with following *astitvam*); B, D, J, L: śilāpūtraka iva; LVP finds *śilāputraka iva* in his mss and conjectures, on the basis of Tib's *mchi gu la sogs pa, śilāputrak[ādivan]*. ²⁵ P: astitvam; B, D, J, L: astitvam; LVP, reading *astitvam* in his mss, con-

स्यात्। न चैतदेवम्¹ इत्य् असद्² एतत्³ ॥

§105. अथ स्यात् – किमनया सूक्ष्मेक्षिकया⁴। नैव⁵ हि वयं सर्वम्⁶ अमुं⁷ प्रमाणप्रमेयव्यवहारं⁸ सत्यमित्य् आचक्ष्महे⁹। किं तु लोक-प्रसिद्धिर्¹⁰ एषामुना न्यायेन व्यवस्थाप्यत इति।

5 उच्यते – वयमप्येवं ब्रुमः किम्¹¹ अनया सूक्ष्मेक्षिकया¹² लौकिके¹³ व्यवहारे ऽवतारिकया¹⁴। तिष्ठतु¹⁵ तावदेषा विपर्यासमात्रासादिता-
PsP_L 69 त्मभावसत्ताका¹⁶ संवृतिर्¹⁷ मुमुक्षूणां¹⁸ मोक्षावाहककुशलमूलोप-

jectures *nāstitvam* on the basis of Tib P: de dag kyang mchi gu la sogs pa bzhin du kun rdzob tu yod pa ma yin pa nyid du khas blangs par 'gyur na (D, C: °yod pa yin pa nyid°).

¹ Q: caivam ÷ caitad evam; Tib: n.e. etat ² D: aṃsad ³ Q: etat | eṣā copādāyaprajñāptivyavasthā vistareṇa madhyamakāvatāre vihiteti tata eva paryanveṣyā; Tib: brten nas brtags par rnam par gzhag pa 'di yang dbu ma la 'jug pa las rgyas par bstan pas de nyid las yongs su btsal bar bya'o (cf. PsP_L 68, n. 4). This extra sentence represents yet another interpolated reference to the MA. See Translation note.

⁴ B, J, L: śūkṣme°; D: śūkṣmekṣikamā ⁵ D: nanaiva ⁶ Q: sarva; B, J, L: sarvata ⁷ Q: om.; B, J, L: om.; D: anum; PsP_L: sarvapramāṇa° (i.e., om. amum; *sarva* conjoined with the following compound); Tib: n.e. amum ⁸ B, J, L: apramāṇaprameyavyavahāraṃ (B, J and L's *ta* of *sarvata* followed by initial *a* are probably the results of an early misreading of the *akṣaras ma* and *mu* of *sarvaṃ amum*) ⁹ B:

āvakṣyahe; J: ācakṣyahe ¹⁰ D: lākapramiddhir ¹¹ L: kiṃm ¹² B: śū°; D: śūkṣametikayā; J: śūkṣmekṣikaśā ¹³ Q: laukika; D: laukikaṃ(?)vya°; PsP_L: laukika (compounded with following word) ¹⁴ D: 'vatācitayā ¹⁵ D: tiṣṭantu ¹⁶ J: °sattā; L: °mātrāsādityatma° ¹⁷ J: savṛtti; L: saṃvṛtti ¹⁸ P: mumukṣānām; B: mumukṣūṃmām; L: mumukṣūṇām

J26r चयहेतुर्¹ यावन् न² तच्चाधिगम³ इति। भवांस्⁴ ब⁵ एनां⁶ संवृति-
D11v परमार्थसत्यविभागदुर्विदग्धबुद्धितया⁷ क्वचिद् उपपत्तिम्⁸ अवतार्या-
न्यायतो नाशयति। सो ऽहं संवृतिसत्यव्यवस्थावैचक्षण्याल्⁹ लौ-
किक¹⁰ एव पक्षे स्थित्वा संवृत्येकदेशनिराकरणोपक्षितोपपत्त्यन्तरा-
न्तरम्¹¹ उपपत्त्यन्तरेण¹² विनिवर्तयन्¹³ लोकवृद्ध¹⁴ इव लोकाचारात् 5
परिभ्रश्यमानं¹⁵ भवन्तम्¹⁶ एव निवर्तयामि। नो¹⁷ तु संवृतिम्।
तस्माद्¹⁸ यदि लौकिको¹⁹ व्यवहारः। तदावश्यं लक्षणवल्²⁰ लक्ष्ये-
Q11v णापि²¹ भवितव्यम्। ततश्च²² च²³ स एव दोषः²⁴। अथ परमार्थः।

¹ B, L: mokṣovāhaka°; D: māḥṣā...mūlāpacamahetur; J: mokṣogaha-
ka° ² B: om. ³ B, J: tattvāvigama; D: tatvāvigama; L: tattvādiga-
ma ⁴ Q: ucyate bhavāms; J: bhavās ⁵ L: t ⁶ D: eṣām; J: anām;
PsP_L: etām; Tib: de ⁷ Q: saṃvṛtṭimpara°; D: °paramārtha | satya-
vi°; Tib: n.e. vibhāga; mi mkhas pas ∴ durvidagdhābuddhitayā ⁸ D:
uṣapattita ⁹ B: savṛti...vaicakṣyaṇyāl; D: °vaicakṣyaṇyā; J: °vaica-
kṣyaṇyāl; L: saṃvṛtisatyavāvasthāvaicakṣyaṇyāl ¹⁰ D: lokika
¹¹ Em. following LVP: saṃvṛtyekadeśanirākaraṇopakṣiptopapatty-
antarāntaram. P: saṃvṛtyekadeśanirākaraṇopakṣiptopapatyantarēṇa
(= eyeskip to following compound); Q: °kṣiptopattyā°; B: saṃvṛtṭye-
kadaśa°; D: saṃvṛttekadaśanirākaraṇopakṣiptāpayatyantarāntaram; J:
saṃvṛttekadaśa°; L: saṃvṛttekadaśavirākaraṇo°; Tib: thad pa gzhan ∴
[u]papattyantarāntaram ¹² P: see previous note ¹³ Q: nivarttayan
¹⁴ PsP_L: loka[m]vṛddha, but PsP_L 599: lokavṛddha. ¹⁵ Em. follow-
ing LVP: paribhraśya°; P: °bhrasāmānaṃ; Q: paribhrasya°; B, J, L:
paribhrasya°; D: parigrasya° ¹⁶ B, J, L: bhavatum; D: tum ¹⁷ D:
nā ¹⁸ D: tasyad ¹⁹ D: lokikā ²⁰ D: lakṣava ²¹ B, J, L: lakṣa-
ṇāpi; D: lakṣyaṇāpi ²² D: tabhaś ²³ Tib: n.e. ca ²⁴ D: dāṣaṭ

तदा लक्ष्याभावात्¹ लक्षणद्वयम्² अपि³ नास्तीति कुतः⁴ प्रमाण-
द्वयम्॥

L21r

§106. अथ⁵ – शब्दानाम्⁶ एवं क्रियाकारकसम्बन्धपूर्विका⁷ व्युत्प-
त्तिर्⁸ नाङ्गीक्रियते⁹ ।

5 तदिदम् अतिकष्टम्¹⁰ । तैर्¹¹ एव क्रियाकारकसम्बन्धप्रवृत्तैः¹² शब्दैर्¹³ भवान्¹⁴ व्यवहरति शब्दार्थं¹⁵ क्रियाकरणादिकं¹⁶ च नेच्छतीति ।
अहो बतेच्छामात्रप्रतिबद्धप्रवृत्तिता¹⁷ भवतः¹⁸ ॥

B22r

§107. यदा चैवं¹⁹ प्रमेयद्वयमव्यवस्थितम् । तदा सामान्यलक्षणा-
विषयत्वेनागमादेर्²⁰ नाप्रमाणान्तरत्वं ॥

¹ D: °vā ² P: lakṣaṇadvayasya (sandhi with following *api*; see next note); D: lakṣaṇadvarām ³ P: *api utpattir*. P's variant reading *lakṣa-ṇadvayasyāpi utpattir* would seem to be the result of interference; the arising of *lakṣaṇas* has not been part of the discussion. Tib: mtshan nyid gnyis kyang med pas ÷ lakṣaṇadvayam api nāstīti ⁴ D: kuṭaḥ ⁵ D: athaṃ ⁶ Q: eva ⁷ B: °sabandha°; J: kriyākarakasabandhapūvikā; L: kriyākarakasabapūrvikā ⁸ D: °tti ⁹ J: °krīyate ¹⁰ Q: iti | kaṣṭaṃ; D: atikathaṃ; Tib: shin tu dka' ÷ atikaṣṭaṃ ¹¹ D: aca ¹² B, L: °sabandha° ¹³ P: bhāvan ¹⁴ B, D, J, L: °rtha ¹⁵ L: kriyāṃkara° ¹⁶ B, J, L: °pravṛttito; D: catechāyātrapratibaddhapravṛttitā; PsP_L: °pravṛttito. Stcherbatsky (1927: 156, n. 1) and de Jong (1978: 35) also emend to *pravṛttitā*. ¹⁷ D: bhavataḥ | pravṛttitā bhavataḥ ¹⁸ J: caiva; Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁹ Em.: sāmānyalakṣaṇāviśayatvenāgamāder. P: sāmānyalakṣaṇaviśaya°; Q: sāmānyalakṣaṇaviśayatvenāgader; B, J, L: sāmānyalakṣaṇaviśayatvenāgamādi; D: sāmānyalakṣaṇaviśaya°. Tib: lung la sogs pa rang dang spyi'i mtshan nyid kyi yul can ma yin pa nyid kyi sgo nas. Em. by LVP: [sva]sāmānyalakṣaṇāviśayatvenāgamādīnām (final superscript *r* of °*āgamāder* has been read in the later mss as an *anusvāra* and has thus been interpreted as

P13r §108. किं च घटः प्रत्यक्ष इत्येवमादिकस्य लौकिकव्यवहारस्या-
सङ्गहाद्¹ अनार्यव्यवहाराभ्युपगमाच्² चाव्यापिता लक्षणस्येति³ न
युक्तम्⁴ एतत्॥

PsP_L 70

J26v §109. अथ स्यात् – घटोपादाननीलादयः⁵ प्रत्यक्षाः प्रत्यक्षप्रमाण-
परिच्छेद्यत्वात्⁶। ततश्⁷ च⁸ यथैव⁹ कारणे कार्योपचारं¹⁰ कृत्वा¹¹
बुद्धानां¹² सुख¹³ उत्पाद¹⁴ इति व्यपदिश्यते। एवं प्रत्यक्षनीलादि-
निमित्तको¹⁵ ऽपि घटः¹⁶ कार्ये¹⁷ कारणोपचारं¹⁸ कृत्वा प्रत्यक्ष इति
व्यपदिश्यते¹⁹ ॥

belonging to the *akṣara nā* of the next word). LVP conjectures [*sva*]*sāmānya*° on the basis of Tib's *rang dang spyi'i*. See Translation note. ²⁰ L: °tve; PsP_L: *pramāṇāntaratvaṃ*; Tib: *tshad ma gzhan nyid ma yin pa ma yin*. LVP (PsP_L 69, n. 3) notes the discrepancy between his text and Tib. See previous note.

¹ D: *lokīkavyavahārasyāsamaṅgrahārasyāsamaṅgrahād* ² Em. following LVP: *anārya*°. P, Q: *ārya*°; B, L: *āryavyavahārātyagamāc*; D: *yayaṃ-vyavahārātyugamā*; J: *āryavyavahārābhyagamāc*; Tib: 'phag pa ma yin pa'i ³ B, J, L: *lakṣaṇasveti* ⁴ D: *muktam* ⁵ P: *gaṭopādānaṃ nīlādayaḥ*; B, J, L: *ghaṭopādānaṃ nī°*; D: *ghaṭopādānaṃ nīlodayaḥ* ⁶ P: °*paricchedātvāt* ⁷ D: *tataśa* ⁸ D: om.; Tib: n.e. ca ⁹ Q: *yathaiva sopacāras tathā ca*; B: *yathai*; D: *yathiva*; Tib: n.e. *iva* and n.e. (Q's) *sopacāras tathā ca* ¹⁰ D: *kāryāpacāraṃ* ¹¹ D: om. ¹² D: om. ¹³ P: *sukham*. P attests *asukha* and *sukha* in the instances that follow. ¹⁴ B, J, L: *utpādaya* ¹⁵ B, J, L: *pratyakṣaṇītvādi°*; D: °*nīlādigimittakā* ¹⁶ B, J, L: *ghaṭāḥ*; D: *ghaṭāṭāḥ*; ¹⁷ P: *kāraṇe*; B, D, J, L: *kārya*; Tib: 'bras bu la ¹⁸ P: *kāryopacāraṃ*. This and the previous variant in P obviously represent two more cases of deliberate change. ¹⁹ B, J, L: *vyavadiśyate*; D: *vyapadiśyate*, then repeats from previous *evaṃ* to *vyapadiśyate*

नैवंविधे विषय उपचारो युक्तः¹ । उत्पादो² हि लोके सुखव्यतिरेके-
 णोपलब्धः । स च³ संस्कृतलक्षणस्वभावत्वाद्नेकदुष्करशतहेतुत्वाद्⁴
 असुख एव । स सुख⁵ इति व्यपदिश्यमानो⁶ ऽसम्बद्ध एवेत्य्⁷ एवं-
 विधे⁸ विषये युक्त उपचारः ॥ घटः⁹ प्रत्यक्ष इत्य्¹⁰ अत्र तु न हि घटो
 5 नाम यो¹¹ ऽप्रत्यक्षः पृथगुपलब्धो¹² यस्योपचारात्¹³ प्रत्यक्षत्वं
 स्यात् ॥

§110. नीलादिव्यतिरिक्तस्य घटस्याभावाद् औपचारिकं¹⁴ प्रत्यक्ष-
 बमिति चेत्¹⁵ ।

एवम् अपि¹⁶ सुतरामुपचारो¹⁷ न युक्त उपचर्यमाणस्याश्रयस्या-
 10 भावात्¹⁸ । न हि खरविषाणे¹⁹ तैक्ष्ण्यम्²⁰ उपचर्यते ॥

¹ D: mukta ² B, J, L: utpādā ³ D: va ⁴ PsP Tib: 'dus byas kyi
 mtshan nyid kyi rang bzhin yin pa'i phyir dang dka' ba brgya phrag
 du ma'i rgyu can yin pa'i phyir ∴ saṃskṛtalakṣaṇasvabhāvatvād ane-
 kaduṣkaraśatahetutvāt; see Translation note. ⁵ D: sukha eva samu-
 kha ⁶ Q: vyavadiśyamāno ⁷ D: evaty ⁸ B: aivaṃvidher; D:
 evavidhe; J: aivaṃvidhe; PsP_L: evaṃviṣaye for evaṃvidhe viṣaye
⁹ B, D, J, L: ghaṭāḥ ¹⁰ D: itity ¹¹ A-N: kaścid yo; Tib: n.e. kaścit,
 n.e. yaḥ (*gang zhiḡ* reflects *yasya*); PsP_L: kaścid yo. I assume that
kaścit is an idiomatic later addition. Tib (for the sentence): bum pa
 mngon sum zhes bya ba 'dir ni gang zhiḡ btags nas mngon sum nyid
 du 'gyur ba bum pa zhes bya ba mngon sum ma yin pa logs shig tu
 dmigs pa yang ma yin no ¹² B, J: °dhā; D: °dhām; L: upabdhā
¹³ D: yasyāvacārāt va; J, L: yasyāpacārāt ¹⁴ L: aupacarikaṃ
¹⁵ D: cat; L: cod ¹⁶ D: ayi ¹⁷ D: °rā ¹⁸ D: upacayaṃmāṇena-
 syā° ¹⁹ D: kharaviṣṇaṇe; PsP_L: kharaviṣāna (compounded with
taikṣṇyam); Tib: bong bu'i rwa la ²⁰ B: tairvakṣvam; D: taikṣam; J:
 taircaṣvam; L: tairvekṣvam

- L21v §111. अपि च लोकव्यवहाराङ्गभूतो¹ घतः। यदि² नीलादिव्यति-
रिक्तो³ नास्तीति कृत्वा⁴ तस्यौपचारिकं⁵ प्रत्यक्षत्वं⁶ परिकल्प्यते⁷।
B22v नन्व⁸ एवं सति पृथिव्यादिव्यतिरेकेण⁹ नीलादिकम्¹⁰ अपि नास्तीति
नीलादेर्¹¹ अय्¹² औपचारिकं¹³ प्रत्यक्षत्वं कल्प्यताम्¹⁴ ॥

यथोक्तम् –

PsP_L 71

- J27r रूपादिव्यतिरेकेण¹⁵ यथा कुम्भो¹⁶ न विद्यते।
वाय्वादिव्यतिरेकेण¹⁷ तथा रूपं न विद्यते ॥

इति। तस्माद्¹⁸ एवमादिकस्य¹⁹ लोकव्यवहारस्य²⁰ लक्षणेनासङ्ग-
हाद्²¹ अव्यापितैव²² लक्षणस्येति²³। तच्चविदपेक्षया²⁴ हि प्रत्यक्षत्वं²⁵
घटादीनां²⁶ नीलादीनां च नेष्यते²⁷। लोकसंवृत्या ब् अभ्युप- 10
गन्तव्यम्²⁸ एव प्रत्यक्षत्वं²⁹ घटादीनाम् ॥

¹ D: lākalpyatāmvyavahārāṅbhūto ² J: yati ³ D: nīlo ⁴ Tib: phyir ÷ iti kṛtvā ⁵ P: tasyopa°; D: °cārīkaṃ ⁶ D: pratyakakṣa-
tvaṃ; L: patyakṣatvaṃ ⁷ D: parīkelpyate ⁸ J, L: natv; Tib: n.e.
nanu ⁹ B: °vyatiriktena; D: °vyatirakeśa; J: °vyatirekena; L: pṛthī-
vyādivyatirekena ¹⁰ D: nīlādīkem ¹¹ B, L: nīlādeścar ¹² P: aṣy;
B, J, L: asy; D: as; PsP_L: asy (compounded with following word); Tib:
yang ¹³ P: aucārīkaṃ; D: aupacāritam; J: opacārīkaṃ ¹⁴ Q: pari-
kalpyatām; B, J, L: kalpatām ¹⁵ B, J, L: °kena ¹⁶ B, D, L: kuṃ-
bhā; J: kumbhā ¹⁷ B: °kena; D: °vyatirakeśa ¹⁸ J: tasyād ¹⁹ D:
evatādīkasya ²⁰ Q: °vyavahārarasya ²¹ D: °lakṣaṇenāśaṃgrahād
²² B: apyāpitaiva; D: avyāpitai; L: avyāyitaiva ²³ D: lakṣaṇaṃsyopi;
J, L: lakṣaṇaṃsyeti ²⁴ D: °vidayekṣamā ²⁵ B, J, L: pratyak-
ṣam; D: pratyakam ²⁶ D: ghaṭīnām ²⁷ L: naṣyate ²⁸ D: atyu-
paśabdavyam; L: apagantavyam ²⁹ D: pratyakṣaṇamtvam

§112. अपि¹ चापरोक्षार्थवाचिबात्² प्रत्यक्षशब्दस्याक्षाभिमुखो³ D12r
 र्थः⁴ प्रत्यक्षः⁵ । प्रतिगतमक्षम् अस्मिन् इति⁷ कृत्वा⁸ घटनीला-
 दीनाम्⁹ अपरोक्षाणां¹⁰ प्रत्यक्षत्वं सिद्धं भवति । तत्परिच्छेदकस्य Q12r
 ज्ञानस्य¹¹ तृणतुषाग्नित्¹² प्रत्यक्षकारणत्वात् प्रत्यक्षत्वं व्यपदिश्यते ।

5 §113. यस्¹³ ब¹⁴ अक्षमक्षं प्रति वर्तत¹⁵ इति प्रत्यक्षशब्दं¹⁶ व्युत्पा-
 दयति¹⁷ तस्य ज्ञानस्येन्द्रियाविषयत्वाद्¹⁸ विषयविषयिबाच्¹⁹ च न

¹ Antecedent to the present sentence which commences with *api*, all of the mss but P (= Q, B, D, J, L) present: *yathoktaṃ śatake¹ sarva eva ghaṭo 'dr̥ṣṭo² rūpe³ dr̥ṣṭe⁴ hi⁵ jāyate | brūyāt⁶ kas⁷ tattvavin⁸ nāma ghaṭaḥ pratyakṣa ity api || etenaiva⁹ vicāreṇa sugandhi madhuraṃ mṛdu | pratiṣedhayitavyāni¹⁰ sarvāṇy uttamabuddhineti¹¹ ||* (= CS XIII.1 and 2). ¹B, J, L: śakate; D: śateke; ²Q: dr̥ṣṭo; B, D, L: dr̥ṣṭo; J: dr̥ṣṭā; ³D, J: rūpa; ⁴D: dr̥ṣṭo; ⁵Q: na; D: sa; ⁶D: rumāt; ⁷J, L: ka; ⁸B: yacin; D: tavi; J, L: tasyacin; ⁹D: etanaiva; ¹⁰D: pratiṣedhamitavyāni; ¹¹Q: uttamamabu°; B: umabu°; L: °na (*daṇḍas* vary). PsP Tib attests a translation for the introduction and the two verses, and closes with *zhes bshad do ||*. PsPL includes the Skt text. See Translation note.
² D: *kāpaṣenokṣārtha*° ³ P: *pratyakṣaśabdasyākṣ(ā)bhi(mu)[1]*; B, J: *pratyakṣaśabdasya sāksād abhimukho*; D: *pratyakṣaṇaśabdasaṁsād abhimukho*; L: *pratyekṣaśabdasya sāksād abhimukho*; PsPL: *pratyakṣaśabdasya sāksād abhimukho*; Tib: *mngon sum gyi sgra ... dbang po mngon du phyogs pa'i* ⁴ P: [1](r).(h); D: 'rtha ⁵ P: om. ⁶ L: *asmiṃnn* ⁷ J: *idhiṃ*; L: *ipi* ⁸ P: [1](tvā); L: *kṛtā* ⁹ Q: *ghaṭadīnām* ¹⁰ P: Ø; D: *aparākṣāṇā*; J, L: *avarokṣāṇām* ¹¹ D: om. ¹² J: *bhṛmatu*° ¹³ Tib: n.e. tu ¹⁴ J: *pravarttata*; Tib: *dbang po dang dbang po so so la 'jug paṣ zhes bya bas* ¹⁵ D: *pratyakṣaṇaśabdam* ¹⁶ P: the *akṣara da* has been erased; D: *vyat*° ¹⁷ B, J, L: °*viṣayatvā*; D: °*viṣayitvā*; PsPL: *jñānasyendriyāviṣayatvā[d]*; Tib: *shes pa ni dbang po'i yul can ma yin pa'i phyir* ¹⁸ B, D, J, L: c; conj. by LVP: [*viṣayaviṣayatvā*]c; Tib: *yul gyi yul can yin pa'i phyir*

युक्ता व्युत्पत्तिः^१ प्रतिविषयं तु स्यात् प्रत्यर्थमिति वा^१ ॥

J27v §114. अथ स्यात् – यथोभयाधीनायाम् अपि^२ विज्ञानप्रवृत्ताव्^३
 आश्रयस्य पटुमन्दतानुविधानाद्^४ विज्ञानानां तद्विकारविकारिबाद्^५
 आश्रयेणैव^६ व्यपदेशो^७ भवति चक्षुर्विज्ञानम्^८ इति^९ एवं यच्च^९ अप्य्
 L22r अर्थम्^{१०} अर्थ^{११} प्रति वर्तते तथाप्यक्षमक्षमाश्रित्य वर्तमानं विज्ञानम्^५
 B23r आश्रयेण^{१२} व्यपदेशात्^{१३} प्रत्यक्षमिति^{१४} भविष्यति। दृष्टो^{१५} ह्यसाधार-
 णेन कारणेन^{१६} व्यपदेशो भेरीशब्दो यवाङ्कुर इति।

P13v नैतत्^{१७} पूर्वेण^{१८} तुल्यम्। तत्र हि विषयेण^{१९} विज्ञाने^{२०} व्यपदिश्यमाने
 रूपविज्ञानम्^{२१} इत्य् एवमादिना^{२२} विज्ञानषट्कस्य^{२३} भेदो नोपदर्शितः

^१ Tib: yul so so ba 'am don so so ba nyid ces bya bar ni mi 'gyur ro ∴ prativīṣayaṃ tu syāt pratyartham iti vā. As LVP (PsP_L 72, n. 3) remarks, the negation is difficult to explain. One could conjecture that at least one of the PsP mss used by the translators contained a ditto-graphy of *tu* (written as either *tu* or *ta*), and that the second *akṣara* was read or interpreted as *na*. If the negation *mi* goes back to Pa tshab, did he intend *mi* 'gyur cig? ^२ P: Ø; D: āpi ^३ P: Ø; B, J: °pravṛttov; D: civijñāna°; L: °pravṛttoc ^४ Q: °mandatāty(?)anu°; B, J, L: °vidhānā ^५ B, J, L: °vikārisvād; Tib: rnam par shes pa rnam rten gsal ba dang zhan pa'i rjes su byed pa'i phyir dang | de dag 'gyur na 'gyur ba'i phyir | (separates the two ablative constructions with *dang*). PsP Skt is supported by the wording of AKBh ad AK I.45ab. See Translation note. ^६ B, J, L: °naiva ^७ D: vya-padr(?)śo ^८ J, L: cakṣuvi° ^९ D: pady ^{१०} D: artha ^{११} D: om.; L: artha ^{१२} B, J, L: āśrayasya ^{१३} P: (vy)āpade[2]; D: °deśātu ^{१४} Tib: nyid ∴ iti ^{१५} P: Ø; D: drṣṭā ^{१६} P: Ø; B, D, J, L: om. kāraṇe-na; PsP_L: om. kāraṇena; Tib: thun mong ma yin pa'i rgyus ^{१७} P: Ø; B: caitaṃ; J, L: naitaṃ ^{१८} P: Ø; D: pūrvaṇa ^{१९} B: °na; J, L: °na; J and L then repeat tulyaṃ tatra hi viṣayena ^{२०} P: Ø; B, D, J, L:

PsPL 73

स्याद् मनोविज्ञानस्य चक्षुरादिविज्ञानैः सहैकविषयप्रवृत्तत्वात्¹।
 तथा² हि नीलादिविज्ञानषट्के³ विज्ञानम्⁴ इत्युक्ते साकाङ्क्ष एव प्रत्ययो⁵
 जायते – किमेतद् रूपीन्द्रियजं⁶ विज्ञानम्⁷ आहोस्विन्⁸ मानसमि-
 ति। आश्रयेण⁹ तु व्यपदेशे मनोविज्ञानस्य¹⁰ चक्षुरादिविज्ञानविषय-
 5 प्रवृत्तिसम्भवे¹¹ ऽपि परस्परभेदः सिद्धो भवति। इह तु प्रमाणलक्षण-
 विवक्षया¹² कल्पनापोढमात्रस्य¹³ प्रत्यक्षत्वाभ्युपगमे¹⁴ सति विकल्प-
 काद्¹⁵ एव¹⁶ तद्विशेषस्याभिमतत्वाद्¹⁷ असाधारणकारणेन व्यपदेशे
 सति न किञ्चित्¹⁸ प्रयोजनम् उपलक्ष्यते¹⁹। प्रमेयपरतन्त्रायां²⁰ च²¹

vijñāna ²¹ P: Ø; B: rūpavijñāne vyapadiśyamāne rūpavijñānam; J, L: rūpavijñāne pyapadiśyamāne rūpavijñānam ²² P: Ø; D: ava°
²³ P: Ø; B, D, J, L: °ṣaṭkāśya

¹ Q: °viśayaṃpra° ² B, D, J, L: tadā ³ Em. following LVP and Tib: nīlādivijñānaṣaṭke. P: nīlādiviśayaṣaṭka; Q: nīlādivijñānaṣaṭka-
 vikalpa; B, D: nīlādiviśayaṣaṭkā; J: nīlāhiviśayaṣaṭkā; L: nītvādiviśa-
 yaṣaṭkā; Tib: sngon po la sogs pa'i nman par shes pa drug la ⁴ P: Ø;
 Q: jñānam ⁵ P: Ø; B, J, L: pratyayāj; D: pratyayā; PsPL: pratyayāj;
 em. by de Jong (1978: 35): pratyayo; Tib: shes pa re ba dang bcas pa
 nyid du 'gyur la ⁶ P: Ø; Q: rūpendriyajaṃ ⁷ P: Ø; D: vijñānaṃm
⁸ P: Ø; B, D, J, L: āhosvita ⁹ D: āśrayeśa; J: °na ¹⁰ B, D, J: mano-
 vijñānacakṣurādi°, i.e., construed as part of following compound;
 PsPL: manovijñānacakṣurādi°; Tib: yid kyi (nman par shes pa mig la
 sogs pa'i nman par shes pa'i yul la 'jug pa yin yang). LVP does not
 emend his text but remarks (PsPL 73, n. 4), “Le sens est certain *mano-
 vijñānasya* ... *°viśaye* ...” ¹¹ L: °sabhava ¹² B, J, L: °vicakṣayā
¹³ B, L: kalpanāpoṭa°; D: kalpanāyāṭamātrasya; J: kal(?)panāpoṭa°
¹⁴ D: °tvātyupagame; L: °tvātyupagase ¹⁵ P: savikalpakād (saṃvi-
 kalpakād?) ¹⁶ P: iva; Tib: n.e. eva ¹⁷ J: tadviśeṣatvābhimatatvād;
 PsPL: tadviśeṣatvābhimatatvād ¹⁸ D: kiñcata ¹⁹ P: [2](l)ṣ[2]; D:
 ugalakṣyate; J: upalekṣyate; L: upataṣyate ²⁰ Q: °paratantāyāñ; L:
 °paratantāyāṃ ²¹ D: va; Tib: n.e. ca

J28r प्रमाणसङ्ख्याप्रवृत्तौ¹ प्रमेयाकारानुकारितामात्रतया² च समासादिता-
त्मभावसत्ताकयोः³ प्रमाणयोः स्वरूपस्य व्यवस्थापनान्⁴ नेन्द्रियेण⁵
व्यपदेशः⁶ किञ्चिद् उपकरोतीति⁷ सर्वथा विषयेणैव⁸ व्यपदेशो
न्याय्यः⁹ ॥

§115. लोके¹⁰ प्रत्यक्षशब्दस्य¹¹ प्रसिद्धत्वाद् विवक्षिते¹² ऽर्थे¹³ प्रत्य- 5
र्थमिति चाप्रसिद्धत्वाद्¹⁴ आश्रयेणैव¹⁵ व्युत्पत्तिर् आश्रीयत¹⁶ इति PsP_L 74
चेत्।

उच्यते – अस्त्ययं प्रत्यक्षशब्दो¹⁷ लोकप्रसिद्धः¹⁸ । स तु यथा लोके
तथास्माभिर्¹⁹ उच्यत एव²⁰ । यथास्थितलौकिकपदार्थतिरस्कारेण²¹

¹ B: pramāsaṃkhyā° ² Q: prameyākānukāritā°; L: °mātratvātayā
³ B, J, L: samāhādītā°; D: samāsātaddhitātmaḥāvasattākayāḥ ⁴ B,
D, J, L: °nā ⁵ J, L: °yena ⁶ D: vyapadeśeḥ ⁷ Q: uparotīti; D:
upakarīgīti ⁸ D: piṣayoṇaiva; Tib: n.e. eva ⁹ Q: nāyyaḥ; D: tyā-
yyaḥ ¹⁰ B, D, J, L: āloke ¹¹ D: pratyakṣaṇaśabdasya ¹² D: vica-
kṣitai; J: vivakṣate ¹³ B, J, L: 'rtha ¹⁴ B, L: pratyakṣaśabdasya-
prasiddhatvād; D: pratyakṣaśabdasyāpratiddhatvād; J: pratyakṣabda-
syapra°; PsP_L: pratyārthaśabdasy[ā]prasiddhatvād; Tib: dang don so
so zhes bya ba'i sgra ma grags pa'i phyir. *pratyakṣaśabdasyaprasid-
ddhatvād* as found in B, D (D with °āpra°), J and L appears to be the
result of an eyeskip back to the first compound of the sentence. LVP's
solution is unacceptable because the content of the first ablative con-
struction is hardly a reason for the content of the second. ¹⁵ J, L:
āśrayenaiva ¹⁶ J: āśriṣata ¹⁷ D: pratyakṣaṇabdo ¹⁸ PsP_L: loke
prasiddhaḥ ¹⁹ D: tasmābhir ²⁰ Q: eveti; Tib: n.e. iti ²¹ Q: °pa-
dārthariraskāreṇa D: tathā°; L: °laukikadāparthariraskāreṇa

तु तद्व्युत्पादे¹ क्रियमाणे प्रसिद्धशब्दतिरस्कारो² ऽपि³ स्यात्। ततश्च⁴ प्रत्यर्थम्⁵ इत्य् एव⁶ स्यात्॥ B23v L22v

§116. एकस्य च⁷ चक्षुर्विज्ञानस्यैकेन्द्रियक्षणाश्रयस्य⁸ प्रत्यक्षत्वं⁹ न स्याद् वीप्सार्थाभावात्¹⁰ । एकैकस्य च¹¹ प्रत्यक्षत्वाभावे¹² बहूनाम्¹³

5 अपि न स्यात्॥

§117. कल्पनापोढस्यैव¹⁴ च¹⁵ ज्ञानस्य प्रत्यक्षत्वाभ्युपगमात्¹⁶ तेन¹⁷ च लोकस्य¹⁸ संव्यवहाराभावाद् लौकिकस्य च प्रमाणप्रमेय-
व्यवहारस्य¹⁹ व्याख्यातुमिष्टत्वाद् व्यर्थैव²⁰ प्रत्यक्षप्रमाणकल्पना सञ्जायते॥

¹ D: tadvyatpāde ² Q: °tiraskāre (°ro has been changed to °re); B, J, L: prasiddheśabdatiraskāra; PsP_L: prasiddhaśabdatiraskārah (see next note); Tib: rab tu grags pa'i sgra yang spong bar 'gyur ro ³ B, J, L: prasiddha; PsP_L: prasiddhah; Tib: yang ⁴ Tib: n.e. ca ⁵ Em. by LVP: pratyakṣam; Tib: mngon sum ⁶ Conj. by LVP: evaṃ [na]; Tib: de ltar mi 'gyur. LVP (PsP_L 74, n. 2) notes that his mss read *evaṃ*, but Cambridge (my ms L) attests *eva*. The *anusvāra* must have accidentally entered the later tradition given that Calcutta and Paris are copied from exemplars that relied on my J. ⁷ Q: om.; D: om. ⁸ P: cakṣurvijñānasyaikaindriya°; J, L: cakṣuvi° ⁹ D: prabhākṣa-tvaṃ ¹⁰ B, J, L: vīśāthābhāvāt ¹¹ J: ce ¹² L: °bhāva ¹³ L: cahūnām ¹⁴ B, D, J, L: kalpanāpoṭa° ¹⁵ D: vava; Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁶ D: °tvātyupa° ¹⁷ Tib: des kyang ÷ tena ¹⁸ D: lokasyai ¹⁹ Em. following LVP: pramāṇaprameyavyavahārasya. P, Q: pramāṇa-prameyasya; B, D, J, L: pramāṇaprameyasya; Tib: 'jig rten pa'i tshad ma dang gzhal bya'i tha snyad. The loss of *vyavahāra* could be explained as owing to an eyeskip from *vya* to *syā*. ²⁰ D: vārthaiva; J: vyathaiva; L: vyartheva

§118. चक्षुर्विज्ञानसमङ्गी¹ नीलं जानाति नो तु नीलमिति चागमस्य²
 Q12v प्रत्यक्षलक्षणाभिधानार्थस्याप्रस्तुतत्वात् पञ्चानामिन्द्रियविज्ञानानां³ PsP_L 75
 J28v जडत्वप्रतिपादकत्वाच्च⁴ च नागमादपि कल्पनापोढस्यैव⁵ विज्ञानस्य
 प्रत्यक्षत्वमिति न युक्तमेतत् ॥

§119. तस्मात्⁶ लोके यदि लक्ष्यं⁷ यदि⁸ वा लक्षणं⁹ स्वसामान्य- 5
 D12v लक्षणं¹⁰ वा सर्वमेव साक्षादुपलभ्यमानत्वादपरोक्षम् । अतः प्रत्यक्षं¹¹
 व्यवस्थाप्यते तद्विषयेण¹² ज्ञानेन सह । द्विचन्द्रादीनां¹³ बतैमिरिक-

¹ B, J, L: cakṣuvijñānasaṅgī; conj. by LVP: °vijñānasa[ma]ṅgī ² L: vāgamasya ³ J: °nā ⁴ D: jatutva°; J: jatra° ⁵ B, J: °poṭasyaiva; D: kalpanāyāstaṭhaiva; L: °pātasyaiva ⁶ D: tasmā ⁷ Q: vā pratyakṣyaṃ (an erased but still visible *pa* before *kṣyaṃ* has a *kākapada* beside it, indicating that the *praty* in the upper margin is to be inserted in its place); B: lakṣyed; D: lakṣyaṃ yadi lakṣyaṃ; L: lakṣyaḍ ⁸ L: di ⁹ Q: svalakṣaṇaṃ; B, J, L: lakṣyaṇaṃ; em. by LVP: svalakṣaṇaṃ (LVP [PsP_L 75, n. 1] notes that his mss read as P: lakṣaṇaṃ svasāmānyalakṣaṇaṃ vā); Tib: rang gi mtshan nyid. Ms Q and Tib's reading (Tib's reading obviously influenced by a ms in Q's line) appears to be a simplified one, probably altered because the mention of both *lakṣaṇa* and *svasāmānyalakṣaṇa* seemed redundant. Represented here, however, is Candrakīrti's model that focuses on the *lakṣya-lakṣaṇa* pair, but also allows for a division of the latter into *svalakṣaṇa* (e.g., the heat of fire) and *sāmānyalakṣaṇa* (e.g., impermanence). Candrakīrti is merely listing the possible alternatives. *LT's author's exemplar seems to have read as Q (unless we interpret his *tac ca svalakṣaṇaṃ | sāmānyalakṣaṇaṃ vā* as his explanation of the compound *svasāmānyalakṣaṇaṃ*): <<lakṣam (read: lakṣyaṃ) iti >> (= marginal insertion) *prameyaṃ tac ca svalakṣaṇaṃ | sāmānyalakṣaṇaṃ vā* | (cf. Yonezawa 2004: 125, 148 [fol. 3a3]). ¹⁰ Q: sāmānyalakṣaṇaṃ; em. by LVP: sāmānyalakṣaṇaṃ; Tib: spyi'i mtshan nyid. See previous note. ¹¹ B: pratyakṣa ¹² J: °na ¹³ B: dvicandrāsaṇaṃ

ज्ञानापेक्षयाप्रत्यक्षबम्¹ । तैमिरिकाद्यपेक्षया² तु प्रत्यक्षबम्³ एव⁴ ॥

§120. परोक्षविषयं⁵ तु ज्ञानं साध्याव्यभिचारिलिङ्गोत्पन्नम्⁶ अनु-
मानम् ॥

§121. साक्षाद्⁷ अतीन्द्रियार्थविदाम्⁸ आप्तानां⁹ यद् वचनं स

5 आगमः ॥

§122. सादृश्यादननुभूतार्थाधिगम¹⁰ उपमानं गौरिव गवय इति
यथा ॥

§123. तदेवं प्रमाणचतुष्टयाल्¹¹ लोकस्यार्थाधिगमो व्यवस्थाप्यते ॥

तानि¹² च परस्परपेक्षया सिध्यन्ति¹³ । तस्माल्¹⁴ लौकिकम्¹⁵

B24r

10 एवास्तु¹⁶ यथादृष्टमित्यलं प्रसङ्गेन । प्रस्तुतम्¹⁷ एव व्याख्या-

L23r P14r

¹ B, J, L: °jñānopekṣayā°; D: amaimirikajñānāpakṣamā° ² D: °pe-
kṣamā ³ P: pratyatvam ⁴ P: evā; D: evā ⁵ Q: paropakṣavi°
⁶ Q: svasādhyāvyabhi°; D: sādhyāvyahi° ⁷ Q: śākṣad ⁸ P: atī-
ndriyārthavivādām; B: atindriyā°; D: °yārthanidām ⁹ Q: āṣṭānām
¹⁰ D: °gamaṃ ¹¹ D: prayāṇa° ¹² L: vāni ¹³ Q: sidhyanti |, fol-
lowed by (in lower margin, marked for insertion): satsu pramāṇeṣu
prameyārthāḥ satsu prameyeṣu pramāṇāni | no tu khalu svāṅgavikī
(read: svābhāvikī) pramāṇaprameyayoḥ siddhir iti; B, D, J, L: attest
(with minor variants) the two sentences and also include the word
artheṣu after *prameyeṣu*; PsP_L: includes the two sentences and ms L's
artheṣu; PsP Tib: tshad ma dag yod na gzhal bya'i don dag tu 'gyur la
| gzhal bya'i don dag yod na tshad ma dag tu 'gyur gyi | tshad ma
dang gzhal bya gnyis ngo bo nyid kyis grub pa ni yod pa ma yin no ||.
See Translation note. ¹⁴ D: tasmā ¹⁵ P: laukikakṣam ¹⁶ D: evā-
star ¹⁷ Q: prakṛtam; B, J, L: praṣṭutam; D: prastatam

स्यामः¹ ॥

PsPL 76

J29r §124. अत्राहुः स्वयूथ्याः – यदिदमुक्तं² न स्वत उत्पद्यन्ते³ भावा
इति तद् युक्तं स्वत उत्पत्तिवैयर्थ्यात्⁴। यच्⁵ चोक्तं⁶ न द्वाभ्याम्⁷
इति तदपि युक्तम्⁸ एकांशहानेः⁹। अहेतुपक्षस्¹⁰ ब् एकान्तनिकृष्ट¹¹
इति तत्प्रतिषेधो¹² ऽपि युक्तः। यत् तु खल्विदमुच्यते नापि परत¹³
इति तद् अयुक्तं¹⁴ यस्मात् परभूता एव भगवता भावानाम्¹⁵ उत्पाद-
का निर्दिष्टाः ॥

¹ D: vyākhyāsumah. After *vyākhyāsyāmaḥ*, all the mss present the sentence *laukika eva darśane sthitvā buddhānāṃ bhagavatāṃ dharmadeśanā*, which does not appear in PsP Tib and makes little sense here. After the sentence, Ms P continues on with an introduction to a quotation and then the quotation itself (ms Q attests neither): *et upamābhi nidarśana vakṣye kin tu na teṣa samo iha kaścit | paṇḍita-vijñājanā* (leaf breaks off; text continues on the next line with:) *natimiraghnaśya jñānalokasya te mane na ravir viṣaye bhūmim khadyotim api vindatītyādi* |. None of this text appears in PsP Tib. *LT: *etat[*] upamayābhidarśitaṃ teṣāṃ buddhānāṃ samo na kaścid asti yo jānāti* (cf. Yonezawa 2004: 125, 148 [fol. 3a3]). See Translation note. ² L: tyadyante ³ P: utpattivaiy (leaf breaks off); B, J, L: °vaiyarthāt; D: utpattivaiyathāt ⁴ P: Ø; D: yav ⁵ P: Ø; Q: yathotkan for yac coktaṃ; D: roktaṃ ⁶ P: Ø; L: dvātyām ⁷ P: Ø; D: muktaṃ ⁸ P: Ø; Q: ekāṇśavihāneḥ; B, J, L: ekāṃśahāveḥ; D: ekāṃśahāmeḥ; conj. by LVP: ekāṃśa[vaikalyāt]; em. by de Jong: ekāṃśahāneḥ; Tib: ma tshang ba ⁹ P: Ø; Q: ahetukapakṣas; J: °pakṣa ¹⁰ P: Ø; B, J, L: ekāṃtenikṛṣṭa ¹¹ P: Ø; B: tpratiṣedho ¹² B, J, L: ayukta ¹³ B, J, L: nām; conj. by LVP: [bhāvā]nām ¹⁴ D: nirdiṣṭiḥ

चत्वारः प्रत्यया हेतुर्¹ आरम्बणम्² अनन्तरम्।

PsP_L 77 तथैवाधिपतेयं³ च⁴ प्रत्ययो नास्ति पञ्चमः ॥ [MMK I.2]

तत्र निर्वर्तको⁵ हेतुरिति लक्षणाद् यो⁶ हि यस्य निर्वर्तको⁷ बीज-
भावेनावस्थितः⁸ स⁹ तस्य हेतुप्रत्ययः। उत्पद्यमानो¹⁰ धर्मो¹¹ येना-
5 रम्बणेनोत्पद्यते¹² स तस्यारम्बणप्रत्ययः¹³। कारणस्यानन्तरो¹⁴
निरोधः¹⁵ कार्यस्योत्पत्तिप्रत्ययः¹⁶। तद्यथा बीजस्यानन्तरो¹⁷
निरोधो¹⁸ ऽङ्कुरस्योत्पादप्रत्ययः¹⁹। यस्मिन् सति यद् भवति²⁰ तत्

¹ B, J, L: hetuc. PsP_L reads *hetuś cālabanam*, but none of LVP's mss attest *hetuś cā*°; all present the simpler erroneous reading – the result of *r* read as *c* – *hetuc ārambanam*. ² B, J, L: *ārambanam*; PsP_L: *cālabanam*. De Jong (1978: 35) suggests reading *ārambaṇam* on the basis of D, stating that D “has everywhere *ārambaṇa* instead of *ālabana* (77.2, 83.14, 84.1 etc.) and *ārambaṇaka* instead of *ālabanaka* (85.5).” ³ D: *tathivodhipatayaṃ* ⁴ J: om. ⁵ Q: *nivarttako*; B, D, J: *nivarttako*; L: *mivarthako* ⁶ P: Ø; D: *yā* ⁷ Em. following LVP: *nirvartako*. P: Ø; Q: *nivarttako*; B, J, L: *vivarttako*; D: *nivarttako* ⁸ Em. following LVP: °*bhāvenāvasthitaḥ*. P: Ø; Q: °*sthi*; B, J, L: °*bhāvenovāsthitaḥ*; D: °*bhāvenāvesthitaḥ* ⁹ Q: om. (eyeskip from *ta* of °*sthitaḥ* to *ta* of *tasya*) ¹⁰ P: Ø; L: °*ṇo* ¹¹ P: Ø; B, D, J, L: *dharmā*; Tib : *dmigs pa gang gis skye bar 'gyur ba'i chos can bskyed pa ∴ utpadyamāno dharmo yenārambanenotpadyate* ¹² P: Ø; D: *yanā*(eyeskip back to the *kārikā*)*rambanemanantārī tathavivādhīpatayaṃ ca pratyayo nāsti pañcamah | tatra nivarttako hetur iti lakṣaṇāt | yā hi yasya nivarttakoṃ bījabhāvenāvesthita nopadyate*; J: *yenālabane*°; L: *yenālabāṣenotpate* ¹³ J: *tasyālabana*°; L: *tasyālabana*° ¹⁴ B, J, L: *kāraṇasyāntaro*; conj. by LVP: *kāraṇasyā[na]ntaro* ¹⁵ D: *dhaḥ* ¹⁶ D: *kāryasyātpatti*° ¹⁷ B, J, L: *bījasyāntaro*; conj. by LVP: *bījasyā[na]ntaro* ¹⁸ B: *nirādho* ¹⁹ D: *kurasyātpādapratyamaḥ*; L: °*ṃkurasyātpāda*° ²⁰ D: *bhaveti*; J: *bhati*

तस्याधिपतेयम्¹ इति त एते चत्वारः प्रत्ययाः। ये चान्ये² पुरोजात-
सहजातपश्चाज्जातादयः³। त एतेष्व⁴ एवान्तर्भूताः⁵। ईश्वरादयस् तु
प्रत्यया एव⁶ न सम्भवन्तीति। अत एवावधारयति⁷ प्रत्ययो⁸ नास्ति
पञ्चम⁹ इति। तस्माद् एभ्यः¹⁰ परभूतेभ्यो भावानाम् उत्पत्तेर¹¹
अस्ति परत उत्पत्तिरिति॥

5

§125. अत्रोच्यते – नैव हि भावानां परभूतेभ्यः प्रत्ययेभ्य¹² उत्पत्तिर¹³
इति¹⁴। यस्मात् –

PsP_L 78

B24v

न हि स्वभावो¹⁵ भावानां प्रत्ययादिषु¹⁶ विद्यते।

L23v

अविद्यमाने¹⁷ स्वभावे¹⁸ परभावो¹⁹ न विद्यते॥ [MMK I.3]

इति²⁰ यदि²¹ हि²² हेबादिषु परभूतेषु प्रत्ययेषु समस्तेषु व्यस्तेषु¹⁰

J29v

व्यस्तसमस्तेषु हेतुप्रत्ययसामग्र्या²³ अन्यत्र वा²⁴ क्वचिद् भावानां²⁵

¹ D: °dhiyateyam ² P: Ø; D: cānyo; Tib: n.e. ca ³ P: Ø; D: purojātaapaścājjātādayas; J: °paścājjādayas ⁴ P: Ø; Q: eṣv; D: eṭaṣv
⁵ Em. following LVP: evāntarbhūtāḥ. P: Ø; Q: avāntarbhūtāḥ; D, L: āntarbhūtāḥ; J: āntarbhutāḥ; Tib: n.e. eva ⁶ Q: om.; D: eve; Tib: n.e. eva
⁷ Em. following LVP: evāvadhārayati. P: [3]dhārayanti; Q: °dhārayanti; B: °yamti; D: evyavadhārayānte; J: evavādhārayanti; L: °dharayanti
⁸ B, D, J, L: °yā ⁹ D: paṃcata ¹⁰ J: abhyaḥ; L: etyaḥ
¹¹ P: utpattir; PsP_L: utpattir; Tib: skye ba'i phyir ¹² P: pratyā[2]; L: pratyayetya ¹³ P: Ø; Q: om.; D: om. ¹⁴ Tib: 'di ltar ÷ yasmāt
¹⁵ P: Ø; B, J, L: sva; conj. by LVP: sva[bhāvo] ¹⁶ P: Ø; D: pratyamādiṣu
¹⁷ P: Ø; L: avidyamānāne ¹⁸ P: Ø; Q: svesave ¹⁹ P: Ø; D: °vā ²⁰ P: Ø ²¹ P: Ø; Q: om. ²² P: Ø; Q: om.; Tib: n.e. hi
²³ Em. following LVP: °gryā. P, Q: °gryām; B, D, J, L: °gryām; Tib: rgyu dang rkyen gyi tshogs pa las gzhan 'ga' zhig la; cf. also Candrakīrti's commentary on MMK I.3 at MABh_{ed} 93.9-11: 'dir rkyen la sogs pa zhes bya ba ni rgyu'am rkyen dag gam | rgyu dang

कार्याणामुत्पादात् पूर्वं¹ सत्त्वं² स्यात्³। स्यात् तेभ्य⁴ उत्पादः⁵। न
 चैवं यद् उत्पादात्⁶ पूर्वं सद्भवः⁷ स्यात्। यदि स्यात्। गृह्येत⁸
 चोत्पादवैयर्थ्यं⁹ च¹⁰ स्यात्। तस्मान्¹¹ नास्ति¹² भावानां प्रत्ययादिषु Q13r
 स्वभावः। अविद्यमाने च¹³ स्वभावे¹⁴ नास्ति परभावः। भवनं भाव
 5 उत्पादः¹⁵ परेभ्य¹⁶ उत्पादः परभावः¹⁶ स न विद्यते। तस्माद्
 अयुक्तम्¹⁷ एतत् – परभूतेभ्यो¹⁸ भावानामुत्पत्तिरिति॥

§126. अथ वा¹⁹ भावानां²⁰ कार्याणामङ्कुरादीनां बीजादिषु²¹ प्रत्य-
 येषु²² सत्स्व²³ अविकृतरूपेषु²³ नास्ति स्वभावो²⁴ निर्हेतुकब-
 प्रसङ्गात्²⁵। तत् किम् अपेक्ष्य²⁶ परत्वं प्रत्ययादीनाम्। विद्यमानयोर्²⁷ D13r

rkyen gyi tshogs pa'am de las gzhan yang rung ste ²⁴ B, J, L: ca; D:
 kā ²⁵ Q: bhāvānānām

¹ P: Ø; Q: pūrva ² P: Ø; B, J, L: satva ³ P: Ø; D: syāta ⁴ P: Ø;
 L: tetya ⁵ P: Ø; D: utpādā ⁶ P: Ø; L: utpādā ⁷ P: Ø; B: sambha-
 vaḥ; D, J: sambhavaḥ; L: sambhavaṃ ⁸ P: Ø; Q: gr̥hyet; B: ≈hyeta
⁹ P: Ø; D: °vaimarthyam; J: °vaiyathyam; L: vo° ¹⁰ Tib connects
 gr̥hyeta and utpādavaiyarthyaṃ with 'am ¹¹ P: Ø; B: tasyān ¹² P:
 Ø; B, D, J, L: na cāsti ¹³ Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁴ Q: svebhāve; Tib: bdag gi
 dngos po yod pa ma yin pa nyid yin na ÷ avidyamāne ca svabhāve
¹⁵ D: parabhya ¹⁶ P: °(bhā).(ḥ); D, L: parabhāva ¹⁷ D: eyuktam
¹⁸ Em. following LVP: parabhūtebhyo. P: Ø; Q: parebhyo; B, D, J, L:
 parabhyo; Tib: gzhan du gyur pa dag las ¹⁹ P: Ø; D: om. ²⁰ P: Ø;
 L: bhānām ²¹ P: Ø; D: bījādīṣu ²² P: Ø; J: pratyeṣu ²³ P: Ø; D:
 arikṛte° ²⁴ P: Ø; D: °vā ²⁵ Em. following LVP: nirhetu°. P: Ø; Q:
 nirhatu°; B, J, L: nihamtuka°; D: nihetu° ²⁶ P: Ø; B, J, L: apekṣa;
 D: ayeḥṣya; PsP_L: kimapekṣam for kim apekṣya ²⁷ P: Ø; B, J, L:
 vidyamāneyor

P14v एव हि मैत्रोपगुप्तयोः¹ परस्परापेक्षं² परब्रम्। न³ चैवं बीजाङ्कुरयोर्⁴
यौगपद्यम्⁵। तस्माद् अविद्यमाने⁶ स्वभावे⁷ कार्याणां परभावः परब्रं
बीजादीनां नास्तीति परव्यपदेशाभावाद्⁸ एव⁹ न परत उत्पाद
इति¹⁰ ॥

§127. तस्माद् आगमाभिप्रायानभिज्ञतैव¹¹ परस्य। न हि तथागता⁵
युक्तिविरुद्धं¹² वाक्यमुदाहरन्ति। आगमस्य चाभिप्रायः¹³ प्रागेवोप-
वर्णितः¹⁴ ॥

PsPL 79

J30r §128. तदेवं प्रत्ययेभ्य उत्पादवादिनि प्रतिषिद्धे¹⁵ क्रियात्¹⁶ उत्पाद-
वादी मन्यते – न चक्षूरूपादयः¹⁷ प्रत्ययाः साक्षाद्¹⁸ विज्ञानं जनय-
न्ति¹⁹। विज्ञानजनिक्रियानिष्पादकत्वात्²⁰ तु प्रत्यया उच्यन्ते। सा²¹
च²² क्रिया विज्ञानं²³ जनयति। तस्मात्²⁴ प्रत्ययवती²⁵ विज्ञानजनि-

10

B25r L24r

¹ P: [3]+u+t+(yoh); B, J, L: maitropaguhyakayoh; D: maitrāpagupta-
yoh; PsPL: maitropagrāhakayoh; em. by de Jong: maitropaguptaka-
yoh; Tib: byams pa dang nyer sbas dag ² B: °pekṣatvaṃ; D: rāye-
kṣaṃ ³ B: om.; L: ca ⁴ Q: °yo ⁵ B, L: yogapadyaṃ; J: yogasā-
padyaṃ ⁶ B, J, L: aviṣamāne ⁷ Q: svebhāve ⁸ P: Ø; D: para-
vyayade° ⁹ P: Ø; J: eve ¹⁰ P: Ø; Q: (in upper margin, marked to
be inserted after *iti*): ayuktam etat parata utpadyante bhāvā iti. Tib:
(gzhan las skye ba ma yin pa)s dngos po mams gzhan las skye'o zhes
bya ba 'di ni mi rung ngo. See Translation note. ¹¹ P: Ø; B, J, L;
°jñateyaiva; D: °jñateyaiva ¹² P: Ø; J: mukti° ¹³ P: Ø; Q: vyahā-
raḥ; Tib: lung gi dgongs pa yang (= āgamasya cābhiprāyaḥ) ¹⁴ B, J,
L: evāpa°; D: evārnataḥ; Tib: n.e. eva ¹⁵ B, D, J, L: pratisiddhe
¹⁶ D: kriyātā ¹⁷ J: cakṣūrūtpādayaḥ; L: cakṣurūyādayaḥ ¹⁸ P: Ø;
Q: śākṣad ¹⁹ P: Ø; B: janayati; L: °tī ²⁰ P: Ø; B, D, J, L: te; Tib:
kyi ²¹ P: Ø; J: bhā ²² P: Ø; J: va ²³ P: Ø; D: vijñānāṃ ²⁴ P:
Ø; L: tasmā ²⁵ P: Ø; D: pratyasavati; J: pratyayevati

क्रिया¹ विज्ञानजनिका² न³ प्रत्ययाः⁴ यथा पचिक्रिया⁵ ओद-
नस्येति⁶ ॥

§129. उच्यते –

क्रिया न प्रत्ययवती⁷ [MMK I.4a]

5 यदि⁸ क्रिया काचित्⁹ स्यात्¹⁰ सा¹¹ चक्षुरादिभिः¹² प्रत्ययैः¹³ प्रत्य-
यवती¹⁴ विज्ञानं जनयेत्¹⁵ । न बस्ति । कथं कृत्वा । इह क्रियेयमिष्य-
माणा¹⁶ जाते वा¹⁷ विज्ञान इष्यते¹⁸ ऽजाते वा जायमाने वा । तत्र
जाते न युक्ता । क्रिया हि भावनिष्पादिका¹⁹ । भावश्चेन्²⁰ निष्पन्नः
किमस्य क्रियया ॥

10 जातस्य²¹ जन्म²² पुनरेव च नैव युक्तम् ॥

इत्यादिना च मध्यमकावतारे²³ प्रतिपादितमेतत् ॥

अजाते ऽपि न युक्ता

¹ P: Ø; D: °krimā ² P: Ø; D: vikriyāvijñānajanikā ³ P: Ø; B, D, J, L: ma; em. by LVP: na ⁴ P: Ø; J: °yā; Tib: de'i phyir rnam par shes pa skye ba'i bya ba rkyen dang ldan pa ni rnam par shes pa skyed par byed pa yin gyi rkyen dag ni ma yin (the sentence's added verb and adversative is presumably for the sake of clarity) ⁵ P: Ø; B, J, L: parikriyā; D: yacikriyā; PsP_L: parikriyā; em. by Stcherbatsky (1927: 168, n. 3): pacikriyā; Tib: 'tshed pa'i bya ba ⁶ P: Ø; D: gedanasyati; L: vada° ⁷ D: °vati ⁸ L: yedi ⁹ B: kācidi; J: kācin ¹⁰ B: tyāt; J: tyās; L: tyā ¹¹ B, J, L: mā ¹² D: cakṣayādibhiḥ; L: cakurādi-bhiḥ ¹³ D: pratyayaṃ ¹⁴ D: °vattī ¹⁵ D: janeyet ¹⁶ D: °mā-śā; J: °nā ¹⁷ Q: om. ¹⁸ Q: iṣyet ¹⁹ B, J, L: °niṣpādakā; PsP_L: °niṣpādakā ²⁰ P: Ø; J: ce ²¹ P: Ø; D: jātesya ²² P: Ø; D: jatma ²³ P: Ø; D: °ra

कर्त्रा¹ विना जनिरियं न च युक्तरूपा² ॥

PsP_L 80

इत्यादिवचनात्³ ॥

जायमाने ऽपि भावे क्रिया न सम्भवति जाताजातव्यतिरेकेण⁴
जायमानाभावात्⁵ ।

यथोक्तम्⁶ –

5

जायमानार्धजातत्वाज् जायमानो न जायते ।

अथ वा जायमानत्वं सर्वस्यैव प्रसज्यते⁸ ॥

इति ॥

यतश्चैवं⁹ त्रिषु कालेषु जनिक्रियाया¹⁰ असम्भवः । तस्मान्
नास्ति¹¹ सा¹² । अत एवाह – क्रिया न प्रत्ययवतीति ।

10

विशेषणं नास्ति¹³ विना¹⁴ विशेष्यम्¹⁵

J30v इत्यादिना¹⁶ प्रतिपादितम्¹⁷ एतन् मध्यमकावतारे । न हि वन्ध्या-
पुत्रो¹⁸ गोमानित्य् उच्यते¹⁹ ।

¹ Q: karttā ² L: ktarūpe ³ B, J, L: esyādi ⁴ B, D, J, L: °kena
⁵ B, J, L: jāyamānobbhāvāt ⁶ B: yathoktam ca ⁷ Em. following
LVP: jāyamānārdha°. P: Q: jāyamānorddhajātātvaḥ; B, D, L:
jāyamānorddhajātātvaḥ; J: as B, °tvāj ⁸ P: Ø; B: prasahyate ⁹ Tib:
n.e. ca ¹⁰ P: Ø; D: janikrimāyā ¹¹ P: Ø; D: nāsthi ¹² P: Ø; D: tā
¹³ B, J, L: nāstīti; D: nāsthi. LVP (PsP_L 600) corrects *nāstīti* of his
edition to *nāsti* on the basis of MA VI.57 (MABh_{ed} 148.5) and PsP
Tib (khyad par med par khyad par can yod min) ¹⁴ P: na ¹⁵ Q:
niśeṣyam; L: viśeṣāḥ ¹⁶ L: mityādinā ¹⁷ L: pratiyāditam; Tib:
bstan pa *nyid* ÷ pratipāditam ¹⁸ B, D, J, L: °trā ¹⁹ D: uṣyate

§130. यद्येवम्¹ अप्रत्ययवती तर्हि भविष्यतीति।

§131. एतदप्य² अयुक्तमित्याह –

नाप्रत्ययवती³ क्रिया।

[MMK I.4b]

यदा प्रत्ययवती⁴ नास्ति⁵ तदा⁶ कथम्⁷ अप्रत्ययवती निर्हेतुका⁸
5 स्यात्। न हि तन्तुमयः⁹ पटो¹⁰ न युक्त इति वीरणमयो¹¹ ऽभ्युप-
गम्यते¹²। तस्मात्¹³ क्रिया¹⁴ न भावजनिका॥

§132. अत्राह – यद्य् एवं¹⁵ क्रियाया¹⁶ असम्भवः¹⁷। प्रत्ययास्¹⁸
तर्हि¹⁹ जनका भविष्यन्ति भावानाम्²⁰ इति।

B25v

§133. उच्यते²¹ –

10 प्रत्यया नाक्रियावन्तः²²

[MMK I.4c]

L24v

यदा क्रिया नास्ति²³ तदा क्रियारहिता²⁴ अक्रियावन्तो²⁵ निर्हेतु-
काः²⁶ प्रत्ययाः²⁷ कथं जनकाः॥

¹ L: aivam ² P: Ø; D: aṣy ³ P: Ø; D: nāpratyamavatī ⁴ P: Ø; D: pratyamavatī; Tib: bya ba rkyen dang ldan pa ∴ pratyayavatī (assumes preceding *kriyā*) ⁵ P: Ø; D: tadīṃm ⁶ P: Ø; D: om.; J, L: kathaṃm ⁷ P: Ø; D: nihertikā ⁸ P: [1]n(t)+mayah; B, J, L: mantumayah; D: gantumayah ⁹ Q: ghaṭo; D: paṭā ¹⁰ D: cīraṇa°; L: virāṇa°; PsP_L: virāṇa°; Stcherbatsky (1927: 169, n. 2) emends to *vīraṇa*° ¹¹ L: tyu° ¹² D: tasyāt ¹³ L: kiya ¹⁴ L: avam ¹⁵ L: kriyācā ¹⁶ D: ahaṃbhavaḥ ¹⁷ B, J, L: °yā ¹⁸ J, L: tahi ¹⁹ J: °ṇām ²⁰ P: Ø; J, L: ucyante ²¹ P: Ø; D: nāstiyāvataḥ ²² P: Ø; D: nāsthi ²³ P: Ø; D: kriyāvahitā; Tib: rkyen bya ba dang bral ba dang bya ba dang mi ldan pa ²⁴ P: Ø; B, J: akriyavanto; L: akriyavantau ²⁵ P: Ø; D: nihetukāḥ; J, L: °kā ²⁶ P: Ø; J: pratyakāḥ; L:

§134. अथ – क्रियावन्त एव जनका इति।

उच्यते¹ –

PsP_L 81

क्रियावन्तश् च सन्त्य² उत³ ॥ [MMK I.4d]

नेति⁴ प्रकृतेनाभिसम्बन्धः⁵ । उतशब्दो⁶ ऽत्रावधारणे⁷ । तत्र क्रियाया
अभाव उक्तः⁸ । कथं क्रियावत्त्वं⁸ प्रत्ययानाम्⁹ इति । यथा च विज्ञान-⁵
जनक्रियोक्ता¹⁰ । एवं¹¹ पचिक्रियादयो¹² ऽपि भावा उक्ता वेदितव्या¹³
इति नास्ति क्रियातो¹⁴ ऽपि¹⁵ समुत्पत्तिर्¹⁶ भावानामिति भवत्युत्पा-
दाभिधानमर्थशून्यम् ॥ P15r

§135. अत्राह – किं न एतेन क्रियावन्तः प्रत्यया इत्यादिविचारेण ।
यस्माच्¹⁷ चक्षुरादीन्¹⁸ प्रतीत्य प्रत्ययान्¹⁹ विज्ञानादयो²⁰ भावा¹⁰
जायन्ते । तस्माच्²¹ चक्षुरादीनां²² प्रत्ययत्वं²³ तेभ्यश् चोत्पादो
विज्ञानादीनाम्²⁴ इति ॥ J31r

pratyeyāḥ

¹ L: ucyamte ² D: bhanty ³ B, J, L: ute; D: ata; ⁴ Q: naiti
⁵ D: prakṛtenādbhi°; J: °sabandhaḥ ⁶ D: utpaśabdo ⁷ Q: 'vadhā-
raṇe; B, J, L: 'vadhāraṇe; D: ācadhāraṇe; PsP_L: 'vadhāraṇe; Tib: n.e.
atra ⁸ Q: kriyāsatvaṃ; Tib: rkyen rnams ji ltar bya ba dang ldan ba
nyid yin ÷ kathaṃ kriyāvattvaṃ pratyayānām ⁹ Q: pratyayām; L:
pratyayān ¹⁰ P: Ø; D: °kriyāktāḥ ¹¹ P: Ø ¹² P: Ø; B, J, L: pari-
kriyādayo; D: °damo; PsP_L: parikriyādayo; Tib: 'tshed pa'i bya ba
¹³ P: Ø; D: neditavyā ¹⁴ P: Ø; D: yato ¹⁵ P: Ø; D: vi ¹⁶ P: Ø; B,
J, L: °tti ¹⁷ D: yasmā ¹⁸ J, L: °dīt ¹⁹ D: prabhāmān ²⁰ Q:
vijñānadayo; D: vijñānodayo ²¹ D: tasmā ²² D: cakṣuvādīnām
²³ D: pratyamatvaṃ ²⁴ J, L: vāmjñānādīnām

§136. एतदप्ययुक्तमित्याह –

उत्पद्यते¹ प्रतीत्येमान्² इतीमे प्रत्ययाः किल³ ।

Q13v D13v

यावन् नोत्पद्यत⁴ इमे तावन् नाप्रत्ययाः⁵ कथम् ॥ [MMK I.5]

यदि चक्षुरादीन् प्रत्ययान्⁶ प्रतीत्य विज्ञानम् उत्पद्यत⁷ इत्यस्येमे

5 प्रत्यया उच्यन्ते⁸ ननु यावत् तद्⁹ विज्ञानाख्यं कार्यं नोत्पद्यते ।

तावदिमे चक्षुरादयः कथं नाप्रत्ययाः । अप्रत्यया एवेत्य¹⁰ अभि-

PsP_L 82 प्रायः¹¹ । न चाप्रत्ययेभ्य¹² उत्पत्तिः सिकताभ्य¹³ इव¹⁴ तैलस्य ॥

§137. अथ मतम्¹⁵ – पूर्वम् अप्रत्ययाः¹⁶ सन्तः¹⁷ किञ्चिदन्यं प्रत्य-

यम् अपेक्ष्य¹⁸ प्रत्ययत्वं¹⁹ प्रतिपद्यन्त²⁰ इति । एतदप्ययुक्तम्²¹ ।

¹ B: utpadyamte; J: utpadyante; L: utpaṣv(?)ante ² D: pratītyamān

³ D: (eyeskip to PsP_M §145. [sentence before MMK I.8ab]; PsP_L 84.10) mānasya hi nāstyārambaṇena yogaḥ | anārambaṇa pravāyaṃ sarvadharmā upadiśyate bhavadbhiḥ sārasya ita vākyaśeṣa || athānārambane dharme kutaṇ [D 13v] ārambaṇaṃ punaḥ | atha śabdaḥ praśne kuta ita hetau | tenāyamartha kilah ⁴ Q: nātpadyata ⁵ B, D, J, L: °yā ⁶ D: prabhāvāt ⁷ L: udyata ⁸ L: ta ⁹ L: kārya ¹⁰ L: evebhy ¹¹ D: ahiprāyaḥ ¹² L: °yetya ¹³ B, L: śikatātya; D, J: śi° ¹⁴ P: om. ¹⁵ J: mata ¹⁶ D: aprathyayāḥ; L: aprayāḥ

¹⁷ PsP Tib: sngar rkyen ma yin par gyur pa las ∴ pūrvam apratyayāḥ santaḥ. The *las* serves to indicate a state or situation out of which something occurs, and does not suggest that the translators read a Sanskrit ablative or misunderstood the meaning. ¹⁸ B, J: avekṣya; D, L: avakṣya ¹⁹ B: pratyayasam; J: pratyayasam; L: pratyayasvaṃ ²⁰ B, J, L: pratipadyata; D: pratiṣadyataḥ ²¹ L: ayuktav

B26r यत्¹ तत्² प्रत्ययान्तरम्³ अप्रत्ययस्य⁴ प्रत्ययत्वेन कल्प्यते⁵ । तदपि
प्रत्ययत्वे सत्यस्य⁶ प्रत्ययो⁷ भवतीति⁸ तत्राप्य⁹ एषैव¹⁰ चिन्तेति¹¹ न
युक्तम्¹² एतत्॥

§138. किं चेहेमे¹³ चक्षुरादयो विज्ञानस्य प्रत्ययाः¹⁴ कल्प्यमानाः¹⁵
L25r सतो¹⁶ वास्य कल्प्येरन्¹⁷ असतो¹⁸ वा । सर्वथा च¹⁹ न युज्यते²⁰ 5
इत्याह –

नैवासतो²¹ नैव सतः प्रत्ययो²² ऽर्थस्य²³ युज्यते²⁴ । [MMK I.6ab]

¹ L: om.; PsP Tib: gang zhig rkyen ma yin pa 'di'i rkyen nyid du rtog pa | rkyen gzhan de'i rkyen nyid de yang rkyen yod na yin pas ÷ yat tat pratyayāntaram apratyayasya pratyayatvena kalpyate tad api pratyayatve saty asya pratyayo bhavatīti. LVP (PsP_L 82, n. 1) reconstructs *apratyayasya tasya* for *rkyen ma yin pa 'di'i*, but it may be more likely that *asya* of the co-relative part of the sentence has been moved to the relative part. *tat pratyayāntaram* appears to have been transferred to the co-relative part and is in Tib set in a genitive construction with *rkyen nyid*. Did the translators read or mentally construe *tad api tasya pratyayāntarasya pratyaye sati pratyayatvaṃ bhavati* instead of *tad api pratyayatve saty asya pratyayo bhavatīti*? Or was their text, like Q's text, corrupt (Q reads *pratyayatvasya* for *pratyayatve sati asya*), forcing them to improvise? ² L: om. ³ D: °yāntaraḥm ⁴ L: avratyayasya ⁵ D: kelpyate ⁶ Q: pratyayatvasya ÷ pratyayatve saty asya ⁷ D: pratyaryo ⁸ J, L: bhavati; PsP_L: bhavati; Tib: yin pas ⁹ Tib: 'di la ÷ tatra ¹⁰ J: aṣaiva ¹¹ Q: citteti; B: cīmtayati; D: cindeti; J, L: cintayati; PsP_L: cintaneti; de Jong (1978: 36) emends D's reading to *cinteti* ¹² D: yaktam ¹³ D, L: caHEME; Tib: n.e. iha ¹⁴ D: pratyapratātyayāḥ ¹⁵ D: °noḥ ¹⁶ D: satā ¹⁷ D: kalpyaratv; L: kalpyenann ¹⁸ D: asatā ¹⁹ D: ve; Tib: n.e. ca ²⁰ Q: yujyanta ²¹ D: mevāsato; L: °satau ²² D: pratyarya ²³ B, J, L: °āsyā ²⁴ D: pujyate; L: yukṣyate

कस्मादित्याह –

असतः प्रत्ययः कस्य सतश् च प्रत्ययेन¹ किम्॥ [MMK 1.6cd]

असतो ह्यर्थस्याविद्यमानस्य कथं प्रत्ययः स्यात्²॥

§139. भविष्यता व्यपदेशो भविष्यतीति चेत्³।

5 नैवम्⁴

भविष्यता चेद् व्यपदेश इष्टः शक्तिं विना नास्ति हि भावितास्य।

इत्यादिनोक्तदोषत्वात्॥

§140. सतो⁶ ऽपि विद्यमानस्य⁷ लब्धजन्मनो⁸ निष्कलैव⁹ प्रत्यय- J31v

PsPL 83 कल्पना¹⁰ ॥

10 §141. एवं समस्तानां प्रत्ययानां कार्योत्पादनासामर्थ्येनाप्रत्ययत्वम्
उद्भाव्यातः¹¹ परं¹² व्यस्तानाम् अप्रत्ययत्वं¹³ प्रतिपाद्यते॥

§142. अत्राह – यद्यप्य¹⁴ एवं प्रत्ययानामसम्भवः¹⁵ तथाप्य¹⁵
एव¹⁶ लक्षणोपदेशात् प्रत्ययप्रसिद्धिः¹⁷। तत्र निर्वर्तको¹⁸ हेतुरिति

¹ L: pratyaye | na ² D: syā≈ ³ B: ce ⁴ D: naiva ⁵ D: rcad; L: ve ⁶ L: tato ⁷ B, J, L: vijñānasya ⁸ D: laprajanmano ⁹ D: nispalaiva ¹⁰ Q: pratyayaparikalpanā ¹¹ L: udbhāvyāt ¹² B, J, L: para ¹³ Q: apipratyayatvaṃ ¹⁴ Q: om. api; Tib: n.e. api ¹⁵ B: ast; D, L: ast; J: aḥt ¹⁶ B, J: ava ¹⁷ B: pratyayasiddhis ¹⁸ B, J, L: nivarttako; D: nivarttakā

लक्षणमुच्यते हेतुप्रत्ययस्य। न चाविद्यमानस्य लक्षणोपदेशो युक्तो¹
वन्ध्यासुतस्येवेति²।

§143. उच्यते³ – स्याद्⁴ धेतुप्रत्ययो⁵ यदि तस्य लक्षणं स्यान् न
ब्रूति⁶। यस्मात् –

न सन् नासन् न सदसन्⁷ धर्मो⁸ निर्वर्तते⁹ यदा¹⁰।

कथं¹¹ निर्वर्तको¹² हेतुर्¹³ एवं सति न¹⁴ युज्यते॥ [MMK I.7]

5

¹ Q: om. yukto. Tib seems to have read *ukto* (*brjod*) instead of *yukto*. Tib for the sentence (n.e. ca, n.e. iva iti): de la sgrub par byed pa ni rgyu'o zhes rgyu'i rkyen gyi mtshan nyid brjod de yod pa ma yin pa mo gsham gyi bu la ni mtshan nyid nye bar ston pa mi brjod do
² D: °syevati; Tib: n.e. iva iti (see previous note) ³ Tib: n.e. ucyate
⁴ D: syā ⁵ D: hetupratyo ⁶ Q: om. na tv asti. Tib: yod pa ni ma yin te. Candrakīrti often concludes conditional statements such as the preceding one with a sentence in the negative; cf., e.g., PsP_L 180.8-9, 202.8-9, 280.6-7. Without it, it is difficult to make sense of the following *yasmāt* in connection with the verse. The loss of words may have been caused by an eyeskip: *syān* may have been written as *syāt*, and Q's scribe's eye jumped from *āt* of *syāt* to *āt* of *yasmāt*. It is also possible that earlier in the tradition the *akṣara nna* of *syān na* was read as *t* plus *virāma*, and *tv asti*, then no longer contextually understandable, was dropped. ⁷ B, D, J, L: sadasad ⁸ D: dharto ⁹ B, D, J, L: nivarttate ¹⁰ D: yathā ¹¹ PsP Tib: ji ltar sgrub byed rgyu zhes bya ÷ katham nirvartako hetuḥ ¹² Q: nivarttako; B, D, J, L: nivarttako ¹³ P: hetu; B: hetum; J, L: hetu ¹⁴ Em: na. P, Q: hi; B, D, J, L: hi; PsP_L: hi (PsP_L 31.8, where MMK I.7cd is also cited, likewise reads *hi*; all the mss attest *hi*); PsP Tib: mi; ABh, BP, PP, PPT: mi; MMK_T: mi. See Translation note.

तत्र निर्वर्तक¹ उत्पादको। यदि निर्वर्त्यो² धर्मो³ निर्वर्तते⁴। तमुत्पाद-
 को हेतुरुत्पादयेत्। न तु निर्वर्तते⁵ सदसदुभयरूपस्य निर्वर्त्यस्या-
 भावात्⁶। तत्र सन् न⁷ निर्वर्तते⁸ विद्यमानत्वात्। असन्नप्यविद्यमान-
 त्वात्। सदसन्न अपि⁹ परस्परविरुद्धस्यैकार्थस्याभावाद्¹⁰ उभय- B26v
 5 पक्षाभिहितदोषत्वाच्च¹¹ च¹²। यत एवं¹³ कार्यस्योत्पत्तिर्¹⁴ नास्ति।
 हेतुप्रत्ययो¹⁵ ऽप्यतो नास्ति। ततश्च¹⁶ च¹⁷ यद्¹⁸ उक्तं¹⁹ लक्षणसम्भ-
 वाद्²⁰ विद्यते हेतुप्रत्यय इति तद् एवं²¹ सति न युज्यते²² ॥ L25v

PsPL 84 §144. इदानीम् आरम्बणप्रत्ययनिषेधार्थम्²³ आह –

P15v

अनारम्बण²⁴ एवायं सन्²⁵ धर्म उपदिश्यते।

10 अथानारम्बणे²⁶ धर्मे²⁷ कुत आरम्बणं²⁸ पुनः ॥ [MMK I.8]

¹ B, D, J, L: nivarttaka ² Q: nirvratyo; B, J: nivartyo; D: nivarttyo; L: nivatyo ³ D, L: dharmā ⁴ Q: nirvvarttet; B, L: nivartteta; D, J: nivarttata ⁵ B, J, L: nivarttate; D: nivarttata ⁶ Q: nirvṛtyabhāvāt; B, D, J, L: nivarttyasyā°; Tib: yod pa dang med pa dang gnyi ga la ngo bo 'grub pa med pa'i phyir ro ⁷ J: om. ⁸ P: nirvartyate; Q: nivarttate; B, J, L, N: nivarttate ⁹ D: apiḥ ¹⁰ P: parasparavi(ru)-ddha[7]; D: °kārthasyāt; J: °viriddhasyaikābhāvāt ¹¹ P: Ø; D: °bhi-hitapadoṣatvāv ¹² P: Ø; B: om. ¹³ P: Ø; B, J, L: eva ¹⁴ P: Ø; D: kāyasmātpatir; J: °patti; L: kāryasyatpatti ¹⁵ L: hestuprayo ¹⁶ J: tata ¹⁷ J: om.; Tib: n.e. ca ¹⁸ D: om. ¹⁹ D: om. ²⁰ B, J: °bha-vo; L: lakṣaṇasaṃbhavo ²¹ B: eva; D: amavaṃ ²² L: yuktate ²³ B, J, L: ālambana°; LVP: ālambana° ²⁴ Q: anāraṇa; B, J, L: anā-lambana; LVP: anālambana ²⁵ Em. following LVP: san. P, Q: sad; B, D, J, L: sa; Tib: yod pa'i chos 'di ÷ ayaṃ san dharmah ²⁶ B, L: athānārambane; J: athānālambane; PsPL: athālambane ²⁷ B, J, L: dharma ²⁸ B: ārambanam; PsPL: ālambanam

J32r इह सारम्बणा धर्माः¹ कतमे सर्वे² चित्तचैत्ता³ इत्यागमाच् चित्त-
 चैत्ता⁴ येनारम्बनेणोत्पद्यन्ते⁵ यथायोगं रूपादिना। स तेषामारम्बण-
 प्रत्ययः⁶। अयं⁷ च विद्यमानानां⁸ वा⁹ परिकल्प्येताविद्यमानानां¹⁰
 वा¹¹। तत्र विद्यमानानां नार्थस्¹² तदारम्बणप्रत्ययेन¹³। धर्मस्य ह्य
 उत्पत्त्यर्थम्¹⁴ आरम्बणं¹⁵ परिकल्प्येत¹⁶। स¹⁷ चारम्बणात्¹⁸ पूर्वं¹⁹ 5
 विद्यमान एवेति। अथैवम्¹⁹ अनारम्बणे²⁰ धर्मे²¹ स्वात्मना प्रसिद्धे
 किम् अस्यारम्बणयोगेन²² परिकल्पितेनेत्य्²³ अनारम्बण²⁴ एवायं
 D14r सन् विद्यमानो²⁵ धर्मश्²⁶ चित्तादिकः। केवलं सारम्बण²⁷ इत्युच्यते
 भवद्भिः²⁸ स्वमनीषिकया । न त्व्²⁹ अस्यारम्बणेन³⁰ कश्चित्

¹ P: ∅; B: sārāmbanā dharmāḥ; PsP_L: sālambanadharmaḥ ² P: ∅; B, D, J, L: sarva ³ P: ∅; B, D, J, L: °caityā ⁴ P: ∅; B, D, J, L: °caityā
⁵ P: ∅; B: yenārambane°; D: yanārambane°; PsP_L: yenālambane°;
 Tib: skyed par byed pa ∴ utpadyante ⁶ D: °pratyayā ⁷ Tib: n.e. ayaṃ ca
⁸ D: vidyamānā; J, L: °nā ⁹ B, J, L: cā ¹⁰ L: °vidya- māmānām
¹¹ B: cā, followed by parikalpyetāvidyamānānām vā; J, L: as B, vā pari° ¹² B: nāthas ¹³ B, J: tadārambana°; PsP_L: tadā- lambana°; Tib: dmigs pa'i rkyen de ∴ tadārambaṇapratyayena
¹⁴ D: utpatortham; Tib: bskyed par bya ba'i phyir ∴ utpattiyartham
¹⁵ D: āraṇaṃ; L: ālambaṇaṃ; PsP_L: ālambanaṃ ¹⁶ D: parikalpyet; PsP_L: parikalpyate; Tib: yongs su rtog par byed na ¹⁷ D: om.
¹⁸ B: cārambanāt; PsP_L: cālambanāt ¹⁹ P: ∅; D: athevam ²⁰ P: [1]nā(r)am(b)ā[1]; B: anārambane; PsP_L: anālambane ²¹ P: ∅; D: dharma
²² P: aśyāra(m)bā[1]°; B: asyārambana° ²³ D: parikal- patenety ²⁴ PsP_L: anālambana ²⁵ P: avidyamāno; B, J, L: avidya- māno; D: avidyamānā ²⁶ B, J, L: dharma ²⁷ B: sārāmbana; D: sārasbaṇa; PsP_L: sālambana ²⁸ D: bhavati; L: bhavadbhi ²⁹ B, J, L: nv ³⁰ Q: asyārambaṇe; B: asyārambane; D: asvārasvaṇena

सम्बन्धो¹ ऽस्ति॥

§145. अथाविद्यमानस्यारम्बणं² परिकल्प्यते। तद्³ अपि न⁴ युक्तम्।
अनारम्बणं⁵ एवायम्⁶ इत्यादि⁷। अविद्यमानस्य⁸ हि नास्त्य⁹ आर-
म्बणेन¹⁰ योगः।

PsPL 85

5 अनारम्बणं¹¹ एवायं सन्¹² धर्मं¹³ उपदिश्यते। [MMK I.8ab] Q14r
भवद्भिः सारम्बणं¹⁴ इति वाक्यशेषः।

अथानारम्बणे¹⁵ धर्मे¹⁶ कुत आरम्बणं¹⁷ पुनः¹⁸ ॥ [MMK I.8cd]

अथशब्दः¹⁹ प्रश्ने²⁰ कुत इति हेतौ। तेनायम्²¹ अर्थो ऽथैवम्²² B27r
अनारम्बणे²² धर्मे²³ ऽसत्यविद्यमाने²⁴ भूयः कुत आरम्बणम्²⁵।

10 आरम्बणकाभावाद्²⁶ आरम्बणस्याप्य²⁷ अभाव इत्यभिप्रायः॥

¹ L: sabandho ² D: athāvidyamānasvaṇam; PsPL: °syālabmanam
³ D: tajñ ⁴ D: ta ⁵ PsPL: anālabmana ⁶ D: evāyan ⁷ B: °dih
⁸ Tib: 'di ltar yod pa ma yin pa la ni ... ÷ avidyamānasya hi ⁹ B:
nyasty; L: nnasty ¹⁰ D: ārambaṇana; PsPL: ālabmanena ¹¹ LVP:
anālabmana; Tib: chos 'di dmigs pa med pa ni || yin pa ste gyur pa
kho na khyed kyis nye bar bstan te | dmigs pa dang bcas par zhes bya
ba ni tshig gi lhag ma ÷ anālabmana evāyam san dharma upadiśyate,
bhavadbhiḥ sālambanana iti vākyaśeṣaḥ ¹² P: sana; B, D, J, L: sa
¹³ Q: bhavan dharma ¹⁴ PsPL: sālambana ¹⁵ Q: athānāmbaṇe;
PsPL: athānālabmane ¹⁶ D: dharma ¹⁷ J, L: arambanaṇam; PsPL:
ālabmanam ¹⁸ B: yataḥ; J, L: vataḥ D: °śabda; Tib adds preced-
ing zhes bya ba la ²⁰ J, L: praśneḥ ²¹ Tib: 'dir (atra) ÷ ayam
²² PsPL: anālabmane ²³ D: dharma ²⁴ J: °ṇe ²⁵ PsPL: ālabma-
ṇam ²⁶ Q: ārambakā°; D: ārasvaṇa°; PsPL: ālabmana°; Tib: dmigs
par byed pa ÷ ārambaṇaka ²⁷ PsPL: ālabmanasyāpy

J32v §146. कथं तर्हि¹ सारम्बणाश्² चित्तचैत्ताः³ । सांवृतम्⁴ एतल्⁵
लक्षणम् । न पारमार्थिकमित्यदोषः ॥

L26r §147. इदानीं समनन्तरप्रत्ययनिषेधार्थम्⁶ आह –
अनुत्पन्नेषु धर्मेषु निरोधो नोपपद्यते⁷ ।

नानन्तरम् अतो⁸ युक्तं निरुद्धे⁹ प्रत्ययश्च कः ॥ [MMK I.9] PsP_L 86

तत्र पश्चिमे श्लोकस्यार्थे¹⁰ पादव्यत्ययो¹¹ द्रष्टव्यश्च शब्दश्च¹² च
भिन्नक्रमो¹³ निरुद्धे¹⁴ चेति¹⁵ । तेनैवं पाठो – निरुद्धे च प्रत्ययः को
नानन्तरमतो युक्तम् इति¹⁶ । श्लोकबन्धार्थं¹⁷ ब्रूवमुक्तम् ॥

तत्र कारणस्यानन्तरो निरोधः¹⁸ कार्यस्योत्पादप्रत्ययः समनन्तर-
प्रत्ययलक्षणम्¹⁹ । अत्र विचार्यते अनुत्पन्नेषु²⁰ धर्मेषु कार्यभूतेष्वङ्कु-
रादिषु निरोधो नोपपद्यते कारणस्य बीजादेः²¹ । यदैतदेवम् । तदा

¹ Q: om.; Tib: n.e. tarhi ² Q: ārambaṇāś; B, J, L: sārambaṇā; D: sārambaṇaṁś ³ B, D, J, L: °caityāḥ ⁴ J: sāṁṛtam ⁵ D: eta
⁶ Q: anantarapratyaya° (ms P attests *samanantara* each of the three times the word is compounded with *pratyaya*; ms Q attests *samanantarapratyaya* only in the second case. Was Q changed to correspond with *anantaram* of the verse?); B, J, L: °pratyayeni°; D: °pratyayā-naśedhārthas ⁷ D: nāpapadyate ⁸ D: eto ⁹ B, L: niruddham
¹⁰ B, D, J, L: °ārdha ¹¹ D: mādayatyayā; L: pādayabhyayo
¹² D, L: va°; Tib: yang gi sgra ni 'gags na yang zhes rim pa bzhi du sbyar ÷ caśabdaś ca bhinnakramo niruddhe ceti ¹³ P: bhinnakrame; B, J, L: ninnakrame; D: bhinnakrame ¹⁴ D: nivuddhe ¹⁵ D: cati; L: veti ¹⁶ D: itiḥ ¹⁷ B, D, J, L: °rtha ¹⁸ L: dhaḥ ¹⁹ L: saman-tarapra°; LVP (PsP_L 600) emends to *lakṣaṇaḥ* ²⁰ D: anutpannaṣu
²¹ L: bījāde

कारणस्य निरोधाभावाद् अङ्कुरस्य¹ कः समनन्तरप्रत्ययः² । अथा-
 नुत्पन्ने³ ऽपि कार्ये⁴ बीजनरोध इष्यते । एवं सति निरुद्धे बीजे
 ऽभावीभूते ऽङ्कुरस्य⁵ कः प्रत्ययः । को वा⁶ बीजनरोधस्य प्रत्यय
 इति । उभयमेतदहेतुकमित्याह – निरुद्धे च कः प्रत्यय इति ।
 5 चशब्दो ऽनुत्पन्नशब्दापेक्षः । तेनानुत्पन्ने चाङ्कुरे⁷ बीजादीनां निरोध⁸
 इष्यमाणे ऽप्युभयम् एतद्⁹ अहेतुकमापद्यत इति नानन्तरमतो
 युक्तम् ॥

§148. अथ¹⁰ वा न स्वतो नापि परत इत्यादिनोत्पादो निषिद्धस्¹¹
 तम्¹² अभिसन्ध्यायाह –

P16r

10 अनुत्पन्नेषु धर्मेषु निरोधो¹³ नोपपद्यते¹⁴ ।

J33r B27v

नानन्तरमतो युक्तम्

इति ॥

अपि च

¹ L: umkursya ² Q: nantara° (ko nanatara° for kaḥ samanantara°)
³ D: athānatpanne ⁴ D: kāye; L: kārya ⁵ D: 'kurasya ⁶ Tib: n.e.
 vā. Tib conjoins the alternatives with *la*, structuring each alternative
 such that the last five words of I.9cd (*rkyen yang gang zhig yin*)
 appear within it. ⁷ P: cānkura; D: cāmkuve; J: cām're; L: cā're
⁸ D: nirādhaḥ ⁹ L: et; Tib: n.e. etat ¹⁰ Tib: yang na | bdag las ma
 yin gzhan las min zhes bya ba la sogs pas skye ba bkag pa yin la |
 skye ba bkag pa de la dgongs nas ∴ atha vā na svato nāpi parata
 ityādinotpādo niṣiddhas tam abhisandhāya ¹¹ D: niṣiddha notpādo
 niṣiddhas ¹² D: tag ¹³ D: nirādho ¹⁴ B, L: nāpipadyate; D:
 nāpa°; J, N: nāpividyate

निरुद्धे प्रत्ययश्च कः ॥

इत्¹ अत्र पूर्वकम्² एव व्याख्यानम्³ ॥

§149. इदानीम् अधिपतिप्रत्ययस्वरूपनिषेधार्थम्⁴ आह⁵ –

भावानां निःस्वभावानां न सत्ता विद्यते यतः।

सतीदमस्मिन् भवतीत्येतन् नैवोपपद्यते ॥ [MMK I.10]

PsPL 87

L26v इह यस्मिन् सति यद् भवति तत् तस्याधिपतेयम्⁶ इत्⁷ अधिपति-
प्रत्ययलक्षणम्। भावानां च प्रतीत्यसमुत्पन्नत्वात् स्वभावाभावे

¹ Tib: 'di la bshad pa ni snga ma nyid sbyar bar bya'o ÷ ity atra pūrvakam eva vyākhyānam ² Q: pūrvvam ³ Q: vyākhyātam ⁴ B, J, L: adhipatipratipratyaya°; Tib: da ni bdag po'i rkyen bsal bar bzhed nas bshad pa ÷ idānīm adhipatipratyayasvarūpaniṣedhārtham āha ⁵ LVP, on the basis of Tib's *sa bon la sogs pa*, conjectures a following *bījādīnām*. None of my mss attest *bījādīnām*. The acceptance of *bījādīnām* into the text would imply a conflation of the *hetu-pratyaya*, exemplified as *bīja* by Candrakīrti in his commentary on MMK I.2, with the *adhipatipratyaya*, or an intersection of the one with the other. It is not completely clear how the *adhipatipratyaya* with the definition *yasmin sati yad bhavati tat tasyādhipateyam* was conceptualized; the other commentators do not elaborate. The addition in Tib suggests the AK understanding of the *adhipatipratyaya* as equivalent to the *kāraṇahetu* and of *kāraṇahetu* as allowing for pre-dominant *kāraṇahetus*. Given that no mss attest *bījādīnām*, I refrain from adding it to the text. It may have been included as a marginal addition in one of the Skt mss used by the translators of the Tib.
⁶ D: °yas ⁷ Q: om.

कुतस्¹ तद् यदस्मिन्² इति कारणत्वेन व्यपदिश्यते कुतश् च³ तद्
यद्⁴ इदमिति कार्यत्वेन। तस्मान् नास्ति लक्षणतो ऽपि प्रत्यय-
सिद्धिः ॥

§150. अत्राह – तन्वादिभ्यः⁵ षटादिकम्⁶ उपलभ्य⁷ षटादेस्⁸
5 तन्वादयः⁹ प्रत्यया इति।

§151. उच्यते – षटादिफलप्रवृत्तिर्¹⁰ एव¹¹ स्वरूपतो¹² नास्ति।
कुतः प्रत्ययानां प्रत्ययत्वं¹³ सेत्स्यति¹⁴। यथा च¹⁵ षटादिफल-
प्रवृत्तिर्¹⁶ असती¹⁷ तथा प्रतिपादयन्नाह –

न च व्यस्तसमस्तेषु प्रत्ययेष्वस्ति तत् फलम्।

10 प्रत्ययेभ्यः¹⁸ कथं¹⁹ तच्²⁰ च भवेन्²¹ न प्रत्ययेषु यत्²² ॥ [MMK I.11]

तत्र व्यस्तेषु तन्तुतुरिवमतसरशलाकादिषु²³ प्रत्येकं²⁴ षटो²⁵ नास्ति D14v
तत्रानुपलभ्यमानत्वात्²⁶ कारणबहुत्वाच्²⁷ च²⁸ कार्यबहुत्वात्प्रसङ्गात्।

¹ J, L: kuta ² P: yasminn for yad asminn. A scribe in P's transmission line appears to have corrected *yad asminn* to conform with Candrakīrti's commentarial *yasmin* of the previous sentence. ³ P: om. ca; B, D, J, L: om. ca; PsP_L: om. ca; Tib: yang ⁴ J: yed ⁵ Q: adds following *paṭāḍibhyaḥ*; B: *tantvādityo*; D: *tantvādityaḥ* ⁶ B, J, L: *ghaṭādikam* ⁷ J: °bhyāḥ; L: *upalasya* ⁸ B, J, L: *ghaṭādes*; D: *paṭādas* ⁹ J, L: *tatvādayaḥ* ¹⁰ B, J, L: *ghaṭāḍiphalapravṛtter*; D: °*pravatter* ¹¹ D: *ava* ¹² Tib: n.e. *svarūpataḥ* ¹³ J: °*tve* ¹⁴ B, L: *syatsyati*; J: *syetsyati* ¹⁵ Tib: n.e. *ca* ¹⁶ B, J, L: *ghaṭādi°* ¹⁷ P: *asatīti* ¹⁸ L: °*yetyaḥ* ¹⁹ J: *katha* ²⁰ D: *te*; J: *c* ²¹ L: *tuvan* ²² D: *yata*; J: *tat* ²³ B, D, J: °*vemataśaraśa°*; L: *tanturivemataśaraśa°*; PsP_L: *tantuturī°* ²⁴ B, J, L: *pratyayaṃ*; D: *pratyake*; PsP_L: *pratyayeṣu*; Tib: *so sor* ²⁵ B, J, L: *ghaṭo* ²⁶ D: °*upalabhyemāna°*

J33v समुदितेष्वपि तन्वादिषु¹ नास्ति पटः² प्रत्येकम्³ अवयवेष्वविद्यमा-
नवाद्⁴ एकस्य च⁵ कार्यस्य⁶ खण्डश⁷ उत्पत्तिप्रसङ्गात्। तस्मात्
फलाभावान् न सन्ति प्रत्ययाः स्वभावत⁸ इति ॥

§152. अथासदपि तत्⁹ तेभ्यः¹⁰ प्रत्ययेभ्यः¹¹ प्रवर्तते।

PsPL 88

फलम्

[MMK I.12abc₁]

5

इत्यभिप्रायः स्यात्।

अप्रत्ययेभ्यो¹² ऽपि कस्मान् नाभिप्रवर्तते ॥ [MMK I.12c₂-d]

B28r अप्रत्ययेष्व¹³ अपि नास्ति फलमित्त् अप्रत्ययेभ्यो¹⁴ ऽपि वीरणा-
दिभ्यः¹⁵ कस्मान्¹⁶ नाभिप्रवर्तते पट¹⁷ इति नास्ति¹⁸ फलप्रवृत्तिः¹⁹
स्वरूपतः²⁰ ॥

10

27 J: °tvoc 28 P: om.

¹ D: tentvādiṣu; J, L: tattvādiṣu ² B, J: ghaṭāḥ; D: paśaḥ; L: ghaṭoḥ

³ D: prayobhyekam ⁴ Q: avayaveṣu vidyamānatvāt ∴ avayaveṣv
avidyamānatvād ⁵ Em: ca. P, Q: om. ca; B, D, J, L: om. ca; PsPL:

om. ca; Tib: dang ⁶ B, J, L: kāyasya ⁷ B, D: khaṇḍaṇa ⁸ Tib:

n.e. svabhāvataḥ ⁹ P: tan ¹⁰ L: tetyaḥ ¹¹ B, D, J, L: om.; conj.

by LVP: [pratyayebhyaḥ] ¹² Em. following Saito 1984: 230, n. 41

and 1985: 25f. P, Q: om. apratyayebhyo 'pi kasmān nābhipravartate;

B, D, J, L: om. apratyayebhyo 'pi kasmān nābhipravartate; conj. by

LVP: [apratyayebhyo 'pi kasmān nābhi]pravartate phalam. See

Translation note. ¹³ P: pratyayeṣu ¹⁴ D: apratyarebhyo ¹⁵ D, L:

°ādityaḥ ¹⁶ D: kalān ¹⁷ B, J, L: ghaṭā ¹⁸ L: nyasti ¹⁹ D:

°pravṛti ²⁰ Tib: n.e. svarūpataḥ

§153. अत्राह – यद्यन्यत् फलं¹ स्यादन्ये च² प्रत्ययाः³ तदा किं⁴ Q14v
 प्रत्ययेषु फलम् अस्ति⁵ नास्तीति⁶ स्याच् चिन्ता। नास्ति तु
 व्यतिरिक्तं⁷ फलम्। किं तर्हि। प्रत्ययमयम् एवेति⁸ ॥

§154. उच्यते –

5 फलं च प्रत्ययमयं⁹ प्रत्ययाश् चास्वयम्मयाः¹⁰ ।

फलमस्वमयेभ्यो¹¹ यत् तत् प्रत्ययमयं कथम् ॥ [MMK I.13]

यदि प्रत्ययमयं¹² प्रत्ययविकारः फलम्¹³ इति व्यवस्थाप्यते। तद्¹⁴
 अयुक्तं यस्मात् ते ऽपि प्रत्यया अस्वयम्मया¹⁵ अप्रत्ययस्वभावा L27r
 इत्यर्थः। तन्तुमयो¹⁶ हि पट¹⁷ इति। उच्यते – स्यात् पटो¹⁸ यदि
 10 तन्तव¹⁹ एव स्वभावसिद्धाः स्युः। ते²⁰ ह्य अंशुमया²¹ अंशुविका-
 रा²² न स्वभावसिद्धाः। ततश् च²³ तेभ्यो ऽस्वयम्मयेभ्यो²⁴ यत्²⁵ 26

¹ L: phala ² B, J, L: va ³ D: atti ⁴ D: ti ⁵ L: vyatirikṭā ⁶ B, J, L: avayaveti; D: aveti ⁷ L: pratyayasamyam ⁸ Q: pratyayān
⁹ P: cā[1]yam[1]mayāḥ; Q: cātva(?)yam°; D: casva°; J: °mayoḥ
¹⁰ D: °mayetyā ¹¹ D: °meyam; Tib translates *pratyayamaya* as *rkyen gyi rang bzhin* throughout ¹² D: phalām ¹³ D: dad ¹⁴ D: atyayammayā
¹⁵ P: ṭan+mā+(o); B, D, J, L: °yā ¹⁶ B, J, L: ghaṭa; D: pata ¹⁷ B, J, L: ghaṭā; D: paṭā ¹⁸ D: tanteva; L: taṃntava
¹⁹ B, J, L: eṣa; Tib: n.e. eva ²⁰ D: ta ²¹ P: a(ś)u(m)ayā; em. by LVP: aṃśa° on the basis of Tib: cha shas; *cha shas* may, however, be the translation for *aṃśu*. ²² P: a.[1](v)ikārā; em. by LVP: aṃśa°
²³ D: ma ²⁴ Tib: n.e. ca ²⁵ Q: asvayamsvabhāvebhyo; B, D, J: 'svayamayasvabhāvebhyo; L: svayamayasvabhāvebhyo; conj. by LVP: 'svayammaye[bhyo] 'svabhāvebhyo; Tib: bdag nyid kyi rang bzhin ma yin pa de dag las (= tebhyo 'svayammaye bhyo). De Jong follows D and emends PsP_L to: 'svayamayasvabhāvebhyo. He is of the opinion that this reading is confirmed by Tib but note that *asvayammayāḥ*

फलं पटाख्यं¹ तत् कथं तन्तुमयं² भविष्यति ॥

यथोक्तम् –

घटः³ कारणतः सिद्धः सिद्धं कारणमन्यतः ।

सिद्धिर् यस्य⁴ स्वतो नास्ति तदन्यज् जनयेत् कथम् ॥

इति ॥

5

तस्मान् न प्रत्ययमयम्⁵ [MMK I.14a]

फलं⁶ संविद्यते ॥

§155. अप्रत्ययमयं⁷ तर्ह्य⁸ अस्तु ।

J34r

नाप्रत्ययमयं⁹ फलम्¹⁰ ।

संविद्यते

[MMK I.14b-c₁]

10

of I.13b and of its first instance in the commentary is translated as *bdag gi rang bzhin min* (that is, *rang bzhin* translates °*maya*, not *svabhāva*). The paper mss presumably received the interpolated reading found in Q from ms δ via ms ι. ²⁶ L: ya

¹ B, J, L: ghaṭākhyam ² B: tatumayam ³ P: paṭaḥ; B: yataḥ; D: paṭhaḥ; J, L: paṭaḥ; PsP_L: paṭaḥ; PsP Tib: snam bu; BP: snam bu. See Translation note. ⁴ P: Ø; D: yasā ⁵ B, D, J, L: °mayī ⁶ Tib: de phyir rkyen gyi rang bzhin gyi 'bras bu ni yod pa ma yin no ∴ phalam samvidyate, i.e., Tib, unlike Skt which merely clarifies the quarter by adding two words, provides a gloss for the quarter. ⁷ B: °maya ⁸ Q: tahya ⁹ D: mā° ¹⁰ Q: om.

इति। तन्तुमयो¹ यदा² पटो³ नास्ति। तदा कथं⁴ विरुद्धो⁵ वीरणमयः P16v
स्यात्॥

§156. अत्राह – मा भूत्⁶ फलम्। प्रत्ययाप्रत्ययनियमस् तु विद्यते।
तथा च भवान्⁷ ब्रवीति⁸ यद्यसत् फलं प्रत्ययेभ्यः⁹ प्रवर्तते¹⁰ ऽप्रत्य-
5 येभ्यो¹¹ ऽपि¹² कस्मान् नाभिप्रवर्तत¹³ इति। न चासति¹⁴ फले
पटकटाख्ये¹⁵ तन्तुवीरणानां¹⁶ प्रत्ययाप्रत्ययत्वं¹⁷ युक्तम्¹⁸। अतः
फलम्¹⁹ अप्यस्तीति॥

§157. उच्यते – स्यात् फलं यदि²⁰ प्रत्ययाप्रत्यया²¹ एव²² स्युः।
सति²³ हि फल इमे ऽस्य प्रत्यया इमे ऽप्रत्यया इति स्यात्। तच् च B28v
10 विचार्यमाणं नास्तीति²⁴ ॥

PsPL 90

फलाभावात् प्रत्ययाप्रत्ययाः²⁵ कुतः॥ [MMK I.14 c₂-d]

¹ D: °mayā; Tib adds *yang* (gang gi tshe snam bu snal ma'i rang bzhin du yang med pa) ² D: padā ³ B, J: ghaṭo; D: paṭā ⁴ L: thaṃ ⁵ Q: viruddhe; B, J, L: om.; PsPL: om. LVP (PsPL 89, n. 5) notes that Tib reads *de'i tshe 'gal ba 'jag ma'i rang bzhin du ji ltar 'gyur* and reconstructs the Skt as *tadā katham viruddhaviṛaṇamayāḥ* ... ⁶ B: tūt ⁷ Q: bhagavā; J, L: bhagavān ⁸ D: tuvīti ⁹ D: °yetyaḥ; L: pratyayaḥ ¹⁰ P: p+[1](rtt)āte; D: pravarvarttato ¹¹ D: apratyayette ¹² D: vi ¹³ P: Ø; Q: nābhivarttate; L: nobhi° ¹⁴ L: vāsati ¹⁵ D: paṭakaśekhye ¹⁶ D: maṃtu° ¹⁷ P: pratyayānām pratyayatvam; B, D, J, L: pratyayānām pratyayatvam; LVP: pratyayānām pratyayatvam; Tib: rkyen dang rkyen ma yin pa nyid ¹⁸ D: muktamm ¹⁹ D: phalem ²⁰ D: yādi ²¹ D: °yām ²² Tib: n.e. eva ²³ Tib: 'di ltar 'bras bu yod na ÷ sati hi phale ²⁴ Tib: med pa nyid de | de'i phyir ÷ nāstīti ²⁵ B, D, J, L: °yā

प्रत्ययाश्च चाप्रत्ययाश्च चेति समासः¹ । तस्मान् नास्ति भावानां स्व-
भावतः² समुत्पत्तिरिति ॥

§158. यथोक्तमार्यरत्नाकरसूत्रे –

शून्यविद्य³ न हि⁴ विद्यते क्वचिद्⁵ अन्तरीक्षि⁶ शकुनस्य⁷ वा⁸
पदम्⁹ ।

5

यो¹⁰ न विद्यति सभावतः¹¹ क्वचित्¹² सो¹³ न जातु परहेतु¹⁴
भेष्यति¹⁵ ॥

यस्य नैव हि सभावु¹⁶ लभ्यते¹⁷ सो¹⁸ ऽसभावु¹⁹ परपत्ययः²⁰
कथम् ।

¹ D: samāsa ² J: svabhāvetah; L: svabhāvath (t with *virāma*); Tib: n.e. svabhāvataḥ ³ Q: śūnyavidyā; B, J, L: śūnyavidye; D: śūnyavidyate. *LT: śūnyavidyeti | śūnyā 'vidyā (cf. Yonezawa 2004: 126, 150 [fol. 3a6]). I understand *śūnyavidya* of the verse as intending *śūny' avidya*. Tib: gang na'ang stong pa rig pa med pa ni ||. The first four verses are in *rathoddhatā* metre. ⁴ Q: om. ⁵ P: ⊗; PsP_L: kva-ci. ⁶ Q: °kśe; L: °kśe ⁷ D: śakunatya ⁸ Q: om. *LT: śakuner iva padaṃ yathā antarīkṣe nāsti (cf. Yonezawa 2004: 126, 151 [fol. 3a6]); cf. BHSD s.v. vā (= iva) ⁹ Q: pādām ¹⁰ Em. following LVP: yo. P: ya (following *akṣara* damaged); Q: yan; B: ya; D, J, L: yan ¹¹ P: ⊗; B, D, J: svabhāvataḥ; L: svabhāvātaḥ ¹² LVP: kvaci ¹³ D, J, L: sā ¹⁴ Q: °hetur; B: °hetur ¹⁵ B, D, J, L: bhaviṣyati ¹⁶ P: sabhāvubhā; B, J, L: svabhāva ¹⁷ PsP_L: labhyati ¹⁸ D: svo ¹⁹ Em. following LVP: 'sabhāvu (the metre requires a light syllable). P, Q: 'svabhāvu; B, J, L: 'svabhāva; D: 'svabhāvu ²⁰ Em.: parapatyayaḥ. P, Q: parapatyayaḥ (*pra*° is unmetrical); B, D, J, L: parapatyayaḥ; PsP_L: parapaccayaḥ

अस्वभावु¹ परु² किं जनीष्यति³ एष हेतु सुगतेन⁴ देशितः⁵ ॥

L27v

सर्व धर्म अचला⁶ दृढ⁷ स्थिता निर्विकार निरुपद्रवाः⁸ शिवाः⁹ ।

अन्तरीक्षपथतुल्य ऽजानका¹⁰ अत्र¹¹ मुह्यति जगं¹² अजानकम् ॥

शैलपर्वत यथा अकम्पिया एव¹³ धर्म अविकम्पियाः सदा ।

J34v

नो¹⁴ च्यवन्ति¹⁵ न पि¹⁶ चोपपद्यिषु¹⁷ एव¹⁸ धर्मत¹⁹ जिनेन²⁰

देशिता²¹ ॥

इत्यादि ॥

तथा

यो²² न²³ पि जायति²⁴ नो²⁵ चुपपद्यी²⁶ न²⁷ च्यवते²⁸ न पि

जीर्यति²⁹ धर्मः ।

¹ L: asvabhāva ² L: puru; PsP_L: paraṃ (cf. PsP_L 90, n. 7). ³ Q: janīṣyati ⁴ Q: saṃgatena ⁵ Q: diśitaḥ; D: daśitaḥ ⁶ D: ayalā ⁷ PsP_L: dṛḍham ⁸ D: °vā ⁹ D, J: śivā; L: śitāḥ ¹⁰ Em. following LVP: 'jānakā. P: jānakā; Q: jānikā; B, D, J, L: jānakā; PsP Tib: shes pa med pa. ¹¹ Q: tatra; PsP_L: tatra. Tib: de la ¹² Q: jagah; D: jayaṃ ¹³ PsP_L: evaṃ, second syllable read as light (cf. PsP_L 90, n. 10). ¹⁴ D: mo ¹⁵ L: cyavanni ¹⁶ Q: vi ¹⁷ P: copapadyayū; B, J, L: nopipadyeyu; D: nopapadyaṣu; PsP_L: copapadyayu ¹⁸ PsP_L: evaṃ. The meter requires a light syllable; *eva* would have been read as *evā* ¹⁹ Q: dharma; em. by LVP: dharmaṇa; Tib: chos rnam ²⁰ D: jinana ²¹ P: deśita; Q: diśitā ²² D: yomya; J: yoja. The next three verses are in *dodhaka* metre. ²³ D: ne ²⁴ D: jāṣati ²⁵ PsP_L: nā, LVP (PsP_L 600) corrects to *no* ²⁶ B, J, L: vu°; D: vuya-padvi ²⁷ PsP_L: no. ²⁸ L: cyacato ²⁹ B, J, L: jīyati; D: jīnaṃti

तम् जिनु¹ देशयती² नरसिंहस्³ तत्र⁴ निवेशयि सत्वशतानि॥
 यस्य सभावु⁵ न विद्यति कश्चिन्⁶ नो⁷ परभावतु⁸ केनचि⁹ लब्धः¹⁰ ।
 नान्तरतो¹¹ न पि¹² बाहिरतो¹³ वा लभ्यति¹⁴ तत्र¹⁵ निवेशयि
 नाथः॥

D15r

शान्त गती¹⁶ कथिता सुगतेना¹⁷ नो¹⁸ च गती¹⁹ उपलभ्यति²⁰ 5
 काचित्²¹ ।

¹ B, D, L: jina ² At PsP_L 243.4 LVP, against the mss, emends to *darśayati* ³ Q: narasighas; B, D, J, L: narasiṅghas. ⁴ At the equivalent for PsP_L 243.5, P, B, D, J and L read *tatra nideśayi satvamaharṣī* for *tatra niveśayi satvaśatāni*. LVP (PsP_L 243, n. 3) states that PsP Tib presents the equivalent for *tatra niveśayi satvaśatāni*. Galloway (2001: 330) accepts the reading *tatra nideśayi satvamaharṣī* for his edition of the citation in PsP chapter 13. ⁵ P: svabhāvu, also at its equivalent for PsP_L 243.6; B, D, J, L: svabhāvu ⁶ Q: kaści; LVP: kaści; Galloway (2001: 330) accepts *kaści* for the PsP chapter 13 citation but notes “Should be *kaścid*.” ⁷ D: nā ⁸ Galloway (2001: 330) reads *parabhāva tu*. ⁹ B, J, L: kenavi ¹⁰ B: ruddhaḥ; J, L: luddhaḥ ¹¹ Galloway (2001: 331) reads *na-antar ato*. ¹² P: pi na ∴ na pi, but *na pi* at the equivalent for PsP_L 243.8 ¹³ L: bāhito. Galloway (2001: 331) reads *bahir ato*. ¹⁴ D: latyati ¹⁵ D: tratra ¹⁶ B, J, L: matī ¹⁷ Q: °na; P at the equivalent for PsP_L 243.8: °nā ¹⁸ D: nā ¹⁹ J: garja; L: garji ²⁰ D: upalatyati. P at the equivalent for PsP_L 243.11: upapadyati. LVP emends *upapadyati* of his edition to *upalabhyati* (cf. PsP_L 243, n. 6; Tib: *nyed pa*). Galloway (2001: 331) retains the reading *upapadyati*. ²¹ P: kāñcit, but P at the equivalent for PsP_L 243.11: kācit; B, D, J, L: kācit; PsP_L: kāci. Galloway (2001: 331) accepts *kāci*.

तत्र च वीहरसी¹ गतिमुक्तो² मुक्तकु³ मोचयसी⁴ बहुसत्वान्॥

इति विस्तरः ॥

§159. इत्याचार्यचन्द्रकीर्तिपादोपरचितायां प्रसन्नपदायां मध्यमक-
वृत्तौ प्रत्ययपरीक्षा नाम प्रथमं प्रकरणम्॥

5

¹ Em.: vīharasī. P, Q: vyāharasī, P also vyāharasī at the equivalent for PsP_L 243.12; B, D, J, L: vyāharasī; PsP_L: voharasī; Tib: rnam par gsungs. Galloway (2001: 331) emends, following LVP, to voharasī.

² B, J, L: gatiyukto; D: muktogatimukto ³ P: muktaka, P at the equivalent of PsP_L 243.13: muktaku; Q: muktakṣa; B, J, L: yuktaku;

⁴ L: mocasī

